

Notes on Justin Martyr's *Apologies*

MIROSLAV MARCOVICH

The works of Justin Martyr are preserved virtually in a single and relatively late manuscript—the precious Parisinus gr. 450 (= A),¹ dated 11 September 1364 (f. 461^r bottom). The Parisinus is copied in an easy, neat and readable hand (probably by the monk Joasaph), but it is plagued with textual gaps, corruptions, scribal errors and intrusive marginal glosses. Back in 1883, Adolf Harnack estimated that A contained some 200–300 scribal errors in the text of the *Apologies* alone, as compared to a tenth-century manuscript (such as is the Arethas codex, Parisinus gr. 451, copied in A.D. 914).² But, apparently, no subsequent editor heeded Harnack's warning. The result is that we still do not have a critical edition of Justin. I present here a few remarks on the text and probable sources of the *Apologies*.³

Apologia Maior

1: Already the Address is typical of the textual problems involved (comprising inversion, omission and interpolation). It reads: Αὐτοκράτορι Τίτῳ Αἰλίῳ Ἀδριανῷ Ἀντωνίνῳ Εὐσεβεῖ Σεβαστῷ Καίσαρι, καὶ Οὐηρισσίμῳ υἱῷ φιλοσόφῳ, καὶ Λουκίῳ φιλοσόφῳ, Καίσαρος φύσει υἱῷ καὶ Εὐσεβοῦς εἰσποιητῷ, ἐραστῇ παιδείας, ἱερᾷ τε συγκλήτῳ καὶ δήμῳ παντὶ Ῥωμαίων, ὑπὲρ τῶν ἐκ παντὸς γένους ἀνθρώπων

¹ Cod. Claromontanus 82 (later belonging to the collection of Sir Thomas Phillipps [1792–1872], now in the British Museum, Loan Nr. 36), dated 2 April 1541, is an apograph of A (hence called by me “a”). It is of no value for the establishment of Justin's text.

² A. Harnack, *Die Überlieferung der griechischen Apologeten des 2. Jahrhunderts in der alten Kirche und im Mittelalter*, T.U. I.1–2 (Leipzig 1883) 79 n. 190.

³ Here are the principal editions of Justin's *Apologies*: R. Stephanus (Paris 1551); F. Sylburg (Heidelberg 1593); J. E. Grabe (*I Apology*, Oxford 1700) and H. Hutchin (*II Apology*, Oxford 1703); S. Thirlby (London 1723); P. Maran (Paris 1742 = PG VI [Paris 1857 = 1884]); C. Ashton (Cambridge 1767); J. W. J. Braun (Bonn 1830); J. C. Th. von Otto (Jena 1842; 2nd ed. 1847; 3rd ed. 1876); G. Krüger (Freiburg i. B. 1891; 4th ed. Tübingen 1915); L. Pautigny (Paris 1904); A. W. F. Blunt (Cambridge 1911); J. M. Pfätisch (Münster 1912); E. J. Goodspeed (Göttingen 1914); S. Frasca (Turin 1938); A. Wartelle (Paris 1987). None of them is critical. I quote Wartelle's text as being the most recent.

ἀδίκως μισουμένων καὶ ἐπηρεαζομένων, Ἰουστίνος Πρίσκου τοῦ Βακχείου, τῶν ἀπὸ Φλαουίας Νέας πόλεως τῆς Συρίας Παλαιστίνης, εἰς αὐτῶν, τὴν προσφώνησιν καὶ ἔντευξιν πεποιήμεαι.

First, the title Καίσαρι belongs to Marcus Aurelius, not to Antoninus Pius; consequently, read Σεβαστῶ, καὶ Καίσαρι Οὐηρισσίμφ υἱῶ φιλοσόφῳ (as Sylburg had conjectured). Second, the words καὶ Λουκίῳ φιλοσόφῳ, Καίσαρος φύσει υἱῶ καὶ Εὐσεβοῦς εἰσποιητῶ, ἐραστῇ παιδείας are a later interpolation, introduced by a pedant interested in historical exactness (as Gustav Volkmar in 1855 had seen, only to be disregarded). For (a) the expression ἐραστῇ παιδείας is redundant in view of 2. 2 ἐρασταὶ παιδείας (which is the source of inspiration for the interpolator). (b) Neither Lucius Verus nor his father, the Caesar Lucius Aelius Verus, was a philosopher. (c) The explanation, Καίσαρος φύσει υἱῶ καὶ Εὐσεβοῦς εἰσποιητῶ, is tedious and out of place in an address. Finally, (d) the introduction of Lucius Verus destroys the entire thematic unity of both *Apologies*. They deal only with Εὐσέβεια, embodied in the person of Antoninus the Pious, and Φιλοσοφία, manifested in Marcus Aurelius the Philosopher—from I *Apology* 1 and 2. 1–2 down to II *Apology* 2. 16 and 15. 5.⁴

Third, the expression οἱ ἐκ παντὸς γένους ἄνθρωποι means in Justin either “the human race” (as in *Dial.* 95. 2 and 134. 5) or “the gentiles” (as in I *Apol.* 25. 1, 32. 4, 40. 7). Certainly, Justin is not speaking on behalf of either of them, but on behalf of the Christians. The most common synonym for “Christians” is οἱ θεοσεβεῖς.⁵ Consequently, read ὑπὲρ τῶν ἐκ παντὸς γένους ἀνθρώπων <θεοσεβῶν>, ἀδίκως μισουμένων καὶ ἐπηρεαζομένων. Justin is speaking on behalf of the God-worshipping people coming from every nation, which is being unjustly hated and mistreated. The supplement is confirmed by Justin himself; compare *Dial.* 52. 4 οἱ γὰρ ἀπὸ τῶν ἐθνῶν ἀπάντων . . . θεοσεβεῖς . . . (ἡμεῖς) γενόμενοι, 91. 3 οἱ ἐκ πάντων τῶν ἐθνῶν . . . εἰς τὴν θεοσέβειαν ἐτρέπησαν, 131. 5 ἐκ παντὸς γένους ἀνθρώπων θεοσεβεῖς . . . δείκνυσθαι εἶναι τοὺς εἰς αὐτὸν πιστεύοντας et alibi. Finally, at the end of the sentence read εἰς αὐτῶν <ῶν> (with Eusebius *HE* 4. 12 cod. A, and with Grabe).

5. 3 (The evil demons arranged through wicked men that even Socrates be killed for telling the truth.): . . . καὶ αὐτὸν οἱ δαίμονες διὰ τῶν χαϊρόντων τῇ κακίᾳ ἀνθρώπων ἐνήργησαν ὡς ἄθεον καὶ ἀσεβῆ ἀποκτείνεσθαι. Ἀποκτείνεσθαι is Otto's emendation of the transmitted

⁴ Compare H. H. Holfelder, “Εὐσέβεια καὶ φιλοσοφία: Literarische Einheit und politischer Kontext von Justins Apologie,” *ZNTW* 68 (1977) 48–66 and 231–51.

⁵ Compare Melito ap. Eus. *HE* 4. 26. 5 νῦν διώκεται τὸ τῶν θεοσεβῶν γένος; *Ep. ad Diogn.* 6. 2 and 9; *Iren. Adv. haer.* 3. 11. 8; *Clem. Strom.* 6. 167. 3; *Tertull. Apolog.* 37. 4 et al.

ἀποκτεῖναι. Read ἀποκτ<αν>ῆναι instead. The chapter ends with a remark on the activity of the evil demons (5. 4): . . . κακούς καὶ ἀνοσίους δαίμονας, οἳ οὐδὲ τοῖς ἀρετὴν ποθοῦσιν ἀνθρώποις [such as was Socrates] τὰς πράξεις ὁμοίας ἔχουσιν. Wartelle's translation will convince no one: ". . . des démons pervers et impies, eux dont les agissements n'équivalent même pas aux actions des hommes désireux de vertu." Obviously, there is a lacuna before ἔχουσιν. Judging by the fact that at the beginning of c. 5 Justin was speaking of the need for men to judge with reason the schemes of the evil demons (5. 2 τοὺς οἱ λόγῳ τὰς γινομένας πράξεις οὐκ ἔκρινον), I would expect the lacuna to contain, e.g., τὰς πράξεις ὁμοίας <λόγῳ κρίνειν παρ>ἔχουσιν. The evil demons would not allow even the men longing for virtue to judge similar machinations with reason.

7. 5: Οὐ γὰρ τοὺς κατηγοροῦντας κολάζειν ὑμᾶς ἀξιόσομεν· ἀρκοῦνται γὰρ τῇ προσούσῃ πονηρία καὶ τῇ τῶν καλῶν ἀγνοία. I shall not demand that you punish the false accusers of the Christians. For, "le mal qui les habite et leur ignorance du bien leur sont une sanction suffisante," translates Wartelle. I would doubt, however, that this construction can yield such a sense. Read instead ἀρκοῦν γὰρ τὸ (for ἀρκοῦνται γὰρ) τῇ προσούσῃ πονηρία καὶ τῇ τῶν καλῶν ἀγνοία <συζῆν>. Justin is imitating Plato (compare, e.g., *Hippias Maior* 296a5, *Republic* 3. 411e1 ἐν ἀμαθία . . . ζῆ).

9. 2 (We do not worship the lifeless statues of gods, perishable works of men.): . . . καὶ ἐξ ἀτίμων πολλάκις σκευῶν διὰ τέχνης τὸ σχῆμα μόνον ἀλλάξαντες καὶ μορφοποιήσαντες θεοὺς ἐπονομάζουσιν [sc. οἱ τεχνῖται]. Obviously, the text is lacunose (as already Henri Estienne in 1592 had noticed). Read σκευῶν, διὰ τέχνης τὸ σχῆμα μόνον ἀλλάξαντες καὶ μορφοποιήσαντες, <ἀνδριάντας ποιήσαντες> θεοὺς ἐπονομάζουσιν and compare Isaiah 44. 13.

19. 2 (It is hard to believe that a full-grown human body could have developed from a little drop of the human seed, and yet it is true.): Εἷ τις ὑμῖν μὴ οὔσι τοιοῦτοις [sc. full-grown men] μηδ' ἐκ<κ> τοιούτων ἔλεγε, τὸ σπέρμα τὸ ἀνθρώπειον δεικνὺς καὶ εἰκόνα γραπτὴν, ἐκ τοῦ τοιοῦδε οἶόν τε γενέσθαι διαβεβαιούμενος, πρὶν ἰδεῖν γινόμενον ἐπιστεῦσατε; Showing us a picture of what? Of a full-grown human body, of course. Thus read δεικνὺς καὶ <σώματος> εἰκόνα γραπτὴν and compare the context (19. 1 εἰ ἐν σώματι μὴ ὑπήρχομεν and 19. 4 τὰ ἀνθρώπεια σώματα).

21. 2 (Bellerophon too, a mortal man, reportedly ascended into heaven.): καὶ τὸν ἐξ ἀνθρώπων δὲ ἐφ' ἵππου Πηγᾶσου Βελλεροφόντην [sc. ἀνεληλυθέναι εἰς οὐρανόν]. Read instead καὶ τὸν ἐξ ἀνθρώπων δὲ

<γενόμενον> ... Βελλεροφόντην and compare 54. 7 τὸν Βελλεροφόντην καὶ αὐτὸν ἐφ' ἵππου Πηγάσου, ἄνθρωπον ἐξ ἀνθρώπων γενόμενον, εἰς οὐρανὸν ἔφασαν ἀνεληλυθέναι.

31. 1 (The Jewish kings carefully kept the books of the prophecies by the prophets of God.): τὰς προφητείας ... τῇ ἰδίᾳ αὐτῶν Ἑβραίδι φωνῇ ἐν βίβλοις ὑπ' αὐτῶν τῶν προφητῶν συντεταγμένας κτῶμενοι περιεῖπον. The prophets composed the books of prophecies, not the prophecies themselves. Thus read συντεταγμένα<ι>ς and compare 31. 3 τὰς βίβλους ... τῇ προειρημένη Ἑβραίδι αὐτῶν φωνῇ γεγραμμένας.

33. 7: τὸ δὲ Ἰησοῦς, ὄνομα τῇ Ἑβραίδι φωνῇ, σωτὴρ τῇ Ἑλληνίδι διαλέκτῳ δηλοῖ. "*Jésus est un nom hébreu, qui signifie en grec Sauveur,*" translates Wartelle. Obviously, the text is lacunose. Read τὸ δὲ Ἰησοῦς ὄνομα <ἄνθρωπος> τῇ Ἑβραίδι φωνῇ, σωτὴρ τῇ Ἑλληνίδι διαλέκτῳ δηλοῖ. "The proper name Jesus means in Hebrew Man, in Greek Savior." This is confirmed by II *Apology* 6. 4 Ἰησοῦς δὲ καὶ ἀνθρώπου καὶ σωτήρος ὄνομα καὶ σημασίαν ἔχει.

Justin derived the name Jesus from Hebrew *'ish* ("man") and from Greek Ἰάσων = Σωτήρ. Compare the inscriptions in the catacombs of Rome⁶ and II *Apology* 6. 6 πολλοὶ τῶν ἡμετέρων ἀνθρώπων ... κατὰ τοῦ ὀνόματος Ἰησοῦ Χριστοῦ ... ἰάσαντο καὶ ἔτι νῦν ἰῶνται, 13. 4 ἄνθρωπος γέγονεν [sc. Christ], ὅπως ... ἴασιν ποιήσεται; Clem. *Paed.* 3. 98. 3 ὁ ἰώμενος ἡμῶν καὶ σῶμα καὶ ψυχὴν ... Ἰησοῦς; Eus. *Dem. ev.* 4. 10. 19 ... καὶ Ἰησοῦς ὀνομάζετο, παρ' ὅσον τῆς τῶν ἀνθρωπίνων ψυχῶν ἰάσεως τε καὶ θεραπείας χάριν τὴν πάροδον εἰς ἡμᾶς ἐποιεῖτο; Cyrill. *Hierosol. Catech.* 10. 4 Ἰησοῦς καλεῖται φερωνύμως, ἐκ τῆς σωτηριώδους ἰάσεως ἔχων τὴν προσηγορίαν, 10. 13 Ἰησοῦς τοίνυν ἐστὶ ... κατὰ δὲ τὴν Ἑλλάδα γλῶσσαν ὁ ἰώμενος, ἐπειδὴ ἰατρός ἐστι ψυχῶν καὶ σωμάτων καὶ θεραπευτὴς πνευμάτων; Eriphan. *Ancor.* 108. 7 Ἰησοῦς ... ἰατρός ἐρμηνευόμενος καὶ σωτήρ; Panar. 29. 4. 9 Ἰησοῦς γὰρ κατὰ τὴν Ἑβραϊκὴν διάλεκτον θεραπευτὴς καλεῖται ἥτοι ἰατρός καὶ σωτήρ.

35. 1 (It has been predicted by the prophets that Christ shall be ignored by the Jews.): Ὡς δὲ καὶ λήσειν ἔμελλε τοὺς ἄλλους ἀνθρώπους γεννηθεῖς ὁ Χριστὸς ἄχρις ἀνδρωθῆ, ὅπερ καὶ γέγονεν, ἀκούσατε τῶν προειρημένων εἰς τοῦτο. Delete ἄχρις ἀνδρωθῆ as a gloss. For Christ was never recognized as Messiah by the Jews, as is confirmed by 35. 6 Ἰησοῦς δὲ Χριστὸς ἐξετάθη τὰς χεῖρας, σταυρωθεὶς ὑπὸ τῶν Ἰουδαίων ἀντιλεγόντων αὐτῷ καὶ φασκόντων μὴ εἶναι αὐτὸν Χριστόν.

⁶ Compare G. Kittel, *Th. Wb. zum NT III* (1938) 287 n. 24.

35. 5: Καὶ πάλιν ἐν ἄλλοις λόγοις δι' ἑτέρου προφήτου λέγει (there follows Ps. 21 [22]. 17c + 19b). Says who? The Holy Ghost, as throughout the treatise. Thus read δι' ἑτέρου προφήτου <τὸ προφητικὸν πνεῦμα> λέγει.

36. 2 (One and the same divine Logos speaks in different persons—sometimes as a prophet, sometimes as in the person of God, or Christ, or the Jewish people.): ὁποῖον καὶ ἐπὶ τῶν παρ' ὑμῖν συγγραφέων ἰδεῖν ἔστιν, ἓνα μὲν τὸν τὰ πάντα συγγράφοντα ὄντα, πρόσωπα δὲ τὰ διαλεγόμενα παραφέροντα. Read πρόσωπα δὲ τὰ διαλεγόμενα <πλειῶ> παραφέροντα.

37. 7: Κἄν φέρητε σεμίδαλιν, θυμίαμα, βδέλυγμά μοί ἐστι. “Que vous m'apportiez fleur de farine ou encens, c'est pour moi une abomination,” translates Wartelle. Read instead Κἄν φέρητε σεμίδαλιν, <μάταιον> θυμίαμα βδέλυγμά μοί ἐστι = LXX Isaiah 1. 13.

39. 5 (oath of allegiance to the emperor by the Roman soldiers): . . . ὑμῖν μὲν τοὺς συντιθεμένους καὶ καταλεγόμενους στρατιώτας καὶ πρὸ τῆς ἑαυτῶν ζωῆς καὶ γονέων καὶ πατρίδος καὶ πάντων τῶν οἰκείων τὴν ὑμετέραν ἀσπάξεσθαι ὁμολογίαν . . . Wartelle translates: “. . . les soldats que vous enrôlez et dont vous exigez un serment sacrifier à l'engagement qu'ils ont pris à votre égard leur propre vie, leurs parents, leur patrie et tous leurs intérêts . . .” But Roman oaths of allegiance did not require the soldiers to place an emperor above the fatherland. Consequently, delete καὶ πατρίδος as a gloss and understand τῶν οἰκείων to mean “and the soldiers' relatives.” Compare, e.g., Suet. *Calig.* 15. 3 . . . *ut omnibus sacramentis adicerentur: “Neque me liberosque meos cariores habebō quam Gaium habeo et sorores eius”*; Tertull. *De corona* 11 *Credimusne humanum sacramentum divino superduci licere et in alium dominum respondere post Christum et eierare patrem et matrem et omnem proximum, quos et lex honorari et post deum diligi praecepit . . . ?*

41. 3–4: Λάβετε χάριν καὶ εἰσέλθετε κατὰ πρόσωπον αὐτοῦ καὶ προσκυνήσατε ἐν αὐλαῖς ἀγίαις αὐτοῦ . . . Εὐφρανθήτωσαν ἐν τοῖς ἔθνεσιν· Ὁ κύριος ἐβασίλευσεν ἀπὸ τοῦ ξύλου. Read καὶ προσκυνήσατε <τῷ κυρίῳ> ἐν αὐλαῖς and Εὐφρανθήτωσαν <καὶ εἰπάτωσαν> ἐν τοῖς ἔθνεσιν, which is confirmed by LXX I Chron. 16. 29 and 31; Ps. 95 (96). 8b + 9a + 11a + 10a and by Justin's *Dial.* 73. 4.

43. 2 (We agree with the prophecies about the punishments and rewards after death.): Τὰς τιμωρίας καὶ τὰς κολάσεις καὶ τὰς ἀγαθὰς ἀμοιβὰς κατ' ἀξίαν τῶν πράξεων ἐκάστου ἀποδίδοσθαι διὰ τῶν προφητῶν μαθόντες καὶ ἀληθὲς ἀποφαινόμεθα. Read μαθόντες <δίκαιον> καὶ ἀληθὲς ἀποφαινόμεθα and compare 12. 11 (δίκαιά τε

καὶ ἀληθῆ ἀξιούμεν) and 43. 6. Incidentally, read ἐκάστῳ (with Thirlby and Ashton) for the transmitted ἐκάστου.

44. 8 (Plato borrowed wisdom from Moses.): "Ὡστε καὶ Πλάτων εἰπὼν· "Αἰτία ἐλομένου, θεὸς δ' ἀναίτιος,"⁷ παρὰ Μωσέως τοῦ προφήτου λαβὼν εἶπε· πρεσβύτερος γὰρ Μωσῆς καὶ πάντων τῶν ἐν "Ἑλλῆσι συγγραφέων."⁸ Read πρεσβύτερος γὰρ Μωσῆς (= A) <καὶ Πλάτωνος> καὶ πάντων τῶν ἐν "Ἑλλῆσι συγγραφέων.

48. 2 (the miracles of Christ): Τῇ παρουσίᾳ αὐτοῦ . . . τυφλοὶ ἀναβλέψουσι καὶ λεπροὶ καθαρισθήσονται καὶ νεκροὶ ἀναστήσονται καὶ περιπατήσουσιν. Read καὶ νεκροὶ ἀναστήσονται καὶ <χωλοὶ> περιπατήσουσιν = Matthew 11. 5.

54. 6 (The evil demons imitated Moses' prophecies about Christ in their myth about Dionysus.): Τούτων οὖν τῶν προφητικῶν λόγων ἀκούσαντες οἱ δαίμονες Διόνυσον μὲν ἔφασαν γεγονέναι υἱὸν τοῦ Διός, . . . καὶ διασπαραχθέντα αὐτὸν⁹ ἀνεληλυθέναι εἰς οὐρανὸν ἐδίδαξαν. The important allusion to the resurrection of Christ is missing in the text. Thus read καὶ διασπαραχθέντα αὐτὸν <ἀναστήναι καὶ> ἀνεληλυθέναι εἰς οὐρανὸν . . . This is confirmed by Justin's *Dial.* 69. 2 "Ὅταν γὰρ Διόνυσον μὲν υἱὸν τοῦ Διός . . . γεγενῆσθαι λέγωσι . . . καὶ διασπαραχθέντα καὶ ἀποθανόντα ἀναστήναι, εἰς οὐρανὸν τε ἀνεληλυθέναι ἱστορῶσι . . .

60. 5 (Plato misunderstood Moses' "sign of the cross" at Numbers 21. 6-9 and wrote in *Timaeus* that the first God placed Christ in the universe in the shape of the letter X [36b7-8 and 34b3].): <"A"> ἀναγνοὺς Πλάτων καὶ μὴ ἀκριβῶς ἐπιστάμενος, μηδὲ νοήσας τύπον εἶναι σταυροῦ ἀλλὰ χίασμα νοήσας, τὴν μετὰ τὸν πρῶτον θεὸν δύναμιν κεχιάσθαι ἐν τῷ παντὶ εἶπε. Read μηδὲ νοήσας . . . , ἀλλὰ χίασμα νομίσας, . . .

61. 4-5: Καὶ γὰρ ὁ Χριστὸς εἶπεν· "Ἄν μὴ ἀναγεννηθῆτε, οὐ μὴ εἰσέλθητε εἰς τὴν βασιλείαν τῶν οὐρανῶν" (= John 3. 5 + Matthew 18. 3). "Ὅτι δὲ καὶ ἀδύνατον εἰς τὰς μήτρας τῶν τεκουσῶν τοὺς ἀπαξ γεννωμένους ἐμβῆναι, φανερόν πᾶσιν ἐστὶ. The main purpose of baptism is regeneration, and it is missing in the second sentence. In

⁷ Plat. *Rep.* 10. 617e4.

⁸ The source is Aristobulus the Jew ap. Clem. *Strom.* 1. 150. 1-3; ap. Eus. *Praep. ev.* 11. 9. 4-5, 13. 12. 3-4 et al. Compare Philo *De spec. legg.* 4. 61; *Leg. alleg.* 1. 108; *Quis rerum div. heres* 214; *Quod omnis probus liber* 57; *Quaest. in Gen.* 3. 5 s.f., 5. 152; Ps.-Justin *Cohort.* 14. 2; Min. Fel. *Oct.* 34. 5 et al.

⁹ Compare Aristid. *Apol.* 10. 8; Clem. *Protr.* 17. 2; Orig. *C. Cels.* 3. 23; *Acta Apollonii* 22; Amob. *Adv. nat.* 1. 41, 5. 19; Ps.-Nonnus *Hist. Gregorii in Iulian.*: ad Greg. *Orat. II c. Iul.* 35 (PG XXXVI 1053C); *Alcestis Barcinon.* 62 ed. Marcovich.

addition, editors have not recognized that it is a free quotation of John 3. 4. Consequently, read "Ὅτι δὲ καὶ ἄδύνατον εἰς τὰς μήτρας τῶν τεκουσῶν τοὺς ἅπαξ γεννωμένους ἐμβῆναι <καὶ ἀναγεννηθῆναι>," φανερόν πᾶσιν ἐστὶ. John 3. 4 reads: Πῶς δύναται ἄνθρωπος γεννηθῆναι γέρον ὦν; Μὴ δύναται εἰς τὴν κοιλίαν τῆς μητρὸς αὐτοῦ δεύτερον εἰσελθεῖν καὶ γεννηθῆναι;

63. 10 (the Logos Incarnate): . . . νῦν δὲ διὰ θελήματος θεοῦ ὑπὲρ τοῦ ἀνθρωπέου γένους ἄνθρωπος γενόμενος [sc. Λόγος] ὑπέμεινε καὶ παθεῖν ὅσα αὐτὸν ἐνήργησαν οἱ δαίμονες διατεθῆναι ὑπὸ τῶν ἀνοήτων Ἰουδαίων. The word καὶ attests to a lacuna after ὑπέμεινε. This is confirmed by 63. 16 . . . νῦν δ' . . . διὰ παρθένου ἄνθρωπος γενόμενος κατὰ τὴν τοῦ πατρὸς βουλήν ὑπὲρ σωτηρίας τῶν πιστευόντων αὐτῷ καὶ ἐξουθενηθῆναι καὶ παθεῖν ὑπέμεινε . . .

65. 3 (the Eucharist following a baptism): "Ἐπειτα προσφέρεται τῷ προεστῶτι τῶν ἀδελφῶν ἄρτος καὶ ποτήριον ὕδατος καὶ κράματος . . . Since τὸ κράμα usually means "wine mixed with water," Ashton deleted the word ὕδατος, while Harnack followed Ottobonianus gr. 274, which omits καὶ κράματος, strangely believing that the early Eucharist consisted of bread and water alone.¹⁰ The simplest solution is to read ποτήρια for ποτήριον. A deacon brings bread and two chalices, one with wine, the other with water. The word κράμα means here οἶνος, as is confirmed by 65. 5 μεταλαβεῖν ἀπὸ τοῦ εὐχαριστηθέντος ἄρτου καὶ οἴνου καὶ ὕδατος and 67. 5 ἄρτος προσφέρεται καὶ οἶνος καὶ ὕδωρ.

As for the equation κράμα = οἶνος, compare Song of Solomon 7. 2 (3); Plut. *Praec. coniug.* 20 (140f) τὸ κράμα, καίτοι ὕδατος μετέχον πλείονος, οἶνον καλοῦμεν; Theodoret. *Eran.* 1 (PG LXXXIII 56A) σῶμα τὸν ἄρτον ἐκάλεσε, καὶ αἷμα τὸ κράμα; Modern Greek κρασί = οἶνος.

For the use of "wine mixed with water" in the early Eucharist compare Iren. *Adv. haer.* 1. 13. 2 ποτήριον οἴνῳ κεκραμένον (versio Lat. et Hippol.): ποτήρια οἴνῳ κεκραμένα (Eriphan.—the same error is in our text), 4. 33. 2 καὶ τὸ κράμα τοῦ ποτηρίου ἴδιον αἷμα διεβεβαίουτο [sc. ὁ Κύριος], 5. 2. 3 τὸ κεκραμένον ποτήριον; Clem. *Paed.* 2. 20. 1 κίρναια ὁ μὲν οἶνος τῷ ὕδατι . . . ; Cyprian *Ep.* 63. 13 *Sic autem in sanctificando calice Domini offerri aqua sola non potest, quomodo nec vinum solum potest . . .*; *Constit. apost.* 8. 12. 37 Ὡσαύτως καὶ τὸ ποτήριον κεράσας ἐξ οἴνου καὶ ὕδατος . . .

¹⁰ A. Hamack, T.U. VII.2 (1891) 117–44, esp. 130. But Ottobonianus is an unreliable manuscript. For example, at 67. 8 it omits one whole line of its exemplar. The fact that the initiates of Mithra offered to their god bread and water (*CIL* VI 3722a; compare M. Clauss, *Mithras: Kult und Mysterien* [Munich 1990] 117–22) proves nothing. Two out of three elements common to the Christians and Mithra were a sufficient reason for Justin to proclaim that Mithra was a copy of Christ (*I Apology* 66. 4).

Apologia Minor

1. 1 (Willy-nilly you Romans are our brothers.): ... ὑπὲρ ὑμῶν, ὁμοιοπαθῶν ὄντων καὶ ἀδελφῶν, κἂν ἀγνοῆτε καὶ μὴ θέλητε ... Read καὶ <εἶναι> μὴ θέλητε.

1. 2 (We Christians are being exterminated by incorrigible criminals, instigated by the evil demons.): Πανταχοῦ γάρ, ὅς ἂν σωφρονίζεται ὑπὸ πατρὸς ἢ γείτονος ἢ τέκνου ἢ φίλου ἢ ἀδελφοῦ ἢ ἀνδρὸς ἢ γυναικὸς κατ' ἔλλειψιν, ... καὶ οἱ φαῦλοι δαίμονες, ... φονεύειν ἡμᾶς παρασκευάζουσιν. Wartelle translates: "Partout, en effet, les gens qui devraient apprendre ce qui leur manque de sagesse auprès d'un père, d'un voisin, d'un fils, d'un ami, d'un frère, d'un mari, d'une épouse ..." But σωφρονίζεσθαι means here "to be corrected (castigated)," as it does at 2. 2 (a sinful woman ἐπει<δῆ> δὲ τὰ τοῦ Χριστοῦ διδάγματα ἔγνω, αὐτὴ <τε> ἐσωφρονίσθη ...). Consequently, read ὅς<τις> (Ashton) ἂν <μῆ> σωφρονίζεται ὑπὸ πατρὸς ..., i.e., any incorrigible sinner becomes a servant of the evil demons.

3 (8). 6 (Crescens the Cynic and Socrates): ... διὰ τοὺς ἀκούοντας δὲ οὐ τολμᾶ λέγειν, ὁμοίως Σωκράτει ..., ὅς γε μηδὲ τὸ Σωκρατικὸν ἀξιέραστον ὄν τιμᾶ. "Ἄλλ' οὐτι γε πρὸ τῆς ἀληθείας τιμητέος ἀνὴρ." Read <ἀν>ὁμοίως Σωκράτει. *Unlike* Socrates, Crescens is too afraid to tell the truth (about Christ), disregarding Socrates' admirable words: "No man should be put above the truth" (Plato *Rep.* 10. 595c2-3).

6 (5). 3 (another etymology of the name Christ): Χριστὸς μὲν κατὰ τὸ κεχρῖσθαι καὶ κοσμησαί τὰ πάντα δι' αὐτοῦ τὸν θεὸν λέγεται. Wartelle translates: "il est appelé Christ, parce qu'il a reçu l'onction et que Dieu a mis l'ordre dans l'univers par lui." The etymology, Christ or Messiah, the anointed One, is out of place here. *Κεχρῖσθαι* is medial here and means "to caulk." Christ is called so because through Him God "caulked" and arranged all things. Compare Theophilus *Ad Autol.* 1. 12 Ποῖον γὰρ πλοῖον δύναται εὐχρηστον εἶναι καὶ σώζεσθαι, ἐὰν μὴ πρῶτον χρισθῆ; Ἡ ποῖος πύργος ἢ οἰκία εὐμορφος καὶ εὐχρηστός ἐστιν, ἐπὶ οὐ κέχρισται; ... Ποῖον δὲ ἔργον ἢ κόσμιον δύναται εὐμορφίαν ἔχειν, ἐὰν μὴ χρισθῆ καὶ στιλβῶθῆ; (Of course, εὐχρηστος alludes to Χρηστός.)

7 (6). 1 (It is for the Christians' sake that God delays the end of the world.): "Θεὸν καὶ ἐπιμένει ὁ θεὸς τὴν σύγχυσιν καὶ κατάλυσιν τοῦ παντὸς κόσμου μὴ ποιῆσαι ..., διὰ τὸ σπέρμα τῶν Χριστιανῶν, ὃ γινώσκει ἐν τῇ φύσει ὅτι αἰτίον ἐστιν. "De là vient que Dieu retarde la réalisation du bouleversement et de la destruction du monde entier ..., en

vertu de la famille des chrétiens qu'il reconnaît dans la nature pour être la cause de ce dé lai," translates Wartelle. The words ἐν τῇ φύσει speak against the interpretation αἴτιον τῆς ἐπιμονῆς. Read instead ὁ γινώσκει ἐν τῇ φύσει ὅτι <τοῦ ζῆν> αἴτιόν ἐστιν and compare Justin's source, Aristid. *Apol.* 16. 1 and 6, "wegen des Flehens der Christen die Welt besteht" (Geffcken 92 f. and 94).

8 (7). 1 (Thanks to the seed of the Logos, implanted in all mankind, the philosophers were able to grasp a part of the truth. And that is why the evil demons hated them so much.): Καὶ τοὺς ἀπὸ τῶν Στωϊκῶν δὲ δογμάτων ... διὰ τὸ ἔμφυτον παντὶ γένει ἀνθρώπων σπέρμα τοῦ Λόγου, μεμισῆσθαι καὶ πεφονεῦσθαι οἶδαμεν· Ἡράκλειτον μὲν ... καὶ Μουσώνιον δὲ ἐν τοῖς καθ' ἡμᾶς καὶ ἄλλους οἶδαμεν. Heraclitus and Musonius may have been hated, but they were not killed. Thus delete the words καὶ πεφονεῦσθαι as a gloss inspired by the death of Socrates. The subsequent text speaks only of μισεῖσθαι (8. 2 and 3). Incidentally, delete the second οἶδαμεν as a dittography.

11. 4 (Heracles at the crossroads): Καὶ τὴν μὲν Κακίαν, ἀβρᾶ ἐσθῆτι καὶ ἐρωτοπεποιημένῳ καὶ ἀνθοῦντι ἐκ τῶν τοιούτων προσώπῳ ... , εἰπεῖν πρὸς τὸν Ἡρακλέα ... Read ἐκ τῶν τοιούτων <χρωμάτων> προσώπῳ and compare Prodicus (fr. 2 D-K) ap. Xenoph. *Memorab.* 2. 1. 21-28.¹¹

11. 8 (Death is inevitable for any born man.): ὁ καὶ περὶ Χριστιανῶν ... ὑπολαβεῖν δεῖ πάντα <ν>συνεχῆ,¹² ἐκ τοῦ καὶ τοῦ φευκτοῦ καταφρονεῖν ἡμᾶς θανάτου λογισμὸν ἔλκοντα. "... tout esprit sensé doit le concevoir en tirant argument du mépris que nous manifestons pour la mort que, justement, tout le monde fuit," translates Wartelle. But Justin's argument is this: "Every man who is born must die: Death is an inevitable debt for everyone, and we Christians pay it with gratitude." Consequently, read ἐκ τοῦ τοῦ μὴ φευκτοῦ καταφρονεῖν ἡμᾶς θανάτου λογισμὸν ἔλκοντα and compare 11. 1 ... εἰ μὴ πάντως παντὶ γεννωμένῳ καὶ θανεῖν ὀφείλετο· ὅθεν καὶ τὸ ὄφλημα ἀποδιδόντες εὐχαριστοῦμεν.¹³

12. 4 (Our enemies impute to us the crimes they themselves commit.): Φονεύοντες γὰρ αὐτοὶ τινὰς ἐπὶ συκοφαντίᾳ τῇ εἰς ἡμᾶς, καὶ εἰς βασιάνους εἴλκυσαν οἰκέτας τῶν ἡμετέρων ἢ παιδῆς ἢ γυναῖκα, καὶ

¹¹ Also in Philo *De sacrif. Abel.* 20-34; Max. Tyr. *Or.* 14. 1a-d; Clem. *Paed.* 2. 110. 1; Themist. *Or.* 22. 280a; Cic. *De officiis* 1. 18 et al.

¹² <ν>συνεχῆ Thirlby: οὐν ἔχει A.

¹³ At I *Apology* 11. 2 Justin alludes to Eurip. *Alc.* 419, 782 (βροτοῖς ἅπασι κατθανεῖν ὀφείλεται), *Androm.* 1271 f., as does Philo *De aet. mundi* 27.

δι' αίκισμῶν φοβερῶν ἐξαναγκάζουσι κατεπειν ταῦτα τὰ μυθολογούμενα, ἃ αὐτοὶ φανερώς πράττουσιν. Read instead Φονεύ<σ>αντες γὰρ αὐτοὶ τινες ἐπὶ συκοφαντία τῇ εἰς ἡμᾶς, <συνέλαβον> καὶ εἰς βασάνους εἴλκυσαν οἰκέτας τῶν ἡμετέρων ... , καὶ δι' αίκισμῶν φοβερῶν ἐξαναγκάζουσι κατεπειν <ἡμῶν> ταῦτα ... , and compare Eus. *HE* 5. 1. 14 συνελαμβάνοντο δὲ καὶ ἔθνικοί τινες οἰκέται τῶν ἡμετέρων ... οἱ ... φοβηθέντες τὰς βασάνους ... κατεψεύσαντο ἡμῶν Θυέστεια δεῖπνα καὶ Οἰδιποδείους μίξεις ...

14. 2 (By punishing us for the crimes they themselves commit our enemies only condemn themselves.): ἐκ τοῦ [καὶ δελεῖν] ἡμῖν, ὡς τοιαῦτα πράττουσι, θάνατον ἢ δεσμὰ ἢ ἄλλο τι τοιοῦτον προστιμᾶν [Thirlby: πρόστιμον A] ἑαυτοὺς κατακρίνειν ... Read ἢ ἄλλο τι τοιοῦτον πρόστιμον <κρίνειν> ἑαυτοὺς κατακρίνειν.

15. 3 (Our doctrine is far away from the works of Sotades, Philaenis, Arcestratus or Epicurus; and yet you persecute us while allowing everyone to read their works.): ... εἰ δὲ μή, κἂν Σωταδεῖοις καὶ Φιλαινιδεῖοις καὶ Ἀρχεστρατεῖοις καὶ Ἐπικουρεῖοις καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις τοῖς τοιούτοις ποιητικοῖς διδάγμασιν οὐχ ὅμοια [sc. ἡμῶν τὰ διδάγματα], οἷς ἐντυγχάνειν πᾶσι ... συγκεχώρηται. E. Leutsch emended the transmitted ὀρχηστ(τ)ικοῖς to Ἀρχεστρατεῖοις.¹⁴ Fr. Buecheler defended ὀρχηστικοῖς¹⁵ but I think it is defenseless in view of the fact that the group Arcestratus, Philaenis and Epicurus appears together in Athenaeus 3. 104b, 8. 335b, 10. 457d–e. His source is Chrysippus, which may suggest that Justin is using a Stoic source here.

Appendix:

Marcus Aurelius to the Senate: A Christian Legend (A f. 240^r–41^r)

In Germany Marcus Aurelius is besieged by 77,000 Quads and Sarmats:

Wartelle (p. 222.2–11):

Φανερά ὑμῖν ἐποίησα τὰ τοῦ ἐμοῦ σκοποῦ μεγέθη, ὅποια ἐν τῇ Γερμανίᾳ ἐκ περιστάσεως διὰ περιβολῆς ἐπακολουθήματα ἐποίησα ἐν τῇ μεθορίᾳ καμῶν καὶ

Read:

Φανερά ὑμῖν ποιήσω τὰ τοῦ ἐμοῦ σκοποῦ μεγέθη, <δείξας> ὅποια ἐν τῇ Γερμανίᾳ ἐκ περιστάσεως διὰ περιβολῆς ἐπακολουθήματα [5] ἐποίησα, ἐν τῇ μεθορίᾳ

¹⁴ *Philol.* 20 (1863) 465.

¹⁵ *Rhein. Mus.* 35 (1880) 285.

παθών, ἐν Καρνούτῳ καταλαμ-
βανομένου μου ὑπὸ δρακόντων
ἑβδομήκοντα τεσσάρων ἀπὸ μι-
λίων ἑννέα. Γενομένων δὲ αὐ-
τῶν ἐγγὺς ἡμῶν ἐξπλωράτωρες
ἐμήνυσαν ἡμῖν καὶ Πομπηϊανὸς
ὁ ἡμέτερος πολέμαρχος ἐδήλωσεν
ἡμῖν ἅτινα εἶδομεν (καταλαμ-
βανόμενος δὲ ἡμῖν ἐν μεγέθει
πλήθους ἀμίκτου, καὶ στρατευ-
μάτων λεγεῶνος πρίμας, δεκάτης,
γεμίνας, φρενησίας μίγμα κατη-
ριθμημένον), πλήθη παρεῖναι
παμμίκτου ὄχλου χιλιάδων ἑνα-
κοσίων ἑβδομήκοντα ἑπτά.

Κ<ου>άδων καὶ Σ<αρ>ματῶν ἐν
Κοτινοῖς καταλαμβανομένου μου
ὑπὸ δρακόντων ἑβδομήκοντα ἑ-
πτὰ * ἀπὸ μιλίων ἑννέα. Γενο-
[10]μένων δὲ αὐτῶν ἐγγὺς ἡμῶν
ἐξπλωράτωρες ἐμήνυσαν ἡμῖν
καὶ Πομπηϊανὸς ὁ ἡμέτερος
πολέμαρχος ἐδήλωσεν ἡμῖν ἅτινα
εἶδομεν (καταλαμβανόμενος γὰρ
[15] ἡμῖν ἐν μεγέθει πλήθους ἀ-
μίκτου καὶ στρατεύματ<α ἔχ>ων
λεγεῶνος πρίμας, δεκάτης γεμί-
να<ς> <καὶ> Φρενησία<ς> μίγμα
κατηριθμημένον): πλήθη παρεῖ-
[20]ναι παμμίκτου ὄχλου <τῶν>
ἐναντίων χιλιάδων ἑβδομήκοντα
ἑπτά.

1 ποιήσω scripsi: ἐποίησα A (cf.
5) || 2 δεῖξας supplevi || 6 Κουάδων
καὶ Σαρματῶν Sylburg: καμῶν καὶ
σπαθῶν A: καμῶν καὶ παθῶν
Lange et Scaliger || 7 Κοτινοῖς
Harnack¹⁶: κοτίνω A: Καρνούτῳ
Panuinius¹⁷ || 8-9 ἑπτὰ scripsi (cf.
22): τεσσάρων A | ante ἀπὸ lacunam
statuit Geffcken¹⁸ (nomen oppidi
desideratur) || 14 γὰρ scripsi: δὲ A ||
16 στρατεύματ<α ἔχ>ων scripsi:
στρατευμάτων A || 17-18 γεμί-
να<ς> <καὶ> Φρενησία<ς> scrip-
si: γεμιναφρενησια A, corr.
Panuinius (qui legit: legiones
primam Geminam et decimam
Fretensem) || 20-21 <τῶν> ἐναν-
τίων χιλιάδων scripsi conl. Greg.
Nysseni *Or. Ib in XL martyres*, p.
146 s. Lendle (*PG XLVI 757 s.*):
χιλιάδων ἑνακοσίων A

We learn from Lucian (*Hist. conscrib.* 29) that "dragon" is a military unit consisting of 1,000 men (χιλίους γὰρ οἶμαι ὁ δράκων ἄγει). Consequently, in lines 8-9 we should read "seven" for the transmitted

¹⁶ A. Hamack, "Die Quelle der Berichte über das Regenwunder im Feldzuge Marc Aurel's gegen die Quaden," *SBBA* (1894) 2. 835-82. Cotini is mentioned in Xiphilinus (*Dio Cass.* 71. 12).

¹⁷ Onuphrius Panuinius, *Fastorum libri V* (Venetiis 1558) 349 f. and in Sylburg 439 f.

¹⁸ J. Geffcken, *Neue Jahrb. f. d. klass. Altertum* 2 (1899) 253-69.

"four," and in line 21 ἐναντίων for the transmitted ἐννακοσίων. The total number of Quads and Sarmats facing Marcus is 77 dragons = 77,000 men.

The text of lines 16–19 means, "and I had with me the armies of the legions First and Tenth-Gemina, in addition to a limited detachment of the legion Fretense."¹⁹

Abandoned by the Roman gods, Marcus appeals to his Christian soldiers:

Wartelle (p. 222.14–19):

... παρεκάλεσα τοὺς παρ' ἡμῖν λεγομένους Χριστιανούς· καὶ ἐπερωτήσας εὐρον πλήθος καὶ μέγεθος αὐτῶν, καὶ ἐμβριμησάμενος εἰς αὐτούς, ὅπερ οὐκ ἔπρεπε διὰ τὸ ὕστερον ἐπεγνωκέναι με τὴν δύναμιν αὐτῶν. "Ὅθεν ἀρξάμενοι οὐ βελῶν παράρτησιν οὔτε ὄπλων οὔτε σαλπίγγων, διὰ τὸ ἐχθρὸν εἶναι τὸ τοιοῦτο αὐτοῖς διὰ τὸν Θεόν, ὃν φοροῦσι κατὰ συνείδησιν.

Read:

... παρεκάλεσα τοὺς παρ' ἡμῖν λεγομένους Χριστιανούς, καὶ ἐπερωτήσας εὐρον πλήθος παμμέγεθες αὐτῶν, καὶ <ἐβόων> ἐμ- [5]βριμησάμενος εἰς αὐτούς (ὅπερ οὐκ ἔπρεπε διὰ τὸ ὕστερον ἐπεγνωκέναι με τὴν δύναμιν αὐτῶν). "Ὅθεν <οὐν ὄρμᾶν> ἀρξάμενοι<ς> οὐ βελῶν παράρτυσις οὔτε [10] ὄπλων οὔτε σαλπίγγων διὰ τὸ ἐχθρὸν εἶναι τὸ τοιοῦτο αὐτοῖς διὰ τὸν Θεόν, ὃν φοροῦσι κατὰ συνείδησιν.

3–4 παμμέγεθες H. O. Hirschfeld: καὶ μέγεθος A || 4 ἐβόων supplevi || 8 οὐν ὄρμᾶν supplevi || 8–9 ἀρξάμενοι<ς> scripsi: ἀρξάμενοι A || 9 παράρτυσις scripsi (παράρτυσιν iam Geffcken): παράρτησιν A || 10 post σαλπίγγων lacunam statuit Harnack

There are two lacunae in the text, ἐβόων in line 4 and οὐν ὄρμᾶν in line 8. The closest parallel seems to be Gregory of Nyssa *Or. Ib in XL martyres*, p. 146. 22 Lendle (= PG XLVI 760): τότε καταλιπόντες οἱ γενναῖοι [sc. οἱ Χριστιανοὶ] τὴν ἐκ τῶν ὄπλων βοήθειαν ἔγνωσαν τὴν ἄμαχον καὶ ἀκαταγώνιστον ἐν τοῖς φοβεροῖς συμμαχίαν.

The Christians pray to God for rain:

¹⁹ Compare E. Ritterling, *RE* XII (1925) 1686.

Wartelle (pp. 222.20–224.26):

Ῥίψαντες γὰρ ἑαυτοὺς ἐπὶ τὴν γῆν οὐχ ὑπὲρ ἑμοῦ μόνον ἐδεήθησαν ἀλλὰ καὶ ὑπὲρ τοῦ παρόντος στρατεύματος, παρήγορον γενέσθαι δίψης καὶ λιμοῦ τῆς παρούσης. Πεμπταῖοι γὰρ ὕδωρ οὐκ εἰλήφειμεν διὰ τὸ μὴ παρ-εῖναι· ἡμεν γὰρ ἐν τῷ μεσομάλῳ τῆς Γερμανίας καὶ τοῖς ὄροις αὐτῶν. Ἄμα δὲ τῷ τούτους ρίψαι ἐπὶ τὴν γῆν ἑαυτοὺς καὶ εὐχέσθαι Θεῷ, ᾧ ἐγὼ ἡγνόουν, εὐθέως ὕδωρ ἠκολούθει οὐρανόθεν . . .

Read:

Ῥίψαντες γοῦν ἑαυτοὺς ἐπὶ τὴν γῆν οὐχ ὑπὲρ ἑμοῦ μόνον ἐδεήθησαν <θεοῦ>, ἀλλὰ καὶ ὑπὲρ τοῦ παντός στρατεύματος, παρ-[5]ήγορον γενέσθαι δίψης [καὶ λιμοῦ] τῆς παρούσης. Πεμπταῖοι γὰρ ὕδωρ οὐκ εἰλήφειμεν διὰ τὸ μὴ παρ-εῖναι· ἡμεν γὰρ ἐν τῷ μεσομάλῳ τῆς Γερμανίας κἀν τοῖς [10] ὄροις <Σαρμ>ατῶν. Ἄμα δὲ τῷ τούτους ρίψαι ἐπὶ τὴν γῆν ἑαυτοὺς καὶ εὐχέσθαι Θεῷ, ᾧ ἐγὼ ἡγνόουν, εὐθέως ὕδωρ ἠκολούθει οὐρανόθεν . . .

1 γοῦν scripsi: γὰρ A || 3 θεοῦ addidi (cf. 12) post Ios. Scaligerum || 4 παντός Panuius: παρόντος A (cf. 6) || 4–5 παρήγορον Scaliger: παρήγοροι A || 5–6 καὶ λιμοῦ seclusi || 9 κἀν scripsi: καὶ A || 10 <Σαρμ>ατῶν Hirschfeld: αὐτῶν A || 11 τούτους Sylburg: τούτοις A

The words καὶ λιμοῦ are a gloss: The Roman army suffered from thirst alone. Compare Iul. Capitol. *M. Anton.* 24. 4 (*suis pluvia impetrata, cum sibi laborarent*); Apollinaris ap. Eus. *HE* 5. 51–56 (. . . ὄμβρον δὲ ἐπὶ τὴν τῶν τὸ θεῖον παρακεκληκότων στρατιὰν <ἀναρραγέντα supplevi>, πᾶσαν αὐτὴν ἐκ τοῦ δίψους μέλλουσιν ὅσον οὐπω διαφθείρεσθαι, ἀνακτώμενον); Tertull. *Apolog.* 5. 6 (*illam Germanicam sitim*); Xiphilinus (Dio Cass. 71. 8. 1–10. 5 = III 259–61 Boissevain); *Orac. Sibyll.* 12. 194–200 et al.

University of Illinois at Urbana–Champaign