A Battle of Metaphors: Is Globalization a ‘Rising Tide that Lifts All Boats’ or ‘a Race to the Bottom’?

Using Metaphors to Understand Ciudad Juarez/El Paso Transnationalism

A Curriculum Module

Developed by the University of Illinois’ Center for Global Studies and Illinois International High School Initiative for the PAWAC Annual Conference

“Mexico and the United States: More than Neighbors”

February 17-18, 2006
**Ming-Hsuan Wu** is a Master of Education student in the Department of Educational Policy Studies in the College of Education at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. She has taught English in her home country, Taiwan, for four years and worked as a volunteer in Panama as a Chinese language instructor for a year. She enjoys doing community work in her free time and views it as a way to connect with people on daily basis. Her research interest is the involvement of NGOs in emancipatory women’s literacy programs. Ming currently is a research assistant working with the Illinois International High School Initiative.

**Jason Sparks** is a PhD candidate in the Department of Educational Policy Studies in the College of Education at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. He has been an English teacher for roughly 15 years in a variety of settings, including an alternative high school for pregnant teenagers, a Navaho Reservation junior-high school, a Korean university, and a public high school in North Carolina. He is currently doing research on issues of globalization and educational policy shifts in the Asia-Pacific region with a focus on English language teacher education policy in Vietnam. Jason currently is a research assistant working with the Illinois International High School Initiative and UIUC’s Global Studies in Education Online.

The **Illinois International High School Initiative** was established as a statewide program with a focus on the international dimension of teaching, learning, and community engagement in the secondary schools. IIHSI is a pioneering effort in the nation to deal with the challenges of our increasingly dynamic and complex world by providing Illinois teachers and students with opportunities and resources to acquire the necessary knowledge, skills, and experiences in international education. Please visit our website ([http://www.ips.uiuc.edu/ihs/index.php](http://www.ips.uiuc.edu/ihs/index.php)) for contact and other information.

The **Center for Global Studies** works closely with UIUC’s nine colleges, multiple disciplinary and professional units, and faculty and students to globalize the research, teaching, and engagement missions of the university. CGS works to make the knowledge and teaching programs on all aspects of globalization available to teachers and students in Illinois and elsewhere around the country from K-16. These resources are also accessible to business, professionals, media, governmental agencies, civic organizations, and all members of the interested public concerned with global problems and how to solve them for the benefit of the American people - and peoples everywhere. Please visit our website ([http://www.cgs.uiuc.edu:16080/index.html](http://www.cgs.uiuc.edu:16080/index.html)) for contact and other information.
Introduction

Goals of this Curriculum Module

Section 1: What do we mean by a ‘Global Perspective’?
(And why might we need one?)

Section 2: A ‘battle of metaphors’: Is the global economy ‘a race to the bottom’ or ‘a rising tide that lifts all boats’?

Section 3: Much “more than Neighbors”:
Ciudad Juarez, El Paso & Globalization

Two Issues:

1. When water meets the desert

2. The economic divide: Maquiladoras, Migration & Labor Rights

Section 4: Readings, resources & references

- Illinois State Board of Education Standards
- Suggested Border Studies readings
- Extending the Research

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 2.5 License
2006 Center for Global Studies, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
Introduction

“This is a place where two cities breathe the same air, drink the same water, and share the same destiny along . . . a ‘seamless border.’”

Overview

This curriculum module was developed for the February 17-18, 2006 Peoria Area World Affairs Council conference, “Mexico and the United States: More than Neighbors.” Although specifically addressing the Ciudad Juarez/El Paso border region of the United States and Mexico, this module seeks more generally to explore the ways global forces are transforming social, political, and economic realities all around the world, including the United States. In this endeavor, we view the Ciudad Juarez/El Paso region as a profound example of how Mexico and the United States are indeed “more than neighbors”; this region presents a variety of issues, ranging from citizenship, economy, the environment and human rights that transcend national borders and are truly transnational in nature. These issues, while manifest in this particular region, are actually part of a larger, global set of trends, forces and processes. To understand the transnational nature of the challenges and opportunities facing the Ciudad Juarez/El Paso region is to begin to understand how globalization is increasingly affecting our lives in many fundamental ways

Methodology

We have developed a theme--A Battle of Metaphors: Is the global economy a ‘rising tide that lifts all boats’ or a ‘race to the bottom’?--and we use this as a framework to consider specific issues of the global economy and the transnational metropolitan region of Ciudad Juarez/El Paso, issues for which we have assembled a range of readings, some resources, and a few examples of classroom activities. The “battle” framework is based on two perspectives that emerged again and again in our research: a relatively pro-global-economy, ‘rising tide lifts all boats’ view arguing that the globalization of national economies benefits nations and those living within them economically and socially; and
a more critical, ‘race to the bottom’ perspective arguing that the increasing globalization of the economy allows transnational, deterritorialized investment capital to exploit a global division of labor that is actually increasing the gap between the rich and poor within and across nations. What both perspective share is an understanding that these global processes are dramatically transforming the lived social reality of people and the environment in the areas where these economic activities take hold.

We developed this framework for two reasons: first, because these metaphors emerge explicitly and implicitly in the texts commonly found on these issues; and second, this ubiquity presented a wonderful opportunity to engage students in the process of consciously and critically engaging texts and discourses. Texts, in some linguistic approaches, are specific instances of use of a particular linguistic genre (everything from haiku poems to ‘stop signs’ to national constitutions). Discourses can be viewed as interpretable and recognizable patterns of thought and argument representing certain perspectives of the world (often ideology) which are structured in texts. A particular editorial column in the Wall Street Journal, on for example tax cuts, would be a specific text (the tax cut editorial) in a particular genre (all editorial columns), that would very likely reflect a certain discourse (the WSJ’s traditional “low tax/small government” theme). In this analysis, the rising tide and race to the bottom discourses are considered to be constituted by a certain set of recognizable discursive features, and students will work directly with them.

We take as our premise that teachers would want students critically engaged with each text they encounter both inside and outside of the classroom, interpreting and critically analyzing the ways texts rhetorically assemble facts and perspectives. Metaphor can be powerful rhetoric, and in this unit, we will see that those promoting global capitalism take great pains to deploy the ‘rising tide’ imagery; similarly those criticizing global capitalism deploy the “race to the bottom’ imagery to great effect. Students can easily come to understand the significance of the ‘up/rising=good capitalism’ and ‘down/bottom=bad capitalism’ discourses which are metaphorically structured in the texts they engage, whichever text genres they encounter (textbooks, TV interviews,
economic policy documents). In engaging the texts as texts, the genres as genres, and the discourses as discourses, students can consciously consider and control how texts are ‘working on them’; they can take responsibility for their own interpretations; and they can decide for themselves where they stand in relation to these complex and important issues. Such an approach, we believe, also opens up entirely new ways for teachers to develop lessons around the analysis of texts on this or any subject, substituting texts encountered in the world outside the classroom \textsuperscript{iii} for textbooks, or even analyzing textbooks as texts representing a certain genre, constructed discursively to create certain effects.

Final thoughts . . .

We believe that teachers are busy, but also creative, and we hope that our methodology is clear enough to be suggestive of multiple ways of using our ‘battle of metaphors’ framework to develop classroom activities and for further teacher and student research into the issues. We hope teachers appreciate that our readings were chosen for their accessibility (both for being online and readable), for their relevance to the themes and topics, and for their ‘authenticity’ (discourses actually and commonly found in internet research: World Bank Group reports; NGO websites; online news-media outlets; Google Scholar articles). We have also indexed our module to Illinois State Student Learning Standards (see them in “Readings, Resources & References” below).

We thank both the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign Center for Global Studies and the Joint Areas Centers of the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign for their support and resources. We are very grateful for the opportunity to work on this project given us by the Peoria World Affairs Council, and we hope we have succeeded in creating something teachers and students will find interesting and useful.

Everything below is intended for both students and teachers.
Goals of this Curriculum

- To understand what a Global Studies Perspective is and how it compares to an International or Nation-centric point of view;
- To consider the benefits of a Global Studies Perspective in researching the increasingly transnational interconnections and interdependencies transforming the social, political, economic, cultural and environmental reality of the world in general, and the Ciudad Juarez/El Paso region in particular;
- To understand how the transnational complexity of this border region reflects processes of globalization that link people in the region to each other and to people around the world, whether we live in Illinois or in India;
- To consider multiple perspectives on the Global Economy, as well as the way these perspectives often are structured in recognizable discourses;
- To develop critical reading skills in students across multiple text genres;
- To facilitate critical research skills as students encounter issues of relevance, quality, and ideology in online-text-based research across a wide variety of text genres and perspectives.
References and Text Links


ii Understandings and definitions of the notions of “discourse” and “text” are quite diverse in the field of linguistics. The use of the terms here is based in Norman Fairclough’s work in discourse analysis and social science research. The inclusion of these terms and concepts is not intended to add an element of academic ‘fanciness’ to this discussion; the authors believe that students can easily see the importance of understanding political, social and historical literature in much the same way we teach them to interpret and analyze poetry, short stories and other fiction in English classes. For example, good history teachers would certainly encourage students not to take at face value the content in history textbooks. A U. S. history textbook is a certain kind of text, one filled with easily recognizable discourses which present the world in certain ideological frames of reference. For example, a textbook may present the history of the Alamo conflicts from different perspectives: one might be overtly nationalistic; another more critical of U.S. aims and actions; and a third may adopt the tone of academic objectivity, yet exclude obvious and important facts and perspectives students need to decide for themselves what happened and why it is important. Thus, students can certainly see the importance of how a history book is a certain kind of text, one structured for certain social purposes, purposes it is their responsibility as citizens to
recognize and engage; similarly, students can certainly see the importance of how such a text is inevitably imbued with certain discourses, ones structured and deployed for certain social purposes, and again, ones students as citizens have the responsibility to critically engage. (Or such is the premise that undergirds our curriculum module.)

iii A glorious compendium of real-world textual resources can be found on the Globalization Links page on David Held et al.’s Global Transformations website, http://www.polity.co.uk/global/links.asp. This should not be missed.
Section 1

What do we mean by a ‘Global Studies Perspective’? (And why might we need one?)

Local or global? It depends on what’s in your iPod.

Central Illinois farmers in need of agricultural news of the day can go to the WILL-AM radio station webpage called “Your Agricultural Information Advantage.” And what an informational yield you find there! You can check out such things as the daily chart on “World Agricultural Supply and Demand Estimate in millions of tons.” Also, you can scroll down among the many recorded audio reports, and link to issues like these:

- **Listen to Allendale's Joe Victor's examination of bird flu issues**
- **Listen to David Hightower of the Hightower Report on global economic issues**
- **Listen to Drew Learner of World Weather, Inc. on La Nina potential**

And the busy farmer-on-the-go can even download agriculture news, or “podcasts,” on his or her iPod:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subscribe to AM 580 AG PODCASTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>If you have not tried our AM 580 Agricultural podcasts, now would be a great time to set up your computer or portable listening device. Enjoy the convenience of having the Opening and Closing Market Reports and our flagship show, Commodity Week, delivered directly to your computer everyday!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What can we infer from this august assemblage of auditory agricultural information?

Central Illinois farmers are tuning into Argentina weather reports and Turkey bird flu updates because those far away facts of life are directly related to the lives of farmers, families and friends right here in Illinois. It is now impossible for Illinois farmers, or farmers anywhere in the United States, to think of their businesses in a purely American context; the markets these farmers seek and the competition they face are no longer local or even national: they are global. We now think of Illinois farms and farming communities and farming markets as part of a global agricultural network that connects people from Peoria to Patagonia, Urbana to Udon Thani, Rantoul to Rome. In short, farming is a global industry, one in which the United States is a major agricultural export leader, particularly among its regional NAFTA partners. Consider the following:

NAFTA partners are expected to rank as the United States’ top two markets.

Canada will remain the No. 1 market for U.S. agricultural products at $9.7 billion, while sales to Mexico of $8 billion are expected to surpass those to Japan of $7.7 billion. The European Union (EU) at $6.5 billion and China at $4.6 billion will round out the top five markets.ii

That is big money. But why is this ‘global’? Why is this not simply a matter of international trade between the U.S. and several individual nations?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>North America Moves Toward One Market</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Directions: Look carefully at the following passage. Answer the question: What is the difference between international trade (trade between two nations) and the “one market” described below?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| The agricultural economies of Canada, Mexico, and the United States are increasingly behaving as if they form one market. Not only is U.S. agricultural trade with Canada and Mexico on a clear upward trend, but firms are reorganizing their activities around continental markets for both inputs and outputs. For example, many North American pastures and feedlots contain animals that have lived in more than one NAFTA country, and U.S. consumers...

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 2.5 License

2006 Center for Global Studies, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
There is a difference between trade relations between two nations and a systemic interconnections and interdependencies among several nations, whether in a region, as with NAFTA, or in a larger global context. So we need a way to think about how a regional and global economic system functions if we want to understand the economy of any single nation within that system, a way to extend our understanding of the world beyond our national borders, and, in fact, to a very large extent, beyond all borders. Something systemic and global is happening, and so we must begin to think of global forces and global processes. Furthermore, we need to understand that the global economy does not occur in a vacuum; the global economy has national, regional and local social consequences; and, axiomatically, it is constituted by national, regional and local activities. Any changes in the global economy affect the local economies we all are a part of, and thus our daily social lives are directly affected. Consider the following example of how changes in the global economy could profoundly affect the local social circumstances of the people involved.iv

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Local Costs of Global Free Trade: Agriculture Exports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Directions: Read the text from the World Trade Organization website, “DIRECTOR-GENERAL’S MESSAGE: Seattle Ministerial Conference must deliver for the poorest, says Moore.” Consider the following questions:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. This text presents the Director General’s agenda for controversial 1999 Seattle WTO meeting. What is he advocating regarding agriculture export markets for the “poorest” nations?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. What can you infer would be the consequences for U.S. agriculture if the Director General succeeds in convincing rich nations to remove “ALL barriers to imports from the least-developed countries”? How might this affect farm families in Illinois? How might this affect farm families in poorer nations?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Do some research and find out what these trade “barriers” are.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 4. Do some follow up research and see whether the rich agriculture-exporting nations have changed their policies in alignment these 1999 goals. Why have
So from this agriculture example—which is really just one sector in a huge and diverse global economy—it is not hard to see evidence of important changes across the world as people and places become ever more interconnected and interdependent. If wealthier nations such as the U.S. stop subsidizing agricultural corporations that export to other nations and also allow more and cheaper agricultural imports into their markets, local farmers in those wealthier nations will face serious challenges in trying to compete. However, if less-economically advantaged nations are allowed market access in richer nations for their agricultural products, those people will certainly benefit as their economic conditions improve, and they will be able to afford to buy more goods and services. That is the ‘free-trade’ trade-off! These WTO economic policies, negotiated by participating nation’s representatives, will definitely have consequences for the lived social realities of the people within these nations affected by them. For some it might be better; for others worse.

By the way, what is the WTO?

The World Trade Organization (WTO) is the only global international organization dealing with the rules of trade between nations. At its heart are the WTO agreements, negotiated and signed by the bulk of the world’s trading nations and ratified in their parliaments. The goal is to help producers of goods and services, exporters, and importers conduct their business.

--from the WTO website
Now let’s move outside the realm of economics for a second and consider how globalization is affecting some other aspects of our lives. For example, when that terrible tsunami hit South and Southeast Asia in 2004, you very probably heard about it. You could not have missed it! It was massively reported news from the first moments of the disaster, and just as quickly, relief efforts were mobilized all around the world. Consider this passage from the American Red Cross website on the 2004 tsunami:

---

### Bringing Help and Hope to Tsunami Survivors

When the images of destruction floated across our television screens, the global community mobilized on an unprecedented scale to respond to this devastating disaster that transformed the lives of millions of people in a matter of minutes. The American Red Cross and its partners in the larger International Red Cross and Red Crescent Movement (the Movement) were activated within hours. The immediate priorities were to meet the most urgent needs: to locate the missing, render first aid, distribute food and safe drinking water, provide shelter and prevent the spread of disease.

---from Red Cross website

You may have participated in one of the many relief efforts by donating money to an International Non-Governmental Organization, such as the Red Cross, or even having a fund raiser yourself. And if you did, you were not alone. As the reading selection above says, “the global community” responded. What do you think the phrase “global community” means? Do you feel you are part of a global community? What is your role in that community? Who is in this community with you? Do you have responsibilities in that community? These are questions we are beginning to ask, questions that emerge naturally as we come to share the experience of being together with people beyond our borders in ways we could not have imagined before--on the Internet, watching the same movies, listening to the same music, studying in online education programs, working in Non Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and even working together in the many
Transnational Corporations (TNCs) that are, single-handedly, transforming the ways people work and live all around the world.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Alphabet Soup! IGOs, INGOs &amp; NGOs</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intergovernmental Organizations (IGOs):</strong> It is precisely because states cannot solve global problems that they have established a large number of IGOs. Probably the best-known IGOs are the League of Nations and United Nations (UN).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>International Non-governmental Organizations (INGOs):</strong> INGOs are autonomous organizations not accountable to governments although they may work with them at times. Particular INGOs have often been powerful forces in world affairs. You have probably heard of some of the most famous INGOs, such as Greenpeace, the Red Cross, Oxfam and Amnesty International.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non-governmental Organizations (NGOs):</strong> Private or nonprofit organizations that are not affiliated with a governmental body or institution.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consider a similar situation from another perspective. If the news media flashes events into your living room at the speed of light from across the world, it does the same to people everywhere else. We tend to consider the events of September 11, 2001 as a national, *American* tragedy, but the truth is that the whole world was affected. If you travel in most nations on the globe, you will encounter people who consider “9/11” as a significant event in their own lives, an event with its own meaning, an event that developed each individual’s sense what kind of world she or he lives in, and also a sense of what it means to be himself or herself in that world.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>President George W. Bush Address the Nation on September 20, 2001</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>And on behalf of the American people, I thank the world for its outpouring of support. America will never forget the sounds of our National Anthem playing at Buckingham Palace, on the streets of Paris, and at Berlin's Brandenburg Gate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We will not forget South Korean children gathering to pray outside our embassy in Seoul, or the prayers of sympathy offered at a mosque in Cairo. We will not forget moments of silence and days of mourning in Australia and Africa and Latin America.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Clearly the experience of 9/11 transcended borders. But in another way, so did the tragedy of Hurricane Katrina. Over 70 nations pledged Katrina aid to the U.S.

### US ambassador thanks Vietnam for Katrina relief aid, 6/12/2005

The Ambassador of United States in Vietnam Michael W Marine yesterday sent a letter thanking the Vietnamese Government and its people for providing financial and material assistance to the people and Government of the United States of America following Hurricane Katrina that devastated New Orleans, Louisiana.

Among the many private and public contributions from Vietnam were offers of cash assistance from the Government of Vietnam, and organisations including Vietnam Red Cross, An Giang Fisheries Association and the readers of Thanh Nien Daily. The donations went to the Bush-Clinton Katrina Fund and the American Red Cross. The Food and Foodstuff Association of HCM City also gave away an impressive array of products to the victims of Hurricane Katrina. Hurricane Katrina hit New Orleans on August 29 this year, killing over 1,300

Katrina marked not only a moment of global community due to the outpouring of aid; it also was a moment where people in other nations cast a critical eye on what many interpreted as a slow and inadequate response to the suffering of the people in New Orleans. In particular, many people were shocked that in one of the richest nations in the world they could see levels of poverty and neglect equal to that found in what is commonly called the ‘third world,’ or ‘developing world.’ Worse, the slow governmental response to the crisis, combined with the fact that the victims were overwhelmingly African-American, ignited debates about race and class in America, all around the world. In this situation, many in the world saw this as a moment of global solidarity based in concerns for global poverty and global human rights.
### Two Views from the September 14, 2005 UN Summit

- Antigua and Barbuda's Prime Minister, Winston Baldwin Spencer, joined others in voicing solidarity with the victims of Hurricane Katrina. He added that there would be a silver lining for the global underclass "if the riveting television images of the ongoing agony of Katrina's victims could ignite among all nations, and among all peoples, the recognition that we all share the duty to be our brothers' keepers."

- Owen Seymour Arthur, the Prime Minister of Barbados, noted that the United States is coming to terms with the enormity of the destruction inflicted by Hurricane Katrina, just about a year after Grenada was devastated by Hurricane Ivan. "These recent events have highlighted our interdependence, reinforced the need for sustained and effective international cooperation and have placed before us, forcibly, the need to carry out a programme for global development to stop poor people from being poor, no matter where they live."

When we move beyond the national discussion of Katrina and enter conversation with the global community, we get insights we could never imagine. Katrina in this sense marks a moment where we can see that the problems of America are not isolated to America, and social issues of poverty have global aspects, something that allows us to speak of, for example, 'global poverty' or 'global inequality.' And so we begin to ask ourselves: How is poverty in one country connected to poverty in other countries? Is it possible that by looking at global economic trends we might better understand local poverty? What are the connections? How are our parent's jobs connected to the jobs of parents in other parts of the world? In the case of agriculture, which is where we began this discussion, we can again ask what might happen to the families of farmers here in the States and in developing countries if the WTO does finally develop a 'free trade' in agriculture products that forces our government to remove the various protections that advantage U.S. farmers? Clearly, local social and economic experience is increasingly affected by global forces.
As globalization theorist David Held tells us, we live in a world where “the effects of
distant events can be highly significant elsewhere and even the most local
developments may come to have enormous global consequences.” As we saw above,
the tragic events of September 11, 2001 in New York, Pennsylvania, and Washington
D. C. are considered by many to be a global event, an event experienced by a global society. That is only one of the most spectacular (and horrible) events experienced
as global social reality by people all over the world; but as we begin to reinterpret our
lives here at home as being part of global processes, we will see that it is our typical
and unspectacular school, work and social lives that actually make up the greater part
of what globalization really is. But how can we come to recognize the ways our lives
are increasingly affected by global processes? How can we come to see ways in which
our lives are increasingly connected to—even dependent on—the lives of people in
other parts of the world? How are solutions to my problems linked to the solutions to
problems faced by people in other countries? How are my future prospects, my
possible futures, linked to this globalizing world?

So what is a ‘Global Studies perspective’? A few perspectives

So, perhaps you are wondering what a “global studies perspective” might be. In truth
there can be no one, single global studies perspective, and it is beyond the scope of this
curriculum module to survey the various conceptions of what global studies means. But
perhaps a sketch might do? Most conceptions of global studies are premised in the
global or international “knowledge gap” of American students, a gap that, if not narrowed, will leave a whole generation of children . . . ill-prepared to work and act as informed citizens in the 21st century.xv

A survey of the discourse terrain on global studies education will quickly see that global studies education is a contested notion that enters an already contentious debate on United States curriculum. We can easily recognize four perspectives. First, on the conservative side, we see folks like former Secretary of Education under Ronald Reagan, Chester E. Finn:

Educators have an obligation in any such circumstance to provide the information, the analysis, the conclusions and the lessons that they believe their pupils need. What happened? Why did it happen? How should we think about it? What are we doing about it? What should we do about it? How can we keep it from happening again? And so forth.xvi

This rather teacher-centered and proscriptive approach is an explicit effort to mitigate the emphasis on “tolerance, peace, understanding, empathy, diversity and multiculturalism” he criticizes in U.S. education, particularly in the immediate aftermath of the September 11, 2001 attacks. Finn is aiming his attack on the second perspective on global education, the more progressive side of the spectrum we see in Merry M. Merryfield’s “global educators”:

I have found that global educators share certain characteristic instructional strategies: they confront stereotypes and exotica and resist simplification of other cultures and global issues; foster the habit of examining multiple perspectives; teach about power, discrimination, and injustice; and provide cross cultural experiential learning.xvii
A third common view of global education might be called the “global workforce” perspective:
Globalization is driving demand for an internationally competent workforce. Already, one in six U.S. jobs is tied to international trade. Our trade with Asia now equals over $800 billion a year, more than our trade with Europe. The majority of future growth for industries of all sizes is in overseas markets. Future careers in business, government, health care, law enforcement, architecture, and a wide variety of other jobs will all require greater international knowledge and skills. xviii

I bet we have all seen that one! The fourth and last perspective we typically see in the discourses of global education could be called the “Global American Leadership” view, something we see in the following George W. Bush quote:

America’s leadership and national security rest on our commitment to educate and prepare our youth for active engagement in the international community. I call on schools, teachers, students, parents, and community leaders to promote understanding of other nations and cultures by encouraging our young people to participate in activities that increase their knowledge and appreciation for global issues, languages, history, geography, literature, and the arts of other countries. xix

As you can see, perspectives vary depending on your perspective of the world, the role of the United States in the world, the role of education in society, and the roles of students and teachers in the classroom. In short, it is personal. In developing this curriculum module, we advocate none of these personal pedagogical stances. We take a relatively apolitical stance and base our global studies perspective in three premises:

1. We seek to move beyond a nation-centered analysis and even beyond an international analysis, to a focus on the interconnections and the interdependencies among multiple nations, cultural networks, international
organizations, social movements and groups of all types. A national or merely international perspective necessarily distorts our even obscures our understanding of these genuinely global phenomena.

2. The changes going on around us are dynamic and profound requiring flexible, active interpretation of the world by individual teachers and students in ways that will necessarily expand or transform our understandings of what a society is, what our identities are, and what our roles are in this world changing might be.

3. The nation-state is a hugely significant feature in our globalizing world. But the role of the state is transforming in response to changing reality. For example, as the aspects of economy become increasingly globally regulated (WTO; IMF; World Bank), national governments give up some power. As the global economy moves investment capital in and out of countries at the speed of light, national governments must develop policies to account for these flows and prevent social chaos (consider the 1997 Asian financial crisis). Thus, even to understand the nation, we must understand how governance is changing in a globalizing world.

So, what IS in your iPod?

So what does all this have to do with farmers listening to their iPods? Like farmers, we are beginning to experience certain aspects of our daily lives in our local communities as somehow connected to events, policies, weather, politics, culture, soybean yields, and yes, even musicians, far beyond the towns, farms, schools and malls we spend our days moving through. Like the farmers downloading podcasts from WILL-AM onto their iPods, we are beginning to understand that our education must begin to reflect the
increasingly global realities we face in our lives, not only to protect us from threats, or to help us compete to get a job, but also to help us understand the ways our lives are changing on an almost daily basis and to help us recognize the multiple opportunities and responsibilities this changing world presents.

If the discussion above succeeded in any way to convince us of the need for developing some type of a ‘global studies’ approach to education in this era of globalization, we might move on to another germane question: *What is globalization?*

**What is globalization?**

‘Globalization’ has many dimensions, definitions, and debates, and there can be no one definition, frankly. Later we will engage some of these dimensions and debates, but let’s start by building a quick working definition of ‘*globalization*’ that we can use for the rest of the discussions below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>What is Globalization?  Let’s ask an expert, David Held.</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Globalization can usefully be conceived as a process (or set of processes) which embodies a transformation in the spatial organization of social relations and transactions, generating transcontinental or interregional flows and networks of activity, interaction and power.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is characterized by four types of change:

1. First, it involves a stretching of social, political and economic activities across political frontiers, regions and continents.

2. Second, it suggests the intensification, or the growing magnitude, of interconnectedness and flows of trade, investment, finance, migration, culture, etc.

3. Third, the growing extensity and intensity of global interconnectedness can be linked to a speeding up of global interactions and processes, as
the evolution of world-wide systems of transport and communication
increases the velocity of the diffusion of ideas, goods, information, capital,
and people.

4. Fourth, the growing extensity, intensity and velocity of global interactions
can be associated with their deepening impact such that the effects of
distant events can be highly significant elsewhere and even the most local
developments may come to have enormous global consequences. In this
sense, the boundaries between domestic matters and global affairs can
become increasingly blurred.

In sum, globalization can be thought of as the widening, intensifying, speeding
up, and growing impact of world-wide interconnectedness.

--Definition from David Held's Global Transformations website

The above definition, from one of the world’s leading social theorists of globalization,
certainly is a mouthful! But maybe we are starting to see that globalization has multiple
effects on the world, economic, social and political, and we are beginning to experience
these effects as “world-wide interconnectedness.”

**Discussion**

- For each of David Held’s “four types of change” above, think of one or two
  examples.
- Imagine that one of your friends asked you what globalization was. (And you
don’t have Held’s definition with you!) How would you answer in your own words?

OK, that is one good first effort to understand what globalization is. We will take this
and apply it to our main topic of discussion, the ways the relationship of Mexico and the
United States are transforming in this era of globalization—and more generally, how
study of this changing relationship can help us understand the multiple effects and
forces of globalization in the world today.
In the next section, we will consider some specific examples of our “connectedness” to people, places, economies, and societies of people around the world. This will help us when we look more specifically at Mexico and the United States. We will look at how our United States economy is part of the “world-wide systems of transport and communication” and investment “capital” that constitute our truly global economy. We will see that in order to understand the United States economy, we need to see it from a “Global Studies Perspective,” one that lets see how the U.S. fits in to a global system that no one nation, or group of nations can completely control. Everything from the jeans we buy to the jobs we will one day get are part of this global economy; and this also means that everything we buy, every job we do, every politician we vote for, and every social organization we join affects the web of interconnectivity that David Held describes above.

In short, and in particular, we will look into some aspects of the global economy and consider how they affect the lives of people here in the United States and in Mexico. Furthermore, we will see how “increasingly powerful transnational actors,” such as transnational corporations (TNCs), are involved in these some social, economic, and environmental issues.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>More Alphabet Soup! MNCs, MNEs &amp; TNCs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Multinational corporation (MNC)</strong> or <strong>multinational enterprise (MNE)</strong> or <strong>transnational corporation (TNC)</strong> is a corporation/enterprise that manages production establishments located in at least two <strong>countries</strong>.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Multinational corporations (MNC) are often divided into three broad groups:

- **Horizontally integrated multinational corporations** manage production establishments located in different countries to produce same or similar
products.

- **Vertically integrated multinational corporations** manage production establishment in certain country/countries to produce products that serve as input to its production establishments in other country/countries.

- **Diversified multinational corporations** manage production establishments located in different countries that are neither horizontally nor vertically integrated.

Very large multinationals have budgets that exceed those of many countries. They can have a powerful influence in international relations, given their large economic influence in politicians’ representative districts, as well as their extensive financial resources available for public relations and political lobbying.

Multinationals have played an important role in globalization. Given their international reach and mobility, prospective countries, and sometimes regions within countries, must compete with each other to have MNCs locate their facilities (and subsequent tax revenue, employment, and economic activity) within. To compete, countries and regional political districts offer incentives to MNCs such as tax breaks, pledges of governmental assistance or improved infrastructure, or lax environmental and labor standards. This process of becoming more attractive to foreign investment can be characterized as a race to the bottom.

---

**Research**

Pick one MNC. Visit their website and map out their operations across the countries involved. Try to understand why this MNC has chosen these locations. For example, for manufacturing? Raw materials? For sales markets?
References and Text Links

i WILL AM 580 website, http://www.will.uiuc.edu/am/agriculture/default.htm


v Wonderful resources for this issue can be found by hunting around the WTO website’s Trade Topics section for their “Agriculture” page (http://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/agric_e/agric_e.htm). Also, for a critical and informative look at the WTO and their global economic involvement, go to the Public Citizen’s Global Trade Watch section for their “Agriculture” page (http://www.citizen.org/trade/wto/). Wikipedia has a nice, quick chronology of the Doha Round and some good links too (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Doha_round).


viii In addition to the links that appear below, be sure to visit the Global Policy Forum website for more detailed discussion of NGOs: http://www.globalpolicy.org/ngos/index.htm. Also look around this organizations site for multiple resources. Their stated mission is to “monitor policy making at the United Nations, promote accountability of global decisions, educate and mobilize for global citizen participation, and advocate on vital issues of international peace and justice.”

ix These definitions are adapted from Robin Cohen and David Kennedy’s (2000) Global Sociology, published by New York University Press, New York, p. 31. This is an excellent and very readable college-level textbook that could be used either as a course book for upper-level high school kids or for teachers seeking background knowledge or curriculum materials. In the humble opinion of the authors of this module, we believe this book is essential for teachers doing work in globalization.
From the “Glossary” page of the You think! But do you know? section of the Worldbank website, http://youthink.worldbank.org/glossary.php. Go to the Youthink! But do you know? area and find many excellent resources for teachers and students.


The film September 11 is an interesting compilation of short films by several international directors. Students may enjoy the global perspectives. http://www.amazon.com/gp/product/B00062J0NA/qid=1139994551/sr=1-2/ref=sr_1_2/103-8876039-7306201?s=dvd&v=glance&n=130


David Held, “What is Globalization?” From the Global Transformations website, http://www.polity.co.uk/global/executiv.htm. This is an amazing website for readable texts about globalization assembled by one of the world’s leading theorists of globalization.

Section 2

A Battle of Metaphors:

Is the global economy ‘a race to the bottom’ or ‘a rising tide that lifts all boats’?

Preview: Edifying Editorial Cartoons

Look at these cartoons. They will introduce us to some of the issues we are going to discuss. Do you ‘get’ them? What are they trying to say? What are some things you don’t understand?

Discussion

Using everything you can think of from the cartoons, try to answer the following questions:

1. What does each cartoon say about the connection between Mexico and the United States?
2. What do these cartoons say about the global economy and its effects on people’s lives, such as yours?
3. What is the attitude of each editorial cartoonist? (Remember, these are editorial cartoons!)
4. Using the cartoons and your imaginations (educated guesses!), what do you think our two metaphors, a ‘rising tide’ and a ‘race to the bottom’ MIGHT mean in discussing the global economy?
Cheap Labor

© Copyright 2004 Larry Wright All rights reserved-Used by permission
The economic debate: ‘Battling’ Metaphors

Do you remember what metaphors are? Review them in an old English book. Sometimes metaphors help us ‘get a handle on’ things. (How is that for a metaphor?) In writing, we commonly resort to metaphors to help us shape our ideas, something we all know from our experiences ‘getting into’ poetry and songs, but, in fact, we use metaphors all the time. Here we will ‘look into’ the way two metaphors represent the global economy in the news, in our textbooks, in government reports, and in

The Great Wall (Mart) of America
© Copyright 2005 RJ Matson All rights reserved-Used by permission
conversations. One we will call the ‘rising tide lifts all boats’ metaphor; the other, the ‘race to the bottom’ metaphor.

The ‘rising-tide’ image of the global economy tells us that the increasingly interconnected economic system not only makes rich nations rich, but also makes poor nations less poor. Consider this World Bank Group statement as an example:

Rapid growth and poverty reduction in China, India, and other countries that were poor 20 years ago, has been a positive aspect of globalization.ii

Other analysts of global economics see the global process metaphorically as a ‘race to the bottom,’ in which investors ‘race’ to set up operations in those nations, or in those regions within nations (export-processing zones, or EPZs), with the lowest labor costs and the lowest environmental and labor-rights standards in order to maximize profits. And thus, this intensifies competition among nations, or regions within them, to provide even lower cost labor and even lower environmental and financial standards in order to attract greater investment from multinational or transnational corporations.

The ‘race to the bottom’ view does not agree with the ‘rising tide’ perspective at all, citing the following as evidence of increasing global inequality:

This globalization of market forces has greatly increased the inequality in the world. Just 150 years ago there was not great inequality between the standards of living of people in the global north and those in Africa, Asia and Latin America. But slavery, colonialism and an increasingly integrated world economy transferred wealth from the south to the north.
Now the richest 20 percent of the world's population receives 83% of the world's income, while the poorest 60% of the world's people receive just 5.6% of the world's income. The richest 20% of the world's population in northern industrial countries uses 70% of the world's energy, 75% of the world's metals, 85% of the world's wood, and 60% of the world's food. This 20% minority is also responsible for producing about 75% of the world's environmental pollution.iii

If you look closely, the data cited by both groups are not necessarily contradictory; however, the ideological, political, and social viewpoints are not very complementary. The ‘rising tide’ view is correct in stating that overall wealth in these nations has increased; whereas the ‘race to the bottom’ perspective sees unequal distribution of wealth within and across nations.

Defenders of the system keep reassuring us that if we can just get economic growth rates high enough, these problems will be solved. We regularly hear the refrain, "a rising tide floats all boats." But for those who don't own boats or have leaky boats, a rising tide means greater inequality between them and the more fortunate.iv

These competing interpretations of the benefits and costs of a globalizing economy are not assembled here to encourage us to decide the winner of some ‘point-counterpoint’ debate. This debate is meant to show what the issues are and how they emerge in the discourses we commonly see in newspapers, talk shows, magazines, textbooks, and even political cartoons. The debate helps us see how the global economy can be understood as a global system of trade in which individual national economies are merely component parts. As David Held says:
The growing extensity and intensity of trade has led to the increasing enmeshment of national economies with each other. A new global division of labour in the production of goods is emerging. The stages of the production process are being sliced up and located in different countries, especially in developing and emerging economies. Thus not only do countries increasingly consume goods from abroad, but their own production processes are significantly dependent on components produced overseas. The impact of this is that economic activity in any one country is strongly affected (through trade networks) by economic activity in other countries.

So, regardless of how we imagine the global economy, either as a 'rising tide' or a 'race to the bottom,' we can probably agree that the global economy is transforming rapidly, permanently, and profoundly, and that these changes will have serious consequences for the societies, the economies, and the natural environments of every nation in the world. Let’s take a closer look at each of these perspectives of the economy.

**Discussion One: Is the global economy a ‘rising tide that lifts all boats’?**

As mentioned briefly above, many people view the global economy as a good thing for all involved. This ‘rising-tide lifts all boats’ perspective of the global economy tells us that the increasingly interconnected economic system not only makes rich nations rich, but also makes poor nations less poor. Let’s consider again this World Bank Group statement:
Rapid growth and poverty reduction in China, India, and other countries that were poor 20 years ago, has been a positive aspect of globalization.\(^vi\)

One organization, the World Trade Organization (WTO), plays a major role in promoting the global economy. The WTO is a forum in which 149 member nations negotiate global trade agreements among many economic sectors, under the guiding ‘free market’ principles of the organization. Recently there has been a great deal of controversy over trade in agriculture between developing and developed nations in what is called the Doha Round. If anything would be of interest to our Illinois farmer with the iPod discussed above, it would be these negotiations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yet More Alphabet Soup! The WTO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The World Trade Organisation was established, with around 150 member states, in 1995, as a result of the Uruguay round of trade negotiations, held under the General agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT). The purpose of the WTO is to regulate, administer, and arbitrate on the rules of international trade. Member states agree unanimously to most decisions, legislating them afterwards in their parliaments. Trade decisions are made in a number of forums, but mainly in the Ministerial meetings, held every two years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Every two years, the trade ministers from, WTO member states meet to discuss and agree on rules of trade at the Ministerial meetings. The terms of trade are currently weighted in favour of the developed countries, which are seeking ever greater access to Southern markets . . .</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--“Editorial,” from Maree Keating(^vii)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Take a look at the PowerPoint slide below. This is from a presentation done by a United States expert on the global agriculture industry who is arguing for ‘free trade’ in agriculture.\(^viii\) In this slide, the presenter demonstrating the connection, in his view, between a ‘free market’ in agriculture as envisioned by the WTO and the development of ‘low income’ countries. Look carefully at the slide and try to understand what he is saying.
Why the Development Focus in This WTO Round?

- It’s in our economic self-interest:
  - 50% more population by 2050 -- all in low income countries
  - Half the current population lives on less than $2/day.
  - They are the only potential growth market for agricultural products, but only if and when they can afford to eat meat, fruits, vegetables; edible oils.
- Trade is a more powerful engine of growth than aid.
- Persistent poverty can have adverse geopolitical effects (Doha soon after 9/11) and cause illegal immigration
- Developing countries are now the majority of WTO members; there will be no agreement until they perceive something of value in it to them (unlike the past).

Discussion

Look carefully at the slide above. What is he (it is, actually, a 'he') saying? In your own words, make the presenter's argument. What is his claim? How does he support his claim? What do you think? Does this argument convince you?

Take a look at a second slide form the same presentation. What do you notice?
Notice how detailed this slide is? These World Bank statistics indicate those nations with large populations living on less than one or two U.S. dollars per day. The presenter is indicating that if these people begin to have more money to spend on food, then those folks selling food, like Illinois farmers, like farmers all over the world, will make more money. But the barrier to this “market growth potential” is economic development in these countries—which means these countries need to be able to sell their products to developed countries like the U.S. Developed countries are not all in agreement about this, and many nations set up a variety of trade barriers that many free-trade advocates describe as “global agricultural distortions” that must be eradicated to realize the full benefits of our global economy. According to a 2001 United States Department of
Agriculture report, “eliminating global agricultural policy distortions would result in an annual world welfare gain of $56 billion.” That is a lot of money!

### WTO Minister’s Statement on Development and Developing Nations

| WTO Minister’s Statement on Development and Developing Nations
| International trade can play a major role in the promotion of economic development and the alleviation of poverty. We recognize the need for all our peoples to benefit from the increased opportunities and welfare gains that the multilateral trading system generates. The majority of WTO members are developing countries. We seek to place their needs and interests at the heart of the Work Programme adopted in this Declaration. Recalling the Preamble to the Marrakesh Agreement, we shall continue to make positive efforts designed to ensure that developing countries, and especially the least-developed among them, secure a share in the growth of world trade commensurate with the needs of their economic development. In this context, enhanced market access, balanced rules, and well targeted, sustainably financed technical assistance and capacity-building programmes have important roles to play. |

### Research

 Spend some time on the World Trade Organization website trying to understand the way this issue of developing nations and economic development is discussed. What are the issues? Does some research into U.S. trade policies. What is our national policy ‘stance’ in regard to developing nations and the agriculture sector? How might these issues affect family farmers differently than large American agribusiness corporations? What are your views?

In short, this ‘rising tide’ view argues that if there were a free and open global marketplace for goods and services, richer and poorer nations would be able to trade in ways that would benefit all parties. It is the ultimate win-win situation. In this view of the global economy:

> Globalization is the solution for world poverty. [. . .] All the boats rise, so to speak, with the tide of increased wealth swelled by a global division of labor, competitive markets, and the diffusion of scientific knowledge and technological know-how. 

But for those subscribing to the ‘rising tide’ perspective, the growth of an open, unregulated global economy means that everybody wins based on their view that the laws of capitalist economy, based in mechanisms of the ‘free-market’ in which the labor
pool comes from the “global division of labor,” not merely the division of labor within any given nation.

The WTO and the World Bank are two organizations promoting the globalization of the economy, but there are other ‘players’ to consider. In particular, we need to understand how the global economy is increasingly dominated by multinational, or transnational, corporations (MNCs or TNCs), huge organizations that play a major part in the transformation of the global economy—some even say they are “the single most important force in creating global shifts in economic activity.”

For example, consider the following World Bank Group statement:

Firms and entrepreneurs of all types—from microenterprises to multinationals—play a central role in growth and poverty reduction. Their investment decisions drive job creation, the availability and affordability of goods and services for consumers, and the tax revenues governments can draw on to fund health, education, and other services.

The World Development Report 2005 argues that improving the investment climates of their societies should be a top priority for governments.

In this very favorable view of TNCs, they are seen to benefit not only consumers; they also benefit societies by providing tax revenues that provide essential social services (health, education) and jobs. Sounds like a nice deal for everybody. Furthermore, for many of the people promoting this ‘rising tide’ view of the global economy, even the
controversial practice of ‘outsourcing’ or the ‘off-shoring’ of jobs from developed nations to developing nations with lower labor costs and regulations is a good thing—a *natural* reflection of the global division of labor in a properly functioning free-market economy. It is ‘efficient’ and thus good for everyone—another win-win situation. Consider this passage from a column by globalization guru Thomas Freidman, as he recounts a conversation he had recently with an Indian corporation head about American white-collar jobs disappearing as this work moves to India:

"How can it be good for America to have all these Indians doing our white-collar jobs?" I asked 24/7's founder, S. Nagarajan.

Well, he answered patiently, "look around this office." All the computers are from Compaq. The basic software is from Microsoft. The phones are from Lucent. The air-conditioning is by Carrier, and even the bottled water is by Coke, because when it comes to drinking water in India, people want a trusted brand. On top of all this, says Mr. Nagarajan, 90 percent of the shares in 24/7 are owned by U.S. investors. This explains why, although the U.S. has lost some service jobs to India, total exports from U.S. companies to India have grown from $2.5 billion in 1990 to $4.1 billion in 2002. What goes around comes around, and also benefits Americans.\textsuperscript{xvi}

So even though America lost *some* kinds of jobs to India, consumers in the improved Indian economy demanded *other* products and services that *other* American workers could provide. This example from India illustrates the notion of ‘comparative
advantage,’ which is a technical economic concept that is intended to explain how the
global economy could naturally be structured.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comparative Advantage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The idea that a country will specialize in producing goods and services that can be produced most efficiently. For example, in producing some goods, a less-developed country has a comparative advantage in lower wage costs, which allows it to produce and trade some goods at less cost than developed countries.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| --from “WTO Terms and Phraseology”

This comparative advantage argument is often used by ‘rising tide’ proponents to answer the criticism, discussed below in detail, that an uncontrolled global economy makes it too easy for MNCs to move in and out of countries with no regard to the social or economic consequences to those nations and their citizens. As in the Indian example above suggests, there is something natural about the economy, some force that seeks equilibrium, or balance, and while some individuals will suffer as industries, factories and jobs come and go, more people will benefit. For proponents of the ‘rising tide’ view, education plays a major role in this dynamic global economy, educating students and adults (lifelong learning) in the skills and knowledge necessary. In this ‘social efficiency’ view of education, education can assist the economy and society by providing the ‘human capital’ for the global economy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Human Capital</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>People and their ability to be economically productive. Education, training, and health care can help increase human capital. See also capital and physical capital.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| --from You think! But do you know?

Notice that human knowledge and health are viewed as ‘capital,’ something that can be invested!
Read the following description of the Coca Cola Learning Centers in Vietnam.

Providing a dynamic environment in which Vietnamese youth can extend their education through IT access and tools, Coca-Cola, in partnership with Viet Nam’s Ministry of Education-Training and the National Youth Union has set up an interlinked network of learning centres in secondary schools and youth centres across Viet Nam. Covering 33 provinces and cities and benefiting an estimated 10,000 students and their teachers, 40 centres have so far been built. Staffed by teachers, these Learning Centres are equipped with computers providing Internet and e-mail access, software and books in a comfortable learning environment, for use both during and after school hours. The programme includes the annual “Young Leaders of the Future” contest, covering a number of academic disciplines and involving the 200 top students involved in the Learning Centre programme. Eventually the programme will cover each of Vietnam’s 61 provinces and cities.

1. What does this program suggest about the ways global capitalism may be a force for development?

2. Consider the role of education in developing human capital in a global division of labor. Why might Coca Cola be interested in Vietnamese education?

So, briefly sketched above is the ‘rising tide lifts all boats” perspective of the global economy. Without doubt, data indicate that poverty across the globe has been dramatically reduced as global economic activity has increased. But is this the whole
story? Let’s take a look at the other side in this metaphorical debate, the ‘race to the bottom’ viewpoint. It may be that we discover some issues left out of the enthusiastic portrayal of global capitalism’s ability to ‘raise all boats’ above.

**Discussion Two: Is the global economy ‘a Race to the Bottom’?**

The ‘rising tide lifts all boats’ metaphor discussed above offered us one point of view of the relationship of global capitalism and social and economic development. It will probably not surprise you to hear that there is another point of view on global capitalism, a critical one that is distinctly skeptical of the supposed benefits of global capitalism to national economies and the societies affected. This skeptical argument is based in an analysis of the effects on local and national economies and societies of policies promoting ‘free trade,’ policies that are promoted and enforced by Intergovernmental Organizations (IGOs), national governments (treaties such as NAFTA, CAFTA), policies that directly benefit Transnational Corporations (TNCs). In this view, national governments give in to pressures or incentives to weaken national control of the economy and permit increasingly unregulated international trade and investment in an effort to create desirable ‘investment climates.’ National governments compete with each other to create these ‘climates’ (*there* is a great metaphor!) in an effort to attract investment and development. Thus, according to this view, we see national governments ‘racing’ each other to transform their economies and societies into ever-more convenient and comfortable places for MNCs and other investment capital—a race to the bottom. (Global capital can also be said to ‘race’ to the bottom, seeking increased profit.) But what are the features of this ‘investment climate’ that
governments seek to change in order to attract investment and development?

According to one national document, such a climate would feature:

- developed markets for sale of products;
- skilled and relatively cheap labour resources;
- developed scientific, technological, industrial and export capacities;
- political and social stability;
- legislative and organisational support of the investment process.

We will focus on three features of this climate, two are explicit, one implicit. The explicit features are the ‘labor resources’ and the political and social stability. The implicit feature is the effects on the natural environment of governmental “support of the investment process” that may be responsible for limited regulation of environment protection.

First of all, what happens when jobs in wealthier ‘Northern’ nations, like the U. S. or Germany are lost when imports from less-wealthy nations, often ‘Southern’ nations, such as Mexico or India, increase dramatically? (We saw this above in the discussion of the WTO’s efforts to establish a free agriculture market, trying to force developed nations to stop subsidizing their agriculture corporations, and thus opening their markets to crops from developing nations.) As global capitalism races around the globe in search of the greatest profit, local conditions, be they economic or social, do not necessarily improve. Jobs can be lost, the environment polluted and worsening economies can have serious negative social effects.
The following quote illustrates the effects on the U.S. apparel industry, once a major employer of U.S. workers, of global economic competition:

Over the past four decades, the U.S. apparel industry has been overwhelmed by this global low-wage competition. Apparel imports rose from about 2 percent of U.S. domestic consumption in the early 1960s to more than 60 percent in the 1990s.\textsuperscript{xxi}

This trend has all but decimated the U.S. apparel industry, and, to compound this loss, we have recently agreed to lower our import restrictions to nations like China and India. There personal, local and even national consequences to this loss of industry.

But this ‘race to the bottom’ does not begin with U.S.-based and Multinational firms moving to poorer, ‘Southern’ countries. We saw it in the U.S. beginning in the 1970s. The United States has seen the ‘migration’ of jobs from Northern and Northeastern states (the ‘rustbelt’) with strong labor union involvement in the setting of wages and benefits to the South and Southwest (‘sunbelt’) states who created an attractive investment climate because they discouraged union involvement in wage and benefit negotiations, and thus promoted lower wages, fewer insurance benefits, and less support for injured, laid-off, or fired workers. These Southern and Southwestern states called themselves ‘right to work’ states.\textsuperscript{xxii}

We see this trend in the following example. Here we see a conversation reported in the \textit{New York Times} among some textile mill workers in Maine who have just learned that their mill has been sold and they will lose their jobs. The new owners, under the
management of Albert Dunlap, a controversial CEO, plan to move the mill operations to a southern state where labor is cheaper. Here, one mill worker recognizes that the work they do can be done anywhere, despite the expertise they have:

"Any company can weave our shells if they have our patterns," she said flatly, bringing the conversation down to earth.

Recently installed modern machinery at the mill could be shipped almost anywhere, she said, even to Mexico.

"I have the feeling, Ray," she said, softly now, as she looked at Mr. Tilton, "if they wanted to move us down South they could do it. That's what scare[s] me."

"I don't know," replied Mr. Tilton, a little deflated but refusing to concede defeat.

"We have all the experience. The tradition. Our families are here."

"They could retrain workers and get it done in six months," Mrs. LaChance said, pursing her lips with conviction.

"Family, traditions -- that means this much to Al Dunlap," said another person in the room, forming a zero with his thumb and forefinger.

And so (and with apologies to Al Dunlap, who is not very favorably, or perhaps fairly, represented here) we can see from this example that the local is always already global: here, the same economic force that is transforming the global economy, investment capital, will move these workers’ factory from a higher paying region of the U.S. to the south. Furthermore, as this mill worker above recognizes, those jobs in the southern
U.S. could just as easily move to Mexico and by now they may have. These workers, like workers everywhere, are quite aware that the economy that feeds, clothes and houses them is no longer national, it is transnational—it is global.

Quickwrite!
Write a quick one-page essay in which you analyze this cartoon. How can this cartoon help us understand the ‘race to the bottom’ perspective on the global economy? What do you think?

What’s in your iPod? Using songs to explore the issues
Bruce Springsteen’s song “My Hometown” addresses this issue directly. xxiv

Now Main Street's whitewashed windows and vacant stores
Seems like there ain't nobody wants to come down here no more
They're closing down the textile mill across the railroad tracks
Foreman says these jobs are going boys and they ain't coming back to your
Jobs in manufacturing such as those described above moved to places like Cuidad Juarez in the form of 'maquilas.'

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maquilas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The use of the word 'maquila' in Central America originates from the Arabic word makila, which referred to the amount of flour retained by the miller in compensation for grinding a farmer's corn in colonial times. Today the term retains some of its original meaning. In current usage, a maquila is a factory contracted by corporations to perform the last stages of a production process --- the final assembly and packaging of products for export. Transnational corporations (TNC's) supply maquilas with the pre-assembled material, such as cloth and electronic components, and maquilas employ workers to assemble the material into finished or semi-finished products. The maquilas then export 100% of their products back to the TNC's.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

--from "The Maquila in Guatemala: Facts and Trends," xxv

These “transnational assembly plants arrived on the U.S.-Mexico boundary a generation ago and boomed after the passage of NAFTA,” but,

lately, maquilas have been moving from Juárez to countries such as China, which offer even cheaper labor. In the past two years, according to the New York Times, Juárez has lost some 300,000 maquila jobs. xxvi

But issues beyond labor costs drive this race to the bottom. For example, consider freelance journalist, and teacher Sam Wardle’s description of a recent visit to an amusement park in Wuhan, China,

One day, I went with my students on a field trip to an amusement park. We drove through some heavily industrialized areas, where the smog limited visibility to less than a quarter mile. We drove past factories making Ikea furniture and Nike
shoes as well as Chinese brands. As a Westerner, I felt a certain degree of complicity in causing their pollution problems, since so much of our stuff is made there in factories that produce levels of gunk that would never be acceptable in the US. You could barely see up the road.\textsuperscript{xxvii}

Whether we, as Americans, should empathize with his feeling of ‘complicity’ is a personal matter. But this description of the effects of industrial pollution at levels U.S. citizens would not tolerate is not a rare one, as anyone who has traveled to China can attest. And such industrial pollution, whether done by nationally-based corporations or MNCs, suggests much about the relationship of governmental environmental controls and governmental efforts to maintain a desirable investment climate.

This North to South, rich nation to poor nation, pattern of investment, while largely empirically accurate, is really just a shorthand way of understanding the systemic and transnational nature of globalization and the global economy, the effects of which move across and within borders in ways that individual nations alone cannot control. Consider the following rather strongly argued criticism of the way the global economy enriches small, elite groups \textit{within} Southern nations at the expense of the many:

This is not a war between "north and south." It is a collaborative effort between first world elites and third world elites. Rich outsiders are allowed to enter the local economy and take away wealth in the form of natural resources or financial profits, and in return the local elites get a cut of the take so they can maintain the armies and police forces that keep them in power. Look next door, to Mexico, for
example. That country now ranks fourth in the world (behind the U.S., Japan and Germany) for its number of billionaires, yet for most of the 85 million Mexican people life is more difficult now than it was ten or twenty years ago.

This quote comes from an NGO called Global Exchange, and clearly they are no fans of NAFTA and the increasingly interconnected global capitalist economy. They are criticizing a situation in which the benefits of globalization that seem to accrue more directly to the transnational elites, while the poor in these nations face increasing challenges to their threatens the economic and civil rights of citizens within nations. These governments, at the prodding of wealthier and more politically-connected elites inside and outside their nations, sign various treaties that limit governmental control over their own national economies. Thus, these treaties may have done much to create a desirable investment climate, but those who view global capitalism as a ‘race to the bottom’ see such treaties a threat to local democratic participation in important policy decisions about the economy and society.

This potential for limited democracy is evident in the recent flare up between multinational oil corporations and citizens of Ecuador. In this case, tensions arose between Ecuadorian indigenous groups and multinational firms that were allowed to drill for oil in that nation. In one case, the United States firm Texaco reportedly “dumped 18 billion gallons of pollutants into the environment during its stay, causing an environmental and public-health crisis.” These tensions increased to the level of large demonstrations and even violence. Recently documents have been discovered and
reported in the media showing that these tensions prompted the oil companies to form a contract with the Ecuadorian government for their military to conduct operations against Ecuadorian citizens:

The military and 16 multinational oil firms, including US-based companies Kerr-McGee, Burlington, and Occidental Petroleum, signed one contract that was dated July 2001 and marked classified. It established "terms of collaboration and coordination of actions to guarantee the security of the oil installations and of the personnel that work in them," to include the control of arms, explosives, and undocumented persons in areas of oil operations. It also instituted communication networks and required military personnel to periodically update oil firms on army activities.

Another contract marked classified and signed in April 2001 by California-based Occidental Petroleum required soldiers "to carry out armed patrols and checks of undocumented individuals" within the company's operating area. It also mandated that soldiers "plan, execute, and supervise counterintelligence operations to prevent acts of sabotage and vandalism."

There is the suggestion here that the oil companies used the national military as a corporate police force against Ecuadorian citizens. So, regardless of whether Ecuador example is as sinister as it sounds (you might research this for yourselves) these contracts were signed and the services were delivered, and all of this was documented. They were also, according to a spokesman for one of the transnational corporations involved, entirely legal in Ecuador and within the bounds of U.S. laws as well as
international trade agreements of the sort we see with the WTO. All this means that the government cannot change its mind just because citizens don’t agree with the arrangement. It also suggests much about the importance of informed citizen participation in government and how this can be a force to ensure that our governments sign agreements that we, as citizens, agree are beneficial to us and reflect our ethical values.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Do some research into the ways MNCs conduct business here in the States and in other nations. Are there significant differences in the way corporations handle issues of labor rights or the environment between nations? How are they working to ‘develop’ these nations?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consider this comment on corporate responsibility from Coca Cola:

*People around the world invite our beverages into their lives more than 1.3 billion times a day. The Company has a presence in people's lives not only as a simple moment of refreshment, but also as an employer, a business partner, a part of the community and a global citizen. We highly value these relationships—and the trust and responsibility that come with them.*

Look into recent issues involving Coca Cola in India. You could also examine the history and present status of the 1984 Bhopal incident involving Union Carbide. Also, look into how Wall Mart handles labor union issues in different countries. What are the local factors that drive these different policies?

The situation, as sketchily as it is reported here, suggests something of the potential for democratic participation among citizens in their own national politics to be limited by contracts and treaties signed by their governments with multinational corporations, contracts and treaties that limit their own national autonomy. It is this situation that leads many globalization theorists to describe globalization as a force that threatens the
sovereignty, or autonomy, of the state. For example, David Held describes the rise of the international organizations:

New forms of multilateral and global politics have been established involving governments, intergovernmental organizations (IGOs) and a wide variety of transnational pressure groups and international non-governmental organizations (INGOs). In 1909 there were 37 IGOs and 176 INGOs, while in 1996 there were nearly 260 IGOs and nearly five and a half thousand INGOs. In addition, there has been an explosive development in the number of international treaties in force, as well as in the number of international regimes, such as the Nuclear Non-Proliferation regime. xxxiii

The cumulative effect of all this interconnectivity through transnational organizations is national government is increasingly locked into an array of global, regional and multilayered systems of governance - and can barely monitor it all, let alone stay in command.xxxiv

We saw tensions around national sovereignty and this “multilayered system” of governance in the recent U.S. debates on whether or not to sign the Kyoto Protocol to limit ‘greenhouse gasses.’ xxxv While there are intense debates around whether the nation-state is a significant factor in this era of globalization, there is little debate around the profound changes in the role of the state as it seeks to address issues involving society and the economy due to multiple forces of globalization working against and through it.
Conclusion

And so, the debate described above between ‘rising tide’ global capitalism enthusiasts and ‘race to the bottom’ skeptics rages. So what do you think? Do these metaphors give us some insight into the debates and issues regarding the global economy and its relationship to society, the environment, and the rights of citizens within nations? Whether we agree with either of these analyses entirely, or believe either or both adequately explain the nature of the global economy, perhaps we can agree that understanding the ‘rising tide’ and ‘race to the bottom’ metaphors will help us understand the debates about global economics we see today, and the effects of economics on societies. Additionally, these metaphors also give us a sense of how these issues are not merely national issues, nor even international issues (between nations), but are truly global issues. Forces originating in no one country, nor one group of countries, are creating a new global reality. These forces are interpreted by governments, societies, industries, families and individuals and are changing our experiences of the world. Everyone is beginning to make decisions and plans with this new understanding of our increasingly globalizing world. The choices and plans we make in the companies, communities, societies, and nations we live, learn, and work in will determine the nature of that globalization.

Engaging the Debate

Below you will see two sets of readings based around specific topics, agriculture and labor. In the readings you will be able to find evidence of the ‘rising tide lifts all boats’ and the ‘race to the bottom’ perspectives. These two discourses, these two
perspectives on the economy, are actually in a kind of dialogue, so use both perspectives to develop greater understanding of these complex issues. Decide for yourself how you feel about the issues, but remember, complex issues have more than two sides!

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Readings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Texts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>1. “European Moratorium on Biotech Foods”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. “USDA Statement”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. “U.S. vs. E.C. Biotech Products Case: WTO Dispute Backgrounder” (optional)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor</td>
<td>1. “Tom’s Journal” PBS Interview with Thomas Friedman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. “Mexico’s China Obsession”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. “Downsized but not Out”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. “U.S. Jobs Gained and Lost through Trade: A Net Measure” (optional)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(All readings except 4 appended)
Research

Do some research on the WTO. This cartoon suggests that there is a debate regarding the role of the WTO in globalizing the economy. Write an essay that both describes the WTO and engages the debate indicated in this cartoon. Explain this cartoon in the context of your research. You might consider U.S. agriculture policy (USDA) and tensions within the U.S. involving family farmers vs. large agribusiness MNCs.
“Teachers Guide” page from Daryl Cagle’s Professional Cartoonists Index website, http://cagle.msnbc.com/teacher/. This is a great site with countless editorial cartoons on many topics collected for use by teachers and others. They have developed a rather simple format for using cartoons: the editorial cartoon is presented with a short introduction; then there are discussion “Questions to Ponder”; finally there are “Learning Links.”


x Ibid.


xii National Family Farm Coalition website: http://www.nffc.net/issues/fair/fair_6.html


Thomas Friedman article can be found at
http://web.mit.edu/outsourcing/class2/whatgoesaround.pdf

http://www.globaled.org/issues/160/e.html. This has multiple resources for students and teachers.


“Coca Cola Learning Centers,” from the UNESCO website,
http://www2.unescobkk.org/education/ict/v2/info.asp?id=15325

“Investment Climate and Prospects for Involvement of Foreign Investments,” from the Embassy of the Republic of Belarus in the United States of America website,
http://www.belarusembassy.org/belarus/investment_climate.htm

Retrieved on February 1, 2006:


You could begin this research at the Coalition Against Coke Contracts website, [http://caccuc.blogspot.com/](http://caccuc.blogspot.com/).

Much about the Bhopal incident can be found at [http://www.bhopal.net/index1.html](http://www.bhopal.net/index1.html).

David Held, “The Territorial State and Global Politics.” From the *Global Transformations* website, [http://www.polity.co.uk/global/executiv.htm#Fate](http://www.polity.co.uk/global/executiv.htm#Fate).

David Held, “The Territorial State and Global Politics.” From the *Global Transformations* website, [http://www.polity.co.uk/global/executiv.htm#Fate](http://www.polity.co.uk/global/executiv.htm#Fate).


• PDF: http://www.newyorkfed.org/research/current_issues/ci11-8.pdf;

Section 3

Much “more than Neighbors”: Ciudad Juarez, El Paso & Globalization

What follows in this section is an introduction of Ciudad Juarez and El Paso in a global context. The background information provided aims to help both teachers and students embed further discussions on this cosmopolitan region in historical context. Following this is a consideration of some shared problems resulting from the interdependency and interconnection of these two cities, problems of a transnational nature. We then supplement them with some geographical knowledge, hoping that teachers who are not in the geography field will better understand how some change in one region will inevitably affect the other. We further illustrate this notion by focusing on two issues among many others:

- Issue 1: When Water Meets the Dessert;

A simple curriculum module is drafted in order to help teachers initiate research interest and rigorous discussion on this issue among students. We believe, however, every teacher has the great potential to develop a more engaged and challenging curriculum with his or her students than the one set out here.
Introduction

Mexico and the United States are ‘more than neighbors’: both nations share a border experience that is increasingly transnational—culturally, economically and socially. Trade agreements such as NAFTA are transforming the individual national economies of Mexico, Canada, and the U.S. into one large regional economy, a regional economy integrated into a global economy.

It should be clear to us all by now that any effort to understand the U.S. economy must account for the way it functions within the global economy. Global economic forces may be strongly influenced by U.S. policies and preferences (too much so, for some analysts); but nonetheless, the U.S. economy cannot separate itself from global economic interconnections and interdependencies that are as constraining as they are enabling. In short, we need a global perspective, the ability to look beyond borders to see the web of interconnections and interdependencies that constitute globalization in order to understand transforming local and national economic reality we all experience.

And as we will see that these global economic forces have direct and indirect effects on social, cultural, political, and environmental reality as well. Our jobs, our education, and our aspirations are all interrelated and all interwoven into the material economic conditions we live in. And as globalization speeds up and intensifies the changes in our economic reality, it also speeds up and intensifies changes in our politics, society, culture, and even our national identity. For example, do the many people who regularly...
cross the border for school, work, shopping, and social life in this “bi-national” area feel like Americans? Mexicans? Or something else?

Thus no region in the world better exemplifies the transformative effects of globalization on our social, cultural, political, and environmental realities than the Ciudad Juarez/El Paso border region. (Interestingly, although we described it in the last sentence as a ‘region,’ we might consider a new term for such a place. Maybe we should say,”bi-national metropolitan area”!)

The rest of this module will focus specifically on the Ciudad Juarez/El Paso ‘region’ and some of the issues it faces in the struggle to adapt to the increasingly transnational nature of its politics, society, culture, and environment. This region is uniquely qualified to demonstrate three things for us:

1. We will see clearly some of the important ways that Mexico and the United States are, indeed, “more than neighbors”;

2. We will see that only a global studies perspective will allow us to see the way the issues facing the region are actually manifestations of global forces, forces that are, as David Held said above, “stretching . . . social, political and economic activities across political frontiers, regions and continents.”

3. We will also see more of our ‘battling metaphors’ in action. Be on the alert for the familiar, and opposing, discourses of ‘a rising tide lifts all boats’ and ‘the race to the bottom.’ Again, use them to unlock the issues and debates, not necessarily to decide who is right or wrong.
What follows is a closer examination of two important issues facing the Ciudad Juarez/El Paso metropolis: dwindling water resource that both cities actually share; and the challenges facing Juarez due to massive migration to the Juarez side of the border by Mexican laborers to work in the maquiladoras, the factories set up by transnational corporations (TNCs) to take advantage of, among other incentives, the low wages paid to Mexican workers.
Regional Description: Data & Details

“This is a place where two cities breathe the same air, drink the same water, and share the same destiny along what U.S. Congressman Silvestre Reyes calls a ‘seamless border.’”

El Paso:
1. 1,250 miles from Chicago, the sixth-largest city in Texas.
2. Over 700,000 people, located where Texas, New Mexico, and Mexico come together.
3. Located in the far western part of the state on the north bank of the Rio Grande, opposite the Mexican city of Ciudad Juárez on the south bank.

Juarez:
1. The largest city in the state of Chihuahua and the largest production-sharing center in North America with an estimated population of 2 million individuals.
2. Chihuahua is the only Mexican state that shares a border of 582 miles with two U.S. States, Texas & New Mexico.
3. The border with Texas is 350 mile long, delineated by the Rio Grande.

The metropolitan area forms the largest bi-national population center of any international border in the world.
Historical Context

- El Paso officially became part of the United States when Texas joined the Union in 1845.
- The Mexican War of 1846 legally confirmed U.S. control of the previous Mexican territory, and established the Rio Grande as the international boundary.
- Prohibition (the banning of alcohol production, sales and consumption) in the United States in 1920 brought a new boom to Juarez. The city became a center for entertainment for El Paso and the entire southwestern United States.
- The Border Industrialization Program initiated the maquiladora, or twin plant, program in Juarez where American companies opened factories in Mexico to take goods, raw materials and work-in-progress from the U.S., assemble it in Mexico, then ship it back to the U.S., avoiding import duties, paying duties only on the value added.
- In 1967, Mexican President Gustavo Diaz Ordaz and U.S. President Lyndon B. Johnson met in El Paso and Juarez to officially transfer to Mexico lands that had become part of the U.S. when the Rio Grande changed course during flooding. The Rio Grande now passes through Juarez and El Paso in a man-made canal so it can't change its course and consequently move the international border.
- The North American Free Trade Treaty was signed in 1992 and went into effect in 1994. A strong international trade arrangement resulted.
Today, with a population of over million people, Juarez is one of the largest cities in Mexico. Growth is still fueled by the maquiladora program and the general belief that economic opportunities are better in the north.

Border Industrialization Program
The Mexican government launched the Border Industrialization Program (BIP), better known as the Maquiladora Program, in 1965, less than a year after the termination of the 23-year Bracero Program, a U.S. government program aimed at attracting cheap, temporary, migrant Mexican labor to work in the booming U.S. agricultural sector. Part of the justification for the BIP was that returning braceros would find otherwise scarce jobs in foreign factories near the border. But it is doubtful that many of the 4 million braceros, who were almost entirely male, found work in the mostly female-employing maquilas. The maquiladora system was, in essence, the extension of the Bracero Program to the industrial sector. The BIP exempted machinery, raw materials, parts, and components from import duties within 100 kilometers of the border. After assembly or processing, these materials could then be re-shipped to the United States with duties assessed only on value added.

Retrieved from http://www.thirdworldtraveler.com/Mexico/Class_Poverty_MaquilaZone.html

More about Maquiladora

What is a maquiladora?
A maquiladora is a Mexican assembly or manufacturing operation that can be subject to up to 100% non-Mexican ownership. Maquiladoras utilize competitively priced Mexican labor in assembly processing and other manufacturing operations. They bring in most capital equipment and machinery from abroad. Maquiladora operations are generally labor-intensive cost centers, with most production geared for export from Mexico. Maquiladoras may be entirely foreign managed, unlike multi-nationals operating in Mexico.

Where can a maquiladora locate?
Although most locate along the U.S./Mexican border, it is possible to locate anywhere Mexico, except for Mexico City.

What products can maquiladoras manufacture?
Maquiladoras can manufacture a broad array of products under Mexican law. There are exceptions to this allowance that include such industries as petroleum, petrochemicals, other chemicals, arms, and items containing radioactive elements.

Do products have to be fully assembled or processed in Mexico?
No. In fact, most items are further processed in the country to which they are ultimately re-exported.
**Are Maquiladoras required to incorporate Mexican components?**
No. Maquiladoras are not required to use any Mexican components in assembly processing or manufacturing.

**What are the Mexican Tariff/Duty policies relating to this program?**
As long as the imported components brought into Mexico are destined for export, no Mexican import duty is levied on the temporarily imported maquiladora components. In lieu of duties, maquiladora operators must post a bond with the Mexican Customs Service to guarantee that components and raw materials are re-exported from Mexico within a 6-month period. A bond on capital equipment and machinery ensures that they will be fully returned to the maquiladora operator's country of origin once it ceases operations in Mexico.

**What are the U.S. Tariff/Duty Policies relating to this program?**
U.S. Customs has three regulations that complement the maquiladora program.

1. Allows the import into the U.S. of metal products processed abroad with duties assessed on the value added to those goods (for example, the total value of Mexican inputs, including labor, electricity, component parts, etc.) rather than levying an import duty on the total value of the product. The products must have been processed in the U.S. before being sent abroad and then must be further processed in the U.S. upon their return.
2. Customs provision allows an article assembled in Mexico from U.S. made components to be exempt from duty on the value of such components. These goods may or may not involve metal components. U.S. customs law allows for machinery of U.S. origin to be returned to the U.S. duty free.

If the goods assembled or manufactured in Mexico contain at least 35 percent Mexican content upon import into the U.S., they may be eligible for treatment under the U.S. Generalized System Preferences (GSP). GSP eligible items may enter the U.S. market with no duty levied.

Shared Chronic Problems: A Graphic View

This graph tries to depict the formation of maquiladoras and their impacts on the society, economy and environment.

More shared problems: drug trafficking\textsuperscript{iii}, violence\textsuperscript{iv}, and diseases, such as tuberculosis and hepatitis that flow freely back and forth. As you will learn from the following sections, the Social/Economic problems and the Environmental ones are usually related to each other.
Issue 1: When Water Meets the Dessert

El Paso continues to explosively grow in population and development and it is estimated that the population of the El Paso-Juarez borderplex could brim to 6 million people by 2025. Besides, major manufacturing operations involving 178,000 workers in 235 plants also put strain on all local resources. In fact, the two cities use water from a shared aquifer called Hueco Bolson, which is sucked dry by nearly three million thirsty border residents, as well as industrial factories and agricultural lands. Juarez is expected to run out of fresh water from the aquifer in FOUR years, and El Paso has an estimated TWENTY years left of fresh water from the aquifer.

In response to this critical issue, two of El Paso Public Service Board (PSB) Projects are addressing the water issue: (1) The El Paso-Las Cruces Sustainable Water Project, and (2) Pipe Line Construction.

Before getting to know more about the aquifers, ground water, and the water project and pipe line construction, we want to shed lights on two important questions:

- When the demand is greater than supply, what’s next step?
- If we fix the economy, will the other solutions fall into line?

### Aquifers

A zone of material capable of supplying ground water at a useful rate from a well is called an aquifer. Gravel, sand, soils, and fractured sandstone, as well as granite and metamorphic rocks with high porosity due to connected open fractures, are good aquifers if ground water is present.

An aquifer is called an unconfined aquifer if there is no confining layer restricting the upper surface of the zone of saturation.
at the water table. If a confining layer is present the aquifer is called a confined aquifer and the water beneath it may be under pressure, forming artesian conditions. Similar to the effect that a water tower that produces water pressure for homes.

Water in artesian systems tends to rise to about the height of the recharge zone (the zone where precipitation infiltrates the surface to move down to the ground water system, creating an artesian well. Cited from http://geology.er.usgs.gov/eespteam/brass/aquifers/aquifersintro.htm

Ground Water

Ground water recharge is any process that adds water to an aquifer and can be natural infiltration or human induced, like leakage from a broken water line. Ground water discharge is any process that removes ground water from an aquifer. Included is natural discharge from a spring that is present where water flowing in an aquifer intersects the surface of the earth. Spring discharge can form the beginning of a stream or river.

Ground water discharge also occurs when water is pumped from a well. Both confined and unconfined aquifers many be found in the same area.

When water is pumped from a well, a cone of depression forms in the water table or artesian pressure surface. A large cone of depression can alter the direction in which ground water moves within an area. Overpumping of an aquifer causes the water level to lower continuously over time, which necessitates the lowering of pump settings or drilling deeper.


The El Paso-Las Cruces Sustainable Water Project

The project would send 40 MGD through a 5 foot pipeline over a mountain pass from the river, and this water would be injected into the Hueco Bolson to recharge it, using the aquifer as kind of a giant holding tank for future mining of groundwater. Also, another 120 MGD would be cleaned at existing water treatment plants.

If the proposed El Paso-Las Cruces project advances, the Rio Grande below El Paso will carry 45,000 acre feet of water less per year. The project would further reduce stream flows to the river in what is known as the “Forgotten River” segment of the Rio Grande. The water project plan would restore year round
flows to a 100-mile section between southern New Mexico and El Paso at the expense of a 200-mile section, where river flows would be reduced by at least 28%.


### Pipe Line Construction

The El Paso Public Service Board also proposes the construction of a 60-inch pipeline stretching 100 miles—from El Paso to Dell City in Hudspeth County. Farmers and water speculators want to market rural underground water to El Paso, selling water every year to the city. The pipeline would also be constructed 100 more miles to Valentine Texas (population 248), home of pristine superior quality water that would be mined from a 21,000 acre “water ranch” that El Paso PSB bought in 1991, for future “just in case” needs. The Valentine groundwater would be pumped uphill to Dell City. Dell City water would be “blended” with it, after being treated using reverse osmosis membrane technology. The Dell city water is of lower quality (3,300 parts per million of dissolved solvents in the water) than the Valentine aquifer water.

The aquifer grab plan which has been brewing since 1991, when El Paso Water Utilities purchased the Antelope valley ranch, has stirred significant concern and opposition in the four county rural area, where the water would be taken from. Three new single county Groundwater Conservation Districts have formed, and much media attention has been given to the controversy.

Short and long term concerns include drawdowns of the aquifer, where people would periodically have to drill deeper wells; saltwater-brine intrusion into the freshwater of the aquifer; and the loss of water quality and quantity, until the aquifer would be rendered unusable, in as little as 20 years. These aquifer waters in the desert southwest are generally slowly recharged and took many thousand of years to form and collect. It is irresponsible for anyone or everyone together to take more out of the aquifer than is annually recharged. To take more than is recharged is called “water mining.”

Now that you have some knowledge of the Ciudad Juarez/El Paso bi-national metropolis and the strain on its dwindling water resources, we will do an activity that will take us deeper into this water issue. This activity is based around an excellent video, *Borderline Cases: Environmental Matters at the United States-Mexico Border*, directed by Lynn Corcoran and available from Bullfrog Films at [http://www.bullfrogfilms.com/](http://www.bullfrogfilms.com/).

We also append related readings.

### About the documentary: Borderline Cases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BORDERLINE CASES investigates the environmental impact of the nearly 2,000 factories - maquiladoras - that have been built in Mexico at the US-Mexico border by multinational corporations from the US, Asia and Europe.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

In the early rush to globalization these factories, whose workers are paid a fraction of US wages, did not need to comply with costly environmental regulations. The result, according to one reporter, is that the border became "a 2,000 mile long open sewer, a vast toxic waste dump." The public debate over NAFTA brought the border's problems to light. Today environmental issues take an important place in US-Mexico relations.

BORDERLINE CASES, a documentary essay, describes the consequences of 25 years of environmental neglect, the results of five years of earnest activity and promises made for the future. A diverse mix of people of both countries, from grass-roots groups, government, academia, and industry, are rethinking traditional notions of borders as they engage in the search for solutions.


---

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 2.5 License

2006 Center for Global Studies, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
Required Materials:

2. “Challenging the Demand Side of Water.” (see reading package)
3. “Surface and Ground Water Interactions: El Paso - Juarez Region.” (see reading package)
4. “Water/Environment: Congressman Reyes' views on water and environmental issues.” (see reading package)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Challenging the Demand Side of Water</th>
<th>Required Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Goal</td>
<td></td>
<td>165 mins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. To understand the importance of water and reflect on ways to maintain it.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. To reflect on the relationship between people and the environment, and people of different interest groups;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. To understand the interplay of environment and society;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. To realize that in order to grasp a more accurate glimpse of an issue, a comprehensive research is necessary;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. To realize that the solution to any environmental or social problems requires interdisciplinary cooperation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tasks</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Activity</td>
<td>Play the documentary: Borderline Cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>65’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction of aquifer, ground water, and overpumping</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is confined/unconfined aquifer?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How does ground water work?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What’s the result of overpumping?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Introduction of the water issues in El Paso/Juarez</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Historical/geographical accounts of the border cities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Labor migration, maquiladoras and water battles in the border cities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Two governmental projects:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) The El Paso-Las Cruces Sustainable Water Project, and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Pipe Line Construction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Further Discussion:

A. Discuss if the governmental project will work.
B. Identify some other strategies that the public activists have advocated. Are they plausible?
C. How do the geographic features of El Paso/Juarez, especially the fact that they are located in the desert pose the restraints on urbanization?
D. How might the water issue in El Paso/ Juarez affect our lives in Illinois?
E. How might our lives in Illinois affect the water issue in El Paso/ Juarez?
Issue 2: The Economic Divide: Maquiladoras, Migration & Labor Rights

Reason of Migration:

- Maquiladoras demand cheap labor to make the most profits
- Across the border in El Paso, a worker can earn the same amount for a day's work house cleaning - $30 - as for nearly a week's work in one of Juarez's factories. vii
- It results in low paying jobs for the people, drawing thousands of people to the El Paso-Juarez borderplex in search of these jobs.

Lack of Labor Rights:

- Hourly pay is still about $1.25. viii
- Maquiladoras are also generally anti-union.
- Maquiladoras prefer to hire women rather than men, because they are more nimble and more exploitable than men based on the traditional patriarchal socialization (ex. some maquiladora owners justify lower wages for women with the old argument that they are “just working for pin money and men are the real breadwinners”). ix
- The maquiladora economy has exacerbated the gender tensions of border-town culture—sexism, corporate greed lead numerous women at the mercy of serial killers, rapists and domestic violence.

While many argue that the maquiladoras have brought prosperity to Juarez and El Paso, in reality, Texas border cities, are among the poorest in the United States. x

Recently, maquiladoras have been moving from Juárez to countries such as China, which offer even cheaper labor. In the past two years, according to the New York Times, Juárez has lost some 300,000 maquiladora jobs. xi What the future holds in store for this region is unknown.
Do more research on this profound issue!

This was just a brief sketch of the issues surrounding these controversial, globally portable, and highly profitable manufacturing enterprises there on the borderland metropolis of Ciudad Juarez/El Paso. Use the resources we have provided and get online and hunt down your own. Remember, not every website is ‘fair and balanced,’ and in fact many organizations promote their point of view very actively. Learn to see the attitudes, ideologies, and agendas imbedded in these discourses and become skilled at “separating the wheat from the chaff,” as farmers used to say. Since we live in an information age where there is simply too much information, it is up to us to find information that is relevant to our task and of high quality. Only you can decide on that relevance and quality; only you can decide what is utter nonsense. We hope our ‘battling metaphors’ gave you some practice in looking for real information inside sometimes unbalanced perspectives.

So look into the benefits, the costs, and the future of the maquiladoras in the Ciudad Juarez/El Paso region. Find a good term for this new type of bi-national city. Chart the history and predict the future. And most importantly, examine the social, environmental, and economic effects of this 20-year relationship between able and low-priced migrating laborers, a willing bi-national community, massive investment and industrialization, and limited natural resources. Look also at how the meaning of citizenship is changing there in that border metropolis. What it means to be an ‘American’ is developing new meanings there, just as it is changing throughout this and many nations. (Remember, labor migration is a global phenomena, NOT just a Mexican-United States issue.) For some, that is a dangerous notion. For others, it is a source of hope. Good luck!
Drug trafficking in El Paso/Juarez is aggragated by the introduction of NAFTA. Numberous people cross the international bridges every day and the convenient transportation in this area provide drug traffickers with smuggling opportunities. Juarez cartel is among the most powerful and violent drug trafficking organization. The 2001 movie Traffic featured the battle between Tijuana cartel and Juarez cartel. See more on-line articles about El Paso/Juarez drug trafficking issues at


In Juarez there is a huge problem with women that disappear. According to Amnesty International, since 1993, almost 400 women and girls have been murdered and more than 70 remain missing in Ciudad Juárez. Many of them were raped, mutilated and their bodies were dumped in ditches or vacant lots. Some suspect that this might be related to the rising drug trafficking or the unemployement of males in border cities. See more related articles on line at

- http://www.elpasotimes.com/borderdeath/
• http://www.amnestyusa.org/women/juarez/

http://takenbythesky.net/Juarez/articles.html

http://www.lavc.edu/Library/bib-women_of_c._juarez.htm


“The Juárez Murders,” Amnesty Magazine, Retrieved February 12 from

http://www.amnestyusa.org/amnestynow/juarez.html
Section 4

Readings, resources

- Illinois State Board of Education Standards
- Suggested Border Studies readings
- Extending the Research
Illinois State Board of Education Standards


Depending on teacher emphasis, our curriculum module can be aligned to the following ISBE Illinois Learning Standards:

- **State Goal 1:** Read with understanding and fluency, B, C
- **State Goal 5:** Use the language arts to acquire, assess and communicate information, A, B
- **State Goal 13:** Understand the relationships among science, technology and society in historical and contemporary contexts, B
- **State Goal 14:** Understand political systems, with an emphasis on the United States, B, C, D, E, F
- **State Goal 15:** Understand economic systems, with an emphasis on the United States, A, B, C, D, E
- **State Goal 16:** Understand events, trends, individuals and movements shaping the history of Illinois, the United States and other nations, A, B, C, D, E
- **State Goal 17:** Understand world geography and the effects of geography on society, with an emphasis on the United States, A, B, C, D
- **State Goal 18:** Understand social systems, with an emphasis on the United States, A, B, C
From our analysis, the materials and concepts covered in our module are particularly aligned with the following Social Science Classroom Assessments Aligned to the Illinois Learning Standards, as found on the ISBE website,

http://www.isbe.net/ils/social_science/stage_H/assessment.htm:

- **15A15B15C16C.H - Chain of Events**
  Add real events to a chart displaying a likely chain of events starting with low prices for resources.

- **15D16CW.H - Trade Barriers**
  Write an editorial taking a position either supporting a policy of free trade by the United States or a program of barriers to trade during its early years.

- **15E.H - A Free Market with the Help of Government**
  Review major laws passed during important reform periods and categorize them in chart form according to the features they support.

- **16B16E.H - Nationalism and Immigration**
  Showing how immigration to the United States changed after 1880 and explain how this immigration changed both Europe and America.

- **17C.H - Natural Resources and Transportation in the United States**
  Formulate hypotheses about the relationship between natural resources and the location of cities and transportation arteries in the United States.

- **17D.H - Human Settlement and Movement**
  Compare the settlement patterns of different ethnic groups and explain why they are concentrated in certain regions of the country.

- **18A.H - Globalization**
  Write an essay describing the characteristics of each of three global communities.

- **18C.H - Cultural Exchange**
  Write about two examples of cultural exchange.

Additionally, we believe that our module would be of use in meeting one of the Social Science Mandates, “History Requirement,” 105 ILCS 5/27 21 (from Ch. 122, par. 27 21) Sec. 27 21. History of United States, as found on the ISBE website,

Suggested Border Studies Readings

"The border society that has emerged over time as a result of massive population relocations is distinct from that of either the United States or Mexico; it is both an amalgam of the two and entirely different from either."

-David E. Lorey, The U.S.-Mexican Border in the Twentieth Century, 3

Fiction

- Cisneros, Sandra. The House on Mango Street.

Non-Fiction

- Byrd, Bobby and Susannah Mississippi Bryd, eds. The Late Great Mexican Border: Reports from a Disappearing Line. Cinco Puntos Press, 1996.

Retrieved from http://www.earlham.edu/~borders/resources/readings.html
Extending the Research

Below, in no particular order, are some texts or websites that we considered for a larger role in the development of this module, but for one reason or another either were not mentioned or were little used. We recommend them as a way to explore some of the subtleties and nuances of these the issues presented above.

- Globalization and Education (http://globalizationandeducation.ed.uiuc.edu/) is a website full of research and teaching resources developed by faculty and researchers associated with the Global Studies in Education Online Master of Education Degree program at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, http://gse.ed.uiuc.edu/


- For data, analysis, and description of global agriculture markets and how serious and engaged ‘rising tide’ theorists see its relationship to global poverty, go to this page with downloadable chapters from the profound The State of Food Security in the World 2003, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations:

- We cannot emphasize enough the importance of David Held’s Global Transformations website, http://www.polity.co.uk/global/executiv.htm. This is an amazing website for readable texts about globalization assembled by one of the world’s leading theorist of globalization.

- Globalization and Education describes itself as “an internet resource aimed at providing diverse perspectives on ways in which education is being shaped by global processes.” The site offers a broad range of resources, from a glossary of “Key Concepts” to annotated links to websites offering teaching and research information from multiple perspectives: http://globalizationandeducation.ed.uiuc.edu/. This website is developed by graduate researchers at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign affiliated with the Global Studies in Education Online masters degree: http://gse.ed.uiuc.edu/

- “A Race to the Bottom,” blog entry by Derry Brownfield:
A very interesting—and readable—paper on globalization and the environment prepared for the Yale Center for Environmental Law and Policy:
- PDF: http://www.yale.edu/gegdialoque/docs/dialogue/oct03/papers/Esty-Ivanova.pdf#search='the%20environmental%20effects%20of%20globalization'

World Bank Group website on efforts to promote “Corporate Social Responsibility”:
- http://www.ifc.org/ifcext/economics.nsf/Content/CSR-IntroPage

Some research into globalization and job loss from the Federal Reserve Bank of New York report:

A great article on ‘North-South’ economic trade issues, is Robert J. S. Ross and Anita Chan’s “From North-South to South-South: The True Face of Global Competition,” Foreign Affairs, September/October 2002, p. 72. Retrieved on February 1, 2006:

The Center for Global Education promotes international education to foster cross-cultural awareness, cooperation and understanding. Living and working effectively in a global society requires learning with an international perspective. Learn more information at http://www.globaled.us/

“Borderlands: A Blurring of Two Worlds—Implications for International Home Health” is a short (5 pages) and interesting article on the unique health
challenges that have emerged in the U.S./Mexico border regions due to the economic transformations and deformations wrought by the factories built on the Mexican side. The article is written by Elaine Roberts and Carl A. Ross and was published in the October, 2002, Volume 14 issue of *Home Health Care Management and Practice*: http://hhc.sagepub.com/cgi/reprint/14/6/461

AskAsia, a "K-12 resource of the Asia Society," is wonderful site for teaching materials, including everything from a glossary to maps, to full lesson plans on all things Asian. With separate pages for Teachers, Students, and Administrators, there is a lot here for everybody. The Instructional Resources page is a nice place to start, but be sure to check out the photographs and the maps in the Student's page. Learn more information at http://www.askasia.org/

The site supports the AusAID Global Education Program which aims to raise awareness and understanding among Australian school students of international issues, development and poverty, and to prepare them to live in an increasingly globalised world and to be active citizens shaping better futures. Covering topics from food security to globalization, water rights to human rights, this site is amazingly teacher-friendly. Topics are presented using actual case studies which, in and of themselves, are profound resources. Learn more information at http://www.globaleducation.edna.edu.au/globaled/go

The CHOICE program is a set of curriculum resources for teachers brought to us by the Watson Institute for International Studies at Brown University. Particularly interesting is the Teaching with the News page, where we find lesson materials on such international topics as "Iraq: The Challenge of Securing the Peace," "Considering Genocide in Sudan," and "U.S. Role in the World-Four Futures and Online Ballot." Many of the lessons have a "policy options" approach in which students engage the merits and demerits of a set of policy options developed by the Watson Institute. Learn more information at http://www.choices.edu/index.cfm
Global Envision is an interesting website rich in readable, student-friendly texts on a variety of compelling topics related to globalization. Global Envision believes that the "more that we understand about the free market system . . . the better our chances that the global economy will thrive for the prosperity of all," and the reading here certainly reflects that economic perspective. The Articles menu lists topics such as Environment, General Globalization, and Social Entrepreneurship, each with several related articles. Also check out the Interviews on the Learn page. Learn more information at http://www.globalenvision.org

Global Exchange is a website dedicated to "promoting environmental, political and social justice." The site has a dizzying array of resources, everything from "Fair Trade" coffee, to detailed regional information on various issues, to a very compelling page dedicated to the World Bank and the IMF. Attractive and navigable page layout and brief texts provide good thumbnail sketches of the issues and are amenable to classroom use. There is always a historical and current context provided, as well as several "get involved" opportunities. Be sure to look at Global Economy 101, a very comprehensive and politically engaged exposition of "the critical issues pertaining to corporate globalization." Learn more information at http://www.globalexchange.org/index.html

The Global Teacher Project is the site to seek if you are interested in how educators in the United Kingdom are tackling the problem of internationalizing their pedagogies. The Global Teacher Project is an effort "to support the inclusion of a global dimension in course content, and to promote global education throughout the training of teachers." The website functions primarily as a set of resources to help teachers "develop courses with a global dimension." Scroll down to Websites on the Resources page for links to such sites as Educating for a Sustainable Future, Citizenship Education, and Anne Frank. Also interesting is Multiverse, a project whose website "provides teacher educators, student teachers and trainees with a wealth of resources that focus on enhancing the educational achievement of pupils from diverse backgrounds." Learn more information at http://www.globalteacher.org.uk/index.htm