Assessing Community Health Risks Related to Ethylene Oxide Emissions and New Risk Criteria

Dyron Hamlin, MS, PE, CIH
Benjamin Chandler, M.S., CIH, CSP
Ethylene Oxide Uses

- Commonly used in the chemical industry as an intermediate compound
- Manufacturing process for fiberglass
- Sterilization of medical equipment and pharmaceutical products
- Ingredient in industrial cleaners
- Produce ethylene glycols for engine antifreeze
- Personal care products – cosmetics and shampoos
Ethylene Oxide – Health Risks

- Known Human Carcinogen – NTP
- Group 1 Carcinogen – IARC
- Potential Human Carcinogen – NIOSH
- Suspected Human Carcinogen (A2) – ACGIH
- Cancer / Reproductive Hazard – OSHA
- Increase cancers of white blood cells, including non-Hodgkin’s lymphoma, myeloma, and lymphocytic leukemia
- Skin Irritant
- Target Organs – Central Nervous System
Ethylene Oxide Properties

- Extremely flammable liquid and gas under pressure
- Highly reactive
- Flammable Range = 2.6% - 100%
- Clear colorless gas
- Sweet odor reported in industrial settings
  - Reminiscent of bruised apples
Ethylene Oxide – Occupational Exposures

• Primary Routes of Exposure
  – Inhalation
  – Eye contact
  – Skin contact/absorption

• Occupational Exposure Limits
  – OSHA PEL-TWA = 1 ppm
  – OSHA PEL-STE= 5 ppm
  – ACGIH TLV-TWA = 1 ppm
  – NIOSH IDLH = 800 ppm

• No real-time personal air monitoring instrument
Ethylene Oxide – Workplace Compliance

  - General Industry
  - Worker Monitoring
  - Regulated Areas
  - Respiratory Protection and Controls
  - Written Program
  - Medical Surveillance
  - Notification and Training
  - Recordkeeping
Ethylene Oxide – Worker Protection

• NIOSH Respirator Recommendations (Up to 5 ppm)
  – Full face Air Purifying Respirator – APF=50
  – Escape and Workplace
  – SCBA – APF = 10,000 / Emergency
• Some manufacturers recommend Supplied Air
  – Poor warning properties
  – High odor threshold
• Respiratory Protection Program
Ethylene Oxide – Environmental Protection

- EPA Listed Hazardous Air Pollutant
- Process Safety Management
  - Threshold quantity 5,000 lbs
  - 29 CFR 1910.119
- EPA Clean Air Act
- National Air Toxics Assessment
  - 2014 Air Data
  - EPA is evaluating emission levels and workplace controls
- Facility Air Permitting
Ethylene Oxide Impacts – How We Got Here

• Sterigenics – Medical Equipment Sterilization using EtO / Willowbrook, Illinois
• EPA Lowers Health Criteria for Cancer Risk Based on IRIS Assessment – 2016
• ATSDR Report Indicates Increased Cancer Risks for Willowbrook Residents – 2018
  – Modeled Data
  – 30 Day Sampling Study
• Community Uncertainty and Concerns
• Multiple Ongoing Lawsuits
Ethylene Oxide – What are the Risks?

- Task Force of Experts Convened
  - Certified Industrial Hygienist
  - Toxicologist
  - Chemical Engineer
- Air Sampling Study was Implemented
- Ultimately Resulted in Seal Order
- Sterigenics Implemented Additional Control Measures
- Pending Litigation and Continued Air Sampling and New Legislation Introduced
- National Attention on the Sterilization Services Industry
Strategies for Assessing Health Risks

TASK FORCE OBJECTIVES

• Identify Laboratory Methods and Implement Air Sampling Protocols
• Quantify EtO Concentrations at Indoor and Outdoor Locations (Rep. Air Samples)
• Identify Sources of EtO and Evaluate the Potential Contributions
• Measure Background Concentrations of EtO in Urban and Rural Areas
• Provide Guidance on Health Risk
What is Being Done to Understand Risks

- Active Role by local Municipalities and State / County Government
- County Health Departments
- Industry Trade Associations
- Advocacy Groups
- Users / Manufacturers of EtO – Proactive Sampling
  - Medical Sterilization
  - Chemical Industry
  - Transportation
- Implementing Additional Controls Measures to Reduce EtO Emissions

Example Community Activist Messaging
Strategies for Determining Health Risk

HEALTH RISK CRITERIA (1:10,000 / 1:1 million)

- EPA – 0.01 ppb / 0.0001 ppb
- ACC – 24.5 ppb / 0.245 ppb
- TCEQ – 40 ppb / 0.4 ppb

AIR SAMPLING METHODOLOGIES

- Evacuated SUMMA Canister
- 24 Hour Regulator / 6 Liter
- EPA Method TO-15 (GC/MS)
- Multiple Laboratories
- Detection Limits Vary by Laboratory ~ 0.02 ppb
- Potential Interferences - Trans-2-Butene, Acetaldehyde
Air Sampling Data Results and Interpretation

COLLECT QUALITY / INDEPENDENT DATA TO CHARACTERIZE AIRBORNE ETO CONCENTRATIONS IN THE COMMUNITY

• 200+ Ambient Air Samples
• Sample Period – November 2018 through August 2019
• Indoors vs Outdoors Concentrations
• Upwind and Downwind Sample Locations
• Collocated with EPA / Sterigenics Consultant
• Facility Operating vs Shutdown
• Consistently Measured Background EtO above the EPA Risk Criteria
• Positive Detections Noted Indoors and Outdoors
• Other Sources are Contributors
National Emphasis – Qualifying the Risk beyond Willowbrook

- Multiple Air Sampling Projects
  - Sterilization Companies
  - Chemical Producers
  - Local Municipalities
  - Health Departments
  - Trade Organizations
- > 1,000 ambient air samples
- Throughout the US
- Different Laboratories
- Qualifying ambient concentrations compared to wind direction
Unique Challenges for Public Health Experts

- Comparison of Air Sampling Data to Long-term exposure risk criteria
- Limited Amount of Ambient Air Data
- Lack of Understanding on Potential Sources
- Absence of Measured Background Concentrations
- Few Studies on EtO in the Community
- Validation of the Laboratory Method
  - MDL is above EPA Risk Criteria
  - Identified Interferences and Limitations
  - No identified Real-Time Instruments
- Emissions Control Measures in Compliance
- What is the Safe Level of EtO?
Ethylene Oxide in the Environment

**ETHYLENE OXIDE IN THE AIR**

Ethylene oxide is present in the environment and is created by various sources, including vehicle exhaust, plants and cigarette smoke.

Source: https://www.americanchemistry.com/eo/Ethylene-Oxide-Safety-Facts.pdf
What’s Next with Ethylene Oxide

• Multiple Medical Sterilization Facilities have discontinued operations
  – Implementing control measures
  – Directed by Regulators
  – Pressure from Public / Business Decisions
• Continued Debate Regarding Health Risks / Appropriate Risk Values
• New Monitoring Technologies
• Further Studies on Sources, Ambient Levels / Indoor
Questions?

GHD Services, Inc.

Dyron Hamlin, MS, PE, CIH
dyron.hamlin@ghd.com
501-766-1625

Benjamin Chandler, M.S., CIH, CSP
benjamin.chandler@ghd.com
501-366-3999