

















































In this chapter I seek to reiterate the evolution of social thought concerning racial attitudes from the 1870 to 1937. Intellectuals of the time influenced and *were* influenced by cultural productions that engaged primarily with science and the concerns of the future of Brazil as a viable nation-state. This chapter will highlight this era's "scientifism" and then show its progression through time towards a more nationalist critique made by a generation who were disillusioned with Europe and more confident in Brazil. Fundamentally, the question that I tease out of this chapter is how these men intertwined the issues of Race with the concerns over "Progress" throughout time. I aim to show that intellectuals unfortunately did not change their views of minorities that drastically, but rather gradually. The basic underlying structure of racial thought remained the same throughout these years: a hierarchy established with Blacks and Indians at the bottom and Whites at the top. Thus a difficult question arose: If Brazil is a multiracial society and if non-Whites are inferior, then what does this mean for Brazilian history? Or, more importantly, what does this mean for Brazil's future as a viable nation and its hopes for Progress? What I will argue is that in the midst of a fervent desire to modernize Brazil, the Republicans sought to do just that: make Brazil "modern." Modern, to these intellectuals, meant European. Thus, to make Brazil a modern country meant that Brazil had to become a tropical Europe. While Europe had always been the model for Brazil, in the late nineteenth and early eighteenth century, race became an increasingly important focus in explaining reasons for European advancement. Therefore, intellectuals in Brazil began focusing on non-European aspects (e.g. race) for Brazil as a negative. Thus, these scholars linked what they perceived as Brazil's "backwardness" to the racial/ethnic composition of its people.

The first part of this chapter will be a brief description of intellectual trends from 1889-1919. The Second part focuses on the events from 1919-1930. This deals with the post-World

War I phase in the intellectual history of Brazil. During this time period intellectuals began to question the rationale behind the previous generation's allure to a Europe that, after the barbarism of the Great War, was seen as the antithesis of "Civilized." These new intellectuals epitomized the rejection of Europe with the rise of "Brazilian-centric" themes and xenophobic rhetoric against European immigrants that had been encouraged to go to Brazil to "whiten" the population. This infatuation and glorification of Brazilian themes culminated after the rise of Getúlio Vargas in the 1930s. During Vargas's time in office, there emerged a concept of "Brazilianess" of which the African –as will be discussed later- and African rituals emerged as a central, albeit subservient, basis of this identity.

In Brazil intellectuals in the 1870s were in the midst of two juxtaposing events: the Second Industrial Revolution and the War against Paraguay. Western European States, the United States and Japan were also industrializing rapidly during this period. Armed with new technologies, European States expanded their empires across the globe. For example, the scramble for Africa gained a feverish pitch in the latter half of the nineteenth century under the guise of bringing "civilization" to a "barbaric" world. In 1871 the German military defeated the French in the Franco-Prussian War, thus transforming the Prussian Empire into the German Empire. The expansions of European empires across the globe coupled with the technological achievements occurring in Europe created an atmosphere of the triumphalism of science and of *the European*<sup>33</sup>.

While these momentous changes were occurring around the world, Brazilians felt as though they were being left behind. The Imperial Regime's inability to mobilize resources

---

<sup>33</sup> Eric J. Hobsbawm, *Nations and Nationalism Since 1780: Programme, Myth, Reality*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 101-130.



effectively against Paraguay, a much smaller country, distressed many elites, especially in the Military and the younger modern generation.<sup>34</sup> Intellectuals from this generation were perplexed by the situation, and questioned what kind of country Brazil was, and was becoming (civilized vs. barbaric). They realized that it could not be a question of younger nations versus older nations, because the United States, a young nation, was on the rise. Pessimistic intellectuals sought to explain the “backwardness” of Brazil. As they interpreted it Brazil was still an agrarian economy based on slavery, while the advanced “German People” (the Germans and Anglo Saxons English and United States) reached their peak.

Many social thinkers of the 1870s and beyond became obsessed with “diagnosing” the ailments of the nation.<sup>35</sup> Reformers targeted the monarchy itself, because Dom Pedro II was a perfect symbol of the “old order” against which to rally. As Thomas Skidmore has suggested, “however enlightened Pedro II might have been, he stood at the apex of a hierarchical society based on human enslavement.”<sup>36</sup> With such an easily identifiable symbol as the Emperor, opponents of the monarchy placed blame upon him for all forms of failure of the government (failure of the State to mobilize adequately, corruption, political stagnation, lack of jobs, etc).<sup>37</sup> Thus, to those who sought to place Brazil on a track towards progress, the old regime had to be completely done away with.

Because of this growing anti-monarchical feelings on November 19, 1889 members of the military overthrew Pedro II and proclaimed the Brazilian State a Republic. Jubilant supporters of the Republic hailed it as a new tropical manifestation of the previous revolutions

---

<sup>34</sup> Thomas E. Skidmore, *Black into White: Race and Nationality in Brazilian Thought*, 5<sup>th</sup> ed. (Durham: Duke University Press, 2005), 7-14.

<sup>35</sup> Lilia Moritz Schwarcz, *The Spectacle of the Races: Scientists, Institutions, and the Race Question in Brazil 1870-1930*, trans by Leland Guyer (New York: Hill and Wang, 1993) see also Skidmore.

<sup>36</sup> Skidmore, 5.

<sup>37</sup> Carvalho *A Formação das Almas*, 25-26.

(e.g. the American, and especially the French Revolutions). For them, Brazil passed from being a nation of subjects to a nation of citizens. However, the Republic that was established was far from egalitarian. Carvalho explains the problems of the Brazilian “revolution” by comparing its reality to the conclusions of Hannah Ardent’s work on the American Revolution where she states that the “true” revolution that occurred in the United States occurred prior to America’s independence; for Brazil, this was not the case. “In Brazil, there was no prior revolution (as had occurred in the United States). Despite the abolition of slavery, society was still characterized by the profound inequality and concentration of power.”<sup>38</sup> Thus, in Brazil, the Republic was unable to become a progressive state and instead reflected the unequal society they had inherited. Unsurprisingly, the political bosses who controlled the levers of power during the Republic gave it a profoundly authoritarian nature.

More than on any ideas about social equality the advocates of the Republic attacked the Monarch, because of the idea that he inhibited Brazil’s “progress;” as such, it is important to understand what was meant by “progress.” Brazilian society has always been a Eurocentric society, especially among the elite circles. Economically Brazil also depended on Europe since Brazilian producers sold goods primarily to the European markets. Furthermore, Brazilian elites consumed all manner of cultural goods from Europe, particularly France. This connection with the French was especially evident during the *Belle Époque*. As a result members of the elite created a culture within their class that was heavily imitative of Europe.<sup>39</sup> Therefore, ideologically, many intellectuals felt drawn to ideas surrounding science, such as Positivism. While today it is easy to criticize the uncritical infatuation of these men with science, at that time it was difficult to deny the remarkable pace of the advancements. In his introduction to the third

---

<sup>38</sup> Carvalho *A Formação das Almas*, 25.

<sup>39</sup> Skidmore, 92-93.

volume of *História da Vida Privada no Brasil: República da Belle Époque à Era do Rádio*, Nicolau Sevcenko points to the remarkable advancements that occurred from the 1870s through the 1930s (everything from the telegraph, cars, airplanes to radios were introduced). Because of these advancements it becomes easier to understand how one might feel awe at the changes experienced from 1870 onward. Novais also points out that these advancements led to an unprecedented expansion of European Imperialism across the globe.<sup>40</sup> Underpinning these expansions were doctrines of racial superiority. Writing on the Euclides da Cunha's classic account of the military expedition that destroyed Canudos, Nicolas Sevcenko describes the military officers as "true representatives of the social, political and economic elites of the coastal capitals: always looking towards the old continent, on the other side of the Atlantic, and identifying with it."<sup>41</sup> Thus, Sevcenko argues that the defeat represented, not necessarily just a problem with the military, but with the elites themselves who sought progress in a European context. In this pursuit, the military sent its officers to train with European officers to prepare themselves to engage in European theatres of war against European enemies, because they assumed that European techniques would be better regardless of the context in which they were employed. When these officers returned to Brazil they failed, because everything their lessons taught them were not pertinent to their engagement at Canudos; after all Canudos was not Waterloo nor was Bahia Belgium.<sup>42</sup>

Although certainly not all of the elites -intellectuals or otherwise- were Positivists, their mere presence and importance is indicative of the power that Science had upon the minds of the elites at that time. Interestingly, there were multiple strands of these "scientific" movements

---

<sup>40</sup> Nicolau Sevcenko "Introdução. O Prelúdio Republicano, Astúcias da Ordem e Ilusões do Progresso" in *História da Vida Privada no Brasil: República: da Belle Époque à Era do Rádio*, ed. Fernando Novais and Nicolau Sevcenko (São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1998), 10-11.

<sup>41</sup> Sevcenko, 20.

<sup>42</sup> Sevcenko, 16-20.

amongst intellectuals of the time. Some were Positivists, others were Darwinians, and even others were evolutionists, however, what held the era together, intellectually, was a belief that progress came through science. Thus, the intellectuals of the times created “a kind of scientific ethos, an indiscriminate and vague ‘scientism.’”<sup>43</sup> Although “Scientism” was not a coherent set of rules, Schwarcz describes it as an overarching belief that science could unlock important truths about life and society. The term “Scientifism,” for her, describes the tendency that scholars had at that time of incorporating science into all types of work.<sup>44</sup> This predisposition is not surprising given the radical technological advancements that were underway during this period amongst the centers that were culturally highly influential for Brazilian elites (i.e. Europe). Scientifism achieved such wide acceptance that it affected various areas that would not be considered compatible with science (e.g. the humanities). For example, Students of Law saw the discipline as a science, with investigators believing that they could, with a certain amount of confidence, predict criminality based upon physical features.<sup>45</sup> Science, it was thought, would bring unquestionable progress to all social sectors.

However, the intellectual fervor for the Republic began to wane almost immediately. The economic crisis of the Encilhamento brought about increase in external debt and inflation.<sup>46</sup> As a consequence, dissidents in the State of Rio Grande do Sul rebelled from 1893-1895. There were also the military failures at Canudos, in which the government failed three times to take over the town. Furthermore, the first two Republican administrations Deodoro Fonseca (1889-

---

<sup>43</sup> Schwarcz, 30.

<sup>44</sup> Schwarcz, 29-34.

<sup>45</sup> Schwarcz, 168-233.

<sup>46</sup> The Encilhamento was an inflationary economic crisis that arose when in the first two years of the Republic (1890-1891). The then Minister of Finance, Rui Barbosa, deployed economic policies that sought to ease monetary policies and also facilitated the creation of corporations. However, the policies caused the government to lose control over the monetary policy. Boris Fausto, *História do Brasil* 13<sup>th</sup> ed. (São Paulo: Editora da Universidade de São Paulo, 2010) 252.

1891) and his successor, Floriano Peixoto (1891-1894)-both of whom were military men-, restricted civil liberties such as the freedom of speech and of the press in an effort to deal with the institutional crisis they faced. By comparison, Emperor Pedro II never rescinded these freedoms, thus making it harder to compare the Republic favorably against the King's supposed "tyrannical nature." These problems, among others, led to phrasings such as "this is not the republic of my dreams" and other comical parodies usually at the expense of Republican symbols.<sup>47</sup>

Despite the reservations that many held regarding the effectiveness of the Republic, after the administration of Prudente de Morais (1894-1898), another Paulista civilian became president, Campos Sales, thus consolidating the Republican political system. This newfound solidity was the result of an alliance amongst the political bosses throughout the country, which saw the presidency shift amongst a few powerful states (São Paulo, Minas Gerais, Rio de Janeiro). Indeed at this time the most important political unit was the State and not necessarily the Federal Government.<sup>48</sup>

Despite this political consolidation, members of the elite still worried greatly about the state of Brazil as a viable nation in the first decade of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Skidmore proposes that "although political stability appeared to have been achieved between 1898 and 1910, thereby giving satisfaction and relief to worried elite, they had been deeply disturbed by the upheaval of the 1890s."<sup>49</sup> Furthermore, he argues that the elites concerned themselves with the absence of what they saw as an "authentic" national culture based in part on political stability but also on an

---

<sup>47</sup> Carvalho, *A Formação das Almas*, 87.

<sup>48</sup> Fausto, *A História do Brasil*, 258-259.

<sup>49</sup> Skidmore, 84.

“authentic” national literature.<sup>50</sup> Schwarcz points out a similar trend amongst not only intellectuals, but also intellectual institutions of this time period; in her chapter on historical institutes she places the 1900-1914 period together with the 1890s as an “era of pessimism.”<sup>51</sup> “Thus, as the twentieth century began, a new way of understanding history began to prevail. To write history was to take part in a debate on contemporary problems and the uncertainties of the future as well as to integrate the era’s scientific advances.”<sup>52</sup> As such, individuals and institutions became concerned about, what they felt, were the deficiencies of the nation, both at present and historically.

In many ways the Republican era in Brazil is tied to the promise of “Progress,” and the disappointment with its unattainability. As mentioned previously, many positivists argued against the Monarchy in the belief that it was holding back Modernization and therefore that the State should be not a monarchy, but rather a Dictatorial Republic, an idea, which appealed to the military (which eventually carried out the overthrow of the Dom Pedro II), because the state would then be controlled by a small cadre of technocrats who would use science to govern.<sup>53</sup> However, despite the political change, progress did not come. Brazilians, as a result, became dissatisfied almost immediately with the failures of the Republic. Adding to this despair is the edenic myth surrounding Brazilian nature, which has been a part of the Brazilian imagination since the colonial era.<sup>54</sup> Behind this expression of patriotism linked to nature is cynicism as expressed by the joke: Brazil is the land of the future and always will be.<sup>55</sup> The joke itself parodies the assumptions held by many Brazilians –including those who tell the joke- that Brazil

---

<sup>50</sup> Skidmore, 78-123.

<sup>51</sup> Schwarcz, 131-136.

<sup>52</sup> Schwarcz, 135.

<sup>53</sup> Carvalho, *A Formação das Almas*, 27-29.

<sup>54</sup> Jose Murilo de Carvalho, “Dreams Come Untrue,” *Daedalus* 129 (2), Spring 2000. 57-82, 61.

<sup>55</sup> This joke is a play on a famous book by Stefan Zweig, in which he paints an extremely positive view of Brazil. Stefan Zweig, *Brazil: The Land of the Future*, trans. Andrew St. James (London: Cassell, 1942).

has almost everything imaginable to be a “great” power, except for the government, the politicians or its Portuguese colonial heritage, etc. This expectation of greatness is nothing new in Brazil. For example, Carvalho notes that even in the naming of the country, once it gained its independence, Brazil reflected this belief: Brazil was an *empire* rather than a kingdom, because it was believed that Brazil’s wealth in natural resources and sheer size *guaranteed* it a glorious future.<sup>56</sup> Yet, government after government failed to fulfill this great promise, thus, creating a disconnected space between imaginary progress (what should be) and the disappointment of reality (what is). Carvalho provides an excellent example of these failures by highlighting the Republican elites’ inability to create national symbols and “founding fathers” (the obvious exceptions is Tiradentes whose veneration is tied to his Christ-like imagery) that could resonate with all Brazilians. Because of this absence of heroes many continue to see the abundant nature as the appropriate symbol for the country.<sup>57</sup>

As the Brazilian elites felt an air of disappointment rise with every failure of the Republic they sought solace in social explanations for this malfunction. At this time (1870s -1930s), scholars considered arguments based on race to be perfectly acceptable. Many scholars took the works of Herbert Spencer and Charles Darwin to examine their own social realities. Fundamentally, these scholars (re)constructed a racial hierarchy with whites at the top of the pyramid of civilization. For example, the Italian-Argentine scholar, José Ingenieros, described in his book *Sociología Argentina* published between 1899 and 1913 that “[t]he superiority of the White race is an accepted fact, even amongst those who deny the existence of a struggle between the races.”<sup>58</sup> Whole societies (read races) were seen as singular bodies caught in Darwinian

---

<sup>56</sup> Carvalho, “Dreams Come Untrue,” 67

<sup>57</sup> Cavalho, “Dreams Come Untrue,” 57-82. And Carvalho *A Formação das Almas*, 55-73.

<sup>58</sup> Jose Ingenieros, *Sociologia Argentina*, 7th ed. (Buenos Aires: Editorial Losada S.A., 1946), 35.

struggles against each other for survival, with the caveat that whites were undeniably the superior race. Ingenieros argues in his book that a race's quantity and "quality," together with climate, determined the racial struggle with those white races best disposed to their natural climates "winning" in those lands (e.g. US, Canada, Argentina, Chile, Uruguay and Southern Brazil).<sup>59</sup> Ingenieros' basic premise of race and climate affecting the struggle for survival between "races" is emblematic of the international discussions (particularly within South America) about evolution; Brazil was no exception.

These discussions of national deficiencies implied serious problems with individual Brazilians. For intellectuals of the time an individual's flaws passed from generation to generation and were seen as not only problematic for a person's progeny, but also for the entire nation itself, as the nation extended itself from families.<sup>60</sup> Therefore, the backwardness of societies resulted from the unhealthiness or degeneracy of their individual members. This degeneracy could come in virtually any area: alcoholics, sexual deviants, prostitutes, criminals etc.<sup>61</sup> As such these groups of people became the main area of interests of the intellectual establishments in European countries. As Foucault argues, society changed the ways in which it sought to control these deviants. For example, prior to the 1870s the church and various local customs regulated sexual practices; afterwards the doctors began to assume greater control of these powers with great effect on society.<sup>62</sup> Doctors listened to the sexual acts committed, categorized each act and, more importantly, began creating adjectives to describe those acts as fundamental characteristics of the individuals who engage in them. Thus, "[t]he sodomite had

---

<sup>59</sup> Ingenieros.

<sup>60</sup> Dain Borges, "'Puffy, Ugly, Slothful and Inert': Degeneration in Brazilian Social Thought, 1880-1940" *Journal of Latin American Studies* 25 no. 2 (1993) 235-256: 236.

<sup>61</sup> Borges, 238.

<sup>62</sup> Michel Foucault, *The History of Sexuality: An Introduction Volume I*, trans by Robert Hurley (New York: Vintage Books, 1990), 36-49.



been a temporary aberration; the homosexual was now a species.”<sup>63</sup> This process of labeling and ordering extended to racial structures as well. However, few European scholars interested themselves with race given their generally uncritical acceptance of the assumption of White superiority.<sup>64</sup>

Contrary to their European counterparts Latin American scholars considered the issue of race immensely important. This interest could be explained by the prevalence of racially mixed population in Brazil, which constituted the largest and most visible segment of “degenerates” in Brazilian society, a space that would have been taken up by sexual deviants or criminals in Europe. The ideals of scientivism of the time meant that the racial hierarchy created in European scholarly circles influenced the intellectual milieu of Brazil, given the power European ideas had within the Brazilian “market of ideas.” This in turn reflected the power dynamics between intellectuals internationally; after all, intellectuals from Europe hardly read any works produced in Brazil.<sup>65</sup> This one-way exchange resulted from a lack of prestige due to Power differences, and also was the result of Brazilian scholars’ selection of reading material that was considered “inferior” academically within Europe for their Monogest stances on the issues of race.<sup>66</sup> Thus, these interactions created, reflected and reinforced an intellectual hegemony, which, formulated in the image of the “degenerate” an idea which “[l]ike any hegemonic idea or scientific ‘paradigm’, degeneration less often dictated conclusions rather than it provided a biased foundation for polemical debates and for contradictory elaborations.”<sup>67</sup> As such, concerns over the degenerates of the nation were similar to concerns over other problems of the nation, such as typhoid fever, or any other medical problem.

---

<sup>63</sup> Foucault, 43.

<sup>64</sup> Borges, 238.

<sup>65</sup> Borges, 239.

<sup>66</sup> Schwarcz, 42-43.

<sup>67</sup> Borges, 239.

At the base of these intellectual hegemonic ideas of degeneracy was the overall supremacy of scientism, which at this time gained greater strength. Oswaldo Cruz's success in eliminating yellow fever, small pox and the bubonic plague from Rio de Janeiro serves as a great example of how science and social concerns interacted. In the early years of the twentieth century Oswaldo Cruz was effectively given control over changes needed to eradicate the city of diseases. The changes that were undertaken targeted poor communities living in abandoned colonial houses. Furthermore, the treatment of these communities was myopic in the sense that the health care professionals thought only of the elimination of danger areas. Thus, houses were torn down, and previous tenants of those homes were forced further out of the city; thus riding the city of its degenerates. In 1904 a culmination point emerged when angry residents struck out and demanded an end to the vaccines.

The books of both Skidmore and Schwarcz relay how elites' concern over the "deficiencies" and diseases of Brazil eventually led them to racial issues of the country. Policy-makers made greater incursions into the Brazilian backlands and other poorer areas due to advances in railroad and other technologies. Medical expeditions went along in an effort to cure the ills of those people, just as they had cured the capital city. Doctors, however, dedicated themselves in eradicating all the causes they believed led to such conditions (including laziness).

In the vision of these (doctors), the pathological physical constitution extended itself to degenerative miscegenation that served to further increase the indolence of the nationals, laziness, lack of enthusiasm that was found in those residents of ranches and small cities, almost always lying about, smoking the pipe and sniffing powdered tobacco.<sup>68</sup>

---

<sup>68</sup> Maria Cristina Cortez Wissenbach, "Da Escravidão à Liberdade: Dimensões de uma Privacidade Possível," in *História da Vida Privada no: República: da Belle Époque à era do Rádio*, eds. Fernando A. Novais and Nicolau Sevcenko, (São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1998) 49-130, 67.

Thus, during the *Belle Époque* in Brazil the hegemony of science and belief in progress made the possibility of government intervention in one's private life including the racial outcomes of families a possibility. Nonetheless, it must be stated that, while these instances were discussed, few projects were ever even mentioned that focused on the sudden elimination of blacks (read genocide) or creating a concrete segregationist system, as was the case in the United States.

Because of this difference in racial formulations Skidmore and Schwarz share a similar argument in their works: that Brazilian intellectuals created a white supremacist ideology that was fundamentally different from the European model, even while borrowing heavily from it. As Skidmore states: “the whitening ideology squared with one of the most obvious facts of Brazilian social history -the existence of a large ‘middle cast,’ generally called ‘mulatto’.”<sup>69</sup> He further explains the creativity of this model:

By any objective physical characteristics it was nonsense to refer to such a single category as ‘mulato.’ Yet the Brazilians consistently did so, and their belief in such a category was an essential part of their race thinking. Given the experience of their multi-racial society, the whitening thesis offered Brazilians a rationale for what they believed was *already* happening. They borrowed racist theory from Europe and then discarded two of the principal assumptions –the innateness of racial differences and the degeneracy of mixed bloods-in order to formulate their own solution to the ‘negro problem.’<sup>70</sup>

Thus, Brazilian intellectuals took what European pseudo-scientists taught them about the human species and turned it around in an effort to create a way to effectively save Brazil from an inevitable decline into barbarism as contemporary theories of social Darwinism proposed. As Schwarcz argues, “Intellectuals oscillated between determinist models as they reflected upon them, and they found themselves in an uncomfortable place. Their position between the

---

<sup>69</sup> Skidmore, 77.

<sup>70</sup> Skidmore, 77.

exaltation of ‘national modernity’ and their recognition of the nation’s reality was untenable.”<sup>71</sup>

As such, Brazilian intellectuals argued that while whites were “obviously superior,” continued miscegenation and the presence of mulattos indicated that the nation was becoming progressively whiter, thus progressively *superior* and more *civilized*; that is, in the context of Brazil miscegenation was not negative, but rather the nation’s salvation. In this sense, both immigration and black people’s lower reproduction rates meant that whites, like the railroad and medicine were coming to all parts of Brazil to save it from the evils represented by the inferior races.

However, elites put the intellectual and social superiority of Europe after World War I into question. During the War itself Brazilians with the economic ability, benefited from having an increase in share of markets (which Sevcenko argues resulted from increasing sales to the belligerent nations of Europe, but which Werner Baer argues derived not of increasing sales to Europe but an increase in reaching higher capacity of industrialization constructed before the war).<sup>72</sup> Furthermore, Europe’s hegemony over Brazilian intellectuals lessened with war; after all, the nations believed to be at the acme of civilization showed remarkable barbarism. Thus, younger generations began to attack the intellectuals of the *Belle Époque* for adhering so strictly to European standards and for failing to mobilize to tackle Brazil’s fundamental problems, which for them was a lack of education and healthcare.<sup>73</sup> Oliveira Vianna, for example, chastised

---

<sup>71</sup> Schwarcz, 298.

<sup>72</sup> Sevcenko 1998, 34-37 and Werner Baer, *The Brazilian Economy: Growth and Development*, 6<sup>th</sup> ed. (Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2008), 33-34.

<sup>73</sup> Skidmore, 152-172.

Republican policies for being too grandiose and not being focused on-the-ground problems of the country.<sup>74</sup>

The attacks against the *Belle Époque* generation and their veneration of European standards began to emerge as early as the 1910's; however, the hegemonic belief in the primacy of science was not broken. If anything the attacks against the previous generation relied on assumptions that were based on the successes of science in clearing away many of the problems brought about by "race." The Jurist Francisco José de Oliveira Vianna, for example, took issue not with the application of scientific notions of evolution upon Brazilian society, but rather on the creation and application of *vast* laws of evolution to all parts of the world. In his *Evolução do Povo Brasileiro* -originally published in 1923- he argues that there are climatic factors that influence evolution within each country.<sup>75</sup> The argument relies on the idea that evolution applies at the local level, but not at the international level. Therefore, he constructs a paradoxical argument in which he calls for a conservative quasi aristocratic government in which the "Germanic" Brazilian elites control the non-Germanic population, while not adhering to international imperialism.

Nonetheless, Oliveira Vianna's writing indicates an occurring shift within intellectual circles that reflected greater confidence in the development of the nation. Skidmore relates the criticisms this way:

In the earlier period (1889-1910) the critics spoke from a less confident position, expressing a deep sense of uncertainty. The critics of the 1920s felt free to offer a straightforward nationalist critique of the Republican political system. Their view was that Brazil should not continue to copy foreign models of government

---

<sup>74</sup> Oliveira Viana and Jeffrey Needell, "History, Race, and the State in the Thought of Oliveira Viana," *The Hispanic American History Review* 75 no. 1 (Feb 1995), 1-30: 8.

<sup>75</sup> Francisco José de Oliveira Vianna, *Evolução do Povo Brasileiro*, 4th ed (Rio de Janeiro: José Olympio Editôra, 1956), 21-34.

implied a new faith in their own ability to come up with a workable political system reflecting the uniqueness of Brazil. This confidence came, in turn from a new confidence that the variable of race did not necessarily preclude Brazil's future as a great nation.<sup>76</sup>

Oliveira Vianna was at the cusp of this nationalist moment. He sought to address Brazil's problems with local answers, however, he still argued that the masses of Brazilians were, indeed, inferior as "these two barbaric races only become agents of civilization, that is they only become positive elements of eugenics for the formation of the superior classes when they lose their purity and they mix with the white race."<sup>77</sup> Therefore the two "barbaric races" civilized and bettered themselves with each successive generation that engaged in miscegenation with whites. An extreme example of this idea of climbing up the racial ladder is the conception that the Brazilian elites are relatively free from the degeneracy of inferior races because they are extremely light-skinned if not "purely European," due to their "eugenic cautiousness."

In the later part of the 1920s and into the 1930s this confidence in mixed races increased. In 1933 Gilberto Freyre culminated this trend with *Casa Grande & Senzala*, which considered racial mixture to be the prominent feature of Brazilian national identity. Edward Telles considers this book to be *the* publication that made race mixture a prominent feature of Brazilian national identity.<sup>78</sup> Freyre holds that racial mixing is not necessarily negative, because racial differences and superiority/inferiority were always relative. Furthermore, he contends that not only was miscegenation good for Brazil, it was what made Brazil. The Portuguese's ability to mate and coexist with different people served them well, eugenically:

For this (the Portuguese) had been prepared by the intimate terms of social and sexual intercourse on which they had lived with the colored races that had

---

<sup>76</sup> Skidmore, 176.

<sup>77</sup> Oliveira Vianna, 158 (my translation).

<sup>78</sup> Edward E. Telles, *Race in Another America: The Significance of Skin Color in Brazil*, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004), 33.

invaded their peninsula or were close neighbors to it, one of which, of the Mohamamedan faith, was technically more highly skilled and possessed an intellectual and artistic culture superior to that of the blond Christians.<sup>79</sup>

Freyre, thus, highlights the relativity of the inferior/superior racist concepts of culture. The Portuguese colonizers made themselves stronger because of their ability and willingness to come in contact with the “other,” which gave their progeny various positive characteristics of those cultures, such as “mobility” and “economic realism” from the Jews. “This mobility was one of the secrets of the Portuguese victory.”<sup>80</sup>

Furthermore, Freyre completely rejects the racial degeneracy thesis. For him the inferior status of common Brazilians resulted from a host of factors. The environment, for example, forced the Portuguese to change their diet from one based on the temperate climates of the Mediterranean to one based on the Tropical environments, a relatively new environment for them. By comparison the settlers in North America and the Southern part of South America did not have to change their diet, due to the similarities between those climate zones and Europe.<sup>81</sup> Power relations was another factor that determined the “status” of common Brazilians, as the example of syphilis points out:

Not only was sexual intercourse between the European conqueror and the Indian woman disturbed by syphilis and other highly contagious venereal diseases of European origin; it also became widespread, under circumstances that were otherwise unfavorable to the woman. A species of sadism on the part of the white man and of masochism on the part of his Indian companion must have been the predominant feature in the sexual as in the social relations of the European with the women of those races that were subject to his rule. The furious passions of the Portuguese must have been vented upon victims who did not always share his sexual tastes, although we know of cases where the sadism of the white conqueror was offset by the masochism of his native or Negro partner.<sup>82</sup>

---

<sup>79</sup> Gilberto Freyre, *The Masters and the Slaves*, trans. by Samuel Putnam (New York: Alfred A Knopf, 1968) 11.

<sup>80</sup> Freyre, 10.

<sup>81</sup> Freyre, 19-24.

<sup>82</sup> Freyre 74-78.

Nonetheless, *Casa Grande & Senzala* provides hope for the future of Brazil, because the major problems that are related to Brazil's past are not a result of race, but rather of other factors that no longer exist (e.g. Power discrepancy between Master and Slave) or are being mitigated through time (e.g. tropical diseases).

No one can deny the influence of Freyre's book on Brazilian intellectual thought, however, we must note how the time of publication was as much a part of Freyre's success as the work itself. First, Freyre's mentor in New York, Franz Boas, developed the anthropological arguments surrounding the primacy of environment and its effects on society and culture as opposed to race in the early 1900s. Moreover, Boas' influence on Brazilian intellectuals did not start with Freyre. Alberto Torres, whose writing was mostly done prior to World War I, was one of the most famous early examples of intellectuals who refuted "aryanists" claims of Brazil's racial inferiority by using arguments developed by Boas. Like Freyre, Torres' familiarity with Boas' studies provided backing to his claim that the blame for Brazil's lack of progress derived from the environment and "a lack of education, poor nutrition, and faulty hygiene."<sup>83</sup> However, he was unable to make much headway in his arguments, because the elites of the time were not ready to accept his views.<sup>84</sup>

Freyre, on the other hand, published his oeuvre during a time of heightened confidence in the nation, that is, in 1933, three years after Getúlio Vargas' Revolution of 1930. The Vargas regime was nationalist and anti-immigrant in tone in its desire to protect the "native-born" worker. As such, the Vargas Regime began to extol the virtues of the Brazilian people through cultural productions such as Carnival and Soccer, which marked Brazil as a rich multicultural

---

<sup>83</sup> Skidmore 118-119.

<sup>84</sup> Skidmore, 119-121.



society.<sup>85</sup> Freyre's argument fit into this time, because the solution to Brazil's problems was not European in nature. Prior to Freyre's analysis the main problem in Brazil was considered, essentially, too many Brazilians of questionable origins. Policy makers argued that outsiders were a solution for Brazil's problems; therefore they proposed to fill Brazil with Europeans. Freyre's argument represents a counter argument to this solution by proposing that Brazilians were never the cause of Brazil's problems, but rather victims of circumstances.

As such, the intellectual evolution regarding race within Brazil between the 1870s and the 1930s reflects subtle changes rather than abrupt ones. However, simple classifications of time periods risk oversimplifying the complex processes that occurred. Although scientific racism was a prominent part of intellectual circles in Brazil at this time, its power began to wane with time. For example, Alberto Torres and Gilberto Freyre had similar arguments, however when Torres did his work he was one of the very few who rejected the primacy of Scientific Racism that was present at the time (early 1900s).<sup>86</sup> Similarly until the 1930s Scientific Racism was still quite prevalent and respected within academic circles. Jeffrey Needell points out, in speaking about Oliveira Viana's views that he "was far from alone in his racial analysis, and as late as the 1930s could refute cultural explanations of racial differences, as well as archeological defenses of African civilizations, with citations from respectable sources dating from the foregoing decade."<sup>87</sup> After the 1930s, however, harsh scientific racism gave way to the belief in miscegenation as a cornerstone of the Brazilian nation, making more acceptable Freyre's position.

---

<sup>85</sup> Telles, 37.

<sup>86</sup> Skidmore, 113.

<sup>87</sup> Oliveira Viana and Needell, 14.

The decline of Scientific Racism does not mean that there was a decline of racism itself. Freyre, as Oliveira Viana before him, saw races as being comprised of individuals with certain predisposed characteristics. Thus, Jews were economically frugal, blacks were for labor and whites were civilized. Each group's stereotypical characteristic added to what Brazilians became. This highlights the assumption that there existed typical race characteristics, and a typical Brazilian. Furthermore, the African in these monographs were seen simply as parts of the past that formed part of the "typical" Brazilians ancestry, not as current social contributors. Hence, while discourses regarding the "racial question" effectively changed in nature, becoming more progressive over time, racism remained (and still remains) a big social problem in Brazil.

In this chapter I investigated how intellectuals viewed raced during the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. I concluded that Black populations, at best, were generally seen as passive agents. In the beginning, the interest in Blacks derived not from a desire to understand them culturally, but rather as an explanation of the nation's ills. Due to the intellectual environment of scientivism in which these intellectuals lived, it would have been unlikely for them to have gone radically against the existing and respected norms. Thus, at the same time that intellectuals showed immense scholastic ability and malleability in challenging various details of Social Darwinism – particularly regarding the degeneracy of miscegenation- they did not challenge, in any large trend, the overall racist hierarchy present at the time that viewed whites as superior to all others. As we will see in the next chapter women were also subjected to broad generalizations regarding their role in the process of nation building. As we will see many discourses circulated that claimed to provide a space for women to develop but that in reality limited their mobility and behavior, and separated them from the national dialogue by denying them citizenship.

## **Chapter 2: House/Street Gender Norms Among Early Twentieth Century Intellectuals**

In the previous chapter I discussed how Brazilian intellectuals used race to discuss the problems of the young nation. Just like race, gender was another important category that was used to define and analyze social concerns. Just like race gender oppression, by its nature, affects people across economic and social lines. Its prescriptive power for division comes from all social sectors because it formulates general behaviors seen as appropriate and productive. Thus, like the “scientism” approaches generated to regulate racial interaction, elites sought to regulate female behavior by deploying gendered rules that would “ensure” the progressive development of Brazilian society.

Therefore, just as they did with race, Brazilian intellectuals in the early twentieth century concerned themselves greatly with issues of proper female behavior. Specifically, they were interested in what they saw as an erosion of family values, as well as a rise in libertine activities such as dating. Given their concern -explained in the previous chapter- with Lamarckian theories of evolution, their primary attempts at discussing gender was to concentrate on changing the behavior of people they considered to be “degenerate.” Thus, if they attempted to alter behavior they viewed as negative, then the question that ultimately arises: to what should that behavior be changed? What sort of behavior was considered “appropriate” and why?

In this chapter I argue that intellectuals created an idealized image of a “natural woman/mother” against whom all women were compared. Society (re)produced this image of a “natural woman/mother,” but also offered an alternative negative opposite, the “whore.” These images were based upon concepts of “virginity” “honor,” and “honesty” which divided and defined proper female behavior along the line of the house/street dichotomy. Furthermore, these divisions reflected deep patriarchal desires to control women’s body and behavior.

This chapter's structure will be as follows: first I will introduce a theoretical discussion centered on the works of Roberto da Matta and Michel Foucault. This essay uses da Matta's house/street dichotomy as well as Foucault's notions of power and discourse to establish a reading of the Brazilian milieu of the early twentieth century as oppressive to women at an institutional level. I also aim to showcase the "realities" of women's lives and how they clashed with this nation building discourse. Second, the paper will explain the popular image of the "natural woman" through an exploration of women's duties in the home as well as concepts of virginity, honor and honesty. Lastly this chapter will conclude by highlighting the impossibility of women to live up to the notion of the "natural woman/mother" and how this disjuncture relates back to da Matta and Foucault's social insights.

In Brazil's case, it is pertinent to investigate gender using the Triangular model created by anthropologist, Roberto da Matta. The three sides of the Triangle that da Matta describes are the divisions upon which society governs itself. At the base of the triangle is the social division between the "house" and the "street." At the apex of the triangle is the "other world." The basic premise of this system is that Brazilians behave differently in the world of their "house" than they do in their world on "the street." It is fundamental to understand that for da Matta Power is inherent in each of these divisions and that not all people are allowed to navigate all of the realms of this triangle.

In da Matta's conception of Brazilian society the house is a space of the individual (the private, the intimate). Nonetheless, his notion of the house appears to be somewhat amorphous. To him a house may indicate a house in the physical sense, but it may also be increased to

include one's street, neighborhood, or even the entire Nation.<sup>88</sup> The sociological "house" for da Matta appears to be demarcated by intimacy and belonging. Therefore, where one feels a deep sense of belonging may be considered one's house, regardless of the actual physical space.

Thus, the "house" represents the personal, where one is important and may make demands such as attention to one's needs and welfare. One is, as da Matta describes, a "supercitizen" in one's "house."<sup>89</sup> What gives individuals their status of supercitizen in their own house is the personal relationship they have with others. This intimacy gives individuals a plethora of people whom they may call for their benefit.

If the "house" is the space of the intimate, then the "street" is its opposite: the space of the impersonal. Here the individual lacks the critical protection of the relationships that are present in the "house." The "street" represents a lack of social ties, which in turn represents a lack of social protection. Rather than being a public space of all, this impersonality of the street means that it is the space of and for no one. Thus, citizens are more likely to mistreat and misbehave in public spaces, because they are outside one's dominion, the individual house. As such, what is out there on the streets is not the preoccupation of the citizens, but of the State.<sup>90</sup> Therefore, the street is the space of laws. As the introduction of the term "law" reminds us not everyone had free access in between the spaces of the street and the house. As will be shown later in this chapter, women were often the victims and the prime examples of individuals who were unable to navigate freely in these spaces. There were women who were of the house, and those who were of the street. This identification of one as a member of one space versus the other had real implications for the life of women, especially since there was no proper life for

---

<sup>88</sup> Roberto Da Matta, *A Casa e a Rua: Espaço, Cidadania, Mulher e Morte no Brasil* (São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1985), 12-14.

<sup>89</sup> Da Matta, 16.

<sup>90</sup> Da Matta, 16-17.

women in the public sphere. José Murilo de Carvalho points out this inconsistency when he calls attention to the problems faced by the positivists who sought to place the image of a white neoclassical woman as the representation of the nation-state, thus placing womanhood under the realm of the public. For women, to be a “public woman” was to be a prostitute.<sup>91</sup>

However, for a man to be a public figure was not considered a character flaw. Instead these “public men,” that Carvalho points out, were officials who could pass laws that govern the street. In addition, who was allowed to create laws was a sign of status since laws were regulated by those with access to the mythical third space, that of the “other world.” This third space provides justification and morality to Brazilians, either through religion or in the form of a cult of the State. Fundamentally, it is in relation to “the other world” where discourse is created to legitimate laws and notions that allow for the penetration of the street into the affairs of the “house” of Brazilians.<sup>92</sup> This means that lawmakers and religious officials legitimate themselves through their ability to use the discourse of the “other world;”<sup>93</sup> thus, their power arises out of discourse and not action. However, this “other world” does not have to be necessarily linked to a God; for example, during the beginning of the twentieth century, those who create laws governing behaviors considered “degenerate” did so because they legitimated their discourse by adhering to “scientism.”

As we can appreciate, discourse is key to understanding the different zones in which Brazilians operate, as each zone contains its own specific “visions of the world and ethics.”<sup>94</sup> Thus, those with access to the State apparatus used “Scientific” studies to legitimate their

---

<sup>91</sup> José Murilo de Carvalho, *A Formação das Almas: O Imaginário da República no Brasil*, (São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1990) 92.

<sup>92</sup> Da Matta, 52.

<sup>93</sup> Da Matta, 18.

<sup>94</sup> Da Matta, 41 (my translation).

positions. However, the power potential of discourse is not reserved only for authority figures; in the daily milieu people engage in various forms of power discourses depending on where they are physically (e.g. the house or the street) and where they are socially (e.g. a rural worker versus a large plantation owner). In addition, not all discourses hold the same amount of power. For example, on day-to-day interactions the idiom of the house is used more frequently than the discourse of the street. Da Matta explains that this is precisely due to the inequality imbedded in power relations. The poor and dominated segments of society engage with the discourse of the house/family, because it is “an appeal to the moral limits of social exploitation.”<sup>95</sup> Thus, individuals protect themselves by appealing to social relations where they interact with more powerful agents. This implies that if people seek to be heard they must not only speak to those in power but also speak in a way that allows them to be heard. Thus, they must access traditional patriarchal fields of power in order to possibly obtain real material benefits. If we turn again to the example of women, this meant that women the only way would could seek to amplify their power was through engagements with patriarchy.

Among these hierarchies of power and discourse, the discourse of the street figures as one of domination; as it is the space of laws, it is impersonal and juridical.<sup>96</sup> Da Matta provides an especially enlightened example of this phenomenon when he observes that the term “citizen” is used negatively in Brazil to mark a person who is in an inferior or disadvantaged position. “[I]t is known that impersonal and Universalist treatment is utilized so as to not resolve and/or to complicate the resolution of a problem.”<sup>97</sup> Da Matta relates the problematic aspects of this discourse for people caught within it: “If in the universe of the house I am a supercitizen,

---

<sup>95</sup> Da Matta, 18 (my translation).

<sup>96</sup> Da Matta, 42.

<sup>97</sup> Da Matta, 67. (my translation).

because there I only have rights and no obligations, in the world of the street I am a sub-citizen, because the universal rules of citizenship always define me through negative determinations: by my duties and obligations, through the logic of ‘cannot’ and ‘should not.’”<sup>98</sup> Thus, the impersonality or lack of social ties in the street defines a person as a generic “citizen,” and by being lumped in a generic classification then people lose the social protection inherent in personal ties at the same time that they are denied access to power.

Nonetheless, it is important to understand that da Matta’s labeling of one form of language as dominant does not imply that he believes it has great hegemonic power. Da Matta argues against Weber’s arguments that relational societies were in transition to a hegemony of commerce. Instead, he proposes that what makes this situation “Brazilian” is precisely this lack of hegemony. As such, neither the house, the street, nor the other world are mutually exclusive forms of understanding Brazil. Instead, each of the three zones allows Brazilians a variety of different ways in which they may codify themselves at different points.<sup>99</sup> Each zone acts as a possible alternative that affects each Brazilian depending on where s/he is socioeconomically and physically located.

Although da Matta’s model recognizes differences in people’s abilities to navigate socio-personal relations, he does not provide a clear reason why this is so. Instead he subtly shows the influence of power in this structure. In his chapter on citizenship he juxtaposes the nominal equality of citizenship to how in practice each person’s citizenship is gradated based upon a variety of socio-cultural factors that mark him/her.<sup>100</sup> In his explanation of the “citizen,” he

---

<sup>98</sup> Da Matta, 78 (my translation).

<sup>99</sup> Da Matta, 41.

<sup>100</sup> Da Matta, 55-80.



seems to suggest that people who can go around the system are those to whom we are willing to bend rules for. He states:

At the core, we live in a society in which a type of combat exists between the public world of universal laws and the market; and the private universe of the family, of godparents, family and friends. It's a society that contains varying forms of defining its members, according to the variety of relations they can call upon to demonstrate in specific situation.<sup>101</sup>

Da Matta believes, and rightly so, that the historical situation in which Brazilian institutions emerged (wealth inequality, slavery etc) led to this differentiation in citizenships.<sup>102</sup> However, he does not provide an adequate reason of the cause of these differences, and why they are maintained; I believe we can find this explanation by introducing into the discussion the Foucauldian notion of Power.

In his explanation of the term “power,” Foucault cautions us not to see it as emanating from just one place: “At bottom, despite the differences in epochs and objectives, the representation of power has remained under the spell of monarchy. In political thought and analysis we still have not cut off the head of the king.”<sup>103</sup> Instead he argues:

Power must be understood in the first instance as the multiplicity of force relations immanent in the sphere in which they operate and which constitute their own organization; as the process, which, through ceaseless struggles and confrontations, transforms, strengthens, or reverses them from one another; and lastly, as the strategies in which they take effect, whose general design or institutional crystallization is embodied in the state apparatus, in the formulation of the law, in the various social hegemonies.<sup>104</sup>

---

<sup>101</sup> Da Matta, 72 (my translation).

<sup>102</sup> Da Matta, 64.

<sup>103</sup> Michel Foucault, *The History of Sexuality: An Introduction Volume I*, trans by Robert Hurley, (New York: Vintage Books, 1990), 88-89.

<sup>104</sup> Foucault, 92-93.

He goes on: “Power is everywhere, not because it embraces everything, but because it comes from everywhere.”<sup>105</sup> Thus, all people in society have the potential to exercise some form of power. However, this does not mean that all people will be able to exercise power to the same extent. Again if we remember that for da Matta different Brazilians engage with varying degrees of efficacy with members of society and institutions, then we can assume that individuals who are marked by race and gender (i.e. such as the subjects of this chapter and this thesis) would have a lesser ability to deploy this power than the son of a wealthy planter, for example.

Foucault’s notions of power can help fill out the gaps in da Matta’s triangular model of Brazilian society in which relationships mean so much. Fundamentally, we could say that society uses Power to create the sociological divisions between the house and the street. Furthermore, da Matta and Foucault connect in their conception of the power of discourse. Da Matta links domination with discourse, especially concerning “the other world,” and Foucault seems to agree: “[i]ndeed it is in discourse that power and knowledge are joined together.”<sup>106</sup> Foucault also views discourse as integral to his theories, because power is deployed with varying success, based on the individuals’ rhetorical abilities. That is, one’s use of power depends on one’s ability to influence others through various means, including, but not limited to discourse. Foucault provides an example of this in one of power’s principles labeled “the insistence of the rule,” in which he states that “power’s hold on sex is maintained through language, or rather through the act of discourse that creates, from the very fact that it is articulated, a rule of law.”<sup>107</sup> Thus, before any action may be taken against a certain “problem,” a discourse is created to describe, categorize, and analyze it.

---

<sup>105</sup> Foucault, 93.

<sup>106</sup> Foucault, 100.

<sup>107</sup> Foucault, 83.

Scholars familiar with Foucault's principles of Power know that it is not merely the dominion of a select few, because the oppressed may also deploy power in an effective manner. Therefore, scholars of the humanities studying Brazil must always understand the famous *jeitinho*, in which while rules always exist, they are flexible: both Foucault and da Matta recognize such flexibility.<sup>108</sup> Although Foucault makes no mention of the *jeitinho* per se, he argues that at the same time that power creates discourse to justify intervention into specific areas of investigation, it also creates spaces of resistance.<sup>109</sup> This elasticity comes not just from the actions of the individual attempting to achieve a goal for him/herself, but also from the execution of appeals to other social members.

This understanding of power fit perfectly into the model of Brazilian society as da Matta constructs it. For him, this Brazilian relationality amongst different people does not exist to the same extent in countries or areas with more homogenous populations. Instead we can find it in heterogeneous societies, in which, this system of interrelations developed as a way to maintain stability in a context with such fundamental social differences.<sup>110</sup> And so the relations that da Matta advocates are avenues through which Brazilians deploy power. As the author elaborates, “the secret of a correct interpretation of Brazil lies in the possibility of understanding that which is ‘in-between’ things.”<sup>111</sup>

When we look at gender relations in early twentieth century Brazil it is helpful for us to recognize the power that the dichotomy between “natural woman/mother” and “whore” held over

---

<sup>108</sup> Although its history is unclear, the *jeitinho* is a term used to describe an unwritten set of standards and practices through which an individual may engage with a bureaucrat to obtain a short cut or a bending of overly byzantine rules and regulations. The *jeitinho* is granted on a case by case basis by the bureaucrat who needs to be convinced by the appeals of the individual. Livia Barbosa *O Jeitinho Brasileiro: A Arte de Ser Mais Igual que os Outros* (Rio de Janeiro: Campus, 1992) 11-29; 139-147 as cited in Brian Owensby, “A History of Brazil’s ‘Cordial Racism’: Race Beyond Liberalism *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 47 no. 2 (April 2005): 318-347. 340.

<sup>109</sup> Foucault, 101-102.

<sup>110</sup> da Matta, 17.

<sup>111</sup> da Matta, 21 (My translation).

women's behavior. The term "natural woman/mother" describes a subliminal concept that rules the mind of society, especially of those in the upper classes. I formulate this term based on the concept of the "natural man" as used by Greek philosophers. Classic Greek philosophers viewed societies that were different from their own as unnatural. For example, if they encountered a society that was matriarchal then they would consider that society to be "unnatural." If they encountered another society with whom they had no previous contact, but in which patriarchy was central, then they would consider that to be a society organized in the "natural" way. We can draw a parallel between this understanding of society as natural and unnatural and the realm of women in Brazil, especially those in higher classes.

The Republicans deployed the image of women as nation almost from the very beginning of their term in power. It is easy to see the appeal of women as symbols for these men especially given their orientation towards French culture and the French revolution. That is, the French Revolutionary symbols were dominated by women figures (the nation, liberty, the republic etc). For the French public, the revolutionary symbols stood in sharp contrast to the old regime's most important symbol, the patriarchal king.<sup>112</sup> Given the tremendous influence of French ideas in the generation of the Republicans, it is understandable that these Brazilian intellectuals chose women as their main symbols.<sup>113</sup> Yet, these deployed symbols were not just mere copies of European iconography, they represented a particular political plan for the emerging nation. For if a political group uses a woman as a symbol of a nation, the question inevitably arises: what kind of woman? What should she look like? How should she dress? Eventually the Republicans

---

<sup>112</sup> Carvalho, 84.

<sup>113</sup> Carvalho, 75-84.

settled on a very conservative and westernized formulation, the figure of a white woman dressed in Roman inspired classical attire.<sup>114</sup>

As Carvalho points out the deployment of these female images was met with an equal number of skeptics that categorized this search for mythic symbols as a failure.<sup>115</sup> As early as 1895, dissatisfied opponents –and even former supporters of the regime- began publishing mocking caricatures of the women-republics. In fact, Carvalho argues that the caricatures became themselves the dominant image of the iconographic women-republics.<sup>116</sup> In answering why the Positivist Republicans failed to create images and symbols that spoke to the greater Brazilians public, Carvalho, invoking Baczko argues that “the imaginary, although malleable, needs a community of imagination, a community of meaning for it to take root. Symbols, allegories, myths only create roots when there is social space and culture in which to feed itself. In the absence of such a base, the attempt to create it, to manipulate it, falls short, at times comically.”<sup>117</sup> Thus, their failure resulted ultimately from the lack of a unique national/local form of representing the Republic itself.

Contrasting the popularity of the image of Our Lady of Aparecida, another female symbol, to the women-republics can help us explain their lack of success. Our Lady of Aparecida functioned as an alternate representation of the nation employed by Opponents of the Republican regime. Carvalho sees the success of the iconography of the opponents of the Republic in the fact that Our Lady of Aparecida tapped into the cultural spaces of the people –part Mary and part Afro-Brazilian- and was thus able to “take root.”<sup>118</sup> I would also argue that a great importance in

---

<sup>114</sup> Carvalho, 84.

<sup>115</sup> Carvalho, 75-108.

<sup>116</sup> Carvalho, 87.

<sup>117</sup> Carvalho, 89 (my translation)

<sup>118</sup> Carvalaho, 93-94.

the acceptance of this image lies in her characterization as the *Virgin* Mary. That is, she is both a virgin and a mother. By contrast, many of the caricatures of the women-republics made by opponents were of oversexualized female figures, that is, the “whore.” We can explain this obsession with female sexuality if we consider the sexism inherent in early twentieth century Brazil. Women had no place in politics, “The woman, if public, was a prostitute... Not only did women not participate (in politics), their participation was not considered appropriate. Politics was a man’s thing.”<sup>119</sup> Thus, the public space was not for women, whether real or imaginary.

Furthermore, as we can see with this iconographic battle the Virgin/whore dichotomy expressed in the reading of these symbols points to a clear example of the house/street dichotomy. Mary is a mother, and as a mother her place is in the home, not on an oil canvas actively battling for the nation. By contrast the women-republics were women performing in public spaces. Thus, they were women of the streets and as such their moral behavior was suspect. But why was this binary so easily understood? Why were these images of women so easily turned into whores and not virgins?

The answer lies not in what makes a virgin, but rather in what makes a whore. The understanding of this concept is complicated by the difference demarcated between “public” versus “clandestine” prostitutes, and the policing of acceptable behavior. The “public prostitute” is the term used to describe women who sell sex openly.<sup>120</sup> A “clandestine prostitute, on the other hand, “was a promiscuous woman who might or might not receive payment for sex, but who did not publicly solicit clients.”<sup>121</sup> Thus, the existence of two notions of prostitution “public” and “clandestine” highlights the tension between the ideal and the practical. After all, identifying a

---

<sup>119</sup> Carvalho, 92 (my translation).

<sup>120</sup> Sueann Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor: Sexual Morality, Modernity, and Nation in Early-Twentieth-Century Brazil* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2000) 39.

<sup>121</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 39.

“clandestine” prostitute would be considered a constant and dedicated task. Nonetheless, as Caulfield suggests something that unifies both conceptions of prostitution is that they are both constructed based on acts. A “public” prostitute would be easy enough to identify, as she engages in the act of exchanging money for sexual favors. A “clandestine prostitute,” on the other hand, was much harder to identify because she made her identity private. The problem for those who sought to identify such a woman was that unlike the “public” prostitute her identifying feature/act was not an exchange of sexual favors, but rather a personal trait, promiscuity. Thus, in order to identify these “clandestine prostitutes” one had to engage in classifying women based upon the plethora of day-to-day interactions.

As such, the general behaviors of women became a target for government intrusion. As was suggested in the previous chapter, intellectuals of this time attempted to change the behavior of the masses so as to civilize them; thus, they attempted to identify and correct “degenerate” forms of behaving, in the hopes of “bettering” the race. This was especially true for women. “In (the vision of Viveiros de Castro) and also other jurists of the period the path to civilizing the country was in an efficient legislation that guaranteed the ‘respect for the honor of women.’”<sup>122</sup> Thus, women, because of their importance in procreation, were targets of these attempts to create a “civilized” Brazil, which meant a Brazil with European values.

Moreover, intellectuals’ attempts at altering women’s behavior were a part of a wider project of eugenics in Brazil. Citing Nancy Stepan, Jerry Dávila points out that, in Latin America most eugenicists followed a “softer” form of eugenics based upon the theories of Lamarck, who “maintained that the behavior and environment of parents could shape the genes

---

<sup>122</sup> Martha de Abreu Esteves, *Meninas Perdidas, Os Populares e o Cotidiano do Amor no Rio de Janeiro da Belle Époque*, (Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra, 1989) 35. (my translation)

of offspring: tuberculosis or alcoholism, for example would produce degenerate babies.”<sup>123</sup> Thus, if you could eliminate the “contagion,” (i.e. those non-European behaviors) you could improve the lot of the next generation. Dávila’s exploration of the educational system reminds us that eugenics was not only scientific (e.g. genes) but also had pedagogical tones (e.g. teaching proper hygienic practices), especially in the 1920s. Still, in this project, schools were but one of many institutions: “[e]ducators, social scientists and policymakers spared little energy or expense in building a state role in mediating Brazil’s escape from the determinist trap of blackness and degeneracy.”<sup>124</sup> As we can see it is at the space of sex and reproduction that the policing of both race and gender intersect. Despite the difference in sectors that produced these discourses they share an attempt to alter behavior often based on racist, classist and also gendered assumptions.

The multiplicity of cases of “deflowerment” seen at the turn-of-the-century provide an example of just how gendered these intrusions could be. Jurists who sought to govern women’s actions during the forty-one years of the Old Republic Regime dealt with three different codes regarding their sexuality over that time: the civil code of 1830, the penal code of 1891 and the civil code of 1916. A major difference between the first code and the last two is, as the dates indicate, that Imperial law-makers created the civil code of 1830 with liberal ideals in mind. Republican law-makers, on the other hand created the last two codes: as such they reflected the positivistic ideal in the ability of jurists, through science, to better society (i.e. the race).<sup>125</sup> Despite the differences between the two schools (i.e. classical vs. Positivist), “[a]t the heart of these theoretical debates, however were the same concerns to maintain, in ‘modernized’ form,

---

<sup>123</sup> Jerry Dávila, *Diploma of Whiteness: Race and Social Policy in Brazil, 1917-1945*, (Durham: Duke University Press, 2003) 24-25.

<sup>124</sup> Dávila, 7.

<sup>125</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 30-34.



the patriarchal institution of the family and the gendered concept of honor that sustained it.”<sup>126</sup> And so, despite many changes, the codes remained gendered. Highlighting cases of Deflowerment provides two important glimpses: first, it shows the ways in which government officials and social actors viewed women; second, it showcases the ways in which the government officials sought to change the behavior of those in the lower classes - the main targets of their intervention.

As we can see in the legal approaches to deflowerment, the laws established during this time placed women as little more than the property of men. For example, a woman belonged to her father and once she married her sexuality became property of her husband. Thus, a husband could not be convicted of raping his wife.<sup>127</sup> The code of 1916 considered men legal guardians of women, because women were considered incapable of handling their own affairs; a position that Marina Maluf and Maria Lúcia Mott reminds us the Republicans also enforced for the indigenous and children.<sup>128</sup> This emphasis on guarding the private space can also be seen in the attitudes regarding other institutions. For example, from the time of the Imperial Armed forces to World War II, military service in the lower ranks was seen as an extremely un-masculine activity, because of its association with lifestyles that were not considered proper of the house (e.g. defloweres and sodomy); it was only after the victory of World War II that the military began to gain the masculine image we know today.<sup>129</sup> At the turn-of-the-century many men viewed conscription as a threat to their honor by prohibiting them from keeping a vigilant eye

---

<sup>126</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 31.

<sup>127</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 41.

<sup>128</sup> Marina Maluf and Maria Lúcia Mott, “Reônditos do Mundo Feminino,” in *História da Vida Privada no Brasil: República: da Belle Époque à Era do Rádio vol 3*, eds Fernando Novais and Nicolau Sevcenko (São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1998) 367-422. 375

<sup>129</sup> Peter Beattie, “The House, the Street, and the Barracks: Reform and Honorable Masculine Social Space in Brazil, 1864-1945” in *The Hispanic American Historical Review*, 76 (3) (Aug 1996) 439-473.

upon “their women” and so brought conscripts dangerously close to dishonor through the infidelity of their spouses.<sup>130</sup>

Because of this distrust in female desire and sexuality, men (and women) kept vigilance over women’s body through the highly gendered honor/shame complex. In it, “honor” is inherent in all men, however, it is not just related to the man himself, but rather his family also reflects his honor. As such, he may inherit honor from his father, but he may also lose honor by the actions of “his” women. Specifically, if the woman engages in sexual relations with a man outside the approval of her patriarch (i.e. outside of marriage) the family’s honor is lost. Women, on the other hand, instead of honor, have “shame” and are policed publically through gossip. Through this system the honor of men relate directly to the amount of shame “his” women created publicly towards discussions of their sexuality.<sup>131</sup>

This sexual vigilance was ever present, from childhood through their married years. Young women were expected to remain virgins until marriage, as virginity was the upmost sign of proper behavior and honor. Jurists considered “Deflowerment” crimes as a terrible offense against a family as it took a way a prized commodity, proof of the girl’s purity and honor. As a result, Judges punished deflowerers in a variety of ways depending on the family’s social standing: for example, some men were pressed into military service -a severe punishment at the time.<sup>132</sup> During the Republican era, men convicted of deflowering virgins were sentenced to a few years in prison. However, most of the accused were freed if they were able to make restitution for their crimes by marrying the women they deflowered or paying the family of the

---

<sup>130</sup> Beattie, 455-457.

<sup>131</sup> John P. Mitchell, “Honor and Shame” in *Encyclopedia of Social Anthropology*,

<sup>132</sup> Beattie, 441.

girl.<sup>133</sup> It is important to point out that the men who settled their cases by marrying the victims, provided restitution not to the woman, but rather to her family (i.e. ideally to her father). Yet, even with such stringent punishment the onus of proving the crime was placed upon the woman. Prosecutors had to prove not just that a sexual act had occurred, but also that the young lady led a “proper life” *prior to* the sexual act and as such, deserved protection from the State.<sup>134</sup>

Jurists’ concern over, not just the virginity of poor women, but also their “honesty,” and the vigilance present in society via the “honor/shame” complex implies an attempt to control/mold behavior; but towards what ideal? As “deflowerment” cases indicate, virginity was *the* major ideological benchmark against which both men and women judged young women. Boris Fausto in his book on crime in São Paulo argues that this was true across all racial and socioeconomic categories.<sup>135</sup> Part of the allure of virginity is that it appears to be objective, and thus, indisputable. After all, a woman either has a hymen or she does not. Thus, the honor of families rested in part upon women’s ability to stay virgins, but also on honesty, because the *appearance* of virginity also reflected the family’s honor. However, after World War I the legal acceptability of the intact hymen as *the* sign of virginity began to lose sway due to the incapacity of scientifically proving that the hymen would break in every woman who engages in sexual acts.<sup>136</sup>

After World War I, jurists concerned themselves less with the scientific verification of virginity and more with whether or not the young lady engaged in a “proper life.” This concern with a “moral virginity” arose out of an anxiety over the emergence of “modern women.” These

---

<sup>133</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 41-42.

<sup>134</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 36-38.

<sup>135</sup> Boris Fausto, *Crime e Cotidiano: A Criminalidade em São Paulo, 1880-1924* (São Paulo: Editora Brasiliense, 1984), 57-58.

<sup>136</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 95-99.

“modern women” were women who were seen to lead too free a life, primarily in sexual aspects. According to popular conceptions the main problem with these women was that they were too far away from patriarchal vigilance via their families, and were as such, suspected of using their virginity as a tool for social rise instead of holding it in great esteem.<sup>137</sup> Jurists’ concern with “modern women” arose implicitly out of their failure to engage properly in the “honor/shame” structure. In Brazil, during the beginning of the twentieth century, the concept of shame was key for the governance of women’s sexuality, and “new women” put it at risk. Caulfield, while writing in English, makes a point of using the Portuguese term *pudor*, instead of shame, because it connotes not only a general feeling of embarrassment and disgrace, but also a level of modesty and purity at a sexual level. She argues that jurists believed this was the proper sentiment that women should feel regarding their sexuality.<sup>138</sup> Thus, women displayed “honesty” if their hymen was intact until marriage and if they showed the proper level of *pudor* in their everyday life.

Despite the great pressures placed on women to remain virgins, the proper behavior of women was focused not just on the lives of women during their youth, but also after they were married, at which time her behavior affected through the marital union, her husband’s reputation. After marriage women’s lives centered on an triangle based on three roles, “mother-wife-homemaker.” The ideal woman stayed at home, because the “nature of women” made the home their biologically determined space (i.e. “their natural habitat”).<sup>139</sup> In this “ideal” situation, the husband, the head of the marital union, earned enough money for the woman to stay home, and remain outside of the temptations of the street. The wife should stay home insuring the chores

---

<sup>137</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 99-104

<sup>138</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 36-37.

<sup>139</sup> Maluf and Mott, 373-374.

were complete, thereby defending the honor of the family.<sup>140</sup> The man and wife were thus thought of as a team where the man completed tasks in the space of the street and the woman completed tasks in the space of the house.

However, most women did not and *could not* live up to these ideals. Maluf and Mott point out, that while the technological improvements of the era made the lives of women easier; they were only available for the small segment of the population who could afford them. Paradoxically poorer women still had to live up to the ideal of maintaining the house, but on time constraints brought upon by having to work outside the home –provided they had permission from their husbands.<sup>141</sup> Even if women were able to take advantage of some of the new technologies the ability of women to meet up with their expected duties inside the home was almost impossible without outside help.<sup>142</sup> Thus, society's ideal conception of womanhood was that *of* the wealthy white woman and as such only accessible *to* her.

Despite its practical inaccessibility for all women the ideal of the housewife became incredibly powerful in the first three decades of the twentieth century.

The jurists, just like doctors, were guardians of a project of progress and civilization that imposed itself upon society and that evidently stressed moral behavior. They designed an alteration for the masses against their habits of going out alone, ideally getting them to not go out alone and even then only on certain hours and to certain places. However, they flagrantly 'forgot' that to survive poor women had to work and the street was where they worked.<sup>143</sup>

As a result of a model based on the ideal wealthy woman, the men who wrote laws and sought to modernize Brazil during the early part of the twentieth century attempted to mold the behaviors of working class women in exclusionary terms. Working-class women could not engage with the

---

<sup>140</sup> Maluf and Mott, 380-382.

<sup>141</sup> Maluf and Mott, 400-403.

<sup>142</sup> Maluf and Mott, 405-415.

<sup>143</sup> de Abreu Esteves, 47 (my translation).

space of the street, yet they had to penetrate it in order to make ends meet. Thus, the contradiction inherent in this construction –the homemaker- subjected working class women to possible attacks on moral ground.

The classist assumptions upon which the homemaker image was founded is critical to understanding economic tensions inside the household. At the turn on the century, Brazilian society underwent massive economic and social changes. Brazilian families evolved unevenly from paternalistic extended family of the countryside to the idealized bourgeois nuclear family of the city. “The emergence of the modern nuclear family, by reforming the importance of love and of caring for one’s husband and children redefined the role of women and at the same time reduced the woman to the interior of the domestic space where their duties were doubled.”<sup>144</sup> Thus, women were caught in this in-between space of wanting the bourgeois existence of Europe, while at the same time remaining within the confines of a relatively feudal system. As occurred in Europe, the discourse over women’s bodies targeted first wealthy women in the nineteenth century and gradually began to encompass ever-larger segments of society. Influential members of society (e.g. lawmakers, intellectuals etc) created a discourse in which women desperately needed to learn to become proper members of this new family system.<sup>145</sup>

In the scheme of hegemonic power over women’s behavior there were various forms of social control and it is important to understand that these controls were not applied evenly. De Abreu Esteves links Foucault and Jurandir Freire Costa’s discussions of power to point out that, as occurred in Europe, the discourse over women’s bodies was initially directed at wealthy women since their progeny was the one in need of guarding but gradually it expanded to include

---

<sup>144</sup> Maria Fernanda Baptista Bicalho “O Bello Sexo: Imprensa e identidade Feminina no Século XIX e início do Século XX,” in *Rebeldes e submissão: Estudos sobre Condição Feminina* (São Paulo: Fundação Carlos Chagas, 1989), 79-99. 91. (My translation.)

<sup>145</sup> de Abreu Esteves, 27-29.

all segments of society.<sup>146</sup> However, the scholarship of crimes relating to women in the early twentieth century –particularly deflowerment- finds that State intervention overwhelmingly affected the lives of poorer women.<sup>147</sup> Although wealthier women were under similar pressures towards their behaviors, the mechanisms of social controls were somewhat different than those experienced by the lower classes. Power structures guaranteed that government officials could not intervene in the families of the most prominent officials. For example, Suanne Caulfield highlights one incident portrayed in the police journal *Vida Policial*, in which an officer was reprimanded for arresting a wealthy girl because her bathing suit was too short. Caulfield points to this incident to make the point that class hierarchy took precedence over gender hierarchy.<sup>148</sup> This highlights the different limits of powers that government officials actually had to control female bodies and who was targeted by such government action. Thus, women of different classes had to deal with State control over their lives in different degrees. Furthermore, this incident provides us with an excellent example of the private versus public intrusions into the lives of individuals that da Matta relates. The wealthy girl did not have to submit to the intrusions of the police officer, because she was a member of a home space that guaranteed her protection (e.g. a wealthy family). Thus, because she belonged to the “house” of a wealthy individual she was subject to *his* direct patriarchy and not that of the State.

Nonetheless, a similarity remains between all women in Brazil: regardless of class, or race there remains a great influence of the honor/shame code in their home lives. After all, the ideals of virginity and the housewife appear to be recognizable amongst all people, even those economically unable to maintain it. Women had to act a certain way -show *pudor* and stay in the

---

<sup>146</sup> de Abreu Esteves, 28.

<sup>147</sup> See Boris Fausto, Suanne Caulfield, and Martha Abreu Esteves.

<sup>148</sup> Suanne Caulfield, “Getting into Trouble: Dishonest Women, Modern Girls, and Women-Men in the Conceptual Language of ‘Vida Policial’,” *Signs* 19 no.1 (Autumn 1993), 146-176. 158-159.

home- or else they risk damaging the honor of their men. Any deviation from the code could have very serious repercussions. For example, many officials took alarm at what they perceived to be a disquieting rise in wife killings from the 1910s to the 1930s.<sup>149</sup> Although jurists sentenced wife killing as illegal under Republican laws, it was tacitly condoned by juries who freed men who were found to be “passionate” and acted in “defense of honor.”<sup>150</sup>

The example of wife-killings highlights how the honor/shame code fits with da Matta’s notion of social division between the street and the house. Women who engage in public activity are an affront to this system, and thus should be punished. Despite their claims at being revolutionaries, Republican lawmakers did little to change the fundamental concepts of the family. Caulfield describes the debates concerning the penal code of 1890 as having “At the heart... the same concerns to maintain, in ‘modernized’ form, the patriarchal institution of the family and the gendered concept of honor that sustained it.”<sup>151</sup> Thus, these men sought to confine women back to their “natural” role, despite the tensions brought by a changing social context. Jurists, for example, saw ‘modern women’ as a dangerous phenomenon threatening civilization.<sup>152</sup> They viewed these women as hazardous to society, precisely because they did not adhere to the honor/shame code. “Modern girls were guilty not only of cunning and other indecorous knowledge afforded by the environment, but of activities that freed them from the discipline of the family.”<sup>153</sup> Thus, the danger of the modern women lay in their relative freedom, not only from the honor/shame code, but also from the home space (that is, their willingness to engage with the Street). By engaging in the life of the street and, more importantly gaining

---

<sup>149</sup> Susan K. Besse, “Crimes of Passion: The Campaign Against Wife-Killing, 1910-1940,” *Journal of Social History*, 22 no.4 (Summer 1989), 653-666. 655.

<sup>150</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 88-89.

<sup>151</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 31.

<sup>152</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 88-104.

<sup>153</sup> Caulfield, *In Defense of Honor*, 100.



employment, “modern women” challenged the preeminence of men by questioning what da Matta names the street/house dichotomy.

However, one should not be under the impression that “modern women” were somehow freed from repercussions, once they purged their psyche of the “honor/shame” code. The struggle was endless, because, as Foucault reminds us, surveillance is constant and society finds ways to ensure that all social members engage in proper behavior. Therefore, as a response to changing conceptions of femininity among “new women,” cultural institutions (re)created a variety of mechanisms to maintain women within the physical and psychological space of the house. For example, etiquette booklets defined proper behavior in terms of women’s role inside the house, suggesting that in order to be a moral, proper woman they had to remain inside this space. However, lower class women suffered the burden of this moral code to a greater degree than wealthier women, since the last had the “protection” of the family to seek their interests. It is thus no wonder that the women the police interfered with, as shown in the books of Martha de Abreu Esteves and Suanne Caulfield, were poor.<sup>154</sup>

The poorer the woman, the more likely she was to be forced to engage directly with the State. If we consider Brazilian society to be highly “relational” as da Matta suggests, and if we argue that Brazil is a society that is highly structured based upon economic and racial lines, then we can see that a woman would be placed lower and lower based upon a series of signifiers that gave away her status, and a such made her a greater target for State vigilance. In his book about the condition of working class Mexicans in Ciudad Juarez, Alejandro Lugo argues that society along the U.S. Mexico Border is stratified by wealth and power and that as a result people have learned to read and (re)produce signifiers that allow others to police who is allowed to cross

---

<sup>154</sup> de Abreu Esteves, 1989. Suanne Caulfield *In Defense of Honor*

metaphorical (although no less important) borders. Such exchanges are what he calls “border inspections.”<sup>155</sup> The Mexicans, Lugo describes, must pass through a universe that is full of points of repression, where women in particular are judged, in part, based on how they look. Brazilian women in the early decades of the twentieth century were in a similar situation. A lack of proper signifiers categorize lower class woman as one of da Matta’s “citizen.” This is problematic, because as da Matta relates, in the Brazilian context, the “citizen” is a nobody; someone without personal connections. Thus, lower class women were forced to engage directly with State.

However, repression was not the only thing that society gave to women. As Abreu Esteves and Caulfield argue, women engaged in a variety of survival strategies that they deployed tactically to connect with others in a public context. At times, these women managed to engage even with the repressive institutions of the State, such as the Police, to obtain desired goals.

Nonetheless, the proper roles assigned to women were ideals formulated under classist and gendered assumptions. Thus, women in reality rarely fit them. However, these notions were so engrained in the popular consciousness that they were seen as unavoidable. For example, in his critique of Florestan Fernandes’ interpretation of black Brazilian’s pathological behavior towards sexuality, Boris Fausto argued that virginity was important for all social fields.<sup>156</sup> Contrary to this claim to an essential value, Martha Abreu de Esteves and Sueann Caulfield countered Fausto by highlighting the flexibility of ideals for these women. Esteves and Caulfield see women as using societal notions of virginity as just one in a various blend of survival

---

<sup>155</sup> Alejandro Lugo. *Fragmented Lives Assembled Parts: Culture, Capitalism and Conquest at the U.S.-Mexico Border* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2008). 115-150. Especially 115-118.

<sup>156</sup> Boris Fausto, 57-58.

strategies. For these scholars virginity was a way for women to drum up resources for their lives. They suggest that at times these resources were even used to free themselves from their own families. At other times, the resources were designed to bring an extra worker to help them with their tasks. The women who could challenge and bend the system were the “modern girls,” and as such they posed a threat to patriarchy.

In sum, society created an ideal for women’s behavior that did not respond to their multiple realities. The term “society” might elicit frustration amongst scholars; however, it is used to highlight the impersonal hegemonic power that maintained this system in place. For instance, the adjudication of “deflowerment” and the ideal of the homemaker are impossible to trace down to a single source because they emerged from and were supported by a variety of actors (e.g. cultural practices). Unfortunately, these ideals were often impractical, if not impossible to follow. In fact, one has the impression that only the wealthy women could adhere to these standards. Nonetheless, it is important to remember that wealthy women were not just “citizens,” they had husbands, brothers, and fathers, that is, connections that could both save them from a problem and also repress them behind the sanctity of the home.

Because Jurists dealt with upper class women in their day-to-day life this interaction affected the way they approached law making. However as women’s role changed over time, so did the Jurists’ view of proper behavior. This can be appreciated by the fact that by the turn-of-the-century jurisprudence denied women had sexual desire, but by the 1920s Sexuality was seen as a part of some women’s lives, even if it was certainly not see as the “healthy” norm. In contrast, by the mid-1930s far more jurists were accepting women’s sexuality as normal.

In the next chapter, I connect issues of gender and race by looking at members of Brazil's Black Press in the city of São Paulo. Particularly I focus on their use of gender policing as a way to make their claim for inclusion into elite society. Thus, these writers tried to battle racial prejudices by (re)producing patriarchal hierarchies, creating the same expectations of gendered behavior for women of their class as did other members of the white elite. In the end they advocated for a policing of sexual behavior because women who were seen as misbehaving caused dishonor upon the man, and hence disgraced the race.

### **Chapter 3: O Clarim d'Alvorada and Racial and Gender Relations in São Paulo 1924-1932**

Writers of the black press of Brazil in the early twentieth century (1915-1937) engaged with issues of race, gender and power. Oftentimes, their demands for inclusion into white hegemonic circles demonstrated patriarchal notions of power and belonging. Nonetheless, we cannot talk about the black press of Brazil as a constant homogenous entity. As we will see, it went through enormous changes from 1915 to 1937. In the earlier years the intellectuals writing in these journals were mostly focused on elevating their own groups' social performance so that they may gain access to white mainstream society. However, as time went on, their discourse became increasingly combative. That is, they became less willing to "prove" themselves to the rest of Brazil. Miriam Nicolau Ferrara, Kim Butler and Paulina L Alberto, in their respective analyses demonstrate how this evolution occurs in their political thought as they are expressed through the writings in the black press. As these scholars propose, these men, and they were mostly men, gradually came to the realization that the notion of equality as promised by abolition and by the Republic was a sham. Ferrara, Butler and Alberto focus a great deal of their analysis on the essay portion of the papers, where the ideas about the conditions of blacks are more readily addressed. Through these resources, the three scholars created great historical works about the evolution of the Black press from 1915-1960. However, a vacuum exists in the analysis of these journals as literary texts. After all, many of these papers were envisioned not just as vehicles for the expressions of the desires of Black people in São Paulo, but also as literary journals. Thus, these men were able not only to express themselves, but also do so in a multitude of creative fashions.

This was particularly the case of the journal I will study in this chapter, *O Clarim d'Alvorada*. As a cultural intellectual production this newspaper was at the forefront of black

intellectual thought. As Ferrara points out the evolution of the motto of the paper can help us identify that the paper became much more political as the years progressed. The motto changed basically from “Literary, News and Scientific Organ” or “Literary, News and Political Organ” to “O Clarim da Alvorada -- for the interests of Black Men: Journalistic, Literary and Combative” in 1928.<sup>157</sup> While her assessment of the evolution of the political ideology of the paper is accurate the motto also points out that Literature was still an important identity marker for the paper. And the literary characteristic that these men gave to the paper were not just solely focused on the essay form; many of the same men who wrote essays on the conditions of Blacks in the city, also wrote poems and short stories about love and other socio-cultural topics. All of these different literary genres were important tools deployed by these writers to achieve their goals of better integrating blacks into Brazilian society.

Because of the social importance of these literary texts, this chapter engages primarily with the fiction writings of *O Clarim d'Alvorada*. These fiction pieces are important aspects of these papers, because they themselves represent specific moments in time when these men practiced an elevated social position, that of a writer. Furthermore through their fiction they implicitly (subliminally) sent signals of what they considered to be a “proper” social life. This spread of information was central to their aims of inclusion into a Brazilian society that marginalized them, because the principles presented in these stories tended to mirror those of broader white society. Thus, I argue that, in an effort to display their own legitimacy --and that of other black men for whom they felt they spoke for-- and their “Brazilianess,” these writers deployed patriarchal discourses through the recognition and use of symbols of behavior considered “proper.” At the same time they also presented an increasing denouncement of the

---

<sup>157</sup> Miriam Nicolau Ferrara, *A Imprensa Negra Paulista (1915-1963)*, (São Paulo: FFLCH/USP, 1986), 55-56 (my translation).

past as a strategy for placing themselves within the history of the country, by arguing that they are effectively 'owed' inclusion in the national imaginary. Because of this insistence on displaying proper behavior, a set of logical questions arises from a close reading of these historical texts: what was a "proper man?" What ideals were these writers championing? Who were they idealizing? Answering these questions will be the focus of this chapter.

The discussion will be organized in the following way: first, I will define, briefly, the racial terms that will be employing throughout my analysis. Second, I will provide a brief history of the newspaper. Third, I will discuss what the concept of 'belonging' means in the context of this discussion. Finally I will make the crux of the argument in the fourth part where I will describe how the practices the writers engaged in form part of a politics of belonging, and how they managed to inscribe themselves as legitimate members of Brazilian society primarily by establishing themselves as patriarchs deploying power over women's bodies.

Before delving too deep into the subject matter of this chapter, I must make some clarifications over definitions. As with any essay dealing with race in Brazil, one must acknowledge the many notions of race that circulate in Brazil, therefore, I will define the racial codes that I use. In my discussion the term "black" is synonymous with how Brazilians would use the word "negro." Defining someone as "black" or "negro" is dependent on their own opinion regarding their race and not necessarily on blood line. I would consider most of the consistent contributors to the Black Press of Brazil "Black" because they began to deploy that term more frequently to define themselves than did other members of society. For example, José Correia Leite, a founder of *O Clarim d'Alvorada*, was an illegitimate son of a white father, because of this he would likely not have been considered "black" by many Brazilians, however, he eventually embraced the term and defined himself as such.

I need to also make a further clarification, although there were many different newspapers dedicated to the experience of blacks in São Paulo, this chapter focuses exclusively on *O Clarim d'Alvorada*. As a result, this is a case study of the black press, through one of its most important papers. I made the decision to investigate this paper primarily because of practical reasons regarding the availability of these sources at the University of Illinois. Beyond this logistic reason, this newspaper was the most active black newspaper (1924-1932) of the pre-World War Two era. This is significant because this signals that this newspaper might have reached a bigger audience (than other black press newspapers). For example, Kim Butler considers it to be one of the two most influential journals of the late 1920s.<sup>158</sup> Furthermore, many of the most prominent black intellectuals of São Paulo published in this Newspaper (José Correia Leite, Jayme de Aguiar, Arlindo Viega dos Santos, Isaltino Viega dos Santos, Gervásio de Moraes, Lino Guedes, Deocleciano Nascimento, etc). This means that these men participated in the daily life and construction of black intellectual São Paulo through the literary dissemination that this paper provided for them. As for context, these writers also participated in the creation of the Centro Civico Palmares, and in the Frente Negra Brasileira; later this group of intellectuals would split into two major camps, one supporting José Correia Leite, the other Isaltino Viega dos Santos and the Frente Negra Brasileira (FNB). Thus, by focusing on the black press up until the creation of the FNB, I aim to see the contribution of both groups within one newspaper.

*O Clarim d'Alvorada* was founded on January of 1924 by Jaime de Aguiar and José Correia Leite. It had two major phases one from 1924-1927 in which the paper focused more on literature and the second from 1928-1932 when they focused more on politics. However, they were always focused, to a varying extent, on both subjects. After all, the name of the journal

---

<sup>158</sup> Kim D. Butler, *Freedoms Given, Freedoms Won: Afro-Brazilians in Post-Abolition São Paulo and Salvador*, (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1998), 96.



means Clarion of the Dawn. Clarion is an ancient trumpet that was used to announce news, such as arrivals. Thus, we can see this journal's title to signify the arrival of a new day in Brazil; a new day for race relations. José Correia Leite stated in an interview that the newspaper was meant to have a greater dissemination than other newspapers of the black press at the time. It was envisioned as a mouthpiece for members of the black race.<sup>159</sup> They published around 1,000 - 2,000 copies a month. Although there were many people listed as contributors to the paper many of these names were pseudonyms for Leite and Aguiar who sought to make it appear like there were more people working there than there actually were. However, later, many prominent people began to contribute to the paper (e.g. Evaristo de Moraes, a prominent lawyer from Rio de Janeiro; Aureliano Leite, a representative; Cândido Mota Filho, a minister; Cirio Costa, the poet; and the intellectual Mário Vasconcelos). The last issue of the newspaper appeared in 1932 after which time José Correia Leite was forced to stop publishing because militants from the *Frente Negra Brasileira* broke his equipment in retaliation for his satirization of that group, and its leader Arlindo Viegas dos Santos, and his brother Isaltino Viegas dos Santos, disseminated through his other newspaper *Chibata* (the Whip).<sup>160</sup>

Part of what makes *O Clarim d'Alvorada* interesting to study is precisely the time in which these men wrote. The story of that newspaper is a story of a growing consciousness amongst black intellectuals. This can also be seen, for example, in the adoption of the term *negro* by these writers. At that time, this was a radical idea, because as José Correia Leite, himself, puts it: “the self-awareness, amongst blacks from during the time of the papers, happened only among a small part, because the *negro* never saw that he was living an incompatible life. The *Clarim d'Alvorada* fought hard to make the *negro* accept his condition,

---

<sup>159</sup> Leite, José Correia as cited in Ferrara 58.

<sup>160</sup> Ferrara, 56-59.

because the *negro* did not want to be a *negro*, but rather *preto*, man of color, or something to that effect.”<sup>161</sup> Thus, these newspapers were part of a small, but intellectually significant process of defining and disseminating black consciousness and identity in the 1920s. Furthermore, *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, is a less problematic newspaper to look at when contrasted to the integralist *Frente Negra Brasileira* because of its openness to (as opposed to authoritarian) social discussions about race.<sup>162</sup>

One of the problems scholars of black newspaper face is that, there were no concrete objections to the integration of blacks in São Paulo, therefore racial issues are harder to discern than in more openly racist societies. For example, many blacks were denied the vote, but so were many whites; many blacks were destitute, but so were many whites. Nonetheless, while the Brazilian Republic extended citizenship to all men, the mere presence of these niche newspapers suggests that there were real obstacles that prevented the inclusion of all social/racial sectors. Paulina L. Alberto argues that the intellectuals who comprised the black press in Brazil engaged with issues of “belonging” to a local society that marginalized them through governmental practices and cultural preferences. Thus, these men, engaged in discourses and actions that argued for a real inclusion into that society. That is, as Kannabiran, Vieten and Yuval-Davis suggest “belonging is a thicker concept than that of citizenship... [it] is not just about

---

<sup>161</sup> José Correia Leite as quoted in Ferrara, 59. (my translation)

<sup>162</sup> I say that the FNB is problematic because their leadership advocated an authoritarianism that is disturbing as well as a xenophobic attitude towards all foreigners, including Africans. Isaltino Viegas dos Santos, the leader of the FNB, praised Hitler and other fascist regimes and at the same time denounced democracy as well as communism as being foreign and antithetical to Brazil. Although Butler does argue that this was a reflection of the leadership and that the rest of the members were associated mostly for the social benefit of the group. Butler 118, 123. For more information see Alberto 135-138 and Butler 119-123.

membership, rights and duties, but also about emotion that such membership evoke.”<sup>163</sup> More crucially for this case

the incessant recognition of identities, boundaries and collectivities results in ever new frozen positions that simultaneously and by the same process allow privilege and power for some, while denying access to and creating insecurity for others, channeled through constructions of gender, sexuality, culture, color and family relations, and resulting in more widespread processes of social exclusion.<sup>164</sup>

Thus, the ambition to belong is a desire not just to obtain legal citizenship (which was not a concern for blacks in Brazil) but rather was a desire to have equal access to institutions of power. Because Brazilian society, like all other societies, set up structures for the denial of access based on “constructions of gender sexuality, culture, color and family relations,” the question becomes, how did these writers attempt to overcome these power-granting definitions?

One route commonly taken by oppressed groups is the creation of a mythical past to legitimize a great (and civilized) root. Scholars and people involved with Black movements recognize diaspora as an important component of Black Intellectuals argument for self-improvement and exaltation. Abbadias do Nascimento, for example, made the continent of Africa and its idealized history a central part of his manifesto for “quilombismo” in the Americas.<sup>165</sup> Yet, he wrote his manifesto in 1980, the jingoistic era of the 1920s and 1930s, particularly amongst the blacks in São Paulo, made these post-colonial conceptions nearly impossible to surface. Furthermore, the desire of these 1920s intellectuals was for *inclusion*, not for an alternative culture. “Awakening an insatiable patriotism, the black group sought, in this

---

<sup>163</sup> Kalapana Kannabiran, Ulrike M. Vieten, and Nira Yuval-Davis, “Introduction” *Patterns of Prejudice*. 40 no. 3 (2006). 189.

<sup>164</sup> Kannabiran, Vieten, and Yuval-Davis, 189.

<sup>165</sup> Abbadias do Nascimento, “Quilombismo: An Afro-Brazilian Political Alternative” *Journal of Black Studies* 11 no.2 (1980). 144-178.

period, to be accepted and assimilated values of the dominant society...”<sup>166</sup> Their desire to elevate the conditions of blacks in São Paulo meant that these same individuals whom they sought to help had to acculturate into the broader hegemonic cultural system. Thus, the quest for inclusion by black intellectuals in São Paulo rested upon their deployment of signs of prestige present in everyday society of that city and in intellectual discourse, not on the creation of a separate mythical space. Above all, these men signified themselves as “honorable” by performing various legitimizing acts (e.g. writing, Catholicism, demanding adherence to “proper” social norms etc.) through which they demonstrated their position as patriarchs within society. “And indeed, in many ways the terms on which most black intellectuals argued for their own inclusion into Brazilian identity –as literate, urbane catholic men making no claims to cultural distinction...-marked them as a privileged leadership and simultaneously outlined the terms of exclusion for a wider swath of the population.”<sup>167</sup>

The first way through which black men asserted their privileged position was through the deployment of the act of writing. Part of the power of writing arises out of the possibility of controlling discourse itself. As Foucault states, the immense importance and power that intellectuals have comes from their connections with the discourse of ‘truth.’

The important thing here, I believe, is that truth isn’t outside power, or lacking in power: contrary to a myth whose history and functions would repay further study, truth isn’t the reward of free spirits, the child of protracted solitude, nor the privilege of those who have succeeded in liberating themselves. Truth is a thing of this world: it is produced only by virtue of multiple forms of constraint.<sup>168</sup>

---

<sup>166</sup> Ferrara, 91 (my translation).

<sup>167</sup> Alberto, 20-21.

<sup>168</sup> Michele Foucault. *Power Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977*. Ed. Colin Gordon. New York: Vintage, 1980. 109-133. 131.

Thus, the intellectual's power derives from his ability to create and guide discourse, a marker of great prestige.<sup>169</sup> Indeed there were cases prior to and after the existence of *O Clarim da Alvorada* where a black writer's genius is recognized by all of Brazil.<sup>170</sup> For the writers of the newspaper, engaging with the paper became a way to perform this knowledge-power that was denied to them through other institutions.

The performance of writing occurred in two distinct ways: as readers and as writers. As readers, the editors of *O Clarim d'Alvorada* republished many works, particularly poems. These poems often provided an uplifting image of blacks in Brazil, or they highlighted the role of blacks in the construction of the nation. For example, one frequent target of attention for these men of color was the poet João da Cruz e Souza. Besides mentioning him in various publications, they also reprinted many of his works.<sup>171</sup> Their decision to publish his poem *Caveira* (which has no direct connection to race) suggests that the poet's own positioning as a black Brazilian of substantial literary prowess served as an example of intellectual legitimacy for the newspaper writers.<sup>172</sup> The other way of establishing a connection with the practice of writing was by engaging in the actual process of writing. Many of the more famous contributors to the newspaper engaged in the dissemination of knowledge by practicing different genres of writing: they wrote poems, essays, and stories. Although Jayme de Aguiar was more of a poet and José Correia Leite was more of an essayist they actually utilized multiple genres in their writing, showing that their talents were varied and their intellectual capacity was great.

---

<sup>169</sup> Michel Foucault, Edward Said, *Orientalism*, Angel Rama *The Lettered City*

<sup>170</sup> The most obvious examples of prominent black authors would be João da Cruz e Souza and Affonso Henriques Lima Barreto.

<sup>171</sup> "Cruz e Souza" *O Clarim d'Alvorada*, (May 13, 1926), 5-6.

<sup>172</sup> João da Cruz e Souza, "Caveira" *O Clarim d'Alvorada*, (October 24, 1924). 2.

Through writing, these men were able to not only engage in a practice that was highly respected, but also deploy signs within the writing process that (re)presented them as a member who belongs or *should* belong to the dominant society. An important part of this symbology concentrated on gendered notions of masculinity. As the previous chapter showed, part of the prestige of all men in Brazil was tied with notions of honor. An integral element of honor was the behavior not only of one's self, but also of "one's women." Women were by and large represented in relation to men in these stories, and were constructed as power granting (or forfeiting) objects.

The characters created by the men in the newspapers also reflected efforts to teach what they saw as proper behavior so as to elevate their status as "honorable men." This is seen clearly in a story published in 1929. In this story, the narrator finds himself at a local establishment where alcohol is sold. The story starts with a storm, thereby justifying the narrator's presence in the bar where there is "a penetrating perfume of *cachaça*."<sup>173</sup> The men at the bar are engaged in an endless cycle of disingenuous storytelling. Then, a very sickly looking pale boy begins to narrate a story about the Greek poet Euripides, whom he claims was a Libyan who was raised as a Greek. A hedonistic Euripides eventually becomes a convert to Christianity, after he saves another African from being beaten. The boy's story ends with Euripides gloriously dying as a martyr. After the boy finishes his story he leaves, and shortly thereafter the narrator of the story leaves not wanting to hear the other men defile the great story told by the boy.<sup>174</sup> What at first seems like an awkward story actually discusses proper male behavior by establishing dichotomies. There is immediately a distinction between the narrator who finds himself at the

---

<sup>173</sup> Pirajá Kordoso, "Eu Sou Louco Por Um Caso Assim..." *O Clarim d'Alvorada*, (January 6, 1929). 4 (my translation).

<sup>174</sup> *Ibid*

bar because he is forced there by the rain, and the other people who are there on a somewhat permanent basis engaged in a “marathon of disingenuous causes.”<sup>175</sup> So, not only are the men drunkards for being at the bar, but they are also liars. Besides the narrator, the only other honorable man at the establishment is the boy who tells the story of Euripides. This boy is portrayed as good because he has knowledge of a good story. Furthermore, the story is given a high status because it comes from a classical western tradition. While other men narrate cockfights or scary incidents at cemeteries, the boy’s story is treated as culturally superior because the character is a Greek playwright, thus creating a link to high culture. In addition Euripides becomes a convert to Christianity, which further makes him as a bastion of proper behavior.<sup>176</sup> Therefore, the boy constructs an Euripides that is an ideal for the men of the *O Clarim d’Alvorada*: he is a “good” Christian who is engaged in high cultural practices *and* he is from Libya, and therefore an African. Thus, there is a separation, between the ones who engage in this high cultural form -the narrator, the boy and Euripides- and the rest of the men who go on about their day without really understanding the profoundness of the boy and the story he has just told.

The character of Euripides illustrates the importance of historical literary figures for the editors of the paper. By signaling to already established markers of civilization *O Clarim d’Alvorada* focused on elevating (by westernizing) the values of blacks.<sup>177</sup> A major part of this strategy was to create links between “Great Men” and blackness, suggesting that black men contributed to the construction of Brazil. Nonetheless I must highlight that these civilizing, authoritative figure were for the most part men. That is, only masculine figures were thought to

---

<sup>175</sup> Ibid

<sup>176</sup> Although this is what is told in the story, biographical sources for the life of Euripides appear to be rare. Considering that he lived 480-406 BC it would not have been possible for him to have been a Christian almost 500 years before the birth of Jesus Christ.

<sup>177</sup> Ferrara, 105.

posses the ability to grant validation. In an article published in 1927 Horacio da Cunha mentions “father José Joaquim Lucas, inventor of the machine to write music; Dr. Alcides Bahiam Federal Representative for Amazonas; Dr. Evaristo de Moraes Jurist; Dr. Casimiro da Rocha, Doctor, and State Representative; Dr. Cuba dos Santos, [Judge] of Bananal; Dr. Francisco de Assis lecturer of Latin at the Campinas College” all of which are men and figures with a high degree of education and professional involvement in the nation.<sup>178</sup> A favorite figure that appears many times in their writing is Luis Gama. Gama was an immensely popular figure among these intellectuals because of his position as an abolitionist and a mulatto. Even the name of the first independent black newspaper, *O Getulino* was a reference to him.<sup>179</sup> These real black men provided precisely that link between the readers and prominent black male figures so that people could be proud of them, and consequently not consider race as an obstacle for success.

In the realm of fiction black figures were also conceived to highlight the connection to the past. Slaves were an important symbol to create a link to the creation of Brazil. One fictional figure commonly employed was the character of “Father John.” Like Uncle Remus in the United States, many people today may consider the Father John character to be a problematic submissive folkloric character of a slave-owning society. Martha de Abreu shows us, however, that he was also deployed as a form of resistance to that very same slave owning society.<sup>180</sup> Indeed it is this subversive Father John that appears in *O Clarim d’Alvorada* several times. He appears especially when the writers highlighting the sacrifices made by the black community so that Brazil could develop. This is exemplified by the poem published on the front page on June of 1924 where the last stanza reads “beneath the brilliant sky, to remember somberly/ that the

---

<sup>178</sup> Horacio da Cunha, “Os Homens Pretos e a Evolução Social” in *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, February 20, 1927. 2.

<sup>179</sup> Alberto, 45.

<sup>180</sup> Martha Abreu, “Outras Histórias de Pai João: Conflitos Raciais, Protesto Escravo, e Ireverencia Sexual na Poesia Popular, 1880-1950,” in *Afro-Ásia* 31 (2004) 235-276.



fruits of the coffee are red globes/ of the blood that ran from the enslaved black man.”<sup>181</sup> This last line is particularly poignant and immensely striking in its symbolism. It links the crop that made São Paulo state –and Brazil- rich to slave labor by pointing out that the red fruit of coffee is not the coffee cherry –which is also red- but rather the blood of the slave. This link between the past sacrifices of the slaves and the current prosperous present is again highlighted in a special May 13 edition of 1928 dedicated to this topic.<sup>182</sup> We see Father John again in 1924 in a poem of the same name:

Father John! Irradiant Shadow/ of a not too distant past/ lives still forgotten/ when  
he should be remembered/ Father John! Mighty arm/ Big and sincere heart/ black  
man born in the mud/ who lifted like a giant / this nation to the apex heights/  
Father John --how I love you/ Father John --how I admire you<sup>183</sup>

We can discern two points that are at the heart of the slave symbol for the members of the black press. As with the poem by Cyro Costa, there is a link between the wealth of the present and black sacrifice of the past. Thus, it is the blood of Father John that provides wealth; it is his mighty arm, his work that made Brazil. In addition there is also, in Balthazar’s poem, a more direct criticism of a society that has forgotten these sacrifices. Because of the ungratefulness of subsequent generations the submissive figure Father John becomes a martyr of the black cause.

Alberto further expounds upon this link between sacrifices of Blacks for the greater good of a nation that later forgot them when she discusses the evolution of the campaign for a statue of the *Mãe Preta*. She very interestingly points out that the image selected by the *O Clarim d’Alvorada* was not the traditional images of the black wet-nurse holding her white charge, but

---

<sup>181</sup> Cyro Costa, “Pae João,” *O Clarim d’Alvorada* (June 22, 1924). 1 (my translation).

<sup>182</sup> This date is important for two reasons first, May 13 was celebrated as the emancipation day, and so drew particular attention from the black press. Also, 1928 is the year when the *O Clarim d’Alvorada* begins its second and more political phase.

<sup>183</sup> Dádiva de Balthazar, “Pae João” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (May 13, 1928). 6 (my translation).

rather it also included her own black son standing at her feet. This image she rightfully recognizes that:

In *Clarim*'s expanded drawing (quite possibly commissioned by the paper's editors, like many of their illustrations), the black mother who holds the white child close to her chest is simultaneously turning her back on her own child. This image set the tone for commemoration of the *Mãe Preta* that, while celebrating the fraternity between the wet-nurse's black and white sons, also spotlighted the remembered grievances if not the enslaved woman herself, then of the sons that she bore.<sup>184</sup>

And so we have here, disguised as a celebration of black women, a homosocial connection between the black and white sons of the *Mãe Preta*. This link between white and black society again relates to the image of the sacrifices made by blacks who were not recognized. Although the images of Pai João and Mãe Preta do not, on the face value, exert the same high culture aspect of an African Euripides, José do Patrocínio or Luis Gama, they do create forceful symbols not only to the creation of the nation but also to the creation of a miscegenated Brazilian family.

The campaign for the Mãe Preta monument opens up an important aspect not yet discussed in this chapter, gender. Many of the stories and the poems that appeared in *Clarim d'Alvorada* relate to women, and as such contain heavily gendered notions about the possibilities and the proper behavior of women. One could, for example, make the same argument regarding Mãe Preta that José Murilo de Carvalho makes for the failure of the implementation of the woman-republic in comparison to Our lady of Aparecida. Carvalho's description of the failure of the women-republic is based on the idea that these figures were white and too European to be representative of the nation, and more fundamentally they were public women and therefore subject to accusations of prostitution. Our Lady of Aparecida on the other hand is a *morena* (like

---

<sup>184</sup> Alberto, 97.

most of Brazil) and a mother, a proper role for women.<sup>185</sup> As mentioned in the previous chapter many of the judgments made regarding the honesty of women were based upon a house/street dichotomy as discussed by Roberto da Matta. Women associated with the house would be considered proper whereas women that engage in the world of the street would be suspect of being prostitutes. Thus, Mãe Preta, because she is a mother and is always associated with a baby and with breast-feeding would be a symbol of proper feminine behavior. However, in this instance the case of the black mother clearly expresses a homosocial idea; in the end what is highlighted is the black and white boys' relationship, not so much the mother herself.

As we can see with the Mãe Preta, in the black press aspects of gender are latent, and they lie in the descriptions of women and/or their actions. Proper female behavior is not necessarily discussed as such but instead is promoted through the moral implications of fictional stories. Take, for example, the following case: a narrative published on December of 1924 tells the story of two star-crossed lovers who want to marry but cannot because of familial rivalry. The boy, Gastão must leave for the United States for his studies and the girl is married off. When Gastão returns after having completed his studies, the families are no longer rivals, but he is saddened that his love, Maria, has married. The two want to be together but cannot, because of honor and duty. Maria, however, upon realizing that Gastão still feels strongly for her decides to kill her husband, which she does by pushing him off a cliff. After she succeeds, she marries Gastão who had no knowledge of the incident. A year later, Maria kills herself because of the guilt of the murder and confesses her crime in a suicide note. Gastão is so distraught that he also takes his own life.<sup>186</sup> At its heart, this story is a tragedy about what occurs when social norms

---

<sup>185</sup> José Murilo de Carvalho, *A Formação das Almas: O Imaginário da República no Brasil* (São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1990), 81-92.

<sup>186</sup> Sebastião Daniel "Drama de Amor" *O Clarim d'Alvorada*, (December 7, 1924). 2.

are broken. The woman, by first not waiting for her love, and second by killing her husband, has acted selfishly and, thus, is punished by obtaining what she wanted, to marry Gastão, but not being able to enjoy it. Her decision to break the vow of marriage, ultimately leads to the downfall of both Maria and Gastão. By desecrating the home space (committing murder) even if only because of love, she has brought the social fears associated with the street into what was supposed to be a secured honorable realm. It is this transgression that ultimately leads to their downfall. In terms of gendered aspect it is important to note that it is the woman who plots and kills her husband. Therefore she is the one who transgresses against the sacredness of marriage. By violating her vows and killing her husband, Maria steps out of the role of caretaker of the home space. In the story she is a daughter and a wife; by electing to kill her husband she effectively violates her purity, by desiring another and by actually reacting against her patriarch.

While being more direct the essay genre was also used effectively to describe the writers' ideas of how women should be and should behave. In November of 1925 an essay urges women not to succumb to the latest fashions from Europe and get the cut known as the *la Garçonne*, which is named after the French word for "boy." Instead of getting this haircut, which the writer says is the same for boys and for girls, he argues that women should wear their hair either naturally or in braids.<sup>187</sup> There are two strains of thought that disturbs him. First is the fact that this is an androgynous haircut, thus blurring the division between men and women. Second, he refers to it as a haircut of people who work in "bars" and "confectionaries."<sup>188</sup> Thus, the writer associates this risky hair cut with an even riskier activity, working on the street. It is the haircut of women who step outside of the home space.

---

<sup>187</sup> Cunha, Horacio, "La Garçonne" *O Clarim d'Alvorada* (November 15, 1925). 1.

<sup>188</sup> Ibid.

As this anecdote about hair signals, ensuring that black women were in the space of the house became a real concern for these writers. In the front page of the October 1924 issue there is an article that discusses alarmingly the topic of women who find themselves on the streets due to vices (particularly alcohol).<sup>189</sup> In this essay Leite creates a dichotomy between proper women and improper women based upon the street/house dichotomy. “How many times do we encounter in the heart of the city, with lost sisters, bringing dirty dresses dominated by the alcohol, which is the cause of so much disgrace and unfortunately dominates many women who could be exemplary mothers.”<sup>190</sup> He goes on:

how many tears shed by inconsolable mothers that hoped for their daughters who were raised with so much care, to see them today in such complete misery; how many wives abandoned their homes, tricked they throw themselves in the mud of vices, dragging with them often times the good names of their own husbands!<sup>191</sup>

Thus, in appealing to his readers to help the women he is writing about, he portrays them as lost socially, because they are not following normal social etiquettes. Especially alarming to him are these women who tarnish the “honor” of their husband’s names by becoming women of the street. Hence, a defense of proper female behavior becomes a defense of the legitimacy of black men’s honor and their right to belong to elite social circles.

In addition to this policing of female behavior, proper behavior towards women was extremely important to these men as well. The split between the *Frente Negra Brasileira* and the group led by José Correia Leite occurred because the brother of the FNB president, who was married, allegedly seduced a young *frentenegrina*. The journal *Chibata* (the whip) was therefore created specifically to attack the Santos Brothers, after Arlindo Viega dos Santos refused to dismiss his brother from the leadership and instead dismissed Leite accusing him of being a

---

<sup>189</sup> José Correia Leite, “Desgraça” *O Clarim d’Alvorada* (October 12, 1924). 1.

<sup>190</sup> Ibid. (my translation).

<sup>191</sup> Ibid. (my translation).

Judases of the race.<sup>192</sup> In response Leite accused the Santos brothers of a lack of manliness, due to a lack of morality tied in with Isaltino's sexual endeavor and his Brother's willingness to brush it aside. "Word of a lawyer 'it was nothing. There was no breaking of the hymen; it was only a big moral scratch (finally the race has its own saint Francis of Assisi)."<sup>193</sup> Leite refused to allow the Santos brothers to get away with such degrading and debasing actions, because it was improprieties like this that allowed elite circles to argue against black inclusion. In another poem entitled "Guess" Leite says:

A married man who dates a young single woman, what is he? / -D. Juan.  
 Conqueror and etc../ Its just youthful immaturity/ We of the *mocidade negra*/ do  
 not want *tapeação*/ The well-being of our morality/ demands punishment/ get out  
 of the way secretary/ we demand ceaselessly/ we need serious people/ that we can  
 respect.<sup>194</sup>

The attacks against Isaltino's indiscretion reflect a general pervasive morality that is present throughout the newspapers. Kim Butler describes Arlindo Viega dos Santos, for example, as a staunch Catholic. She appears to link his Catholicism and Monarchist sentiments as effects of broader dissatisfaction with the Republic, which sought to break the connection between the church and the state at the same time that it failed to provide full citizenship to afro-Brazilians.<sup>195</sup> Alberto states "as with values like education and patriotism, ideas about gender and about male and female honor in particular, had special meaning for people of color seeking to dispel ideas of their 'moral annihilation.'"<sup>196</sup> As a result members of the intellectual elite of the black movement in Brazil were particularly attuned to issues of morality (especially when dealing with sexuality).

---

<sup>192</sup> For further information on this topic see Alberto, 131-132.

<sup>193</sup> Homem Negro, "Noticiario," *Chibata*, (February 1932). 3 (my translation).

<sup>194</sup> "Adivinhação" in *Chibata* February 1932 1 (my translation).

<sup>195</sup> Butler, 112.

<sup>196</sup> Alberto, 37-38.

As with any issue of morality, ultimately we must consider its link to religion. One of the strongest tendencies throughout the early history of the newspapers (1915-1937) is the strength of Catholicism, present in arguments and ideals. In an essay published by José Correia Leite, in the first edition of *O Clarim*'s more political second phase, he lays out the new and more direct mission of the paper. At the end of his short essay he explains his vision for the future the paper is striving for: “we want a moral and social fraternity of our people in the journey that cannot be measured in vicissitudes, to educate our children in the religion of God and of love, to overcome all of the obstacles that prohibit a new life.”<sup>197</sup> As we can see there is a clear link between proper and uplifting behavior and a religious moral code. Furthermore, another article argues for the importance of having hope/faith (the word used is *esperança*) in God, whom the article argues, will never forget the weak. It ends by saying “happy are those who embrace Divine hope/faith (*esperança divina*): they don't believe in the hypocritical promises of their peers who judge themselves happy in this valley of tears where only illusion is a fact well represented by our brothers without hearts.”<sup>198</sup> As we can appreciate these writers defined the “uplifting” of the race as ultimately reliant on an acceptance of religious values. This religious discourse gives legitimacy in two ways, by establishing that these writers held traditional patriarchal values, and by connecting them with other elite member in the physical space of the Church.

Furthermore, the religious rhetoric links black sacrifices (like slavery) to power granting religious analogies. Ana Maria, which was a pseudonym used by Jayme de Aguiar, tells an instructive story about this issue.<sup>199</sup> That piece relates the story of a man who is depressed, but who upon seeing an image of suffering Jesus loses his melancholy, because he sees the suffering

---

<sup>197</sup> José Correia Leite, “Vida Nova” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (February 5, 1928). 1 (my translation).

<sup>198</sup> Gil Correia, “Esperança” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (August 30, 1925). 4 (my translation).

<sup>199</sup> Ferrara, 57.

that Jesus went through for him. As a result, he decides to dedicate his life to saving his soul.<sup>200</sup>

As we can appreciate, this piece reflects a practice of inscribing oneself as, not only religious, but as a devout member of a dominant and accepted religion, Catholicism.

This staunch Catholicism is part of a broader set of practices amongst the activists who saw the need to create a separate identity of the *negro*. After all this negro identity was relatively new as a non-pejorative identity. We can say that “negroness” came to be only after the brilliant illiterate carioca orator Vicente Ferreira replaced the term “colored man” for the term “negro” and thus signaled a new era in race relations.<sup>201</sup> In this way the racial identity of these writers (which is incredibly complex in Latin America) was undergoing specific local processes of formation in response to new socioeconomic conditions. This new (re)definition and appropriation of a previous negative term is incredibly important because as Stuart Hall proposes, “Identity is always, in that sense, a structured representation that achieves its positive only through the narrow eye of the negative. It has to go through the eye of the needle of the other before it can construct itself.”<sup>202</sup> Therefore the black intellectuals could only form and justify this “new” identity in relation to an “other.”

The “other” against whom the *negro* identified was the foreigner, thus advocacy of racial harmony and nativism were a reaction to increased feelings of displacement.<sup>203</sup> However, this is where *O Clarim d’Alvorada* differed with many of the newspapers of the time. It was far less nativist, promoting a more open definition of racial belonging. In fact, where *A Voz da Raça* was

---

<sup>200</sup> Anna Maria, “Jesus,” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (November 15, 1925): 3.

<sup>201</sup> Florestan Fernandes, *The Negro in Brazilian Society* trans. by Jacqueline D. Skiles, A. Brunel and Arthur Rothwell. Ed by Phyllis B Eveleth (New York: Columbia University Press, 1969) 453 note 3.

<sup>202</sup> Stuart Hall. “The Local and the Global: Globalization and Ethnicity” in *Dangerous: Gender, Nation & Postcolonial Perspectives* eds Anne McClintock, Aamir Mufti and Ella Shohat, (Minneapolis: University of Minneapolis Press, 1997)173-187. 174.

<sup>203</sup> Alberto, 24.



nationalist in tone, the more politically militant *O Clarim d'Alvorada* became -the more they started to pay attention to pan-African movements- very inclusive. (Marcus Garvey, for example garnered special attention in various editions). Alberto shows that this was not the case however in many of the other papers. Even in *O Getulino* there was a belittling for example of Garvey's "Back to Africa" movement, because Africa was seen only as the place of one's ancestors, as opposed to Brazil the place for civilized afro-*brazilians*.<sup>204</sup> She points out that these differences in rhetoric are present because in the 1930s there is a distinction between the right and the left wings of the black movement. The right-winged Frente Negra Brasileira denied space for Africa in *A Voz da Raça*, therefore the leftist journalist who split from the FNB along with Correia Leite began to provide increasing coverage of Pan-African issues.<sup>205</sup>

If we continue to hold that identity is indeed defined by what it is not, then we may understand why Blacks sought to distance themselves from African cultural productions. Kim Butler points out that when Blacks were writing these newspapers, there was already a white elite that had, through a positivist rationale, decided that to be modern and black was antithetical. Furthermore, she points out that this conclusion was confirmed by a worldview that held Africa as the "primitive" and Europe as the "Civilized."<sup>206</sup> Moreover, government officials began to regulate black cultural productions (like *candomblé*) and make them illegal, because they were seen as a permanent threat to order, security and morality.<sup>207</sup> The result, as Freyre argues, was to create out of a legitimate cultural expression (*capoeira*, *candomblé*, *samba* etc) spaces where resistance occurred, but also where negativity became drawn.<sup>208</sup> The consequence was a

---

<sup>204</sup> Alberto, 65.

<sup>205</sup> Alberto, 140.

<sup>206</sup> Butler, 33-35.

<sup>207</sup> Sevcenko, 21

<sup>208</sup> Freyre, Gilberto *Sobrados e Mucambos: Decadência do Patriarcado Rural e Desenvolvimento do Urbano*, 3rd ed. (Rio de Janeiro: José olympio, 1961), 522.

Brazilian reality where Africa was seen as a savage land and hence cultural productions from that place were seen as dangerous. Thus, black cultural productions began to be seen as bad by the general public especially in areas where there was little contact with African culture to begin with, such as São Paulo. Hence any defense of socio-cultural equality between whites and blacks in Brazil stressed their similarity and not their differences.

Although the governing officials separated Church and State during the Old Republic in Brazil in 1889, the Church was still immensely important culturally. Many high-ranking officials were catholic or had connections to the Church. At the more extreme, people may have belonged to one of the smaller protestant churches –or at the extreme of acceptable extremes– belonged to a new European religion (e.g. positivism, spritisim etc). However one thing is certain, practitioners of Afro-Brazilian religions were targeted by State policies as “backward” people.

Because of the urgency they felt to belong, most of the Black intellectuals in São Paulo also saw afro-Brazilian practices as backward. For these men Catholicism was an important marker for inclusion because it signaled Western civilization. After all as Alberto claims “The Paulistanos of color who frequented São Paulo’s black social and political associations were mostly staunch Catholics who saw their religion as central to what qualified them as true, unmarked Brazilians.”<sup>209</sup> Thus, the practice of marking oneself as Catholic through actions (in this case through the act of writing) was a key part of claiming to belong to São Paulo’s elite society, which also shared those same religious views. As a result, religious imagery and elusions were common in black press stories, as described before.

---

<sup>209</sup> Alberto, 141-142.

In contrast, Candomblé would have been antithetical to a black “religious consumer” who sought inclusion into a mainstream society that held negative views of that religion. Thus, the black press created through their allusions to Christianity an identity of Catholicism through a negative othering of candomblé. This was the case for most of the other Black intellectuals of the time as well. These black intellectuals established an obvious contrast between their religious practices and the Afro-derived religions exercised in other Brazilian geographical areas. Kim Butler and Paulina Alberto both compare São Paulo and Salvador for this reason. Alberto points out that in the Frente Negra Brasileira’s newspaper *A Voz da Raça* the pejorative term “macumbeiro” and “batuqueiro” were used against political adversaries.<sup>210</sup> If we consider how important it was for these men to not only be Catholic but show and perform their Catholicism, being called a “macumbeiro” would be akin to being labeled a heretic, an outsider. Even Leite, who had shown more inclusive notions of identity, saw the afro-Brazilian religions as “sort of backward move in the process of obtaining social progress for blacks.”<sup>211</sup> As Alberto puts it:

Therefore, both the Frente Negra’s subtle but palpable rejection of Afro-Brazilian culture *and* opponents like Leite’s embrace of a contemporary, political pan-Africanism portrayed São Paulo’s black politics as essentially modern, while excluding certain kinds of African manifestations deemed “primitive” and rejecting the reevaluation of African culture rooted in the Northeast and in the nation capital.<sup>212</sup>

Thus, these writers privileged certain ideals of “blackness” that were culturally attuned to the “modern” concepts of the city space of São Paulo of the 1920s, including high esteem for westernization and patriarchy. As Miriam Nicolau Ferrara described “if the press valued the *Negro*, it was the westernized *Negro* that assimilated the values of white society and not the

---

<sup>210</sup> Alberto, 141.

<sup>211</sup> Silva, Luiz [Cutti], and José Correia Leite, *E Disse O Velho Militante José Correia Leite*, (São Paulo: Secretaria Municipal de Cultura, 1992) 141 as cited in Alberto 141.

<sup>212</sup> Alberto, 142.

*Negro* through the prism of African culture.”<sup>213</sup> Thus, it is important to remind ourselves that while members of the Black Press in São Paulo exalted the image of the black man and woman, they exalted a *particular* black man and woman one who were firmly placed within a patriarchal western tradition.

In this chapter I have argued that through the creation of fiction writings in the Black Press of Brazil, black Brazilians were reacting to a social reality that saw them increasingly excluded from white society. As a result, they did something that was unusual in the rest of Brazil, they banded together based on the category of Race. Their cultural productions through their newspapers reflected practices that sought to define them and their readership as inherently Brazilian. Furthermore, in an attempt to further legitimize black intellectual productions *O Clarim d’Alvorada* directed itself to a white audience. However, “the white Brazilian did not take notice. *O Clarim da Alvorada* was a journal for blacks and by blacks. Only extremely curious or studious whites would send their employees to get the journal.”<sup>214</sup> And perhaps this special distance was one of the roots of the racial problems. Although some whites sought out the papers, even in those instances, there were few actual contacts between the members of the Black Press and the hegemonic white world. In other words, even with presumably sympathetic whites the intellectual exchange would have been uneven. Thus, the black press may have responded, but with the exceptions of some notable instances (mãe preta holiday, the integration of the State Civil Guard, the Creation of the FNB as a political party etc) there is always the nagging question for scholars engaging with this topic: How many people actually listened?

---

<sup>213</sup> Ferrara, 203 (my translation).

<sup>214</sup> José Correia Leite cited in Ferrara, 58 (my translation).

The answer is that even with a limited number of followers this newspaper still represented a remarkably early and important effort to engage with, and change, the symbology of “blackness,” and “Brazilianess” within not only Brazil but also within a city that had marginalized blacks and “blackness” more than any other, São Paulo. However, in many instances the defense of race came at the cost of gender. In that way, women were subordinated and objectified as a way to signify and enforce power. Thus, a careful policing of sexuality and the female body coexisted with more progressive positions regarding identity politics.

In the introduction to this chapter I raised several questions regarding the rhetoric of these individuals that comprised the *O Clarim d’Alvorada* and how we can extrapolate these findings to a broader Black Press: what was a “proper man?” What ideals were they championing? Who were they idealizing? The answer to all three questions is that they simply were defending a westernized, Catholic and patriarchal version of themselves. That is, through their fiction we can see that there were three sets of men that were idealized: the historical real black man, the historical fictional black man, and the present black man. The historical real men were the great men that through their professional positions were “uplifting” the race; Men, like José do Patrocínio, João da Cruz e Souza, Luis Gama, etc. who, like the writers, were well read individuals of color. The fictional man was the slave image through which they made a moral argument for belonging and forming an integral part of the nation for which their fictional grandfathers suffered. The present man was an idealized patriarchal version of themselves; the one that would secure a position in the hierarchy of power through his actions. This was the man who held ideals such as honor, love and Christianity. Therefore, paradoxically, black intellectuals did not criticize the system that oppressed them but instead sought inclusion by defending the same mechanisms that assured their exclusion.

## Conclusion

In this thesis I discussed various literary works produced by intellectuals within the black movement in São Paulo, Brazil. Specifically, I looked at the production of *O Clarim d'Alvorada*. Primarily I argued that the works these black men created, expressed an ideology that sought to exclude those they viewed as inferior, while at the same time, seeking inclusion into the broader *paulista* society that directly -through policies- or indirectly -through culture- sought to eliminate and/or marginalize these individuals. These writers argued for their inclusion into the normal body politic not by strategically othering themselves, as Abbadias do Nascimento argued for in 1980 in his *Quilombismo* manifesto, but rather by seeking to remove differences between themselves and the broader elites of society.

Explicitly, these writers began to attack and denounced the various forms of racism and inequality that kept them from enjoying their full rights as citizens of Brazil, even while they defined themselves in exclusionary terms.<sup>215</sup> Many of these black intellectuals even recognized (some admired) the immigrant communities who succeeded in Brazil and so sought to replicate their organizational structure (although xenophobia was also utilized as a political tool). Despite these narratives of success, there was a sense that Brazilian society was leaving them behind and forgetting about their collective past sacrifices to Brazil. As a result, they engaged in many campaigns to remind their fellow *Paulistas* of the sacrifices their slave ancestors made for Brazil. One of the ways in which they deployed this strategy was by the use of the Mãe Preta image. This image illustrated the connection to past black sacrifices, because it highlighted what they had lost (i.e. collectively foregoing their mothers) so that white children could be cared for. A

---

<sup>215</sup> If interested, I would highly recommend Paulina L. Alberto's book. It is the most updated book on these intellectuals in São Paulo that I was able to find.

similar case was the image of Pai João whose physical sacrifice of blood and sweat, as a slave, allowed Brazil to economically prosper.

However when we look at the implications of the arguments these intellectuals were making we find that their discourses are also problematic. Specifically they argued for their own inclusion within the Brazilian society not just by attempting to disregard the differences between themselves and the mainstream elites, but also by *(re)producing* differences between themselves (as elite blacks) and those they considered inferior (e.g. the poor and non-western blacks). As such, these men displayed their westernized intellectual prowess by engaging with/and in literary activities that demarcated them as powerful. They distinguished themselves by advocating, and thereby displaying their own conservative ideals and morality about decency. In short, they displayed themselves as patriarchal honorable men.

I have read this behavior as an attempt to present themselves as the antithesis of the “degenerate” that had so preoccupied Brazil of the pre-World War I years. Although there was a forceful defense of Brazil by the white intellectual elites, Chapter One shows that, although this new positive image of Brazil provided an apology for racial miscegenation, it did little to change the ways in which the elites viewed individual black citizens. In fact, race continued to be a tacit way for the white elite to justify their own superiority. In the end Freyre’s *Casa Grande & Senzala* (1933) established a metanarrative through which the white elites could dispel fears of their own “questionable” racial background and turn that issue into an affirmation of their own superiority. For intellectuals, this new positive view of the contribution of Africans and indigenous groups to the formation of Brazil did little to change lingering perceptions of what they saw as “black primitivism.” That is, little seems to have changed in the day-to-day lives of

the people who contributed to the black press. However, through their writings we can get a better sense of what it was that these men were up against.

In an effort to show that they themselves were not “degenerates,” these men upheld and advocated “proper” gender norms. In chapter two I provided background information to show exactly how gender norms were conceived during the early twentieth century. Therefore, in that section I discussed mostly the ideals of proper female behavior because it was through women’s practices that men obtained and maintained their honor. Specifically, the behavior of women reflected not only on themselves but also on the men of their family. This point is not just theoretical; for example, at the time wife-killings based upon a violation of honor were an accepted practice regardless of its legality. Despite the focus on women, it should be noted that the chapter is also about men, in that it is about how men conceived women and proper female behavior. This discussion centered on the evolution of an ideal, the woman who would remain in the space of the house. Those who were unable or unwilling to protect their own family’s honor and entered the space of the street would be subjected to the intervention of the State; that is if they were able to prove that they were “honest women” that only transverse the world of the street but did not belong to it they would be safe from police intervention.

These reconstructions of the intellectual milieu regarding notions of race and gender by the broader elites in Brazil served as the starting point from which to start analyzing the works of the black press. Neither of these discussions was much influenced by black thinkers, however, chapter three shows how both frames of thought came together for black intellectuals. By investigating the construction of blacks and women within intellectual circles, we can see how these black writers fought against, and selectively chose how to represent themselves. These were men seeking to define themselves and claim their space as “honorable” men. Blacks were



seen not only as lazy, but also as unintelligent and caught in practices seen as uncouth and lowly. Intellectuals, such as José Correia Leite and Jayme de Aguiar sought to dispel these myths. They wrote against it directly, but they also showcased their own examples to show how they were upright citizens worthy of inclusion. The problem, however, is that they used the same ideological conceptions that sought to devalue them, and hence they perpetuated myths about the impropriety and degeneracy in Brazilian society and in the black community as a whole. Thus, these men viewed not only “vices” such as drinking negatively, but also cultural practices linked to many afro-Brazilians in other parts of Brazil, such as afro-Brazilian religious practices.

Despite the black press’ flaws I have argued that the political project of the black press needs to be recognized for its innovation. Particularly because when these newspapers came out it was still extremely early in the political fight for racial equality around the world. After all, it was four decades before the voting rights act would be passed in the United States, five decades before the independence of Lusophone Africa, and seven decades before the fall of legal apartheid in South Africa. However, their innovative approach to race must be taken with caution. Some of their positions against their own discrimination were based upon the elimination of differences between themselves and the white elites of Brazil not on an overturn of the system. Hence, the problem arises from the fact that in doing this they also (re)created old differences between themselves, as elites, and other lower members of society. Thus, the discourse these men employed to justify their own inclusion was done through their own use of patriarchy, which took on not only gendered, but also classist tones.

My aim was for this work to reflect the social ideals that the contributors to *O Clarim d’Alvorada* displayed in and through their own literary works. However, there is still much needed to complete our understanding of this subject: one of the most visible possible avenues

for future paths of research is to investigate the other journals as literary works and not just as historical evidences. Another element that must be considered is the differences between São Paulo and another city where black intellectuals were engaged in a similar local struggle. Both Paulina Alberto and Kim D. Butler compare São Paulo and Salvador, because São Paulo's struggle is seen as intellectual whereas the struggle in Salvador is seen as quotidian practices imbued with "African" meanings (e.g. the black press vs candomblé and capoeira), but what about a city with even less cultural links to Afro-Brazilian culture such as Porto Alegre? Porto Alegre had branches of the *Frente Negra Brasileira*, how did they react against a local situation that sought to marginalize them to an even greater extent than in São Paulo? What I am suggesting is that we cannot make the assumption that the practices exercised in São Paulo can be transferred to other black intellectual contexts. Instead we need to consider how the many cultural differences of the large country that is Brazil affected how racial identities were formed, and not assume homogeneity of thought based solely on race.

The overall goal of this thesis was to explore the ways that black intellectuals wrote and reacted to the racism of the 1920s era *as writers*. While there have been works done on the importance of black intellectuals' ideas as disseminated through the black press, little has been said about their literary contributions and their implications. I believe it is important for us to recognize that these men imagined themselves as authors and they placed a great value on this creative profession. Hence, I hope that I have been able to present how art was involved with politics, and how the black press sought to manage and disseminate both fields. I also hope that I successfully presented how race and gender norms can collide in the process of identity formation, and how political discourses can be both conservative and progressive at the same time.

### References:

#### Primary Sources:

“Adivinhação” in *Chibata* (February 1932): 1.

Cunha, Horacio da. “Os Homens Pretos e a Evolução Social” in *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (February 20, 1927): 2.

Daniel, Sebastiano. “Drama de Amor” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (December 7, 1924): 2.

Leite, José Correia. “Vida Nova” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (February 5, 1928): 1.

Kordoso, Pirajá. “Eu Sou Louco Por Um Caso Assim...” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (January 6, 1929): 4.

Costa, Cyro. “Pae João,” *O Clarim d’Alvorada* (June 22, 1924): 1.

Correia, Gil. “Esperança” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (August 30, 1925): 4.

IBGE, “17. Matrícula efetiva, segundo o grau, a padronização e o destino do ensino — 1932/1934” in *Ensino Geral in Educação in Anuario estatistico do Brasil 1937*, (3), (Rio de Janeiro: IBGE, 1937).

IBGE” X — População absoluta e relativa do Brasil, das suas Unidades Federadas e dos municípios das respectivas Capitais, calculada para 31 de dezembro de 1936” in *Estado da População, in Situação Demographica, in Anuario estatistico do Brasil 1937*, (3), (Rio de Janeiro: IBGE, 1937).

Maria, Anna. “Jesus,” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (November 15, 1925): 3.

“Cruz e Souza” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (May 13, 1926): 5-6.

Negro, Homem. “Noticiario,” *Chibata*, (February 1932): 3.

Leite, José Correia. “Desgraça” *O Clarim d’Alvorada* (October 12, 1924): 1.

Cruz e Souza, João da. “Caveira” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (October 24, 1924): 2.

Cunha, Horacio da, “La Garçonne” *O Clarim d’Alvorada* (November 15, 1925): 1.

Blathazar, Dadiva de. “Pae João” *O Clarim d’Alvorada*, (May 13, 1928): 6.

Secondary Sources:

Abreu Esteves, Martha de. *Meninas Perdidas, Os Populares e o Cotidiano do Amor no Rio de Janeiro da Belle Époque*, Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra, 1989.

Abreu, Martha. “Outras Histórias de Pai João: Conflitos Raciais, Protesto Escravo, e Ireverencia Sexual na Poesia Popular, 1880-1950,” in *Afro-Ásia* 31, (2004): 235-276.

Alberto, Paulina L. *Terms of Inclusion: Black Intellectuals in Twentieth-Century Brazil*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2011.

Andrews, George Reid. *Blacks and Whites in São Paulo, Brazil, 1888-1988*. Madison: The University of Wisconsin Press, 1991.

Angel Rama. *The Lettered City (Post-Contemporary Interventions)*. trans. John Charles Chasteen. Durham: Duke University Press, 1990.

Baer, Werner. *The Brazilian Economy: Growth and Development*, 6<sup>th</sup> ed. Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2008.

Beattie, Peter. “The House, the Street, and the Barracks: Reform and Honorable Masculine Social Space in Brazil, 1864-1945” *The Hispanic American Historical Review*, 76 (3) (Aug 1996): 439-473.

Besse, Susan K. “Crimes of Passion: The Campaign Against Wife-Killing, 1910-1940,” *Journal of Social History*, 22 no.4 (Summer 1989): 653-666.

- Bicalho, Maria Fernanda Baptista. "O Bello Sexo: Imprensa e indentidade Feminina no Século XIX e início do Século XX," in *Rebeldes e submissão: Estudos sobre Condição Feminina*. São Paulo: Fundação Carlos Chagas, 1989.
- Borges, Dain. "'Puffy, Ugly, Slothful and Inert': Degeneration in Brazilian Social Thought, 1880-1940" *Journal of Latin American Studies* 25 no. 2 (1993): 235-256.
- Butler, Judith. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York: Routledge, 1990.
- Butler, Kim D. *Freedoms Given, Freedoms Won: Afro-Brazilians in Post-Abolition São Paulo and Salvador*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2000.
- Carvalho, Jose Murilo de. "Dreams Come Untrue," *Daedalus* 129 no. 2, (Spring 2000): 57-82.
- Carvalho, José Murilo de. *A Formação das Almas: O Imaginário da República no Brasil*. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1990.
- Caulfield, Suanne. "Getting into Trouble: Dishonest Women, Modern Girls, and Women-Men in the Conceptual Language of 'Vida Policial'." *Signs* 19 no.1 (Autumn 1993): 146-176.
- Caulfield, Sueann. *In Defense of Honor: Sexual Morality, Modernity, and Nation in Early-Twentieth-Century Brazil*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2000.
- Dávila, Jerry. *Diploma of Whiteness: Race and Social Policy in Brazil, 1917-1945*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2003.
- Said, Edward W. *Orientalism*. 25 anniversary ed. New York: Vintage Books, 1994.
- Fanon, Frantz. *Black Skin White Masks* trans. by Charles Lam Markmann. New York: Grove Press, 1967.
- Fausto, Boris. *Crime e Cotidiano: A Criminalidade em São Paulo, 1880-1924*. São Paulo: Editora Brasiliense, 1984.

- Fausto, Boris. *História do Brasil* 13th ed. (São Paulo: Editora da Universidade de São Paulo, 2010).
- Fernandes, Florestan. *The Negro in Brazilian Society*. eds. Eveleth, Phyllis B. trans. Jacqueline D. Skiles, A. Brunel, and Aruthru Rothwell. New York: Columbia University Press, 1969.
- Ferrara, Miriam Nicolau. *A Imprensa Negra Paulista (1915-1963)*. São Paulo: FFLCH/USP, 1986.
- Foucault, Michel. *The History of Sexuality: An Introduction Volume I*, trans. by Robert Hurley. New York: Vintage Books, 1990.
- Foucault, Michele. *Power Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977*, ed. Colin Gordon, New York: Vintage, 1980.
- Freyre, Gilberto. *Sobrados e Mucambos: Decadência do Patriarcado Rural e Desenvolvimento do Urbano*, 3rd ed. Rio de Janeiro: José olympio, 1961.
- Freyre, Gilberto. *The Masters and the Slaves*. trans. by Samuel Putnam. New York: Alfred A Knopf, 1968.
- Hall, Stuart. "The Local and the Global: Globalization and Ethnicity" in *Dangerous: Gender, Nation & Postcolonial Perspectives* eds Anne McClintock, Aamir Mufti and Ella Shohat. Minneapolis: University of Minneapolis Press, 1997:173-187.
- Hobsbawm, Eric J. *Nations and Nationalism Since 1780: Programme, Myth, Reality*, 2nd ed. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- Ingenieros, Jose. *Sociologia Argentina*, 7th ed. (Buenos Aires: Editorial Losada S.A., 1946).

- Jesus, Carolina Maria de. *Bitita's Diary: The Childhood memoirs of Carolina Maria de Jesus*. ed by Robert Levine trans by Emanuelle Oliveira and Beth Joan Vinkler. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 1998.
- Kannabiran, Kalapana. Ulrike M. Vieten, and Nira Yuval-Davis. "Introduction" *Patterns of Prejudice*. 40 no. 3 (2006): 189-195.
- Lugo, Alejandro. *Fragmented Lives Assembled Parts: Culture, Capitalism and Conquest at the U.S.-Mexico Border*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2008.
- Maluf, Marina and Maria Lúcia Mott. "Reônditos do Mundo Feminino," in *História da Vida Privada no Brasil: República: da Belle Époque à Era do Rádio vol 3*. eds Fernando Novais and Nicolau Sevcenko. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1998: 367-422.
- Matta, Roberto da. *A Casa e a Rua: Espaço, Cidadania, Mulher e Morte no Brasil*. São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1985.
- Mitchell, John P. "Honor and Shame" *Encyclopedia of Social Anthropology*. Eds. Alan Barnard and Jonathan Spencer. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed London, Routledge, 2010.  
[www.credoreference.com.proxy2.library.illinois.edu/entry/routencsca/honour\\_and\\_shame](http://www.credoreference.com.proxy2.library.illinois.edu/entry/routencsca/honour_and_shame)  
 e. accessed on 10/12/2011.
- Nascimento, Abbadias do. "Quilombismo: An Afro-Brazilian Political Alternative" *Journal of Black Studies* 11 no.2 (1980): 144-178.
- Oliveira Viana, Francisco José de and Jeffrey Needell. "History, Race, and the State in the Thought of Oliveira Viana." *The Hispanic American Historical Review*. 75 no. 1 (Feb 1995): 1-30.
- Oliveira Vianna, Francisco José de. *Evolução do Povo Brasileiro*, 4th ed. Rio de Janeiro: José Olympio Editôra, 1956.

Owensby, Brian. "A History of Brazil's 'Cordial Racism': Race Beyond Liberalism"

*Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 47 no. 2 (April 2005): 318-347.

Schwarcz, Lilia Moritz. *The Spectacle of the Races: Scientists, Institutions, and the Race*

*Question in Brazil 1870-1930*. trans. by Leland Guyer. New York: Hill and Wang, 1993.

Sevcenko, Nicolau. "Introdução. O Prelúdio Republicano, Astúcias da Ordem e Ilusões do

Progresso" in *História da Vida Privada no Brasil: República: da Belle Époque à Era do*

*Rádio*, ed. Fernando Novais and Nicolau Sevcenko. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras,

1998.

Skidmore, Thomas E. *Black into White: Race and Nationality in Brazilian Thought*. 5<sup>th</sup> ed.

Durham: Duke University Press, 2005.

Telles, Edward E. *Race in Another America: The Significance of Skin Color in Brazil*. Princeton:

Princeton University Press, 2004.

Wissenbach, Maria Cristina Cortez. "Da Escravidão à Liberdade: Dimensões de uma Privacidade

Possível," in *História da Vida Privada no Brasil: República: da Belle Époque à era do*

*Rádio*, eds. Fernando A. Novais and Nicolau Sevcenko. São Paulo: Companhia das

Letras, 1998: 49-130.

Zweig, Stefan. *Brazil: The Land of the Future*. trans. Andrew St. James. London: Cassell, 1942.