

Monster Study

Monster Study

Duration: c. 6'50"

Elizabeth Gartman

Soprano 1

Soprano 2

Viola

Violoncello

Texts compiled by Susan Bywaters and Elizabeth Gartman from Mary Tudor's graduate thesis in 1939, later made public by the University of Iowa and a public domain article by *San Jose Mercury News*. Additional text written by composer. Sources below:

Tudor, Mary. "An experimental study of the effect of evaluative labeling of speech fluency." MA (Master of Arts) thesis, State University of Iowa, 1939. <http://ir.uiowa.edu/etd/5352>

Dyer, Jim. "Ethics and Orphans: the 'Monster Study.'" *San Jose Mercury News*. 2010.

Reynolds, Gretchen. "The Stuttering Doctor's 'Monster Study.'" *The New York Times Magazine*. 2003. www.nytimes.com/2003/03/16/magazine/

In 1939, Dr. Wendell Johnson of the University of Iowa performed an experiment on orphan children to test the origins of stuttering. Johnson struggled with stuttering throughout childhood and spent his entire adult life attempting to "cure" the impediment. Johnson enlisted graduate student Mary Tudor to conduct his study. Under Johnson's supervision, Mary spent six months verbally interacting with twenty-two children ages five through fifteen at a Davenport orphanage. The experiment was unsuccessful, however, as there were no trends to be found among the children's patterns of speech other than those brought on by newly found self-consciousness. The experiment was kept hidden to protect Dr. Johnson's reputation in the wake of experiments conducted by the Communist community during World War II. In 2001, the San Jose Mercury News led an investigation ultimately exposing the "Monster Study" and resulting in a million-dollar settlement paid to the six remaining orphans from Mary's study.

The musical work *Monster Study* calls attention to the effect of labeling other people. In this horrific study, it was not the speech exercises but rather the label "stutterer" that caused the victims to struggle to speak at all. For 22-year-old female student Mary it was the label of "monster" that shunned her from the scientific community, regardless of the fact her much older, male professor orchestrated the entire experiment. Both the orphans and Mary were "silenced," and unable to live out the rest of their lives as planned. In 2003, Gretchen Reynolds of the New York Times reported: "Only now, at a remove of decades, can we begin to digest and appreciate what the Tudor study tells us about the origins of speech defects, as well as the ethics of science, the brittleness of children, and the egos of driven men." This is *Monster Study* from Mary's perspective.

Text collected by Susan Bywaters and Elizabeth Gartman from public domain articles and Mary Tudor's graduate thesis, published by the University of Iowa. Additional text written by Elizabeth Gartman.

Monster Study

Duration: c.a. 6'50"

Elizabeth Gartman

♩ = 54

Soprano 1

Soprano 2

Viola

Cello

ppp *fade to sul pont.* *pp*

ppp *fade to sul pont.* *pp*

S 1

S 2

Vla.

Vc.

mp freely and warm

"Here's

p *p* *p* *mp* *p* *mp*

p *p* *p* *mp* *p* *mp*

p *p* *p* *mp* *p* *mp*

Monster Study

17

S 1 *mf*
fa-der bear, here's ma-der bear, here's ba-by bear. Fa - der bear is look-in' at the pa-per, an' ma - der bear is

S 2

Vla. *mp* pizz. arco

Vc. *mp* sul pont. fade to ord. ord. sul pont.

20

S 1 *f* slight accel. led by S1 ----- ♩ = 80
knit - tin', ba - by bear is play-in' blocks. The three bears come home an' ss

S 2 slight accel. led by S1 ----- *f* pointed and fricative
"Stut-ter-er" we lab-elled them

Vla. *mf* *f* sul D pizz.

Vc. ord. *mf* slap pizz. *f*

A

23

S 1 *pointed and fricative*

S 2 based on

"stut-ter-ers" based on based on

Vla. arco sul D pizz. arco

Vc. arco sul D slap pizz. pizz. arco

mp *f* *mf*

26

S 1 who had been who had been lab - elled stut-er - er stut-er-er the sti

S 2 who had been who'd been lab - elled stut-er - er by in -

Vla. pizz. arco sul D sul D

Vc. pizz. arco

Monster Study

4

B

mf
almost robotic,
straight tone when possible

♩ = 110

29

S 1
tion. the or-phan-age — child - ren child - ren A A B B

S 2
tu - the or-phan-age. There were twen-ty - two twen-ty - two groups one two one two

Vla.
sul pont.

Vc.
ric.

mf
almost robotic,
straight tone when possible

mp

mp

32

S 1
stut-ter - ers stut-ter - ers nor - mal nor - mal fif - teen fif - teen

S 2
group one group one group two group two age five to five to

Vla.
ord.

Vc.
ord.

mf

mf

35

S 1 *f*
all or - phan child - ren twen - ty two twen - ty two I was twen - ty two I was

S 2 *f*
all or - phans There were twen - ty two twen - ty two. I was twen - ty two, I was twen - ty two, I was

Vla.

Vc.

38

S 1 *with vib., suddenly warmer* (lift) ♩ = 60
twen - ty two

S 2 *with vib., suddenly warmer* (lift) *mf*
twen - ty two when Pro - fes - sor Wen - dell John son asked me to do the

Vla. *f* *p* *mp*

Vc. *f* *p* *mp*

Monster Study

6

43 *mp*

S 1 It — was a small price to pay — for sci-ence.

S 2 stu - dy un - der his su - per - vi - sion

Vla. *p* *mp*

Vc. *p* *mp*

47 **C**

S 1

S 2 *mf* sing freely and speechlike in time allotted
Group one - A con - sis - ted of five "stu - ter - ers" An at - tempt was made to re -

Vla. *p* sul tasto, alt. pressure on bridge illustrated: ord.

Vc. *pp*

Monster Study

$\text{♩} = 100$
mf speechlike, but still sung

S 1
Ma - ny child - ren have the prob - lems you're hav - ing. In a

S 2
move the la - bel "stu - ter - ing" from this group.

Vla.
mf

Vc.
mf

$\text{♩} = 60$

S 1
short while you'll be speak - ing well.

S 2
mf
In the case of Group one - B the jud - ges en - dored the la - bel.

Vla.
p
sul A

Vc.
p
sul D

sul tasto, alt.
pressure on bridge
illustrated:

Monster Study

8

57 $\text{♩} = 100$
mf

S 1
How long, how long have you stut - tered? What hap - pened that caused you ___ to stut - ter? ___

S 2

Vla.
ord.
mf

Vc.
ord.
mf

||

60 $\text{♩} = 60$

S 1

S 2
mf
Group two - B con - sis - ted of six nor - mal speak - ers comp - li - ment - ed on their speak - ing a - bil - i - ty

Vla.
sul tasto, alt.
pressure on bridge
illustrated:
p

Vc.

Monster Study

$\text{♩} = 100$ $\text{♩} = 60$

S 1 *mf*
You speak ve - ry well.

S 2 *mf*
In Group two-A judg - es at - tached the la - bel "stu - ter - ing" to six nor - mal speak - ers.

Vla. *ord.* *mf* *ord.* *sul pont. sul A* *p*

Vc. *sul D* *sul tasto, alt. pressure on bridge illustrated:*

mf

$\text{♩} = 100$ *mf*

S 1 *mf*
The staff has come to the con - clu - sion — that you are be - gin - ning to stut - ter. — Don't speak un -

S 2

Vla. *ord.* *mf* *ord.* *3* *3* *dark*

Vc. *ord.* *mf* *ord.* *3*

Monster Study

10

68

S 1

less you can do it right. Don't speak un - less you can do it right. Don't. _____

S 2

mf
dark

Don't speak un - less you can do it right. Don't speak. Don't speak. Don't.

Vla.

Vc.

71

D

p
ord.

p
ord.

pp

pp

ric.
sul pont.

sul pont.

*almost robotic,
straight tone when possible*

v

S 1

Af-ter six months of stu - dy _____ A de-crease in ver -

S 2

Af-ter six months of stu - dy _____ the re-sults were clear: _____

Vla.

Vc.

76 *mf*

S 1
bal out - put They ap-peared shy and em - bar-assed, shy and em-bar - assed. —

almost robotic, straight tone when possible *mf*

S 2
They spoke more slow - ly. Some hung their heads, oth - ers cov - ered — their mouths, their mouths.

Vla. *mf* *battutto* *fade to ord.*

Vc. *mp* *mf* *battutto* *fade to ord.*

79 *f*

S 1
Shy — ap - peared a - eh - a - eh But — there was no — change in pat-tern

f *with vib. beginning to realize...*

S 2
Spoke slow - ly Spoke slow - ly — mah oh - ah But — there was no — change in pat-tern

f *with vib. beginning to realize...*

Vla. *f* *ord.*

Vc. *f* *ord.* *3* *p* *sul tasto*

Monster Study

12

E

GRAND REALIZATION

Spoken freely:

♩ = 90

S 1
of speech for a - ny group. — Pro - fes - sor John - son's theo - ry was wrong.

S 2
of speech for a - ny group. —

Vla.
fade to ord. ord. full sound, with despair sul D

Vc.
fade to ord. ord. full sound, with despair sul C

p *pp* *mf* *f*

S 1
What they won't (t)ell you is _____ (highest pitch)

S 2
What they won't (t)ell you is my Pro - fes - sor Wen - dell John - son ne - ver pub - lished

Vla.
thin and straight

Vc.
thin and straight

f *mf* *mf*

92

S 1

S 2

Vla.

Vc.

f

f

What they won't tell you is

the ex-per-i-ment like he did for his oth-er stu-dents. What they won't tell you is—

return to full sound

sul D

slap pizz. return to full sound arco

sul C

f

96

S 1

S 2

Vla.

Vc.

mf

that I went back three times af-ter the ex-per-i-ment to pro-vide psych-o-lo-gi-cal help to the

(highest pitch)

thin and straight

mf

thin and straight

slap pizz.

full

full arco

mf

Monster Study

14

S 1 *f* *intensifying* *ff*
 or - phans. What they won't tell you is that I spent dec - ades dec - ades

S 2 *f* *intensifying* *ff*
 What they won't tell you is that I spent dec - ades dec - ades

Vla. *f* *mf* *ff*
 sul D

Vc. *f* *mf* *ff*
 sul C sul G

S 1 *fade to straight* **F** *stage whisper out of time with Sop. 2:*
 try - ing to for - try - to - get. for - get for - get mon - ster, mon - ster...

S 2 *fade to straight* *stage whisper out of time with Sop. 1:* *mp freely*
 try - ing to for - get, ing - for - try - ing, try - ing, try mon - ster, mon - ster... I was

Vla. *mp* *p* *pp*
 103 *non vib.* sul G sul C

Vc. *mp* *p* *pp*
non vib.

mp *poco meno mosso* *a tempo*

108

S 1

It seemed _____ like a small price to pay _____ for sci - ence.

S 2

pp *a tempo* whisper:

twen - ty two. I was on - ly twen - ty two. a _____ price _____ pay _____ sci - ence.

Vla.

108

ppp *pp*

sul G sul C

Vc.

ppp *pp*

||

112

S 1

S 2

Vla.

112

ppp

sul G

Vc.