LITURGICAL JAZZ: THE LINEAGE OF THE SUBGENRE IN THE MUSIC OF EDGAR E. SUMMERLIN

BY

DERICK CORDOBA

DISSEPTION

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts in Music with a concentration in Jazz Performance in the Graduate College of the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 2017

Urbana, Illinois

Doctoral Committee:

Associate Professor Lawrence Gray, Chair
Professor Gabriel Solis, Director of Research
Associate Professor Tito Carrillo
Professor Erik Lund
ABSTRACT

This dissertation discusses the lineage of liturgical jazz with a particular focus on Edgar Eugene “Ed” Summerlin (1928-2006). This lineage stretches back into the late 1950s, but has largely been unexplored beyond a select few high-profile artists. I trace the evolution of liturgical jazz from several composers’ earliest attempts to the present day. Although the liturgical jazz movement began in the late 1950s, it was primarily a product of the turbulent 1960s in America. This was a period of great change and exploration not only in jazz but in organized religion as well. A deep and frank discussion emerged as to what liturgical music should and would be allowed to sound like. These decisions at the highest levels of denominations had ramifications that are still being felt today in the churches of America; however, the primary focus of this dissertation is on the formative period of liturgical jazz during the 1960s and early 1970s. These years give a basis for better understanding and appreciating the development and defining features of liturgical jazz.

Summerlin is a figure that is often cited as a pioneer in liturgical jazz, but no one has offered a history of his life, his music, or why his liturgical music was so revolutionary. This dissertation gives an extensive history of Summerlin and his music. It also creates a clear timeline of the early formation and evolution of this subgenre of jazz.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to offer special thanks to Karen Summerlin, who was so generous in giving me access to her late husband, Edgar E. Summerlin’s music and files which made this dissertation possible. Karen was also generous with her time in granting me interviews and in connecting me to so many people who worked with and loved Ed Summerlin. I would like to thank Jeff Summerlin, James Lee Roy Summerlin, and William Summerlin for talking to me about their father and brother.

I would also like to thank all the amazing musicians who took time out of their busy performing and teaching schedules to speak with me about their friend, colleague, and teacher and who graciously shared contacts with me of others who knew and worked with Ed Summerlin or who were involved in liturgical jazz: Samuel Adler, Steve Blons, Dan Carillo, Ron Carter, Bruce Collier, Ray Gallon, Gabriel Garrick, Frank Griffith, Don Heckman, Sheila Jordan, Jonathan Klein, Paul Knopf, Steve Kuhn, Chuck Mahronic, John Moulder, Bob Norden, Adam Nussbaum, Morgan Powell, Robert Rasmus, Marvin Stamm, Frank Tirro, Thomas Wirtel, Jeffrey Wisotsky and Deanna Witkowski.

I would like to thank all the members of my committee for their support of this project, insights, and encouragement throughout the research and writing of this dissertation: my director of research Dr. Gabriel Solis, my chair Professor Lawrence Gray, Dr. Erik Lund, and Professor Tito Carrillo. This work simply would not have been possible without their support.

I also would like to send my sincere appreciation to Michael Siletti for his insightful commentaries and editorial help.
I would like to offer special thanks to my family who sacrificed a lot to help me see this project to its completion: my wife Tanya, my son Joe, my son Julian, my parents Joe and Eugenia, my in-laws Lisa and Mitchel, all of whom helped in so many different ways over these years. Finally, I would like to thank God who inspired these artists to create their works.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION...........................................................................................................1
CHAPTER 2: EARLY BACKGROUND..............................................................................................50
CHAPTER 3: LITURGICAL JAZZ SERVICE ......................................................................................78
CHAPTER 4: LITURGICAL JAZZ PERIOD .........................................................................................105
CHAPTER 5: NON-LITURGICAL WORK .........................................................................................143
CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................178
BIBLIOGRAPHY ..........................................................................................................................181
APPENDIX A: ED SUMMERLIN DISCOGRAPHY .........................................................................201
APPENDIX B: LITURGICAL JAZZ SERVICE AND JAZZ MASS DISCOGRAPHY ..................205
Preface

Saxophonist, clarinetist, composer, arranger, and educator Edgar Eugene “Ed” Summerlin, born September 1, 1928, was a seminal figure in the development of liturgical jazz, having composed the first liturgical jazz service in 1959. In his formative years, he was firmly rooted in the bebop tradition, but one always looking to push boundaries, he embraced the work of Ornette Coleman and the conventions of the avant-garde scene. Summerlin used his skills as a performer and arranger, and the personal and creative relationships he forged with extraordinary jazz players in New York, to create contemporary liturgical jazz works firmly in the jazz tradition of the 1960s. These jazz services were not a service of jazzed-up hymns, but were complete services of worship including original music grounded in sound theology. By the mid-1960s, when others had entered the liturgical and sacred jazz arena, Summerlin incorporated the innovations of avant-garde jazz and contemporary classical music into his liturgical jazz services. During the late 1960s, when others were turning to more pop-oriented styles for liturgical music, he embraced jazz, congregational participation, and multimedia explorations in worship. As a composer, he contributed jazz compositions to the canon for congregations who were looking to update their selection of hymns. As an author, Summerlin was a tireless advocate for including contemporary jazz in congregational worship.

When Summerlin stopped creating liturgical jazz in the early 1970s he took the same energy and zeal for jazz and applied it to creating a jazz program at City College of New York. He was no longer preaching jazz to congregations, but to college students with the same eye on
innovation. Summerlin built a jazz program with a faculty which would be the envy of any university in the nation, comprised of jazz musicians such as Jaki Byard, John Lewis, Sheila Jordan, Jimmy Heath, Ron Carter, and Joe Chambers. He also brought in artists like Gil Evans, Jim Hall, and Ornette Coleman for residencies at the City College. Many of the students he mentored, including Ray Gallon, Adam Nussbaum, and Dan Carillo, remain fixtures in the New York jazz scene along with countless others who learned about jazz from Summerlin.

Despite Summerlin’s achievements, he has received very little attention outside his immediate circles. His contributions to liturgical jazz in particular have been eclipsed by Mary Lou Williams’, John Coltrane’s, and Duke Ellington’s sacred jazz shadows. The early lineage of liturgical jazz has also been misrepresented and obscured over the decades. Works like Geoffrey Beaumont’s 20th Century Folk Mass have often been cited as the first liturgical jazz work despite the many and obvious flaws in that characterization. There has always been a reluctance to give Summerlin the credit he is due. His liturgical jazz service and subsequent recording Liturgical Jazz are pioneering works in the genre. His innovations in the 1960s in liturgical jazz are unmatched in pushing worship boundaries and in their allegiance to jazz as an art form worthy of sanctified spaces.

Research Objectives

This dissertation discusses the lineage of liturgical jazz with a particular focus on Edgar Eugene “Ed” Summerlin (1928-2006). This lineage stretches back to the late 1950s, but has largely been unexplored beyond a select few high-profile artists. I trace the evolution of liturgical jazz from several composers’ earliest attempts to the present day. Although the
liturgical jazz movement began in the late 1950s, it was primarily a product of the turbulent 1960s in America. This was a period of great change and exploration not only in jazz but also in organized religion. A deep and frank discussion emerged as to what liturgical music should and would be allowed to sound like. These decisions at the highest levels of denominations had ramifications that are still being felt today in the churches of America; however, the primary focus of this dissertation is on the formative period of liturgical jazz during the 1960s and early 1970s. These years give a basis for better understanding and appreciating the development and defining features of liturgical jazz.

Summerlin is a figure that is often cited as a pioneer in liturgical jazz, but no one has offered a history of his life, his music, or why his liturgical music was so revolutionary. This dissertation gives an extensive history of Summerlin and his music. It also creates a clear timeline of the early formation and lineage of this subgenre of jazz and the role that Summerlin played in it.

Literature Review

Whereas sacred jazz has received much scholarly and commercial attention, very little has been written about liturgical jazz. When the subject of liturgical jazz has been broached it has largely occurred as a side note to an artist’s biographical data. A dissertation by Angelo Versace, "The evolution of Sacred Jazz as reflected in the music of Mary Lou Williams, Duke Ellington, John Coltrane and recognized contemporary Sacred Jazz Artists," attempts to create a broad view of sacred jazz through these artists as well as contemporary sacred jazz composers Ike Sturm and Deanna Witkowski. While the title gives the impression of a project similar to my
own, there are significant differences. Versace does not go into any depth on Ed Summerlin nor does he offer a substantial lineage of the liturgical jazz works. Also, he does not explore the liturgical jazz works specifically; rather, he casts a wide net when referring to “sacred jazz” works and compares the “sacred jazz” genre to gospel music. I intend to focus on large-scale liturgical jazz works.

Among the major practitioners of sacred jazz, Duke Ellington is undoubtedly the most commonly discussed figure. Ellington is the subject of a wealth of biographies, as well as his autobiography, *Music is My Mistress*. While several dissertations exist that discuss the sacred aspects of Ellington’s works, the one most focused on his relationship to sacred jazz is Wilbert W. Hill’s “The Sacred Concerts of Edward Kennedy ‘Duke’ Ellington.” Mary Lou Williams has had her life chronicled in two biographies, *Morning Glory* and *Soul on Soul*. There are also several dissertations that explore her connection to the liturgical jazz world, of which Charles W. Pickeral’s “The Masses of Mary Lou Williams: The Evolution of a Liturgical Style,” is the most comprehensive and focused. Melodie G. Galloway’s dissertation, “A conductor's perspective of Dave Brubeck's “To Hope! A Celebration: A Mass in the Revised Roman Ritual,” focuses on Brubeck’s Mass.

Ed Summerlin has only appeared in some online, newspaper, and short magazine articles. He is often referred to in dissertations, but only briefly with almost no detail. There are books on liturgical music, but none specifically on liturgical jazz. The limited recordings that have taken place do have liner notes and there are reviews of concerts in various papers. In the 1960s, there were some television performances as well as a documentary on Reverend John Garcia Gensel. The scholarly writings up to this point have solely been focused on famous jazz
composers such as Duke Ellington, John Coltrane, Mary Lou Williams, David Baker, and Dave Brubeck. While these composers’ sacred and liturgical works are certainly worth close examination, the scholarly community has largely overlooked Summerlin; however, as I demonstrate in this dissertation, his contributions to liturgical jazz are unparalleled in terms of output and innovation.

Methodology

This project rested on a three-pronged methodology, consisting of archival research, oral history, and musical analysis. To better understand Summerlin’s life, music, and reception, I have consulted numerous primary sources, including newspaper articles, magazine articles from both musical and non-musical publications, concert reviews and posters, published interviews with composers, scholarly papers, service programs, conference programs, and articles. I also delved deeper into the autobiographical and biographical writings that were available to gain more insight into the topic and the artists who created the music. The recordings and their liner notes were also valuable source of information. Many of the original recordings contain additional writing inserts with valuable biographical and musical information. While not easily available, I have managed to track down recordings of the early works of Ed Summerlin, Eddie Bonnemère, and Frank P. Tirro.

I interviewed sidemen from recording dates as well as current artists involved in liturgical jazz. Some sidemen like Thomas “Shab” Wirtel and Morgan Powell were locally based. Others, such as Ron Carter, Steve Kuhn, Bob Norden, Sheila Jordan, and Adam Nussbaum, are based in New York. I also interviewed Summerlin’s longtime friends and musical collaborators
Don Heckman and Bob Norden. For insight into the religious aspects of this endeavor, I interviewed both John Moulder, a jazz guitarist and Catholic priest in Chicago, and Pastor Robert Rasmus of the Luther congregation of St. Matthews in Urbana, Illinois. Through interviews, I gained a clearer picture of the composers and their processes when dealing with these sacred works. Through the invaluable information I acquired from interviews and other sources, I was able to create a more complete history of Summerlin’s life and his music.

My analysis of Summerlin’s music focuses largely on his liturgical work *Liturgical Jazz*. I also discuss in some detail *Evensong, A Jazz Liturgy; The Coming of Christ; Liturgy of the Holy Spirit; A Contemporary Service of Worship; Sourdough and Sweetbread; Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?; Celebration of Man’s Hope;* and *Bless This World*. While my focus is on these liturgical works, I also examine his other original works, including *New Sounds from Rochester, Improvisational Jazz Workshop, Still at It, Sum of the Parts, and Eye on the Future*. The analysis of *Liturgical Jazz* is theoretical in nature and includes a discussion of the pertinent melodic, harmonic, and formal elements of the work. There is less emphasis on the use of improvisation within these works except where it offers a significant insight to some aspect of the piece.

**Liturgical Jazz Contributors**

The following is a roughly chronologically-based discussion of the major contributors of liturgical jazz, excluding Summerlin’s, whose liturgical works are discussed at length in Chapters 3 and 4. I define liturgical jazz as music that is stylistically firmly in the jazz genre and was composed for the purpose of worship. While the intent of the composer is usually easier to
discern, the label jazz is not. Since its earliest days, the word jazz has been problematic, and now that we have hit the centennial of the first recorded jazz it has only grown more convoluted. While I might agree with the notion that “you’ll know it when you hear it,” that argument is not sufficient for the purposes of this dissertation. The one criteria that usually is a requirement to call something jazz is the inclusion of improvisation. While there are certainly other styles of music that have historically or currently employ varying degrees of improvisation, this is the one quality which virtually every “jazz” recording or performance contains. Swing feel, often associated with jazz, is a little bit more problematic depending on the era we are referring to and current jazz trends. I do not feel that I need to go into detail on the different eras associated with jazz: early, swing, bebop, cool, harp bop, free or avant-garde, fusion, and so on; instead, I will say that the swing pattern or swing feel became more or less pronounced depending on what era and who the performers were.

A fairly stable canon of jazz compositions and respected practitioners has emerged over the last century, aided in no small part by recordings. More recently, the advent of illegal and legal Real Books, computer programs, and applications have helped create that canon. I would include jam sessions to a degree, but it has been my experience that the material one is expected to know tends to be regional in nature. This may have something to do with the explosive growth of jazz in academia over the last fifty years, the glut of published materials on the performance practices and required repertoire of jazz, and each institution’s long-term allegiance to certain books. Upon listening, most of the initiated can virtually always agree on something being jazz if the music falls comfortably into the expected canonical practices of jazz. While many did argue about whether Ornette Coleman’s music constituted jazz in 1959, I
believe the debate has been settled some sixty years later. Summerlin’s liturgical works fall wholly or, in the later years, in large part in the canonical expectations of what jazz is and was.

There are many jazz works that are often mentioned when the topic of liturgical jazz arises, but they are often sacred jazz works, not liturgical jazz works, since they were never intended to be used to accompany a service of worship. Duke Ellington and John Coltrane are the two most visible examples of this tendency to label sacred jazz liturgical. Since the works are included so often, I felt it was necessary to write about why they are not included in my lineage of liturgical jazz services.

Duke Ellington

When one discusses the topic of liturgical jazz, Duke Ellington’s name is almost always the first mentioned. His Sacred Concerts in 1965, 1968, and 1973 along with their recordings are widely admired both within and outside of jazz circles. Ellington is, of course, a giant in the lexicon of jazz and American music. The above-mentioned works are, however, not liturgical, nor were they meant to be. The first sacred concert was commissioned by the Very Revered C. Julian Bartlett, dean of San Francisco’s Grace Cathedral, and the Reverend John S. Yaryan.¹ Unsure how he and his music would be received by the church in its unfiltered state, Ellington was hesitant to accept the commission; however, Ellington finally accepted the commission in 1964, two years after he was first approached.² The music was sacred, but was not intended to be part of a service of worship. Ellington wrote about sacred concerts in his autobiography

Music is My Mistress, “these concerts are not the traditional mass jazzed up. I have not as yet

² Ibid.
written music for a mass, although I have been commissioned by Father Norman O’Connor to do so." The first sacred concert was commissioned for the “Festivals of Grace” at Grace Cathedral and the only stipulation was that it was to be a sacred concert in the Ellington style.

Ellington wrote about the first concert: "The concert was performed for the first time on September 16, 1965, and it was successful beyond my wildest dreams, both in San Francisco and at a subsequent performance in the Fifth Avenue Presbyterian Church of New York on December 26." Ellington would go on to compose and perform two other sacred concerts in 1968 and 1973, but he never did compose a liturgical jazz Mass or service.

John Coltrane

John Coltrane’s A Love Supreme is perhaps the second most common work referenced when the topic of liturgical or sacred jazz arises. Coltrane’s contributions to jazz are well documented in a wide range of books and articles, so I will focus only on A Love Supreme. The album was recorded on December 9, 1964 in Rudy Van Gelder’s studio with John Coltrane’s classic quartet: John Coltrane on tenor saxophone, McCoy Tyner on piano, Jimmy Garrison on bass, and Elvin Jones on drums and percussion. A Love Supreme’s form and themes were fully conceived by Coltrane during a five-day composing stint at home after the birth of his first son,

---

5 Ellington, Music Is My Mistress, 263.
John Jr. It was a jazz suite in four parts, which were later titled “Acknowledgement,” “Resolution,” “Pursuance,” and “Psalm.” The fourth movement, “Psalm,” was Coltrane reciting, through his saxophone, a poem he wrote to God:

Like a libretto, the words to “Psalm” (eventually titled “A Love Supreme” and printed on the inside of the album cover) define the lyrical flow of the music; one can follow syllable by syllable. Each line crests and resolves, implying punctuation. Some lines-like “God is/ He always was/ He always will be” – convey an almost operatic sense of drama. The words “thank you God,” which appear a dozen times in the text, achieve greater weight each successive time the three-note incantation sounds through the bell of Coltrane’s horn.  

There can certainly be no doubt that this work, generally regarded as John Coltrane’s masterpiece, is sacred work of art. The liturgical question, however, is a bit more complex.

In 1965, Franzo and Marina King conceived of the St. John Will-I-Am Coltrane African Orthodox Church. They attended a concert at the Jazz Workshop in San Francisco featuring the John Coltrane Quartet on September 18, 1965. The couple

found themselves “arrested” by the spiritual presence of John Coltrane. They saw a vision of the Holy Ghost as Coltrane took the bandstand. Their shared vision, referred to by church members as the “Sound Baptism,” initiated a new religious and aesthetic movement called “Coltrane Consciousness”- defined as a set of social, cultural and political practices inspired by the life and music of John Coltrane.

This experience by the Kings led to the formation of the church, which uses a “Coltrane Liturgy.... The music of John Coltrane is integrated within the order of service for the African Orthodox liturgy. Worship services are organized in order from the opening to ‘A Love

 supplementary

7 Ibid., xv.
8 Ibid., 124.
10 Ibid.
11 Ibid.
Supreme: Acknowledgement’ and the singing of Psalm 23, ‘Lonnie’s Lament’ and ‘Tunji’.” This liturgy was developed by Marina King and includes a vocal rendition of Psalm 23 sung to the theme of “Acknowledgement,” blending Coltrane’s melody with the orthodox Christian Liturgy. The congregation incorporates the chanting from Coltrane recordings often during the closing of “Lonnie’s Lament” and “Spiritual” with the Introit (the first chant of the Roman Mass) to the African Orthodox liturgy being sung simultaneously. While Coltrane’s music is being used in a liturgical setting, the works were not composed with that use in mind; instead, they were appropriated for this use. There is no evidence that A Love Supreme, which was certainly composed as a sacred jazz work, was ever meant to be used in a liturgy. Many secular songs are commonly incorporated into contemporary worship services, but are not then considered liturgical works. The other fact is that Coltrane’s music is being used as the liturgy in only one church in the world and has not become adopted by the broader worship communities in the United States or elsewhere. This is an interesting anomaly, but Coltrane’s music was not created as liturgical music and is not being used that way with the one above mentioned exception.

Liturgical Music with Jazz Elements

When I began my research on the topic of liturgical jazz, Geoffrey Beaumont’s 20th Century Folk Mass, composed in 1955 and published in 1956, was commonly referred to as the

12 Ibid., 249.
13 Ibid., 31.
first liturgical jazz Mass or the first use of jazz in a liturgical setting. The album of the same name was recorded on May 25, 1957 by Frank Weir and His Concert Orchestra, The Peter Knight Singers, and Charles Young as cantor. Peter Knight orchestrated the Mass, which was scored for forty-five instrumentalists and twelve singers. Geoffrey Beaumont was a student composer at Cambridge University who wrote songs for the “Footlights” reviews. He was later ordained as a priest and was a chaplain with the Royal Marines in World War II. Beaumont was also one of the founders of the 20th Century Church Light Music Group, a group of composers that strived to help the English churches use music that would allow them to remain culturally relevant while being firmly rooted in Christian tradition.

The 20th Century Folk Mass is in thirteen sections: “Introit,” “Kyrie,” “Gloria,” “Gradual,” the hymn “Lord, Thy Word Abideth,” “Credo,” “Offertory,” the hymn “There’s A Wilderness In God’s Mercy,” “Preface and Sanctus,” “Pater Noster,” “The Breaking of Bread,” “Angus Dei; Communion Sentence,” and the hymn “Now Thank We All Our God.” As the liner notes attest, the “Folk Mass contains little jazz in the strict sense of that word.”

Each section goes through several stylistic changes, very few of which fall into the jazz genre. Hunt wrote, at first, the term “jazz mass” was used to describe his music—though not by Beaumont himself. The term is of course misleading: the vocal style has nothing to do with jazz,

---

19 Ibid.
20 Ibid.
and the only “jazz” elements in Beaumont’s mass are the odd syncopation, and gestures such as the use of the saxophone.  

The “Introit” has a section in an early 1930s big band swing style as well as two short instrumental breaks. The whole album has a Broadway Musical 1930s big tune quality to it using stock orchestration techniques “worn threadbare in Hollywood years ago.” John Briggs, the reviewer of the record, was the opera critic for the New York Times, which may serve to explain why puzzlingly he would write that the work was in a jazz setting. The orchestration and vocals are dense with simple harmonies and is sung in a bel canto style. Fox wrote in the liner notes that Beaumont was trying to put the Mass music in a contemporary format, but that he clearly did not achieve that goal. Christopher Hunt wrote, “the music he [Beaumont] wrote in the 1950s is more characteristic of, say, the 1930s.” There is a short shout-type chorus in the “Credo.” The bass lines are particularly antiquated sounding, often playing root notes to the chords that shift every two beats. It is unclear how much input Beaumont had in the dated and stock-type orchestration that Peter Knight did for the album. Peter Knight was a well respected, albeit a bit cynical, arranger who worked in television and movies.

---

25 Ibid.
While Beaumont’s 20th Century Folk Mass contains a few elements of 1930s jazz styles, it is not a liturgical jazz Mass. Beaumont’s achievement in England was to open the discussion as to whether contemporary musical forms were acceptable in church. His work was well distributed and received considerable exposure from the BBC. In the United States, his folk Mass was performed and extensively covered by newspapers in the northeast. What Beaumont’s work did in the United States was to spur some interest in using jazz in a liturgical service, since others recognized Beaumont’s work was not jazz. Father Norman J. O’Connor was one such person and wrote, “as you can see this isn’t a Jazz Mass. A better title would be a ‘Broadway Mass’ or a ‘Tin Pan Alley Mass’.” He, along with other clerics such as Reverand John Garcia Gensel and Dr. Roger Ortmayer, would spur on jazz composers to create actual jazz masses and jazz services.

Heinz Werner Zimmermann

Heinz Zimmermann is a German composer who became interested in jazz in Heidelberg, Germany in 1950 as a result of his proximity to the headquarters of American military forces after World War II. Regarding the soldiers and jazz scene, Zimmerman wrote:

many of them gathered regularly for jam sessions in the ballroom of the Heidelberg Town Hall; small wonder that almost all of the American jazz stars and jazz bands came to Heidelberg or to nearby Mannheim, one after the other during the course of the years. Many German university students of all faculties joined these jam sessions and enthusiastically attended jazz concerts.

---

30 Ibid.
Zimmerman also began collecting records by the Modern Jazz Quartet, Lennie Tristano, Charlie Parker, Art Tatum, and Lionel Hampton as well managed to attend a concert by the Duke Ellington Big Band.\textsuperscript{31} After he graduated from college he took a teaching position at the Heidelberg School of Sacred Music and also at the Heidelberg American Information Center, where he had access to a large library of American books and recordings. He presented a series of lectures on American ‘Negro’ Spirituals called “From Spirituals to Jazz” in 1955.\textsuperscript{32}

Zimmerman came into contact with influential jazz writer and head of Southwest German Radio Baden-Baden’s jazz department, Joachim Ernst Berendt, who commissioned a piece for his Sudwestfunk All Stars big band.\textsuperscript{33} Berendt was “appalled when I offered to write a \textit{Geistliches Konzert}\textsuperscript{34} on Bible texts for a jazz baritone singer and his big band, but finally agreed when I promised to include improvised sections in my piece.”\textsuperscript{35} Zimmerman’s \textit{Sacred Concert} was premiered in 1955 in Baden-Baden with jazz singer Wolfgang Sauer and Kurt Edelhagen’s All Stars and was well received.\textsuperscript{36} Next he composed what would become his first published work, “Praise Him, O Servants of God,” a motet for five-part choir, which included a jazz-like walking bass line.\textsuperscript{37} This was followed in 1957 by \textit{PsalmKonzert}, a five-part cantata for solo baritone, five-part mixed choir, boys choir, three trumpets, vibraphone, and bass. The inclusion

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{31} Ibid., 181.
\item \textsuperscript{32} Ibid., 183.
\item \textsuperscript{33} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{34} a \textit{Sacred Concerto}
\item \textsuperscript{35} Budds, \textit{Jazz & the Germans}, 183.
\item \textsuperscript{36} Ibid., 184.
\item \textsuperscript{37} Ibid., 186.
\end{itemize}
of vibraphone and bass lines were a direct result of his affinity for jazz. Zimmerman composed his Vespers in 1962, which had several sections of the work over a traditional blues form.\(^{38}\)

*Missa Profana*, which he began composing in 1962, was completed over a decade later and was published in 1980. It is composed for orchestra; a Dixieland jazz band consisting of clarinet, cornet, trombone, guitar, bass and drums; Vibraphone; and electronic tape.\(^{39}\) The work premiered February 25, 1981 in Minneapolis, Minnesota with the Minnesota Orchestra, Bethel College Choir, Twin Cities Dixieland Jazz Band, and four singers. There were later performances in St. Paul, Minnesota (1981), Manila (1982), Hamburg (1983), Halle (1990), Leipzig (1990), Pforzheim (1992), Mannheim (1994), Frankfurt (2001), and Greifswald (2002).\(^{40}\) These were sacred concerts and not services of worship and are therefore not liturgical. One aspect of his Missa Profana that seemed odd was the title, which translated into English from Latin is *Profane Mass*. Zimmerman explained the reason for the word profane in the title is that he is using the meaning of profane as in something that is secular or in the vernacular.\(^{41}\) Zimmerman has, since the 1950s, included jazz compositional techniques and devices in his sacred works. He used these to add a new twist to his European classical compositions. He stated in an

\(^{38}\) Ibid., 188.


\(^{40}\) Ibid.

interview that he didn’t “want to imitate jazz in his music. He wants to blend it with the European style ‘to get new vitamins for our own tradition.’”

Liturgical jazz Works

Frank P. Tirro

Frank Tirro is a well-known author and educator who wrote Jazz: A History (1977), Living with Jazz: An Appreciation (1996), and The Birth of the Cool of Miles Davis and his Associates (2009). Tirro has also contributed essays on early jazz history for the books Jazz & the Germans: Essays on the Influence of “Hot” American Idioms on the 20th-Century German Music (2002) and New Perspectives on Music: Essays in Honor of Eileen Southern (1992) as well as dozens of journal articles on topics pertaining to jazz, classical music, and music education. As an educator, he held teaching positions at the University of Chicago, the University of Kansas, Duke University, and Yale University, where he became Dean of the Yale School of Music.

Tirro is also a saxophone player, clarinet player, and composer who has composed works in both jazz and classical styles. He was introduced to jazz by playing in a lab band at Omaha Central High School as a freshman. While he was a student at the University of Nebraska, he played with a jazz combo in Lincoln every Friday and Saturday night called the Jimmy Phillips Orchestra. After moving to Chicago, he joined a territory band for two years.

---

43 Frank P. Tirro, interview with author, November 2015.
the Johnny Palmer Orchestra, also known as the Peter Palmer Orchestra, until his studies became too hectic for him to continue touring.\textsuperscript{44}

Tirro became interested in composing a jazz Mass while he was a student at University of Nebraska. As the choir director at an Episcopalian church in Omaha that celebrated High Church every Sunday, Tirro was quite familiar with the parts of a formal Mass.\textsuperscript{45} As part of his job as choir director, he would attend an annual summer Anglican music camp in Colorado, where in 1958 the director played the attendees Geoffrey Beaumont’s 20\textsuperscript{th} Century Folk Mass. Tirro thought a jazz Mass was a great idea, but felt that Beaumont’s Mass did not constitute jazz. Upon returning to the university, his theory and composition teacher recommended him for a commission by the Disciples Student Fellowship and the University Episcopalian Chapel on campus to write a jazz Mass.

Tirro composed \textit{The American Jazz Mass} in December 1959 and it was premiered on February 28, 1960 at the University of Nebraska Student Union.\textsuperscript{46} The service was titled “The Music of the Eucharist In a Contemporary Idiom,” the description of the music was “Jass Consecrated to God,” which featured John Mills on trumpet, Norman Smith on alto saxophone, William Brannon on baritone saxophone, John Marshall on bass, Paul Leacox on drums, and a mixed choir directed by Sue Worley.\textsuperscript{48} The work was for a jazz quintet consisting of trumpet, alto saxophone, baritone saxophone, bass, drums, and mixed choir. It was in six sections:

\begin{itemize}
\item[Ibid.]
\item[Ibid.]
\item[Budd Gauger, “Jazz Goes to Church in Service Here Composed by NU Student,” \textit{Lincoln Evening Journal} (Lincoln, Nebraska), February 21, 1960, 17.]
\item[It is unclear if the spelling of “jass” was intentional as a nod to the supposed origins of the word jazz or simply a typo.]
\item[The Music of the Eucharist In a Contemporary Idiom, Service Program, 1960, University of Nebraska Student Union. private collection.]
\end{itemize}
“Kyrie,” “Gloria,” “Credo,” “Sanctus and Benedictus,” “Lord’s Prayer,” and “Agnus Dei.” The unusual move to not have a chordal instrument was inspired by Tirro’s affinity for Gerry Mulligan’s pianoless group with Lee Konitz. The motive of the American Jazz Mass came from the Missa de Angelis by Johannes Prioris. The work had no sections for improvisation, which Tirro stated he regretted not having included since he feels that improvisation is a cornerstone of jazz. He did not include improvisational sections because he “was expecting to have players who could not improvise, certainly not improvise well.” In a 1995 performance in Senigallia, Italy, improvisational transitions were added in between the six sections. In 2012, the work was performed by The Edmonton Metropolitan Chorus with a jazz sextet which had improvisational sections in between the six sections of the American Jazz Mass. Tirro also wrote in sections for improvisation for a more recent performance at Yale as well.

The American Jazz Mass was re-premiered with the Omaha Symphony Orchestra and Symphonic Chorus on April 17, 1961. The Associated Press wrote an article about the service which was picked up by newspapers in twenty-eight cities in all corners of the country, giving Tirro’s work incredible exposure. This exposure led to it being performed in multiple cities in a dozen states between 1962 and 1967. The work was brought back for repeat performances in subsequent years in several of the cities. In total, Tirro thinks it has been performed over two

49 Frank P. Tirro, interview with author, November 2015.
50 Ibid.
51 Ibid.
52 Frank P. Tirro, American Jazz Mass, recorded 1995, unreleased, compact disc private collection.
54 Bill W. Dean, “He Writes Church Music With Beat,” The Lawton Constitution (Lawton, Oklahoma), April 7, 1961, 7.
hundred times. While I have not found evidence to support that figure, I have found newspaper articles that prove it was performed at least fifty times across the United States in the 1960s.

In my opinion, there are several reasons for the large numbers of churches that performed the service during the early 1960s. The incredible nationwide exposure generated by the Associated Press article alerted people across the country of the work's existence. Secondly, I believe the lack of improvisational sections along with the simplicity of the music would make it appealing to a broad range of churches and choirs who would not be intimidated by a lack of experience in the jazz genre. All of the instrumental parts, with the exception of the drums, were precisely notated and simple enough for any professional or experienced amateur musician to play convincingly. Third, the choral parts were also simple, being based on early church polyphony, yet contained the novelty of having some infrequent jazz harmonies. Because of its simplicity and lack of improvisation, Tirro would not have to be there to rehearse and lead the music successfully. Finally, while Ed Summerlin's *Liturgical Jazz Service* had already been performed, recorded and released across the United States, his was not a High Church service like Tirro's. The *American Jazz Mass* would be performed in churches of different denominations than Summerlin's work because of liturgical, not musical reasons. According to Tirro, he spoke to Ed Summerlin two times by phone in the early 1960s about his *American Jazz Mass*.

---

55 Frank P. Tirro, interview with author, November 2015.
Mass and Summerlin’s Liturgical Jazz album; during the conversations they expressed admiration for each other’s work.\textsuperscript{57}

Tirro premiered his second liturgical jazz work, American Jazz Te Deum, on March 30, 1965 at the “Sinfonia Concert,” an annual event held in the University of Nebraska Union.\textsuperscript{58} The work received a world premiere in Seattle, Washington at the National Convention of the American Choral Directors Association on March 13, 1968.\textsuperscript{59} Tirro delivered a pre-concert lecture on composing in the jazz style for sacred music to convention attendees.\textsuperscript{60} The work was scored for trumpet, alto saxophone, baritone saxophone, bass, percussion (drum set and three timpani), and a mixed choir. Except for the addition of the timpani, the work was scored for the same forces as his earlier American Jazz Mass.\textsuperscript{61} The alto saxophone player was expected to double on flute for certain sections, which is not uncommon. The music was considerably more challenging, with frequent use of sixteenth-note instrumental passages, more rhythmic complexity, and shifting time signatures, which included 4/4, 2/4, 3/4, 5/4, 2/8, 3/8, 4/8 and 5/8. Unlike his American Jazz Mass, the work also included scored drums and sections for improvisation.\textsuperscript{62} The work received considerably less press and performances than Tirro’s first work. One reason may be that a considerably higher level of musicianship is required to convincingly perform the instrumental sections of the work, which could have

\textsuperscript{57} Frank P. Tirro, interview with author, November 2015.
\textsuperscript{58} “Frank Tirro’s Jazz ‘Te Deum’ Gets Premiere Here Tuesday,” The Lincoln Star (Lincoln, Nebraska), March 28, 1965, 84.
\textsuperscript{59} “Area Students to be at Choral Convention,” Clovis News-Journal (Clovis, New Mexico), March 10, 1968, 6.
\textsuperscript{60} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{61} Frank Tirro, American Te Deum: In English, We Praise Thee, O God: SATB With Instrumental Ensemble .... (Cincinnati, OH: World Library Publications, 1970), Print.
\textsuperscript{62} Ibid.
dissuaded some churches from performing it. The use of timpani, an instrument not usually available in churches, could have been a barrier to its performance. It may also be partially explained by the work not being published until 1970, a period where jazz, both in and outside of the church, was considerably less fashionable and novel. Also, by 1970 the majority of jazz services and masses had been written and commercially recorded. Tirro’s two liturgical jazz works were never commercially recorded and released, which would also have limited their opportunities for long-term exposure. The *American Jazz Mass* was recorded in the Strong Auditorium at the University of Rochester on April 23, 1966 with Ward Woodbury directing. The jazz group consisted of Joseph Vivona on trumpet, Frederic Lewis on alto saxophone, Derrill Bodley on baritone saxophone, Ralph Childs on bass, and Bill Storandt on drums.63 The recording was never widely distributed and presumably received a small pressing.

The only other liturgical jazz pieces Tirro wrote were some discants commissioned for “A Demonstration Jazz Mass” during The Festival of the Arts at Rockefeller Memorial Chapel in Chicago on May 9, 1965.64 Tirro was the musical director of the service, which featured Warren Kime on trumpet, Kenneth Soderblom on alto saxophone and flute, Barton Deming on baritone saxophone, Frank Diliberto on bass, Harold Russell on percussion, Wyatt Insko on organ, Daniel Robins on carillon, and The Ecumenical Choir.65 The Reverend John W. Pyle was the celebrant, Reverend Michael Porteus was the narrator, and Professor Charles H. Long was the preacher. The service’s music was the carillon piece “Jubilus,” organ sonata “Sonata de Chiesa,” the

64 *A Demonstration Jazz Mass*, Service Program, 1965, Rockefeller Memorial Chapel. private collection.
65 Ibid.
American Jazz Mass, and the American Jazz Te Deum.\textsuperscript{66} According to Tirro’s program notes, the source material for the motives all come from early church music.

Frank Tirro’s American Jazz Mass was the first liturgical jazz Mass, but not the first liturgical jazz service. Ed Summerlin’s Liturgical Jazz Service was widely performed, recorded, and released before the Tirro’s Mass was written and premiered. Tirro’s work did receive a lot of attention and was widely performed from 1962 to 1967 in churches of different denominations than Summerlin’s was. His American Jazz Mass would have also helped to spread the concept and practice of liturgical jazz, like Summerlin’s. Because of Tirro’s chosen career path, he did not continue composing liturgical jazz after 1965. Nevertheless, his American Jazz Mass was an important step in the evolution of liturgical jazz.

Mary Lou Williams

Mary Lou Williams’s career and life has been well documented, so I will only focus on the liturgical jazz portion of her career and life. After a highly successful secular jazz career, she abruptly stopped performing during a stay in Europe in 1954. When she returned to the United States, she found a much bleaker situation for jazz musicians than when she left. It was during this period that she decided to “turn from the ‘sinful’ world of entertainment to a self-cloistered religiosity, said some who knew her.”\textsuperscript{67} In 1956, Lorraine Gillespie introduced Williams to Father John Crowley, a jazz-loving missionary.\textsuperscript{68} Crowley was able to guide her faith

\textsuperscript{66} Ibid.


\textsuperscript{68} Ibid., 257.
and also convinced her to begin performing again. She also met a Jesuit priest, Father Anthony Woods, who, according to Linda Dahl, was a “brilliant and articulate bridge between jazz and liberal Catholic theology and practice.” The following year, Williams and Lorraine Gillespie were both baptized on May 9, 1957 and one month later, the women were confirmed together.

Williams’s first sacred jazz work was a hymn dedicated to Saint Martin de Porres, the first black person to be canonized by the Catholic Church. When he was canonized on May 6, 1962, several countries sent over 4,500 official representatives and 40,000 pilgrims gathered at St. Peter’s Basilica for the momentous event. Saint Martin de Porres was almost totally a cappella and featured complex jazz harmonies. The only instrumentation was a short piano solo by Williams and a barely audible bass accompaniment, provided by Milt Hinton. The piano solo, “which with its Latin-tinged rhythms provided the only cultural link with de Porres' Latin American heritage.” The work was premiered at St. Francis Xavier Church during a noon concert on November 3, 1962, which was de Porres' feast day. On November 11, 1962, the work was played at Lincoln Center with a bill that included Dizzy Gillespie’s orchestra and pianist Lalo Schifrin. Schifrin would write his own jazz Mass two years later. Williams would

---

69 Ibid., 258.
70 Ibid.
71 Ibid., 259.
73 Ibid.
74 Dahl, Morning Glory, 275.
75 Tammy L. Kernodle, Soul On Soul: The Life And Music Of Mary Lou Williams (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 2004), 201.
76 Ibid.
77 Dahl, Morning Glory, 276.
record the work along with the choral piece “The Devil,” gospel pieces “Anima Christi” and “Praise the Lord,” and a variety of secular songs for the album *Mary Lou Williams Presents Black Christ of the Andes* on October 10, 1962. The album sold poorly, but was well received by critics and Williams received the Prix Mondial du Disque Francais for the European release in 1968.

Williams was introduced, at her request, to Bishop John J. Wright of Pittsburgh. She convinced him to have the church back a jazz festival in Pittsburgh in 1964, which she would produce. The festival would be “the first time that an African-American woman produced a jazz festival, and the first time that sacred music was commissioned for a jazz festival, and the first time that the Catholic Church was involved in running a jazz festival.” The festival was held on June 19-20, 1964 and included Art Blakey and his Jazz Messengers, Thelonious Monk, Jimmy Smith, Ben Webster, Melba Liston, Sarah Vaughan, Dave Brubeck, and Joe Williams, among others. Around this time, Williams was sought out by a seminary student named Peter O’Brien, who later became her manager in 1970 and helped organize her performance at the “Praise the Lord in Many Voices” held on February 5, 1967 at Carnegie Hall. The concert featured four masses, a sacred Shabbat service, and a work titled “Praise the Lord,” which featured Mary Lou Williams on piano, Honey Gordon and Leon Thomas on vocals, a choir, and a chamber ensemble.

78 Ibid., 421.
79 Ibid., 278.
80 Ibid., 281.
81 Ibid.
82 Ibid., 284-289.
83 *Praise the Lord in Many Voices, Program, 1967, Carnegie Hall*, accessed on February 24, 2017,
Williams had been eager to write a jazz Mass and on July 24, 1967 she premiered her *Mass* for piano and voice at St. Paul’s Cathedral in Pittsburgh.\(^8^4\) The *Mass* contained “O.W.,” “Praise the Lord,” “Kyrie,” Gloria,” “Credo,” “Sanctus,” “Pater Noster,” “Agnus Dei,” “Act of Contrition,” and “Thank You Jesus.” Williams had included sections for improvisation, but limited her use a swing feel, opting for more funk-inspired groves and ostinato patterns. Her second Mass, *Mass for the Lenten Season*, was commissioned by Father Robert Kelly and was premiered on March 3, 1968 at St. Thomas the Apostle Church in Harlem.\(^8^5\) The work began the same way as her first *Mass* with “O.W.” and continued with “Clean My Heart,” “Lord Have Mercy,” “The Lord is My Light,” “Offertory: Instrumental,” “Holy, Holy, Holy,” “Anemnensis,” “Amen at the End of the Canon,” “Lamb of God,” “Communion Song,” and “The Prodigal Son.” After the assassination of Dr. Martin Luther King Jr., Williams added several pieces to the Mass: “We Shall Overcome,” “Tell Him Not to Talk Too Long,” and “I Have a Dream.”\(^8^6\)

Her third Mass was performed at a memorial for slain Kenya statesman Tom Mboya on July 15, 1969 at the Holy Family Roman Catholic Church.\(^8^7\) The Mass, which Charles Pickeral refers to as the Mboya Mass, would undergo a later transformation\(^8^8\) and be titled *Music for Peace*, which premiered as a concert on April 25-26, 1970 at St. Paul’s Chapel at Columbia

https://www.carnegiehall.org/PerformanceHistorySearch/#!search=Mary%20Lou%20Williams
\(^8^4\) Dahl, *Morning Glory*, 293.
\(^8^6\) Ibid., 198-202.
\(^8^7\) Pickeral, “The Masses of Mary Lou Williams,” 232.
\(^8^8\) Ibid., 243.
University. The Mboya Mass consisted of “Peace O’ Lord,” “The Lord Says,” “Kyrie,” “In His Days,” “Peace I Leave with You,” “Alleluia,” “Turn Aside from Evil,” “Our Father,” “Blessed are the Peacemakers,” and “Spring.” Pickeral wrote:

It is ironic that the Mboya Mass can be viewed as something of a dead end in the evolution of Mary Lou Williams’ liturgical writing, given that it served as the template from which her most widely performed setting was drawn. The textual resources and rudimentary melodic resources did, in fact, spawn much of the later material. However, in order to do so, they were subjected to a major stylistic shift. This change of direction clearly separates all subsequent versions of the third Mass from her previous settings, including the Mboya Mass.

Although Williams referred to the Mboya Mass as the first performance of her third Mass, there are, as Pickeral points out, significant stylistic changes. The updated work was retitled the Roman Catholic Mass for Peace and included three additional movements and does not contain “Spring.” Williams began recording Music for Peace in 1970 and, while the music has obvious links to the Mboya Mass, there exist significant differences. Pickeral wrote, “it is reasonable to consider Music for Peace an altogether different work. In actuality, only half of the movements on the recording are revisions of material that was presented in July 1969 and several of those are radically altered in both style and form.” The album contained “Prologue: ‘O.W.’,” “The Lord Says,” “Kyrie,” “Gloria,” “In His Day/Peace I Leave with You/Alleluia,” “Creed,” “Turn Aside From Evil/Holy, Holy, Holy,” “Our Father/Communion Psalm,” “People in Trouble,” “Lazarus,” “The World,” and “Praise the Lord.” The album’s revamped music included jazz, funk, and

89 Dahl, Morning Glory, 309-310.
91 Ibid., 264.
92 Ibid., 267.
93 Ibid., 286.
rock elements in the arrangements. The album received positive reviews from *Billboard, Record World, and Saturday Review.*

The music was transformed again for Alvin Ailey’s American Dance Theater and was retitled *Mary Lou’s Mass.* The work featured a new “Agnus Dei” with the bulk of the music coming from *Music for Peace* and premiered December 7, 1971 at the New York City Center.

Williams continued to perform both her liturgical jazz works as well as secular concerts throughout the 1970s. In 1977, she was approached by Frank Tirro, who had taken a musicology position at Duke University and shortly thereafter served as chair of the music department. According to Tirro, Terry Sanders, formerly the governor of North Carolina, had called a faculty meeting in which he expressed an interest in hiring more African-American faculty. Duke created six faculty positions that had to be filled by African Americans. The next day, Tirro secured one of the slots and his assistant suggested Mary Lou Williams. He made several trips to New York, but she was hesitant to accept a job in the south. Eventually, Peter O’Brien helped convince her to take the job. Tirro stated that a Catholic African-American woman was an “extraordinary hire” for the time and having someone of the caliber of Mary Lou Williams was a huge coup for the Duke music department. Williams taught at Duke until her death on May 28, 1981.

---

95 Kernodle, *Soul On Soul,* 236.
96 Ibid., 243.
97 Frank P. Tirro, interview with author, November 2015.
Eddie Bonnemère

Edward Valentine Bonnemère was a pianist, composer, educator, and worship leader. He began his professional career playing in churches in Harlem. Bonnemère was active as an educator and performer in New York and became well known in the 1950s for leading a mambo band whose first hit was the song “Five O’Clock Whistle.” He was the first to hire the now-legendary percussionist Ray Barretto for his Latin band. Bonnemère also led the house band at the Savoy Ballroom in Harlem from 1950-1955.

On May 8, 1966, Bonnemère premiered his Missa Hodierna at St. Charles Borromeo Catholic Church in New York with a thirteen piece jazz group and mixed choir. The work was in two parts: The Liturgy of the Word and the Eucharist Liturgy. It opens with “Lord Have Mercy,” which was the Kyrie, “Gloria” or hymn of praise, “Credo” or proclamation of faith, “Offertory,” “Holy, Holy, Holy,” “Benedictus,” which is a song of blessing, and “Lamb of God” or invocation. The Mass ends with concluding prayers. The Mass also included “Sometimes I Feel Like a Motherless Child,” “Sanctus,” “Agnus Dei,” “O Lord, I’m Not Worthy,” and “The Mass is Ended, Let’s Go in Peace.” The work was originally written as part of a master’s thesis for

---

100 “Eddie Bonnemere,” Judith Finell Music Services, Promotional Material. Institute of Jazz Studies: Rutgers University. Newark, N.J.
101 “Missa Hodierna,” Ticket. Institute of Jazz Studies: Rutgers University. Newark, N.J.
102 “Edward V. Bonnemere,” Biography. Institute of Jazz Studies: Rutgers University. Newark, N.J.
Hunter College. Bonnemère’s *Missa Hodierna* was the first jazz Mass to be part of a Roman Catholic Service.

In December of 1967, Bonnemère premiered a *Mass for the Advent Season* at the St. Thomas the Apostle church in Harlem. This was followed by *Mass for Christmas, Mass for Easter*, and *Mass for Every Season*. *Mass for Every Season* was recorded and released independently by the Community of St. Thomas the Apostle in Harlem. The album’s promotional materials list Bonnemère as the composer, arranger, and conductor with lyrics by Father Robert Ledogar. The band consisted of Ira Stuart on piano, Bonnemère on organ, Joe Scott on bass, Sticks Evans on drums, Roy Phelps on guitar, Allen Brown on trumpet, Benny Powell on bass trombone, Arnie Lawrence on alto saxophone, Lawrence “Rico” Henderson on tenor saxophone and flute, and a mixed choir. The music features a wide range of styles and a choir singing in unison so as to facilitate congregational participation. The designation of jazz Mass is a stretch given the breadth of genres represented by the material.

Bonnemère also composed a jazz liturgy for the Lutheran church, *Missae Laetare*, as well as *Misa A Nuestro Dios*, a Mass using Latin American rhythms which premiered on October 10, 1971 at the second annual All-Nite Soul Jazz Vespers at St. Peter’s. Along with the seven masses he wrote, Bonnemère frequently collaborated with Pastor John Garcia Gensel for jazz Vesper services from the late 1960s until the early 1990s. Gensel led the jazz ministry at St. Thomas the Apostle.

---

104 **Ibid.**
106 Kevin P. Kelly, “Community of St. Thomas the Apostle in Harlem,” promotional material. private collection.
108 “Community of St. Thomas the Apostle in Harlem,” promotional material. private collection.
Peter’s Lutheran Church in Manhattan and is discussed later in this chapter. Bonnemère also recorded two more liturgical jazz albums: *Missa Laetare (Mass of Joy)* and *O Happy the People*, which was a jazz Vesper’s service. The score of *O Happy the People* contains three extra sections: “The Invitory,” “Venite exultemus,” and “The Hymn,” which when included conform to a Matins Mass instead of a Vespers Mass.\(^{110}\) *Missa Laetare* was the fruit of his frequent collaborations with Gensel, who was a Lutheran clergyman.\(^{111}\) The work was premiered on March 17, 1969 at St. Peter’s Lutheran Church. For the recording, the same band featured on *Mass for Every Season* was brought in with a few additions. Bonnemère is listed as composer and conductor with Robert Bornemann leading the Lutheran Seminary Choir at Philadelphia. The album features Bonnemère on organ, Arnie Lawrence on alto saxophone and clarinet, Lawrence “Rico” Henderson on tenor saxophone, Howard Johnson on alto saxophone and clarinet, William Bivens on baritone saxophone, Eddie Preston on trumpet and flugelhorn, Allen Brown on trumpet, Benny Powell on bass trombone, Roy Phelps on guitar, Ira Stuart on piano and bells, Sticks Evans on drum set and timpani, Joe Scott and Harold Gaylor on bass.\(^{112}\) The tracks on the album are “Help Me Jesus,” “Introit,” “Kyrie,” “Gloria in Excelsis,” “Collect,” “Epistle: Gal. 4, Seasonal gradual,” “Gospel: John 6,” “Offertory,” “Preface and Sanctus,” “The Lord’s Prayer,” “Agnus Dei,” “Nunc Dimittis,” “Prayer and Benediction,” and “Help Me Jesus.”\(^{113}\)

The choral arrangements on *Missa Laetare* features more complex choral arrangements and harmonic content than the previous recording. There is preaching on the album and, again, a


\(^{112}\) Ibid.

\(^{113}\) Ibid.
wide range of musical styles and eras are represented. The music and performance is more polished than his first album and features improvisation as well as common jazz progressions in the music. Of Bonnemère’s three recorded masses, this one falls most comfortably in the jazz genre.

*O Happy the People*, the Vespers Mass version, was Bonnemère’s third and final liturgical album. Released in 1973 it featured a much smaller group than Bonnemère’s previous albums. The group consisted of Bonnemère on piano, Albert Socarras on flute, Joe Scott on bass, Charles Simon on drums, Robert Henry on vocals, and the Choir of the Lutheran Theological Seminary at Philadelphia under the direction of Robert Bornemann.¹¹⁴ Bonnemère wrote and arranged the music and Robert Bornemann provided the text.¹¹⁵ The album’s tracks were “Just as a Deer,” “The Versicles,” “Psalm 130: De Profundis,” “Psalm 29: Afferte Domino,” “Lesson, Response and Short Responsory,” “It Takes an Awful Lot of Lovin’,” “Offertary: How Great Are You,” “Canticle: Magnificat,” “The Prayer: Kyrie, Lord’s Prayer, Collects, Benediction,” and “Blessed Be the Lord My Rock.”¹¹⁶ The first two tracks are totally a cappella and the choir is once again using harmonies instead of the unison melodies. The band plays a minimal supporting role with the exception of “Psalm 29: Afferte Domino.” Once again, there is very little which falls comfortably into the jazz genre. “It Takes an Awful Lot of Lovin’” is the track which, with its improvisation, accompaniment, vocal delivery, and groove, most closely resembles jazz.

¹¹⁵ Ibid.
¹¹⁶ Ibid.
Bonnemère was active in the liturgical jazz scene in the northeast from the late 1960s into the early 1990s. He was a frequent collaborator of John Garcia Gensel and was a regular performer at St. Mark’s Lutheran Church’s Jazz Vespers. Bonnemère also performed his liturgical music at high-profile venues such as a in special program at Town Hall in New York titled “Jazz for the Masses” on March 21, 1969 and Avery Fisher Hall in Lincoln Center in 1981. He was a permanent fixture in the New York liturgical jazz scene for over two decades.

Bonnemère’s masses never gathered the nationwide attention that Ed Summerlin’s liturgical jazz services or Frank Tirro’s Mass did, but he did manage to be a major force in the northeast and had a long liturgical music career.

Paul Knopf

Paul Knopf is a New York-based pianist, church music director, and composer who earned degrees from The Julliard School and New York University. According to Knopf, he began writing liturgical jazz works in 1964 after hearing an unidentified performance of liturgical jazz that he felt was too restrained in character. Knopf became affiliated with the Judson Memorial Church in New York’s Greenwich Village, which had a very progressive arts ministry and was active in social justice causes. He was commissioned to write the score for a play and later wrote A Setting of the Psalms for a Thanksgiving Day service in 1964. Sheila

---

117 “St Peter’s Church News Release,” Eddie Bonnemère. Institute of Jazz Studies: Rutgers University. Newark, N.J.
120 Paul Knopf, interview with author, March 2016.
121 Ibid.
Jordan sang the work with Knopf on piano, Jack Six on bass, Paul Motian on drums, and choral accompaniment.\textsuperscript{122} John Garcia Gensel and Norman O’Conner attended the second performance, which was in a concert setting, and took an interest in Knopf. He performed it again at the American Baptist Assembly in Wisconsin and several college campuses on the East Coast with Gensel’s and O’Connor’s help. Knopf also worked frequently with Bonnemère, with whom he collaborated on writing liturgical jazz works and performed at services.

In 1965, Knopf composed \emph{Faith of a Radical}, a liturgical jazz work for social justice dedicated to A.J. Muste. He performed it with the same group at several college campuses and churches that were having anti-war protests.\textsuperscript{123} Knopf wrote the music and text for \emph{The Last Trip}, a piece based on the Prodigal Son text from the Bible. He composed a \emph{Palm Sunday Service} and received a National Endowment for the Arts grant to write a musical theater work titled \emph{The Cursing of the Fig Tree}.\textsuperscript{124} Featuring music and a text by Knopf as well as dancing, the work was premiered at one of the All-Nite Soul events at St. Peter’s Church in Manhattan. He also wrote two Catholic masses in Latin: \emph{Aaron and Emma Mass} for choir and sextet, and \emph{Magnificat}.\textsuperscript{125} Knopf also wrote a \emph{Mass for My Brothers and Sisters}, but it has not been performed. He is still involved at Judson Memorial Church and St. John’s Lutheran Church in Greenwich Village.

\textsuperscript{122} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{123} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{124} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{125} Ibid.
Paul Horn

Paul Horn is a flutist, clarinetist, and saxophone player who played in Chico Hamilton's quintet from 1956 to 1958 and with Tony Bennett in 1966.\textsuperscript{126} He worked for Hollywood studios, Canadian television, the Canadian National Film Board, and recorded solo flute at the Taj Mahal and the Great Pyramid of Cheops.\textsuperscript{127} In 1965, Horn was the featured soloist on \textit{Jazz Suite on the Mass Texts} by pianist and composer Lalo Schifrin. Horn wrote, “in terms of concept, recording and live performance, the Jazz Mass was definitely a peak experience in my life.”\textsuperscript{128} Horn wrote that he was looking for a vehicle for improvisation that would include orchestra, his jazz quintet, and voices, so he contacted Lalo Schifrin about composing the music. Schifrin came to prominence as Dizzy Gillespie’s piano player from 1960-1962 and has become a prolific film scorer.\textsuperscript{129} The text was originally in Latin, but was switched to English one week before the recording session after the Ecumenical Council in Rome sanctioned Mass to be delivered in different languages.\textsuperscript{130} Horn recalled, “our mass was the first written in any language other than Latin, and it was the first jazz Mass ever recorded.”\textsuperscript{131} While I think the first claim may be a difficult one to prove, the second one holds true. Tirro’s \textit{American Jazz Mass} was written and

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{127} Ibid.  \\
\textsuperscript{128} Paul Horn, \textit{Inside Paul Horn: The Spiritual Odyssey of A Universal Traveler} (San Francisco: Harper San Francisco, 1990), 145.  \\
\textsuperscript{130} Ibid.  \\
\textsuperscript{131} Ibid., 146.
\end{flushright}
performed years earlier, but it was not recorded until 1966, and even then with limited distribution.

The album features Paul Horn on alto flute, bass flute, alto saxophone, and clarinet. His quintet consists of Lynn Blessing on vibraphone, Bill Plummer on bass, Mike Lang on piano, and Larry Bunker on drums. Comprised of several notable jazz and studio musicians, the orchestra consists of Vincent De Rosa on French horn; Frank Rosolino on trombone; Dick Leith on bass trombone; Al Porcino and Conte Condoli on trumpet; Red Callender on tuba; Dorothy Remsen and Ann Stockton on harp; Ken Watson, Emil Richards, Frank Flynn and Milt Holland on percussion; and an eight-person mixed choir.\textsuperscript{132} The Mass consists of “Kyrie,” “Interludium,” “Gloria,” “Credo,” “Sanctus,” “Prayer,” “Offertory,” and “Agnus Dei.” The album has extensive contemporary improvisations and has many avant-garde qualities. The “Credo” in particular has free improvisation by both Horn and the choir that is supposed to symbolize the agony of being trapped in purgatory.\textsuperscript{133} The album won a Grammy award for “best original composition” in 1965.\textsuperscript{134}

The Mass was performed live a few times in the 1960s according to Horn. He recounted a Mass at Hennepin Avenue Methodist Church in Minneapolis where five thousand people attended.\textsuperscript{135} The “Offertory” began and ended with a written melody, but called for free improvisation from the jazz quintet during the distribution of communion. Because of the size

\textsuperscript{132} Fr. Norman J. O’Connor, liner notes to \textit{Jazz Suite on the Mass Texts}, Paul Horn, RCA Victor LSP-3414, 33\(\frac{1}{3}\) rpm, 1965.
\textsuperscript{133} Horn, \textit{Inside Paul Horn}, 146.
\textsuperscript{134} “Past Winners Search,” The Recording Academy, accessed February 28, 2017, https://www.grammy.com/nominees/search?artist=%22Lalo+Schifrin%22&field_nominee_work_value=&year=All&genre=All
\textsuperscript{135} Horn, \textit{Inside Paul Horn}, 147.
of the crowd and time necessary to distribute communion, the group ended up improvising for forty-five minutes. Horn described it a pivotal moment for him both spiritually and musically that guided his career after that. Lalo Schifrin re-orchestrated the work for the German WDR Big Band and performed the Mass in a concert setting on February 7, 1998 in Cologne, Germany. The recording had featured soloists Lalo Schifrin on piano, Tom Scott on woodwinds, and Joe LaBarbera on drums, all accompanied by the WDR Big Band, St. Stephan’s Youth Choir of Cologne, and some additional orchestral instrumental guests.

Vince Guaraldi

Vince Guaraldi was a pianist and composer who, in the 1950s, played with Cal Tjader, Woody Herman, Frank Rosolino, Conte Condoli, and Howard Rumsey’s Lighthouse All-Stars, among others. He later became well known for his scoring of the television show Peanuts. He was commissioned by Reverend Charles Gompertz to compose a jazz Mass to celebrate the completion of Grace Cathedral. Barret “Barry” Mineah was the choral conductor for the jazz Mass and the St. Paul’s Church of San Rafael Choir was enlisted. Mineah suggested to Guaraldi that the hymns and choral music should be familiar to all Episcopalians and it should be a communion service. Gompertz suggested the “Plain Song’ setting of the Missa Marialis, the

136 Ibid., 148.
138 Ibid.
Fourth Communion service setting—because I knew that nobody, but nobody, could argue with that. You couldn’t get more conservative than that.”

The service was recorded on May 21, 1965 at Grace Cathedral in San Francisco where Ellington would premiere his first Sacred Concert a few months later. The musicians included Guaraldi on piano, Tom Beeson on bass, and Lee Charlton on drums, along with a sixty-eight-person choir. The Mass consisted of “The Bishop’s Greeting,” “Kyrie Eleison,” “Come with Us, O Blessed Jesus,” “Nicene Creed (I Believe),” “Come Holy Ghost,” “Theme to Grace,” “Sursum Corda and Sanctus,” “The Lord’s Prayer,” “Agnus Dei (O Lamb of God),” “Holy Communion Blues,” “Adore Devote (Humbly I Adore Thee),” “In Remembrance of Me,” “Gloria in Excelsis,” and “Blessing (Bishop James A Pike).” The sermon was preached by the nationally recognized and controversial priest Malcolm Boyd, a choice that would be as controversial as using a jazz Mass because of his outspoken criticism of racial segregation. The Mass received some lukewarm reviews, one of which unfavorably compared the work to “cocktail music,” but it lies very comfortably in the jazz piano-trio tradition in groove and Guaraldi’s bebop-inspired melodic improvisations. The criticism may stem from the frequent use of 3/4 and 6/8 time signatures in the work as well as Charlton’s use of brushes on the drums, or with reviewers unfamiliar with the subtleties of jazz piano trios. The recording was edited, reordered and song titles were added to Guaraldi’s improvisations under the guidance of Gompertz because the record company engineers were unfamiliar with the structure of the Mass and it was much too

143 Ibid.
144 Bang, Vince Guaraldi, 150.
long to fit on a single album.\textsuperscript{145} Guaraldi performed the Mass at least one time in 1967 at the Festival of Liturgical Arts in San Francisco.\textsuperscript{146}

Dave Brubeck

Dave Brubeck was a pianist and composer who, in the 1950s and 60s, led a very popular quartet with Paul Desmond on alto saxophone, Eugene Wright on bass, and Joe Morello on drums. He had a long and successful career as a jazz musician and also composed many liturgical works. Because his career is well documented, I will only focus on his works inspired by liturgical jazz. He wrote a jazz oratorio titled \textit{The Light in the Wilderness} in 1968.\textsuperscript{147} Improvisation, syncopation, and piano solos are the only musical ties to jazz in what is otherwise a classically-oriented work. The following year, Brubeck composed the cantata \textit{Gates of Justice}, a work which contained Hebrew melodies, spirituals, blues, jazz, and rock elements.\textsuperscript{148} A Catholic publishing company commissioned Brubeck to write a contemporary Mass with the stipulation that it had to be performable by a full orchestra in a concert setting and by amateurs in any setting.\textsuperscript{149} The result was Brubeck’s \textit{To Hope! A Celebration}, which was released in 1980. The Mass was largely classical in nature with the exception of “The Peace of Jerusalem” and “Alleluia,” both of which featured the jazz quartet’s improvisations. Brubeck’s next major liturgical work with jazz elements was the cantata \textit{The Voice of the Holy Spirit}

\textsuperscript{145} Ibid., 154-155.
\textsuperscript{146} “Festival of Liturgical Arts Opens Monday at Seminary,” \textit{Daily Independent Journal} (San Rafael, CA), April 1, 1967, 19.
\textsuperscript{148} Ibid., 134.
\textsuperscript{149} Fred M. Hall, \textit{It’s About Time: The Dave Brubeck Story} (Fayetteville, AR: The University of Arkansas Press, 1996), 135-136.
(Tongues of Fire), which premiered in 1985.\textsuperscript{150} The work contained a jazz quartet as well as improvisation. While Brubeck’s jazz credentials are unquestionable and these works all contain elements of jazz, particularly jazz-inflected improvisations, they are not wholly or even mostly jazz pieces. Much of this music falls comfortably in the classical genre.

Other Liturgical Jazz Works

David Baker was a trombonist, cellist, composer, author, and educator who wrote three jazz masses. In 1967, he composed his first Mass, Lutheran Mass, which was scored for mixed chorus and jazz sextet.\textsuperscript{151} His second Mass, Catholic Mass for Peace, composed in 1969, was scored for chorus and jazz ensemble.\textsuperscript{152} In 2003, he composed Episcopal Mass for the Feast Days of Bishop Absalom Jones.\textsuperscript{153} The Mass is scored for boys’ choir, mixed chorus, and a jazz septet with sections for improvisation by piano, bass, and drums.\textsuperscript{154} According to Andre Jerome Thomas, Baker also considered Beatitudes, Psalm Twenty-two, Psalm Twenty-three and In Black America to be liturgical jazz works, despite including instrumentation not commonly associated with jazz.\textsuperscript{155} Father Clarence Rivers, a Catholic priest, composed Brother of Man in 1967, which

\textsuperscript{150} Ilse Storb and Klaus-Gotthard Fischer, Dave Brubeck, Improvisations And Compositions: The Idea Of Cultural Exchange: With Discography (New York: Peter Lang, 1994), 139.
\textsuperscript{151} Monika Herzig, David Baker (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2011), 342.
\textsuperscript{153} Herzig, David Baker, 208.
\textsuperscript{154} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{155} Thomas, A Study of the Selected Masses, 123.
was performed at the Newport Jazz Festival that same year.\textsuperscript{156} He also composed \textit{Resurrection}, which was scored for gospel and jazz soloists, chorus, and piano, with the option of replacing the piano with a chamber orchestra.\textsuperscript{157} Baker’s and Rivers’s liturgical jazz works have not been recorded and released.

In 1965, pianist, composer, saxophonist and French horn player Jonathan Klein was commissioned to compose a Jewish jazz prayer ceremony by Temple Emanuel in Worcester, Massachusetts for a Jewish youth convention.\textsuperscript{158} The work was premiered there in November of 1965 and was scored for piano, bass, drums, trumpet, soprano saxophone, alto saxophone, baritone saxophone, French horn, flute, flugelhorn, and two singers.\textsuperscript{159} After its initial performance, the ceremony was performed as a concert in several cities in the northeast.\textsuperscript{160} An album was recorded with Herbie Hancock on piano; Jerome Richardson on flute and tenor and alto saxophone; Jonathan Klein on French horn and baritone saxophone; Thad Jones on trumpet and flugelhorn; Ron Carter on bass; Grady Tate on drums; singers Antonia Lavanne and Phyllis Bryn-Julson; and Rabbi David Davis as the reader.\textsuperscript{161} The recording features improvisation and includes “Blessing Over The Candles,” “Matovu-Bor’chu,” “Sh’ma,” “Micho Mocho,” “Sanctification,” “May the Words of My Mouth,” “Kiddush,” “Torah Service-

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{157} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{159} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{160} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{161} Ibid.
\end{flushleft}
Adoration,” and “Final Amen.” Despite the formidable lineup, the record had a very small pressing and subsequently vanished into obscurity.

In 1990 the Milken Archive commissioned a revised version of the work for a 1992 new recording featuring Herb Pomeroy and four voices that was blended with sections of the original recording. Herb Pomeroy was a trumpeter, composer, arranger, band leader, and educator who worked with Charlie Parker, Charlie Mariano, Lionel Hampton, and Stan Kenton, and was also a member of the faculty at the Berklee School of Music for forty years. The revised work was performed in Massachusetts a few years later with the largely the same 1990s group including Herb Pomeroy. Klein later composed a jazz cantata Of Sacred Times and Seasons with text by Rabbi David Polish. The work was commissioned by Congregation Beth Elohim in 1972 and performed at the synagogue in Brooklyn, New York. The group that performed was Jonathan Klein on keyboards and baritone saxophone, Sal Spicola on tenor and soprano saxophones, Jackson Stock on trombone, Mick Goodrick on guitar, Steve Swallow on bass, Ted Seides on drums and vocalists Beth Harrington and Doug Leese. The work was never professionally recorded but a rehearsal tape does exist. According to Klein the cantata

162 Ibid.
was in a fusion style, not unlike Gary Burton’s 1970s groups, with text about Jewish Holiday’s throughout the year.\textsuperscript{167}

Michael Garrick, a British pianist, organist, and composer, composed \textit{Jazz Praises} in 1965. He began by composing a processional for four-part harmony and the work evolved from there to become a suite of pieces.\textsuperscript{168} Garrick was urged to contact Peter Mound of St. Michael the Archangel Church in Aldershot, England, where he focused on developing choral writing for choir and becoming familiar with the sonic possibilities of the organ.\textsuperscript{169} The work was premiered there in November of 1967 and was performed again in Aberdeen, Leicester, Wandsworth, Cambridge, and Canterbury. The work’s fourth performance at St. Paul’s was recorded and featured Michael Garrick on organ; Art Themen on tenor and soprano saxophone, flute, and clarinet; Jim Philip on tenor saxophone, clarinet, and flute; Ian Carr on trumpet and flugelhorn; Coleridge Goode on bass; John Marshall on drums; Peter Mound as conductor; The Choir of St. Michael the Archangel; singers from Farmborough Grammar School; and the University Choir of St. Nicholas under the direction of Ian Imlay.\textsuperscript{170} \textit{Jazz Praises} consists of “Anthem,” “Sanctus,” “Kyrie,” “Behold, A Pale Horse,” “Salvation March,” “The Beatitudes,” “Rustat’s Gravesong,” “The Lord’s Prayer,” “Agnus Dei (Lamb of God),” “Confiteor,” “Psalm 73,”

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{167} Ibid. \\
\textsuperscript{168} Alyn Shipton, \textit{Handful of Keys: Conversations with Thirty Jazz Pianists} (New York: Routledge, 2004), 46. \\
\textsuperscript{169} Michael Garrick, liner notes to \textit{Jazz Praises at St. Paul’s}, Michael Garrick Sextet, Jazz Academy Records JAZA 11, compact disc, 2008. \\
\textsuperscript{170} Ibid.
\end{flushright}
and “Carolling.”\textsuperscript{171} Despite containing many sections of formal masses, the work’s premiere and subsequent performances were performed as sacred concerts, not as a service of worship.\textsuperscript{172}

Recent Liturgical Jazz Works

Over the last decade there has been some renewed interest in composing liturgical jazz. As was mostly the case in the 1960s and 1970s, New York is at its epicenter. Pianist, vocalist, and composer Deanna Witkowski recorded \textit{From This Place} in 2009 which featured her on piano and vocals, Donny McCaslin on saxophone, John Patitucci on bass and Scott Latzky on drums. Laila Biali, Peter Eldridge and Kate McGarry were on vocals for four of the tracks. The work features several of her liturgical jazz compositions including the “Kyrie,” “Gloria,” “Sanctus” and “Agnus Dei” from her \textit{Evening Mass}.\textsuperscript{173} Bassist and composer Ike Sturm was commissioned by St. Peter’s Church in New York to compose a jazz Mass for retiring Pastor Dale Lind.\textsuperscript{174} The result was the contemporary \textit{Jazz Mass} in 2009, which contains “Kyrie,” “Gloria,” “Interlude,” “Hymn: Just As I Am,” “Offertory: Stillness,” “Sanctus,” “Thanksgiving,” “Our Father,” “Agnus Dei” and “Hymn: Shine.”\textsuperscript{175} Sturm’s album features Misty Ann Sturm on vocals, Loren Stillman on alto saxophone, Donny McCaslin on tenor saxophone, Ingrid Jensen on trumpet and flugelhorn, Adam Benjamin on piano and Rhodes, Ryan Ferreira on guitar, Ike Sturm on bass and Ted Poor on drums. Trumpeter, composer and bandleader Wynton Marsalis composed \textit{Abyssinian Mass}, released in 2016 which featured the Jazz at Lincoln Center

\textsuperscript{171} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{172} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{173} Deana Witkowski, liner notes to \textit{From This Place}, Deanna Witkowski, Tilapia Records 0002, compact disc, 2009.
\textsuperscript{174} Ike Sturm, liner notes to \textit{Jazz Mass}, Ike Sturm, private label, compact disc, 2009.
\textsuperscript{175} Ibid.
Orchestra and the Chorale Le Chateau choir led by Damien Sneed. The work was commissioned by the Abyssinian Baptist Church in Harlem and includes “Devotional,” “Call to Worship,” “The Lord’s Prayer,” “Gloria Patri,” “Anthem,” “Sermon,” “Offertory,” “Doxology,” “Benediction,” and “Amen” among its twenty-three sections. There are many less-recognizable names who have recorded jazz masses and jazz services which have not had the same popular recognition or distribution as the artists I have focused on. I have included the current list as of February 2017 in Appendix B. Considering the large number of churches and jazz musicians in the United States and across the world, I have no doubt that I have left some off, but it is the most complete list available to date.

Jazz Clergy

Most of the jazz services and jazz masses discussed in this dissertation simply would not have been composed without the encouragement, commissions, guidance, and enthusiasm of clergy of various denominations around the United States and beyond. There would be no way to acknowledge all the above-mentioned clergy, but I feel it is important to discuss briefly three that were indispensable to liturgical jazz: John Garcia Gensel, Norman J. O’Connor, and Dr. Roger Ortmayer.

John Garcia Gensel moved to New York in 1956, where he took a jazz history course with Marshall Stearns. He began frequenting jazz clubs and gradually developed a reputation...
as a “hip minister.”¹⁷⁸ Jazz musicians began seeking him out to discuss personal and spiritual problems. Eventually, it became so time consuming that he “sought and received special designation as Pastor to the Jazz Community in New York City.”¹⁷⁹ He was a close confidant to Duke Ellington and Billy Strayhorn and presided over the funerals of jazz legends Ellington, Thelonious Monk, John Coltrane, Coleman Hawkins, Miles Davis, and Dizzy Gillespie, among many others.¹⁸⁰ In 1970, Gensel started the All-Nite Souls event at St. Peter’s Church in Manhattan, a congregation for which he led Jazz Vespers, for three decades. He worked closely with almost every jazz musician discussed in this dissertation and was a champion of liturgical jazz.

Reverend Norman J. O’Connor became Catholic Chaplain at Boston University in 1951. He was on the board for the first Newport Jazz Festival and was a close friend of George Wein.¹⁸¹ O’Connor wrote articles for *Downbeat, Metronome,* and *The Boston Globe,* among other publications.¹⁸² In the 1960s he moved to New York, where he was active on radio, television, and in the jazz community. O’Connor also had contact with almost every liturgical jazz musician in this dissertation.

Dr. Roger Ortmayer was a professor of Christianity and the Arts at the Perkins School of Theology at Southern Methodist University from 1958-1966.¹⁸³ After he was introduced to Ed

---

¹⁷⁸ Ibid.
¹⁷⁹ Ibid.
¹⁸⁰ Ibid.
¹⁸³ “Roger E. Ortmayer Is Dead; A Leader of Church Council,” *New York Times,* Sect. Obituaries, November 1, 1984, accessed December 8, 2015,
Summerlin during his second year there, they formed a partnership that lasted decades.

Ortmayer was the person who commissioned and advised on Summerlin’s first liturgical jazz service in 1959. They worked together on liturgical jazz projects of all types until Summerlin’s retirement from the genre in the early 1970s. The fruits of their labors are discussed in great detail in Chapters 3 and 4. From 1966 to 1974, Ortmayer held a position as the Executive Director of the Department of Church and Culture at the National Council of Churches. He wrote the book *Worship and the Arts*, and contributed chapters for *Christian Faith and the Contemporary Arts, The Rural Church*, and *Pastor and Church.* Ortmayer also wrote for television and plays and lectured at churches and conferences across the United States and abroad.

The clergy were almost always the instigators of the creation of many of these worship services and masses. The masses were particularly impacted by Vatican II, or the Second Vatican Council, which was convened in 1962 by Pope John XXIII and concluded under Pope Paul VI in 1965. According to Joseph A. Komonchak, “Vatican II has rightly been described as the most important event in the history of the Roman Catholic Church since the Protestant Reformation.” Komonchak goes on to write that this view is shared by both supporters and critics of Vatican II’s changes. It is beyond the scope of this dissertation to thoroughly discuss the changes handed down by the event; however, the one that most directly impacted


184 Ibid.
185 Pastor’s Study Conference, conference program, 1968, The First Church of Christ.
composers writing liturgical jazz was the granting of more autonomy to “bishops in making adaptations appropriate to their cultures,” such as using vernacular languages in masses, permitting more freedom in the selection of music, and including the congregation as a more active participant in the Mass. Some church leadership viewed this as opening the door to the use of musical styles of the day, like jazz, in worship. It also encouraged jazz composers to try their hand at writing masses. The door was not open for long, however, because in January of 1967 an edict was issued:

from the Vatican outlawing “jazz masses.” A formal condemnation of this and other “extreme distortions of liturgy,” made jointly by the Sacred Congregation of Rites, which governs liturgical matters, and the Council for the Application of the Constitution on the Liturgy was supported by a similar warning from Pope Paul VI.

This edict had a chilling effect on the creation of new masses to a certain degree. Many denominations were, of course, not bound by the Vatican’s decisions, but the old belief that jazz and church were not compatible seemed to take on new life.

1959 was an extraordinary year for jazz, with the release of, among other notable recordings, Miles Davis’s Kind of Blue, Ornette Coleman’s The Shape of Jazz to Come, Charles Mingus’s Mingus Ah Um, John Coltrane’s Giant Steps, and Dave Brubeck’s Time Out. In Denton, Texas, Ed Summerlin composed, performed, recorded, and released Liturgical Jazz, the first complete service of worship using original jazz composition. The same year, Frank Tirro composed American Jazz Mass, which was then premiered in 1960. They were followed by many jazz composers and performers in the 1960s, including Mary Lou Williams, Lalo Schifrin,

---

188 O’Malley, What Happened at Vatican II, 132.
Paul Horn, David Baker, Vince Guaraldi, and lesser-known names like Eddie Bonnemère and Paul Knopf who worked in the liturgical jazz trenches in New York. The momentum created by Summerlin would continue into the 1970s, when popular and jazz music trends would almost completely end the experiment. The last decade has seen the reemergence of liturgical jazz composition, but only time will tell if the trend continues.
Early Life

Edgar Eugene “Ed” Summerlin was born on September 1, 1928 in Marianna, Florida. The child of William Edgar Summerlin and Eunice Velma Thompson, he had an older sister, Johnnie Vivian, two younger brothers, James Lee Roy and William, and a baby sister who died of pneumonia at the age of six months. When Summerlin was two, his father worked for the Army Corps of Engineers as a civilian on dredge boats in Florida. While he was in third grade, his father moved the family to Lexington, Missouri to work on dredges. Eventually, his father became captain of the William M. Black, the largest dredge on the Missouri river with a crew of one hundred members. Lexington, Missouri had only five thousand residents, but the area had been a hot spot for entertainment since the days of prohibition. There was an entertainment district known as Block Forty-Two because there were forty-two bars in a very small area. Lexington was only forty miles from Kansas City, and people traveled from Kansas City to these bars.

Summerlin was musically oriented at an early age and taught himself a variety of instruments. During the third grade, Summerlin started teaching himself to play the violin. He kept playing it for five years until his orchestra director left to fight in World War II. He also played drums and tuba for the school during the sixth grade. Summerlin taught himself tuba by learning on his older brother’s alto horn, which had the same fingering as an E-flat tuba. They

---

191 Ibid.
192 Ibid.
played for every football game, both home and away, according to Summerlin. His sister played clarinet in school, but she soon lost interest. He taught himself clarinet in junior high, and it became his primary focus because of the lack of opportunity to play violin after the orchestra disbanded.

By the eighth grade, Summerlin had become more accomplished as a musician and began looking to expand his musical knowledge. He was concertmaster of his high school orchestra, even though he was only in eighth grade. At this point he became friends with Tom Wiley, whose mother played piano and father played the drums. According to Summerlin, Wiley was an excellent musician. They got together on Wiley’s front porch and learned songs by popular musicians of the day such as Woody Herman and Artie Shaw. Much to his surprise, Summerlin’s father sold his clarinet to a neighbor and he was devastated. After much pleading, his parents finally agreed to buy him a new one.

At fourteen years of age, Summerlin and Wiley formed their first band, the Zoot Tooters. The band consisted of pianist Betty Baker, drummer Joe Anton, trumpeter Tom Wiley, and Summerlin on clarinet. He practiced “all the time trying to get my clarinet together,” but never had a formal clarinet lesson. It was during this formative period that he decided music was going to be his life. During high school, the Zoot Tooters kept rehearsing and got a gig playing for a high school dance. Suddenly, Summerlin found himself to be popular and admired for his clarinet playing. The Zoot Tooters began working regularly, and they were undoubtedly helped by the fact that the draft had taken many of the young male musicians off to war. The group primarily played dances at municipal auditoriums and parties and made up to

193 Ibid.
194 Ibid.
ten dollars per person for gigs, the equivalent of one hundred and fifty-five dollars in 2017. They later started a big band, but because there were not enough venues for a band that size, gigs were sporadic.

During this period, America joined in WWII, which led to a relaxing of certain laws. Clubs began opening for a few hours on Sunday night, despite the blue laws that didn’t allow the sale of alcohol. There was dancing, everybody was working, and there was a lot of work in Kansas City where “people who had been making twenty-five dollars per week suddenly started making one hundred or one hundred and fifty per week.” At this time, Summerlin would also begin working as a sideman with a musician named Buddy Krenaky from Concordia, Missouri. His first formal music teacher, Victor Lamars, left during Summerlin’s freshman or sophomore year to pursue an advanced degree. He was an important mentor, and Summerlin excelled in his music class.

Summerlin’s mother took him to the Tower Theater in Kansas City where he saw Count Basie perform with Lester Young. Kansas City was a particularly fertile city for music during this era with bands playing the Municipal Auditorium, El Torreon, and the Pla-Mor Ballroom, which, “was the city’s best-known ballroom. It featured the best black and white bands.” Summerlin made trips to Kansas City with Wiley via bus. Summerlin also went with his brother Lee to the Orchid Room, an African-American venue. They saw Gene Krupa at the Pla-Mor, and

---

197 Ibid.
Lee recalled that on occasion Summerlin would sit in with touring bands.\textsuperscript{199} At end of his junior year in high school, Summerlin moved out of the house.

After leaving home, Summerlin worked regular jobs while honing his craft by playing whatever gigs he could get. He moved into the only hotel downtown that charged five dollars a night, and he worked at Montgomery Ward and played gigs. Summerlin then moved to Kansas City and began working at Pullman Company. He left shortly thereafter when he began playing with a big band in Sedalia. Summerlin also played in Dick Bennett’s hillbilly band, Dick Bennett and the Missouri Playboys. Both Dick Bennett and Buddy Leet played guitar, and Rosey played bass and performed comedic routines. They played in churches for dances, but the band broke up when Leet was arrested.

Summerlin became very ill and moved home to be cared for by his mother and to finish his high school education. He stayed and did one semester of his senior year. He excelled in English, music, and drama classes. He earned his high school diploma at Central Missouri State College in the Education Department during the summer of his senior year in 1946. According to his brother Lee, his father bought Summerlin a Ford model A. After graduation, he traded it for a tenor saxophone because he wanted to play bebop. While Summerlin was proud of his decision, his father and brother were very angry with him.

Army Career

After graduation, Summerlin joined the army on August 7, 1946 so he could receive the benefits of the G.I. Bill and have his music education paid for. His father wanted him to be an

\textsuperscript{199} James Lee Roy Summerlin, interview with author, July 2015.
engineer and refused to pay for music school, which strained his familial ties. By volunteering, he only needed an eighteen-month commitment instead of the three years that were required for draftees. Summerlin wanted the shortest stint possible.200

He was sent to Fort Knox, Kentucky with the tank corps. He was not too serious about his military duties, however, and would do roll call before sneaking off and take a nap somewhere. Unfortunately, he missed auditions for the army band school by not being there, having heard about auditions much later. Summerlin was later stationed at Camp Stoneman in Pittsburg, California. They thought Summerlin had gone to college because of his Central Missouri State High School Diploma, and, based on this assumption, they assigned him to the army post. While stationed there, he successfully auditioned for the band. He was later kicked out of the band for disciplinary reasons and was reassigned as a typist in an office.

Summerlin played saxophone in a small army band, which played in service clubs in town where soldiers would go to dance and drink. The band was integrated with both black and white members. As time passed, the white members were discharged and the band became all black, with the exception of Summerlin. He became close friends with the remaining musicians, and he even tried to convince the Army he was black so he could live with his black friends in their barracks, which were still segregated. Race was never an issue with Summerlin, but the same could not be said of his fellow soldiers. His participation in an almost all-black band resulted in a fight. A soldier from the south hit him while he was in his bunk, and Summerlin beat him up, breaking a bone in his hand in the process.

---

Summerlin’s time in the army band was a period of great musical growth. His band was comprised of two saxophones and a rhythm section. They played for the white USO in Pittsburg, California, and black USO in both Pittsburg and Oakland, California. He felt that he learned a lot about playing saxophone during this period. One incarnation was led by trumpeter Fred Pennington and featured Summerlin and Ed Milburn on tenor saxophone, Spooks Zavaky on piano, Johnny Moleda on bass, and Lewis Waites on drums with the group being described as “playing many dances and parties on and off post, these men have delighted their audiences and established themselves as one the finest GI combos in the entire Sixth Army area.” While in California, Summerlin got to hear and learn about bebop. He also heard some of the legendary big bands led by Woody Herman, Buddy Rich, and Gene Krupa. Summerlin received an honorable discharge on January 26, 1948. His Military Occupational Specialty was listed as Bandsman Saxophone. He found it quite amusing that he entered as a private as was discharged as a private due to his frequent misbehavior.

College Education

Summerlin attended Central Missouri State College, where he majored in clarinet with a minor in speech. During this time, he played clarinet in the orchestra, marching band, symphonic band, as well as the Kappa Sigma Kappa pep and dance bands. He was first chair clarinet with both the symphonic band and the orchestra. Summerlin graduated from Central

---

201 Here, credited as “Bud” Summerlin. Bud was short for Buddy, Ed Summerlin’s childhood nickname. He would use this name well into his early adulthood and it even showed up in music programs and yearbooks.
202 Bob Browne, Sharps and Flats, Newspaper clipping paper unknown, 8.
203 Edgar E. Summerlin, Curriculum Vitae. private collection.
Missouri State College in 1951 with a bachelor’s degree in music education. He graduated with honors and was ranked ninth out of one hundred and sixty students. He was a featured soloist at his own commencement and played the first movement of Antoni Szalowski’s *Sonatina*.\(^{204}\)

Summerlin returned on November 2, 1987 to be honored during a “Distinguished Composer Graduates” recital. He wrote *Robert Francis’ Songs* for tenor, violin, viola, two cellos, and trombone. It included “Weather Vane,” “Icicles,” “I am Not Flattered,” “Old Men,” “Indoor Lady,” and “Delicate the Toad.”\(^{205}\)

Outside of his academic playing, Summerlin formed a band with pianist Lester Boldridge. It consisted of Boldridge on piano, Summerlin on saxophone, and Sammy on drums. It was an all-black band with the exception of Summerlin. He always felt that he was welcomed into the black community despite the segregation of the town. The only problem he ever encountered was when a black patron in a black club said to the drummer, “I didn’t know you had white boys in your band now, Sammy.”\(^ {206}\) The drummer punched the patron off the stool. Summerlin recalled that, “nobody said anything about me after that.”\(^ {207}\) He would often be picked up at his house to go to these gigs, and at first, as was the custom in the town at the time, the black band members waited on the porch until Summerlin came out. After a bit, he insisted that they were welcome to wait inside, which was unusual in this small segregated town. They became close friends and would go to Kansas City together to the Municipal Auditorium, which was not segregated, to hear the Duke Ellington Band and Count Basie Orchestra.

\(^{204}\) Central Missouri State, Commencement Program, 1951. private collection.
\(^{205}\) Distinguished Composer Graduates, Program, 1987. private collection.
\(^{207}\) Ibid.
The Eastman School of Music Years

After graduating, Summerlin studied at the prestigious Eastman School of Music where he made life-long musical contacts. According to Lee Summerlin, Ed received a fellowship to study at the Eastman School of Music. He received a Masters of Music Literature in Clarinet Performance on June 9, 1952. He studied clarinet with professor Rufus Arey. At Eastman, Summerlin met Bob Norden, and they formed a group and continued to play together for the next fifty years. After graduation, Summerlin started teaching music at nearby Honeoye Falls Central School so he could stay close to the group and study with Eastman faculty.

Summerlin and Norden played together in clubs around the Rochester area and eventually formed a group together. The group had a regular Monday night gig at Squeezer’s in Rochester. It began in December 1952 with pianist Jim Straney and drummer Bill Porter. At a later date, the band expanded to include Norden on trombone, Bob Silberstein on alto saxophone, and Neil Courtney on upright bass. The club was a fixture in the Rochester jazz scene from the mid-1940s until the mid-1950s with artists such as Pepper Adams, Dizzy Gillespie, Nat “King” Cole, and Tommy Dorsey headlining. Four months after its inception, the group recorded an album, *The Contemporary Jazz Ensemble: New Sounds From Rochester* on the Prestige label, which was Summerlin’s first recorded jazz album.

---

Prestige was founded by Bob Weistock in 1949 and became famous with records by artists like Lennie Tristano, Lee Konitz, Stan Getz, Gene Ammons, Miles Davis, Art Farmer, Red Garland, Modern Jazz Quartet, Thelonious Monk, Jackie McLean, Sonny Rollins, and John Coltrane. It was, “one of the most famous independent labels devoted to new trends in jazz.” The group was experimenting with what had become known as third stream jazz, a term coined by Gunther Schuller during a lecture in 1957 at Brandeis University. It was a blend of various elements from the first two streams, Western classical and jazz. Terry Teachout lays out the extensive pre-history of what would become the third stream in his article “Jazz and Classical Music: To the Third Stream and Beyond.” The article shows that this musical melding of two styles had been decades in the making and the Contemporary Jazz Ensemble were not breaking new ground in attempting to use classical forms in a jazz context.

The Contemporary Jazz Ensemble’s focus was intentionally narrow and was limited to using Western classical forms in a jazz setting. The liner notes state that, “for four months six people worked together to make basic musical forms such as preludes, fantasias, fugues, and

213 According to the liner notes of Still At It the group was brought to the attention of Bob Weistock by bebop pianist George Wallington who had played in groups led by Dizzy Gillespie, Oscar Pettiford, Stan Getz, Charlie Parker, Gerry Mulligan, Red Rodney and Zoot Sims among many others.
215 Ibid.
variations a part of our contemporary jazz.” The record contains Summerlin’s first recorded arrangement, “All The Things You Are.” The song begins with the alto, trombone, and Summerlin’s tenor trading four-bar phrases. The rhythm section then plays a short five-note motive three times before the horns return in unison for the A section of the melody. The trombone takes the melody in the B section while tenor and alto play the introductory motive first heard in the rhythm section, first in unison and then in stretto. Next, the saxophones pick up the melody while the trombone plays an eighth-note countermelody. The alto saxophone takes the first solo chorus, followed by the trombone taking a chorus. Summerlin takes the next chorus quoting the earlier introductory motive several times as well as “The Surrey with the Fringe on Top.” The piano takes the final solo, and there is a two-bar break before the trombone returns alone for eight measures of the A section melody. The next eight measures involve the trombone continuing, now complemented by the whole rhythm section with Summerlin playing an eighth-note countermelody. In the B sections, he returns to the earlier motive in stretto. For the final A section, the saxophones take up the melody in unison with the trombone playing eighth-note countermelodies. The horns return to the twelve-bar introductory motive, but because the lines are different, it suggests that both sets were improvised. The song ends with the horns taking up the rhythm section motive staggered from the introduction to end the song.

Nat Hentoff reviewed the record in 1954 for Downbeat, and gave the record two stars out of a possible five, which was “fair” according to the Downbeat rating system. Hentoff’s review is below:

---

218 Ed Summerlin and Jim Straney, liner notes to New Sounds from Rochester, Contemporary Jazz Ensemble, Prestige Records PRLP163, 33⅓ rpm, 1953.
A group of thinking musicians in their early 20s who have been or are associated with the Eastman School of Music. It’s another approach to more form in jazz, and not too successful so far. The writing is tightly derivative of the half century’s classicists and rather arid besides. The improvised sections are just about adequate. None of these men is yet an outstanding jazzman per se. Pianist Jim Straney and tenor Ed Summerlin sound the most professional. The point is that no matter how complex and well conceived the form becomes, unless you have men who are first-class improvisers as well as technically skilled, you’re grounded before you start. If these men are serious about this, they’d better get some more jazz experience. *All The Things* with the contrapuntal elements in the open and close is the most alive. Recording is muddy. It’s an honest start, though, and I hope they keep on.\(^{219}\)

Despite the lackluster review, Hentoff does single out Summerlin not only as an improviser but as an arranger. Summerlin had done the arrangement on “All the Things You Are” and had saved several copies of this review. I imagine he found Hentoff’s words inspirational, and he clearly redoubled his efforts on his tenor playing and jazz arranging after leaving Rochester.

The record did allow the band to have the remarkable achievement of being the first jazz recital in the Eastman School of Music’s Kilbourn Hall, according to Norden.\(^ {220}\) They performed there during the Seventh Annual Symposium of International Federation of Music Schools on Wednesday March 18, 1953 at 7:30 p.m.\(^ {221}\) They played all of the material from the record: “Variation,” “Prelude: Go Forth,” “Fantasia and Fugue on Poinciana,” “All the Things You Are,” and “Prelude and Jazz,” as well as “Theme for Tenor,” “Prelude: Surrey with the Fringe on Top,” “Rhapsodie for Alto,” “Just the Way You Look Tonight,” and two “Free Improvisations.” The group consisted of pianist James Straney, tenor saxophonist Ed Summerlin, drummer William Porter, alto saxophonist Robert Silberstein, trombonist Robert Norden, and bassist Neil

---

\(^ {220}\) Bob Norden, interview with author, July 2015.
\(^ {221}\) Seventh Annual Symposium of International Federation of Music Schools, Contemporary Jazz Concert Program, 1953. private collection.
Courtney. Richard Lieb and James Straney provided all of the original compositions and arrangements with exception of “All the Things You Are.”

Boston

In 1954, Summerlin moved to Boston to teach as an “instrumental music teacher.” Steve Kuhn confirmed that they met and became friends during this period and that Summerlin “was like a big brother” to him. Kuhn was in the early part of his career and had been a regular performer at a jazz club in Boston called The Stable. He recalled that Summerlin would frequent the club and listen to the local bands, which included Herb Pomeroy’s group.

Summerlin and Pomeroy became colleagues at the Lenox School of Jazz in 1960 where they led a combo together. Kuhn performed at the Stable, sitting in for a few tunes or even subbing occasionally for Herb Pomeroy’s regular pianist, Ray Santisi. Pomeroy had already cemented his local legend status having led a sixteen-piece big band at The Stable and having played with Charlie Parker, Charlie Mariano, Lionel Hampton, and Stan Kenton.

During this time, Summerlin met his second wife, Mary, while on an extended summer gig at Murphy’s Inn with Steve Kuhn, Chuck Israels and Arnold Wise. He had previously

________________________

222 Ibid.
223 Edgar E. Summerlin, Curriculum Vitae. private collection.
224 Steve Kuhn, interview with author, March 2015.
225 Lenox School of Jazz, Concert Program, 1960. private collection.
226 Steve Kuhn, interview with author, March 2015.
228 Chuck Israels replaced Scott LaFaro in the Bill Evans trio, and later, drummer Arnold Wise joined the Bill Evans for two years.
229 Steve Kuhn, interview with author, March 2015.
married on August 29, 1948 to his high school sweetheart, Virginia Lee Allen, but the marriage lasted only a short time. They married again on October 15, 1949 and had a son, Sean Wright, but they quickly divorced again.\textsuperscript{230} Summerlin met Mary Elizabeth Bouknight in the summer of 1955, when she was nineteen, at a resort in Lake George, New York, where she had a summer job. After she met Summerlin she ran away from the family farm in South Carolina and they got married. They were married for thirteen years and had two children. One of those children, Mary Jo, would die before her first birthday and her death would alter Summerlin’s musical direction for over a decade. After eleven years, the Summerlins separated for a couple of years and then divorced.\textsuperscript{231}

New York

Sometime in mid-1955, Ed Summerlin left Massachusetts and headed to New York to work on finding his voice as a writer. There, he studied with Hall Overton and Teddy Charles. Overton was a pianist and composer who studied both at Julliard and with Darius Milhaud. During the war, he developed as an improviser, and he used those skills while playing with Stan Getz, Oscar Pettiford, Teddy Charles, and Jimmy Rainey. He did arrangements for Thelonious Monk in the late 1950s and wrote articles for \textit{Downbeat} and \textit{Jazz Today}.\textsuperscript{232} Summerlin stated

\footnotesize
231 Jeff Summerlin, interview with author, July 2015.
that, “My study with Hall was hard work. I was ignorant in composition, so we did exercises over and over and laid the foundation for future study.”

Summerlin then got a job touring with the Johnny Long Orchestra for a year. Johnny Long was a bandleader and left-handed violinist. The band’s main focus was playing “pleasant, danceable, but never especially exciting dance music.” His first hit came in 1940 with a “glee club’s swinging version of ‘A Shanty in Old Shanty Town,’ but actually the Johnny Long band stood out as one of the most musical of all sweet outfits [easy listening bands]. It played many of the leading hotel ballrooms, most of them in the East and Midwest.” He followed this hit with,

...bigger hits, such as ‘No Love, No Nothin’ which reached number 3 on the 1943 Hit Parade and stayed there for 10 weeks. Long’s rendition of ‘My Dreams Are Getting Better all the Time’ was one of the more popular versions of that tune. His band also appeared in a couple of movies and backed Ella Fitzgerald on a recording of ‘I'm Confessin’.

Long still had a working band by the time Summerlin joined, but they were clearly past their prime. It is likely that Summerlin played on Long’s 1957 record, Johnny Long - Plays For

---

235 Ibid.
“Saturday Night Dance Date,” but the album contains no listing of personnel.\footnote{237} Long went on to record two more records before quitting music altogether in the 1960s.\footnote{238}

Summerlin returned to New York to study with Teddy Charles, whom he described as “one of the most talented teachers I have known.”\footnote{239} Teddy Charles was a self-taught, bebop-oriented vibraphonist who had studied composition with Overton after attending the Julliard School in the 1940s. He went on to work with Benny Goodman, Buddy DeFranco, Artie Shaw, Jackie Paris, Oscar Pettiford, Roy Eldridge, Ed Shaughnessy, Art Farmer, Elvin Jones, and Charles Mingus.\footnote{240} In 1954 and 1955, he was “an active participant in Charles Mingus’s Jazz Composer’s Workshop,” and even played at the Newport Jazz Festival with him.\footnote{241} Summerlin studied with him just after the period of time that Charles was working with the Mingus’s Jazz Composer’s Workshop.

North Texas State College

After getting married and studying with Teddy Charles, Summerlin went to North Texas State College (now known as the University of North Texas) in September 1957 to pursue a PhD

\footnote{237} This is likely because there was a copy of this record among Summerlin’s recorded materials. He had no other Long LPs in his collection, and the year it was recorded matches up with the time he was with Long’s band.
\footnote{241} Ibid.
in composition.\textsuperscript{242} While on tour with Johnny Long’s Orchestra, Summerlin played a concert for the North Texas State College jazz program. An article about the program in the \textit{Denton Record-Chronicle} states that “one of the members of the Johnny Long band, Ed Summerlin, was so impressed with the school’s program that he is now at North Texas doing graduate work and assisting Dr. Hall.”\textsuperscript{243} He was the only jazz teaching assistant,\textsuperscript{244} and he taught jazz arranging starting with contemporary arrangers like Gil Evans and then working backward through the canon of great jazz arrangers.\textsuperscript{245} He was a very gifted teacher offering insights into the charts his students brought in.\textsuperscript{246} His students met two or three times a week at Summerlin’s house to listen to records and discuss music. Summerlin stopped the recordings at interesting points to illustrate significant details at the piano. He was quite adept at imitating the arranging style of Gil Evans and even wrote a chart called “Gil not Bill.” The chart was a reference to moving from Bill Holman’s writing style toward the more contemporary techniques employed by Evans.\textsuperscript{247}

According to Thomas Wirtel, it was Gil Evans, Miles Davis, and Dave Brubeck that impressed Summerlin. He also liked Monk and knew him personally. According to Morgan Powell, Summerlin was very forward and aggressive in his efforts to meet major jazz figures while he lived in New York. He was also keenly interested in the music of Ornette Coleman, as Powell recollects that, “I was a big Ornette fan and I know Ed was too.”\textsuperscript{248}

\textsuperscript{242} Edgar E. Summerlin, Curriculum Vitae. private collection.
\textsuperscript{243} Bob Porter, "Jazz Enthusiasts From All Over the County Flock to NT," \textit{Denton Record-Chronicle}, Sect. 1, p. 1, Jan 19, 1958.
\textsuperscript{244} Morgan Powell, interview with author, August 2015.
\textsuperscript{245} Thomas “Shab” Wirtel, interview with author, March 2015.
\textsuperscript{246} Morgan Powell, interview with author, August 2015.
\textsuperscript{247} Thomas “Shab” Wirtel, interview with author, March 2015.
\textsuperscript{248} Morgan Powell, interview with author, August 2015.
Gil Evans was an arranger, bandleader, composer and pianist. He contributed several arrangements in 1946 and 1947 to the Claude Thornhill band, including the notable “Anthropology,” “Donna Lee,” “Yardbird Suite,” and “Robbins’ Nest,” the first three being Charlie Parker’s compositions. These arrangements used two French horns and tuba in addition to the standard big band instrumentation of the swing era. This orchestral sensibility was used quite effectively in his later collaboration with Miles Davis on *Birth of the Cool*, *Miles Ahead*, *Porgy and Bess*, and *Sketches of Spain*. He continued refining his early experimentation, “to larger instrumental forces (up to 20), often achieving a distinctive synthesis of varied timbral mixtures in which opaque, almost cluster-like voicings alternate with rich polyphonic textures, the whole being couched in an advanced harmonic language.”

In contrast Holman was a saxophonist, arranger, and composer who worked with Stan Kenton, Conti Candoli, Shelly Manne, Mel Lewis, Maynard Ferguson, Woody Herman, and Gerry Mulligan. Gerry Mulligan’s charts written for the Stan Kenton band influenced Holman, but Mulligan’s style was more traditional and simple with a focus on writing for the traditional instrumentation of a swing-era big band. As evidenced by his chart title “Gil not Bill,” Summerlin was more appreciative of Evans’s more adventurous harmonic style.

---

Texas in the 1950s was still a very segregated place, and North Texas State College was no exception. In the spring of 1956, the school admitted its first black students, only one year before Summerlin arrived. At the time, North Texas State College didn’t have any black students in the top band because the group performed off campus frequently and it would have potentially created problems; however, this was an unofficial policy and was never expressly written anywhere. This did not stop the white jazz students from attending concerts at the American Woodman Hall on the south side of Dallas, which had an almost exclusively African-American clientele. There were jam sessions on Sunday afternoons there, and the North Texas State College students even sat in on occasion. The hall became a very popular spot, and the jam session on Sunday “afternoon soon assumed a central role in the life of the community.”

As a player at North Texas State College, Summerlin was “predictable” and had a reputation as a “hot licks” player, according to Wirtel. It was only later that he found his voice. According to Morgan Powell, he was a straight-ahead player and held the first tenor chair while he was a student there. Summerlin also, “wrote several charts for the band and they were all quite exceptional.” While he was clearly influenced by Evans, he was not a mere clone. Summerlin was very focused on his tenor saxophone playing while he was at North Texas State College, so much so that Powell had no recollection of him ever playing clarinet; however,

---

252 Morgan Powell, interview with author, August 2015.
253 Ibid.
255 Thomas “Shab” Wirtel, interview with author, March 2015.
256 Morgan Powell, interview with author, August 2015.
there is video footage from the summer of 1959 that features Summerlin on both tenor saxophone and clarinet at the Empire Room Supper Club in the Statler Hilton, Dallas. This footage was shot as part of Chet Huntley’s *World Wide ‘60* special on Summerlin, which will be discussed in Chapter 3.

Summerlin was also very interested in George Russell’s Lydian Chromatic Concept. According to Wirtel, Russell used the North Texas State College students as guinea pigs for his upcoming book, *The Lydian Chromatic Concept of Tonal Organization*, which was eventually published by Concept Publishing Company in 1959. He sent exercises by mail, and the students in Summerlin’s class sent them back to the author. The author then mailed back these exercises with corrections and notes for the students.²⁵⁷ Summerlin appears to have purchased the exercises from Russell as part of a course of study for his students according to a letter from Russell.²⁵⁸ It is unclear if the exercises mentioned in the letter did appear in the 1959 published version of the book. George Russell worked as a jazz drummer and big band arranger in the mid-1940s, but he was primarily a composer by the late-1940s. During this period, he wrote the suite *Cubana Be/Cubana Bop* for the Dizzy Gillespie Orchestra. He also wrote “A Bird in Igor’s Yard,” a piece that references both Charlie Parker and Igor Stravinsky. By 1953, Russell had a mimeographed notebook of what would become the book *The Lydian Chromatic Concept of Tonal Organization*.²⁵⁹ According to Peter Kenagy, the concept outlined in the book, proposes a way of understanding how tonality—the orientation of a piece of music around a particular tone—is conveyed through vertical and horizontal elements of pitch in the twelve-tone system of equal temperament. Russell

²⁵⁷ Thomas “Shab” Wirtel, interview with author, March 2015.
²⁵⁸ George Russell to Ed Summerlin, 19 October 1959. private collection.
²⁵⁹ Peter Ellis Kenagy, “George Russell’s Jazz Workshop: The Composer’s Style and Original Methods of 1956” (Diss.: University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 2009), 32.
extends the common view that a chord conveys tonality vertically, while a scale conveys that chord’s tonality. In the Concept’s system of vertical polymodality, a spectrum of alternate scales for each chord is explored which gradually moves toward total chromaticism—the inclusion of all twelve pitches. In the system of horizontal polymodality, the same spectrum is available, but in the context of a tonic defined by a local or regional key area (tonic station), rather than by the passing of individual chords. Through tests, illustrations, and transcriptions, Russell’s major treatise, the *The Lydian Chromatic Concept of Tonal Organization*, explores many potential uses of the two approaches to tonality for the jazz improviser or composer.²⁶⁰

The book and concept had a profound impact on many jazz musicians including Miles Davis, John Coltrane, and Bill Evans. Ingrid Monson describes Russell’s system and its impact as him taking “a central principle of Western music theory—the circle of fifths—and developing a theory of tonal organization adapted to the particular needs of jazz improvisers striving to attain a ‘modern’ sound in the wake of the harmonic inventiveness of bebop. In so doing he developed a theoretical underpinning for what later was termed ‘modal jazz.’”²⁶¹

Summerlin began his experimentation by mixing jazz and other art forms while at North Texas State College. Another friend of his was painter Paul John Zelanski, the art teacher at North Texas State College at the time. “Paul’s painting students would come into the old rehearsal hall of the lab band and would hang paintings all over the thing. Then the jazz band would play new jazz works.”²⁶² These new jazz works were composed with the paintings in mind, and then Summerlin and Zelanski would talk about the works and the relationship between the music and the images. This was done on many occasions during his two years at

---

²⁶⁰ Ibid.
²⁶² Morgan Powell, interview with the author, August 2015.
the school. This is a great example of Summerlin’s efforts to create interdisciplinary work, which he would delve into more deeply in the 1960s.

Summerlin completed his last courses at North Texas State College in the Spring of 1959. He successfully completed forty-two credits towards a PhD in composition with excellent grades, and he was working on a project called “Problems in Writing Chamber Music.” His final semester was marked by a tragedy, however. Mary Jo, his first child with his wife Mary, was born two months prematurely on April 2, 1958 with a congenital heart defect. She died nine months later, on January 27, 1959. According to Wirtel, “Ed was devastated by the death.” His daughter’s death not only affected him on a personal level, but it altered his career path for the next fourteen years.

A Requiem for Mary Jo

Through these tragic circumstances, Summerlin was introduced to many people who led him to write liturgical jazz. Gene Hall, one of Summerlin’s professors, contacted The First Methodist Church in Denton, Texas and spoke to the Assistant Minister, Bill Slack Jr. about Summerlin’s current situation with his daughter Mary Jo. Hall was the founder of the jazz program and the director of the Lab Band, later referred to as the One O’Clock Lab Band, the University of North Texas’ premier jazz band. Summerlin had not had any significant contact with churches in the area and was in need of a church and minister to handle the looming

---

264 Ibid.
266 Thomas “Shab” Wirtel, interview with the author, March 2015.
funeral of his daughter. He had little experience with organized religion, save for his childhood.

Summerlin’s father was not granted permission to marry his mother, then sixteen, until he had joined the Fundamentalist Holiness Church and proclaimed his faith. Later, Summerlin experienced the church first-hand on one of the family’s many trips to Florida during the Christmas season. The only thing Summerlin did not like about visiting Florida was going to Wednesday Night Prayer Meetings. The congregation, including his mother, would roll on floor and speak in tongues which “scared the hell out of me,” according to Summerlin.

Hall was aware of Summerlin’s lack of church affiliation and he asked Bill Slack Jr. to visit Summerlin, Mary, and Mary Jo in the hospital that night. Mary Jo was very close to death at that point, and wasting no time, Hall brought the pastor to the hospital that evening. Slack recalled that Summerlin was understandably distraught by the situation and “didn’t even talk too coherently.” The doctors had already warned Summerlin and Mary that Mary Jo would probably not live through the night. They made the funeral arrangements with Slack in the hospital that evening. A few weeks after the funeral, Slack suggested that Summerlin should consider “working with his music in the context of a service of worship.” His response was, “I’ll think about that.” Interpreting his response as a lack of interest, the pastor decided not to press the matter.

---

268 Ibid.
270 Ibid.
271 Ibid.
The idea of writing a liturgical jazz piece clearly intrigued Summerlin. Despite his noncommittal response to the pastor, Mary stated, “Eddie was very excited and very happy about the chance to do something like that, and so he got busy thinking about it, what kind of music he would write, and how it would have to be done.... He got right to work on it immediately, thinking about it anyway, whether you know, not actually composing.” When Summerlin actually began writing the service, “it went very, very slowly, because,” in his words, “I wasn’t exactly sure what I wanted to do. I knew that the music had to be something that would help the service. It couldn’t just be some music that I would write and say I want this played in the church.” From the project’s inception, it is clear that he did not want to simply write some jazz tunes, play them in church, and call them liturgical. He also had stylistic concerns because previous composers of so-called liturgical jazz admitted that what they wrote was not actually jazz in any traditional sense of the word, despite the claims of record labels and reviewers.

Summerlin was familiar with Beaumont’s *Twentieth Century Folk Mass*, which I write about in Chapter 1, and was keenly aware that he wanted this work to be substantively jazz in a contemporary style as opposed to being jazz in name only. He summarized his feelings on both matters by stating that, in his mind, “there was this problem of writing music that would be jazz but would be the kind of music that would make people feel that they were prepared to worship. [...] It couldn’t be fast Dixieland type jazz. So, I had to just think and think until I found what I thought were some good themes and a suitable mood for this music to start this service

---

272 Ibid.
273 Ibid.
According to Slack, Summerlin worked on the “Prelude” for about a month, but “as he went along the music seemed to come easier for him, but he really labored with this ‘Prelude.’” The final section he wrote was the “Anthem,” and Summerlin told the pastor that, “he almost had to write this. It burst out.” According to Slack, Summerlin stated that he had written that piece of music faster than he had ever composed anything before.

The pastor went on to theorize that the “Anthem” was the “biography of the baby. It seems to me as is this was more or less poetic, artistic, musical, the Ed Summerlin expression of the life that he had fathered and known and had come into being and had been thrust into existence you might say and lived a very turbulent time nine months.” He goes on to suggest that the piano at the end of the piece is, “approximating the breathing that she goes through that I saw when she was in the incubator at the hospital that night. And then almost as suddenly as it began the piece ends. ... This is Mary Jo.”

It is likely that Summerlin was keenly aware of how jazz musicians were viewed by society as a whole and that those attitudes were amplified when they were in a 1950s church environment. Embarking on a quest to see jazz as an accepted part of a liturgical service must have seemed daunting indeed. He took the opportunity to make a case for jazz musicians and their character in a television special focusing on his work. It was produced by Chet Huntley on the NBC News program World Wide ‘60, and was titled “A Requiem for Mary Jo.” Summerlin states,

---

274 Ibid.
275 Ibid.
276 Ibid.
277 Ibid.
278 Ibid.
It’s kind of hard to go through life and be a jazz musician and feel that most everyone thinks that you’re not doing something that’s really very worthwhile. By that I mean, they feel that if you’re a jazz musician you play in clubs, you play in noisy places where the music doesn’t really matter and that you really aren’t much of a conscientious artist of any sort. To be a jazz musician doesn’t mean that you are an unfeeling cold person of some sort who cares nothing about the church or about being married and about raising a family. I think that most of the people involved in this are excellent musicians but just plain honest people. I think that what it really boils down to. You take away the fact that they’re called jazz musicians and they’re no different than anyone else.  

Summerlin is certainly making a case that jazz musicians are honest and hard-working people, just like everyone else, but I think there is a deeper subtext here. While he is trying to gain acceptance for jazz and its musicians in a church setting, we cannot separate the music from its racial component. The fact is that jazz music was strongly associated with its great innovators, most of whom were African American. This was the social reality of America in the late 1950s when segregation was still the law in many states. African-American musicians were no exception to the sometimes brutal and sometimes subconscious racism that was woven into the fabric of American life. Summerlin was no stranger to this racism having played in mixed bands during his formative years. He witnessed the overt racism and segregation both in Lexington, Missouri and in the army. I think he realized that in the public’s view—whether conscious or subconscious—inviting jazz into the church would be akin to inviting African Americans into white churches. In the 1950s, “the process of desegregation in the South had scarcely begun and resistance to it was great. Street cars and buses, restaurants and public schools, all aspects of life, including some said especially the churches, were strictly segregated.

279 Ibid.
with the whites clearly on top of the pile.” The video footage shot for the World Wide ‘60 special on Summerlin featured no African Americans on the bandstand, on the dance floor, or in the congregation. Summerlin was battling more than just a stereotype of musicians of a certain style; he was battling the stereotype of an entire racial group.

Another person intimately involved in the writing process of the jazz service was composer and conductor Samuel Hans Adler. Adler arrived to teach at North Texas State College the same year as Summerlin, 1957. He was a student of renowned composers such as Aaron Copeland and Paul Hindemith. Adler conducted concerts and operas in Europe and the United States for the army and other organizations from 1950 to 1957 when he joined the faculty at North Texas State College as a professor of composition. His father was a cantor and composer specializing in Jewish liturgical music. He is described in the The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians as “a prolific composer whose music embraces a wide variety of contemporary styles. His works exhibit great rhythmic vitality, with a predilection for asymmetrical rhythms and metres, and a keen sensitivity to counterpoint.”

It is hard to imagine a better person than Adler to help guide Summerlin through his initial jazz liturgy. According to Adler, “Ed talked to me about writing a Mass in jazz. What would be the improvisational qualities and where. Musicians would agree to certain limitations” when improvising over specific sections in the work. Adler elaborates, “He did

---

280 Lewis Howard Grimes, A History of the Perkins School of Theology (Dallas: Southern Methodist University Press, 1993), 111.
282 Ibid.
283 Samuel Adler, interview with author, July 2015.
bring it [the Mass] in and we discussed each movement separately and quite in detail. [...] His choral writing, I mean he didn’t have much experience to write for chorus and we discussed that especially.”

He went on to add that Summerlin “was not too interested in string quartets and things. He was much more interested in jazz projects. He was very musical and very willing to learn. He was a meticulous fellow, he was a hard worker and always was...diligent in his work.”

Adler also states that Summerlin was aware of Heinz Werner Zimmerman’s writing bluesy anthems for American church settings, suggesting that this also might have been a motivating factor in Summerlin writing the liturgical jazz service. He further discusses Summerlin’s motivations: “I think that his writing of the Mass was not a kind of commercial consideration, but rather he was very religiously convinced that this would give a new spirit to a service.”

Adler thought the jazz liturgy was a success and that “Ed’s Mass was the first very important and, how should we say, popular work that was performed all over the country.”

The tragic death of Summerlin’s infant daughter Mary Jo sent him personally and professionally into the world of liturgical jazz. Despite having grown up in the Baptist Church in Missouri Summerlin had become disconnected from organized religion in adulthood. This was at least partially caused by his professional touring and performing schedules which often conflicted with Sunday morning services. Mary Jo’s death reconnected Summerlin to the church, albeit in a Methodist tradition. He would strike up a working relationship and lifelong friendship with Dr. Roger Ortmayer a professor of Christianity and the Arts at Southern

---

284 Ibid.
285 Ibid.
286 Ibid.
287 Ibid.
288 Ibid.
Methodist University. This relationship would lead Summerlin to join the Methodist Church, a church he would be affiliated with for many years.\textsuperscript{290}

\textsuperscript{290} Ibid.
Chapter 3
Liturgical Jazz Service

Jazz Liturgy

Ed Summerlin’s jazz liturgy, composed after the tragic death of his young daughter Mary Jo, was first used in a service of worship in the chapel of the Southern Methodist University in Dallas on Wednesday May 20, 1959. The composition had been previewed at a Perkins School of Theology student’s banquet, which was held at Southern Methodist University on May 12, 1959 and the “Prelude” was performed at a student recital series at North Texas State College on May 13, 1959. During the service of worship it was listed as “a jazz setting of ‘The Wesley Orders of Common Prayer’ led by Schubert M. Ogden and J. Paul Sampley in the Perkins Chapel.” On the day of the performance, Mr. Ogden penned a letter to Summerlin in which he wrote, “I am delighted to think that the tragic separation between the church and the life of our time—which is the bane of both our existences—may have been dealt a heavy blow by this joint effort.” This feeling that the church was separated from the culture of the 1960s was a widely-held sentiment in many denominations of Christianity. The Catholic Church convened the Second Vatican Council in 1962 to discuss this very problem. It was also the impetus behind many of the liturgical jazz works that followed in Summerlin’s footsteps, spurred on in no small part by progressive—at least musically—members of the church. Mr. Ogden went on to write,

292 Annual All-American Concert Program, May 13, 1959, private collection.
293 Whitsunday, Service Program, 1959, Collection on Schubert M. Ogden, Bridwell Library, Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University.
294 Schubert M. Ogden to Ed Summerlin, 20 May 1959, private collection.
“perhaps the day may come when this will not only not seem unusual, but will have become
the accepted thing which I believe both of us are persuaded it ought to be.”\textsuperscript{296} Schubert M. Ogden was a faculty member at Southern Methodist University for thirty-four years. According
to the Southern Methodist University Archives, Ogden’s accomplishments include having
written “six books and in innumerable essays, articles, and translations” in which “he has
addressed the central questions of contemporary theological reflection with uncompromising
intellectual rigor and supple creativity of spirit—in short, with wisdom.”\textsuperscript{297}

Summerlin’s liturgical jazz was not universally well received. In a letter dated May 21,
1959, Merrimon Cuninggim, the dean of the Perkins School of Theology, thanked Summerlin
and Summerlin’s students for their participation in the worship service that Wednesday.\textsuperscript{298} He
went on to elaborate that “the grape-vine brought word that Dr. Matthews\textsuperscript{299} was somewhat
upset by the whole business.”\textsuperscript{300} In retrospect, this first service foreshadows the attitudes
Summerlin and others eventually adopted in their fight to see jazz as an accepted form of
liturgical music. In another letter of thanks from Sterling F. Wheeler dated May 22, 1959 to
Summerlin, Mr. Wheeler wrote that he had “taken the liberty to write to Dr. Matthews to voice
appreciation for a program out of which such a significant development could come.”\textsuperscript{301} He

\textsuperscript{296} Schubert M. Ogden to Ed Summerlin, 20 May 1959. private collection.
\textsuperscript{297} Biographical Note, Collection on Schubert M. Ogden, Bridwell Library, Perkins School of
\textsuperscript{298} Merrimon Cuninggim to Ed Summerlin, 21 May 1959. private collection.
\textsuperscript{299} Despite extensive searching I have not been able to identify Dr. Matthews and his
connection to Southern Methodist University. He does not appear to have been faculty or
an administrator at the university.
\textsuperscript{300} Merrimon Cuninggim to Ed Summerlin, 21 May 1959. private collection.
\textsuperscript{301} Ibid.
goes on to write that he “was not even then prepared for the overpowering impact which the
service made upon me. It was a very moving experience for a number of us.”

Summerlin must have found Cuninggim’s and Sterling’s words encouraging given the
powerful positions they held at Southern Methodist University. Merrimon Cuninggim became
dean of the Perkins School of Theology at Southern Methodist University, Dallas, Texas in 1951
and served there until 1960. Under his direction Perkins desegregated, two years before the
Supreme Court decision Brown vs. Topeka Board of Education, in 1954. The fact that his
graduate school was the first in the South to do so was said to be the professional
accomplishment of which Cuninggim was most proud. Sterling F. Wheeler was the vice
president of Southern Methodist University in Dallas from 1955 to 1963.

The jazz service was held on Wednesday May 20, 1959, which is during the week of
Pentecost, which commemorates the descent of the Holy Ghost on the Apostles of Jesus Christ.
The program has Whitsunday on it and begins with “Prelude” composed by Summerlin. The
“Prelude” was followed by a Call to Worship: Collect for Purity of Heart and then Charles
Wesley’s hymn “Love Divine” with instructions that read “the congregation will sing verses 1
and 2; the orchestra will play one verse, then the congregation will join in singing verse 4.”
This hymn was followed by The Order For Morning Prayer, which included music, from The
Wesley Orders of Common Prayer. This included “Scripture Sentences, Call to Confession,
General Confession, Prayer of Absolution—with choral Amen, The Lord’s Prayer, Venite—with

302 Sterling F. Wheeler to Ed Summerlin, 22 May 1959. private collection.
303 Historical Note, Merrimon Cuninggim Papers, 1939-1997, Ruth Lilly Special Collections
and Archives, University Library, Indiana University—Purdue University Indianapolis,
304 Whitsunday, Service Program, 1959, Collection on Schubert M. Ogden, Bridwell Library,
Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University.
choral Amen, Psalm: 6, Ole Testament Lesson: Ecclesiasticus 39:1-8, Te Deum, New Testament Lesson: I Corinthians 2, Benedictus—with choral Amen, Apostles’ Creed, Sermon, Anthem, Collect of the Day, Collects for Peace and Grace, The Grace—with choral Amen.” All this was followed by the Hymn of Service by Harry Emerson Fosdick “God of Grace,” which included the instructions “the congregation will sing verses 1 and 2; the orchestra will play one verse, then the congregation will join in singing verse 3.” The service ended with the Benediction and “Postlude,” which was also composed by Summerlin. The Sermon was preached by J. Paul Sampley and the orchestra musicians where listed as Edgar Summerlin, conductor and tenor saxophone, Earle Dhus on tenor saxophone, Robert Foutz on trumpet, Eugene Gandy on piano, Richard O’Donnell on percussion, Morgan Powell on trombone, Donald Ratterree on string bass, Robert Thomas on alto saxophone and Thomas Wirtel on flugelhorn. The ministers for the service were Shubert M. Ogden and J. Paul Sampley and the choir consisted of Mimi Armstrong, Angelica Garris, Barbara Mathis, Erice Peel, Fred French, Sam Hemphill, Harold Leinfinger, and John Mann.

The service went according to plan with the one exception of the band being cut out of the choral amen after the “Venite,” which Shubert M. Ogden apologized for in his letter to Summerlin in the postscriptum. An article in the Denton Record-Chronicle on May 21, 1959 stated that, “a capacity crowd filled the chapel to hear what Summerlin has termed ‘an

305 Ibid.
306 Ibid.
307 Ibid.
308 Schubert M. Ogden to Ed Summerlin, 20 May 1959. private collection.
experiment in the use of the art form of jazz in the church.”\textsuperscript{309} When interviewed for the paper regarding how he felt it was received, Summerlin stated, “I couldn’t be happier about the reception we were given Wednesday. We seemed to create a lot of interest and enthusiasm. Everyone who commented on the service to us seemed to have been moved by some part of the service.”\textsuperscript{310} The article also described a speech Summerlin gave to the congregation regarding the piece where he said, “To me, jazz is a serious art form. The use of the jazz idiom in creating church music seems to scare some. I look on it as a possible way to reach and speak to some people that the church might not reach in other ways.”\textsuperscript{311} The article also states that Summerlin told the congregation that jazz was not meant to replace the music of the church but should be used on occasion as a special service. It is unclear if he was simply trying to reassure the church leadership and more traditional congregants or if he felt this way at the time. This view certainly changed for Summerlin, since it was his frustration that the church did not embrace jazz as an accepted weekly music that led him to stop producing liturgical jazz over a decade later.\textsuperscript{312}

\textit{World Wide ‘60}

After the premiere at Southern Methodist University, several church officials asked Summerlin to perform his liturgical jazz service at their church. Denton’s First Methodist Church scheduled a service for August and then it was performed at Purdue University for the National

\textsuperscript{309} "Dentonite’s Composition: Experimental Jazz Service Well Received at Premier," \textit{Denton Record-Chronicle}, p. 3, May 21, 1959.
\textsuperscript{310} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{311} Ibid.
Methodist Youth Conference. In the congregation at the Southern Methodist University service was a producer who worked for NBC News’ Morgan Beatty. They used some of Summerlin’s music from the service on the air, which caught the attention of Reuven Frank, a writer and later producer for Chet Huntley and David Brinkley. They contacted Summerlin about doing a special on him. The television special “A Requiem for Mary Jo” was filmed for World Wide ’60 with Chet Huntley at the National Methodist Youth Conference at Purdue University.

NBC aired the World Wide ’60 special on February 20, 1960. The special featured the host Chet Huntley, Ed Summerlin, Mary Summerlin, Dr. Roger Ortmayer and Bill Slack Jr. It gave Ed Summerlin and his liturgical jazz nationwide attention. The special begins with Summerlin discussing his motivation in writing the work. He states that he wrote the church service as a memorial to his daughter Mary Jo. Summerlin goes on to elaborate that he became increasingly excited with the project as it progressed because it was something “that I could do for the church, something that I could give to people and to the church.” The special then features the “Prelude” from the church service at Purdue University that was filmed in August of 1959. Chet Huntley narrates during the “Prelude” and emphasizes that “this was not a performance in the concert sense, but a church service at which a congregation worshiped.”

---

313 “Dentonite’s Composition: Experimental Jazz Service Well Received at Premier,” Denton Record-Chronicle, p. 3, May 21, 1959.
317 Ibid.
Dr. Roger Ortmayer leads the opening prayer “Collect for Purity of Heart,” a prayer, that according to Reverend F. Richard Garland, “has been at the heart of Methodist spiritual life for generations. It has been a part of our Service of Holy Communion from the beginning.”

Summerlin’s Nonet provides background music during the prayer and follows it with the traditional “Hymn of Praise: Love Divine.” The Hymn begins in a customary fashion for a Christian service of worship with just piano and Summerlin leading the congregational singing through the first stanza. The nonet then plays the second stanza in a contemporary jazz style in which the band comes in with a swing feel, syncopation of the melody, a re-harmonization of the standard chord progression and no lyrics. This hymn’s arrangement differs from the Southern Methodist University service in that it is missing an opening stanza of traditional piano, the second stanza sung by the congregation, and the fourth stanza sung by the congregation accompanied by trumpets, piano, bass and drums, once again in a more traditional fashion without re-harmonization, swing feel or syncopation.

The special introduces Bill Slack Jr., the Assistant Minister who encouraged Summerlin to write the music and gives background on Denton, Texas and its church life. It then has Summerlin discussing the early writing phase and his concerns about composing jazz for use in a church service, which I discussed in Chapter 2. The episode then has footage of Summerlin playing in Sandy Sandifer’s Orchestra in the Empire Room of the Statler Hilton in Dallas. This section of the special is meant to convey the other musical and personal side of the musician’s lives that took part in the church service. The episode gives background information on Ed

Summerlin, Mary, and Mary Jo, including their faith life. The episode also had an interview with Dr. Roger Ortmayer in which, according to the *Herald Statesman*, he discussed the “chasm existing between artists and churchmen, and the responsibility of the church in the 20th century to the contemporary arts and to artists.” Ortmayer summarized by stating that it was the twentieth century and that the church must stop living off the treasures of the sixteenth and eighteenth centuries. That in order to be relevant the church needed to enlist artists who create works that deal with the issues of the twentieth century. Summerlin closed the special by stating “I think and feel that we have done a good church service. It’s jazz — it’s good music. I don’t think we need to apologize. I do think we need to explain, sometimes. All we ask is that people listen to it objectively.”

The special prompted viewers to write to the producer Reuven Frank with an even mixture of praise and outrage. Some of the viewers liberally wrote words like “communists,” “desecrators,” “bad taste,” and “sacrilegious” to the producer in their letters. Summerlin described fellow jazz musicians as belonging to two different schools. The larger, according to Summerlin, belonged to the revivalists looking to make jazz danceable again; that group felt that jazz had become too technical and intellectual. The second, smaller group, were more forward thinking and were “staunch advocates of work like this jazz liturgy.”

---

321 Ibid.
323 Ibid., 12.
the *Downbeat* article went to producer Reuven Frank, who was pleased with the special and felt that, whether for or against jazz in church, people were talking about it.\textsuperscript{324}

The *World Wide ‘60* special introduced the whole country to liturgical jazz and Ed Summerlin. He was the first exposure many had to even the concept of jazz in a church service.

As the 1960s dawned, the church was struggling to connect with young people and a culture that was going through a dramatic shift in the United States. Summerlin’s jazz liturgy was the first of many that followed in the mid- and late 1960s, but he alone was nationally recognized in the early part of the decade as the purveyor of jazz music in the church.

*Liturgical Jazz Album*

In the 1958-1959 academic year, Roger Ortmayer accepted a position to teach Christianity and the Arts at Southern Methodist University.\textsuperscript{325} He had been a visiting professor on several occasions in the 1950s and was now hired as a full-time faculty member. This is a significant hire because he was instrumental in the premiere of Summerlin’s work at Southern Methodist University and preached the sermon on his record *Liturgical Jazz*. Roger Ortmayer was introduced to Summerlin by Reverend Bill Slack Jr. and it was Dr. Ortmayer who suggested that “Summerlin set his music to a morning service of the Wesley Order of Common Prayer service of the Methodist Church.”\textsuperscript{326} He commissioned Summerlin’s Liturgical Jazz service and

\textsuperscript{324} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{325} Grimes, *A History of the Perkins School of Theology*, 101.
worked closely with him for years.\textsuperscript{327} Dr. Ortmayer left Southern Methodist University in 1966 to head the Department of Church and Culture of the National Council of Churches ecumenical arts ministry in New York City until 1974.\textsuperscript{328}

The \textit{Liturgical Jazz} album came about as a product of the success and attention garnered by the Southern Methodist University premiere. Summerlin had been in talks with labels in New York prior to the filming of the \textit{World Wide '60} episode and was planning to record the music for an album.\textsuperscript{329} The musicians who played at the Southern Methodist University premiere were also used in the recording session titled \textit{Liturgical Jazz}. The only changes were Marvin Stamm replaced Robert Foutz and Dee Barton replaced Morgan Powell on the hymns because of a scheduling conflict with the second recording session according to Morgan Powell.\textsuperscript{330} The session was recorded by Tommy Loy and took place at a recording studio in Dallas, which, according to Wirtel, had once been a chapel.\textsuperscript{331} The bulk of the compositions were recorded over two days with the exception of the hymns, which included congregational singing, which were recorded at a later date.

The \textit{Liturgical Jazz} album was released in 1959 and received four and a half out of a possible five stars in \textit{Downbeat} magazine. The review opens with the statement that

“Summerlin has produced a remarkable score for this attempt to integrate jazz with a liturgical

\begin{flushend}

\textsuperscript{327} “Dentonite’s Composition: Experimental Jazz Service Well Received at Premier,” \textit{Denton Record-Chronicle}, p. 3, May 21, 1959.


\textsuperscript{330} Morgan Powell, interview with the author, August 2015.

\textsuperscript{331} Thomas “Shab” Wirtel, interview with author, March 2015.
service." Reviewer Don DeMicheal goes on to write, “his is a swinging modern composition, complete with improvisation and driving section work.” The reviewer cites the “Prelude” and “Postlude” as examples of the best tracks on the album and his only criticism is that he felt Summerlin failed to integrate the music effectively with the spoken word on the “Venite” and a few other places. The reviewer did write that in other spoken sections, the “combination of music and speech builds to tingling climaxes. The walking bass backing the general confession and the drum solo behind the benediction are not only imaginative but also serve a function of greatly enhancing these parts of the service.” He also singles out Summerlin and Morgan Powell’s solos as particularly outstanding. This review added to Summerlin’s increasing visibility as the premier jazz liturgist of the early 1960s. The jazz community was not the only source of praise. A very skeptical reviewer in The Atlantic wrote the he “thought this was going to be sick, and maybe funny. It is not. It is a bright, earnest, clever, and dignified piece of devotional work.” This skepticism from a more classically predisposed audience was something Summerlin dealt with on a regular basis.

The Liturgical Jazz service format was also almost identical to the Southern Methodist University service. The only differences were the addition of a Versicle, which is, “a phrase or sentence, often from Scripture, said or sung by the officiant and to which the choir or congregation answers” with a response, two times in the service once before the Venite and

---

332 Don DeMicheal, “Jazz Reviews.” Downbeat, January 7, 1960, 32.
333 Ibid., 33.
334 Ibid.
again before the Collect of the Day. For the Old Testament lesson Hosea 14:1-8 replaced Ecclesiasticus 39:1-8 and the New Testament lesson was now II Peter 1:3-11 instead of I Corinthians 2. “Song Without Words” replaced “Anthem” and Charles Wesley’s “Soldiers of Christ, Arise” replaced Harry Emerson Fosdick’s “God of Grace.” Presumably the scripture choices being replaced were decisions made by Roger Ortmayer, who was preaching the sermon.

Liturgical Jazz Tour

The attention that the Southern Methodist University and Purdue performances garnered along with the release and positive review of Liturgical Jazz in 1959 presented Summerlin with the opportunity to embark on a musical tour of the northeast that began in February of 1960. The tour was scheduled to coincide with the airing of the World Wide ’60 special “A Requiem for Mary Jo,” which generated nationwide interest in Summerlin and his liturgical jazz music. He traveled up and down the east coast with his nine-piece group playing churches by day and jazz clubs by night.\(^{337}\) The Corsicana Daily Sun listed the tour dates as Dartmouth, Boston University, Harvard, Brown, American University, Duke, and Vanderbilt along with five churches in the New York area and one in Atlanta, which was reported to be the largest Methodist church in the country.\(^{338}\) The Denton Record-Chronicle elaborated that the college dates included performances of the service as well as some jazz concerts featuring original, secular compositions by Summerlin and his band members. Porter also listed the

\(\text{http://proxy2.library.illinois.edu/login?url=http://search.credoreference.com/content/entry/harvdictmusic/versicle_abbr/0}\)

\(^{337}\) Thomas “Shab” Wirtel, interview with author, March 2015.

personnel for the tour as being Summerlin, Thomas Wirtel and Roger Hopps on trumpet, Bob Thomas and Earl Dhus on saxophone, Franklin Kolb on trombone, Gene Gandy on piano, Toby Gwin on bass, and an unnamed drummer from New York. The drummer ended up being Paul Cohn, who was a last-minute replacement, after Rich O’Donnell was hired by the St. Louis Symphony a short time before the tour was to begin. The Reverend Charles Boyles also traveled with the musicians. He was the executive director of Church Arts Associates in Dallas, and read for the service.

The tour began with an extended stay in New York. The group had several church performances in the region booked along with university performances. They went to see the Charles Mingus band every night in New York that they were not playing. They developed friendships with pianist Horace Parlan and trumpeter Ted Curson over the course of those evenings and found the performances to be quite inspiring. Several newspaper articles listed the length of the tour at nine weeks at the time of their publication with the caveat that the tour was still in the process of being booked. An April 14, 1960 article in Downbeat stated, “Summerlin’s musical setting of morning prayer is to be presented on some 40 campuses.” The tour was self-financed and the band was often paid from the collection plate during the church performances and stayed with congregation members. The band had two separate books of music, one was the liturgical jazz service and the other had compositions and arrangements by the members of the group that they played in jazz clubs and for stand alone

341 Porter, “National TV Show to Tell Story of Denton Composer.”
342 Thomas “Shab” Wirtel, interview with author, March 2015.
343 “Liturical Jazz on Tour,” Downbeat, April 14, 1960, 14.
concerts at the universities. The group also performed at a multi-arts festival with a dance company at Purdue University. Each musician was assigned a dancer they watched and improvised to their movement. Summerlin and the other members of his group had a growing interest in free improvisation. Summerlin incorporated multidisciplinary performances in his later liturgical works with some frequency.

The tour ended in early summer according to Wirtel. The tour traveled as far north as New England and as far south as Georgia. This was the first tour for all the musicians in the band with the exception of Summerlin and was quite a learning experience for the young musicians and for the church congregations. The tour was vital in introducing congregations to the concept and practical aspects of liturgical jazz. Summerlin exposed congregations and university students on the east coast to this new concept and, to some extent, destigmatized the use of jazz in a worship service. There was certainly pushback from more traditional congregants and leadership in churches, but the services were mostly well received. As summer approached, the money and gigs were running low and Summerlin became very agitated and critical of the band members’ performances. The final straw came after a performance where Summerlin criticized the band to such a degree that they simultaneously quit that night. That ended his association with the group members as well as North Texas State College. He did not return to finish his PhD.

344 Thomas “Shab” Wirtel, interview with author, March 2015.
345 Ibid.
346 Ibid.
Theoretical Analysis

Summerlin’s writing at the time was strongly influenced by Gil Evans and Gerry Mulligan’s compositional and arranging styles. The voicings, counterpoint and dissonance were very much in line with the “Cool School” pioneered by Evans and Mulligan. The liturgical jazz service opens with the “Prelude,” a mid-tempo swing composition in d minor whose theme is based on a three-note cell starting on F and continuing up the minor scale. It is then repeated with the last note flatted. There is a call and response between the melody and countermelody in which the answer to the first cell is a three-note descending chromatic line starting on E. The second answer is the same pattern except starting on E flat.

Example 3.1 “Prelude,” m. 4-6.

The B section of the “Prelude” features the trombone playing a new melody with the other horns and rhythm section providing dense chordal support. The harmonic progression features the use of extensions and chromaticism common in jazz.
Example 3.2 “Prelude,” m. 20-27.

The A section returns with the main theme and is followed by an alto saxophone solo over the A sections harmony.

Example 3.3. “Prelude,” Tenor Saxophone Solo Harmony.

The trumpet solos over the bridge chord progression and the final A section. There is an eight-measure musical interlude featuring bass and piano in unison before a trombone and alto saxophone solo over the same progressions as previous soloists. After the solos the two trumpets, tenor saxophone and trombone play an eight-measure section of the theme in stretto. The piano solos over the A section and then the B section returns in a stretto style. There is a return to a variation on the final A section which is ended by the playing of a triangle signaling the end of the “Prelude.”
The “Call to Worship” is a slow rubato five-measure accompaniment by trumpet, alto and tenor saxophones and trombone to the minister’s words. The first two measures have a perfect fifth pedal tone from F while the trumpet plays a blues-like melody which contains the flat fifth, sharp nine and flat seven pitches. The tenor saxophone plays a variation on the melody and the chord underneath changes to a F minor (major 7). The saxophone lingers on the B flat while the chord is being held creating a F minor 11 (major 7, add flat 3). Measures four and five have a E minor triad (add flat 5), C7(9)sus and a D major triad in second inversion.

Example 3.4 “Call to Worship,” m. 1-5.

The “Call to Worship” is followed by the allegro hymn “Love Divine” with the congregation singing for the first and second stanzas accompanied by only the piano in a straight eighth-note feel. The whole jazz group then plays a re-harmonized version of the hymn with the trumpet taking most of the melody playing it in a syncopated swing-feel style at the same tempo. The congregation returns for the final stanza with accompaniment by only the trumpets and piano once again in a straight eighth-note feel.
“The Service of Confession” opens with an aggressive two-measure drum solo which is followed by the trumpet playing some wide intervallic leaps accompanied by complex harmonies played by the other horns and piano that build to a climax.

Example 3.5 “The Service of Confession,” m. 1-5.

The minister then reads a sentence about a wicked man changing his ways and saving his soul. This passage is immediately followed by a roll on the floor tom drum while the piano plays a tone cluster from D to D an octave above. The horns enter with an upward glissando from a G major 7 (b5, #5) chord up to a staccato G7 altered chord. The minister begins speaking again and after one sentence the band begins playing while the preaching continues. The band plays a slow twelve-measure rubato section led by a trumpet melody with the other horns playing complex and relatively dissonant harmonies. The congregation then joins in reciting a prayer of confession while the band starts playing in a medium-slow swing feel with bass and the drummer playing brushes for eight measures. The alto saxophone plays a melody while the rhythm section accompanies and then the trumpet takes over melody with the rest of the horns harmonizing the melody.
Example 3.6 “General Confession,” m. 8-24.

The minister then reads a prayer of absolution while the trumpet plays a slow rubato five-measure melody. It is accompanied only by trumpet and trombone who play minimal backgrounds that are dissonant in sonority until we get the final resolution to a D flat major triad in second inversion in measure five.

Example 3.7 "Prayer of Absolution," m. 1-5.
The “Prayer of Absolution” is followed by The Lord’s Prayer that is spoken unaccompanied. This pause is the music is broken by the dramatic accompaniment of the “Service of the Word.” The drummer plays a cymbal roll with mallets that crescendos slowly and peaks as the trumpet player hits the highest note in the melody, F sharp. The minister leads a responsive reading as the band holds increasingly complex chords as the minister and congregation trade lines until the dramatic resolution on the final A major 9 and G# minor 11 chords.

Example 3.8 “The Service of the Word,” m. 1-6.

The rhythm section then enters into a medium swing groove accompanying the prayer and responses while the piano improvises over the same progression as in the “General Confession.” When the congregation states “Glory be the Father” the band enters a new section the “Gloria Patri.” The trumpet plays the melody while the minister and congregation read together and the band provides rhythmic hits and backgrounds.

Example 3.9 “Gloria Patri,” m. 1-6.
The next section is “Psalm 6” whose reading is accompanied by the full band in a slow swing style with the trumpet taking the melody rubato for the first two measures and then in time with the band. The melody begins with the same three-note motive from “Prayer of Absolution” and then is developed. The improvisation that follows occurs over a similar harmonic pattern that occurs in measures five through eight in the example below.

Example 3.10 “Psalm 6,” m. 1-8.

The trumpet improvisation continues until the congregation and minister read “Glory be to the Father” where the band returns to the music from the “Gloria Patri.” The “Old Testament Lesson” has no musical accompaniment.

The “Te Deum” begins with a mid-tempo swing section where alto saxophone improvises over a seven-measure harmonic progression that is repeated once.
Example 3.11 “Te Deum,” m. 1-7.

The band comes back in, harmonizing the melody played by the alto saxophone over seven measures which is then repeated once. The motive comes from the original three-note cell from the “Prelude” played the trumpet but it is then transposed and includes some new harmonic progressions.


The trombone then solos over the same progression from example 1.11 and the song ends.

The “New Testament Lesson,” which comes from Second Letter of Peter, has no musical accompaniment. The drummer improvises freely and aggressively with mallets over the entire drum set during the “Benedictus” while a responsive reading goes on. This drum solo is followed by the full band entering with the music from the “Gloria Patri” in a mid-tempo swing style. There is no musical accompaniment to the reading of “The Apostles’ Creed.” Before the
minister begins preaching the sermon the piano and horns play almost the same short figure which ends the “Prelude.” The piano just leaves off the first notes of the original figure but the rest is the same including the ringing of the triangle. During two sections of the sermon the piano improvises quietly with light rhythm section accompaniment in a mid-tempo swing style.

At this point in the service the music from Requiem for Mary Jo is used. The “Service of Offering: Song Without Words” also known as the Anthem is played. The music begins with an almost frantic and very dissonant piano entrance. The figures in measures four and five are then taken over by the horns. The musical figure is the one referenced by Bill Slack in the World Wide ’60 special “A Requiem for Mary Jo”. He equates it to Mary Jo’s heartbeat and I have to agree.347 She was born two months early which would certainly have been a shock to her and her parents and the frantic and dissonant nature of the musical figure conveys that shock rather vividly. The up-tempo swing feel and horn figures add to the drama and tension of the piece.

Example 3.13 “Service of Offering: Song Without Words,” m. 1-5.

---
The alto saxophone introduces a new theme, which is punctuated by the earlier horn figures at a tempo of approximately 260 beats per minute the feeling of tension and urgency persist.

Example 3.14 "Service of Offering- Song Without Words," m. 8-9.

This theme is harmonized by all the horns and then is followed by a piano solo and a tenor saxophone solo with backgrounds. Then piano returns with the introductory figure introducing a new section of melodic and harmonic development based on the main theme.

Example 3.15 "Service of Offering- Song Without Words," m. 1-7.

This is followed by a trombone solo with backgrounds. The introductory piano figure returns including the horn section. The piece ends with the piano playing the figure alone with some alterations and a final dramatic chord, which symbolizes the last moment of Mary Jo’s short life.
Example 3.16 "Service of Offering- Song Without Words," m. final 3 measures.

The “Versicle” uses exactly the same dramatic music as in example 1.8 “The Service of the Word.” The “Collect of the Day” takes the theme from “Prayer of Absolution” and modifies it slightly. It is played by the alto saxophone in a very slow rubato style. The tenor saxophone features a counter melody not unlike the answer to the first motive in the “Prelude.”

Example 3.17 “Collect of the Day,” m. 1-5.

The “Collect for Peace” is a slow two trumpet shorter version of the “Collect for Grace to Live Well.” The first five measures are identical except for trumpet one having a quarter note triplet rhythm on beats three and four of measure two, having a measure in 3/4 time in the third measure and ending on a whole note on measure five that is tied to a whole note in measure six instead of continuing. The counter line by trumpet two is identical except it ends on measure five with a quarter note C tied to a whole note in measure six. The “Collect for Grace to Live Well” also has the alto saxophone and tenor saxophone playing a slightly altered version
of the “Collect of the Day” simultaneously with the music from the “Collect for Peace” which has been extended to last seven measures. The rhythm section joins the horns from beat four of measure five to the final measure adding to the dramatic effect.

Example 3.18 “Collect for Grace to Live Well,” m. 1-7.

The band does not accompany the minister’s “Grace.” The band accompanies the hymn “Soldiers of Christ Arise” in a more traditional allegro straight eighth feel for the first two stanzas. The full band reenters with a swing feel on the third stanza with the trumpet playing the melody with the other horns harmonizing. The alto saxophone plays the melody during the refrain. The congregation reenters and the band returns to the original more traditional accompaniment with the trumpets playing pronounced straight eighth feel counter lines heightening the triumphant sentiment. During the “Benediction” the trumpet improvises in a slow rubato fashion while the horns hold a dramatic Eb7 suspended chord. The piece ends with all the horns playing a D minor 7 chord followed by a G major 7(#11) chord.
The “Postlude” begins with a new up tempo theme played by the alto and tenor saxophones in a swing feel. The horns enter with many call and response background figures heightening drama and breaking up the sections between improvisations. Example 3.19 “Postlude,” m. 1-7.

There is an alto saxophone solo, trumpet solo and piano solo with backgrounds. The bass and then drums solo and then the horns return to the main theme to close out the piece and the service.

End of *Requiem for Mary Jo* Period

After leaving North Texas State College, Summerlin took a position at the Lenox School of Jazz in the summer of 1960. He was recommended by George Russell and taught there with some of the premier names in jazz. Many of the students he and the others taught became very well known players and composers. I discuss this brief but pivotal period in Summerlin’s life in Chapter 5. He permanently relocated to New York where he was heavily involved in the burgeoning liturgical jazz scene for the next thirteen years. After the nationwide attention he received from the *World Wide ’60* special and the release of, and touring for, the album *Liturgical Jazz*, Summerlin was increasingly busy writing and performing liturgical jazz. He returned to New York with his Lenox School of Jazz connections and a reputation as a pioneer of liturgical jazz. This led to a wide range of both sacred and secular jazz commissions and opportunities. The secular exploits are discussed at length in Chapter 5.
Chapter 4
Liturgical Jazz Period

New York City

After spending the summer of 1960 as a faculty member at The Lenox School of Jazz and leaving North Texas State College, Summerlin relocated back to New York City. The connections he gained at The Lenox School of Jazz were a vital part of his career for the rest of his life and are discussed in detail in Chapter 5. Summerlin focused on his liturgical jazz for the next thirteen years. The notoriety gained from his piece Requiem for Mary Jo, the Liturgical Jazz album, and his liturgical jazz service facilitated getting future commissions and opportunities.

Summerlin did perform his liturgical jazz service again as part of a short artist residency at the University of the Pacific in California. He was part of a spring luncheon series on April 11, 1961 titled “Religion and Jazz” and a later presentation that evening “American Culture and Jazz,” which included a jazz combo. Summerlin then performed the “Wesley’s Order for Morning Prayer in a Jazz Setting” on April 13, 1961 with a student group accompanying him. The program offers some insights on Summerlin’s definitions of jazz and of liturgical jazz. He defines jazz as a “music which improvises on a theme in a spontaneous, free and creative manner – generally through syncopation” and progressive jazz as “the prevalent mode of expression though improvisation in our time. It is made up of unusual chords arranged in

---

348 This Spring at... Anderson “Y” Center, Spring Event Bulletin, 1961, University of the Pacific Student YMCA-YWCA, private collection.
349 Wesley’s Order for Morning Prayer in a Jazz Setting, Service Program, 1961, University of the Pacific, private collection.
unusual sequences or ‘progressions’. Summerlin defines liturgical jazz as “progressive jazz used as a musical setting for worship.”

It is notable that he includes the word progressive in the definition of liturgical jazz.

Summerlin was quite outspoken in his view that the church needed to embrace modernity in order for it to be relevant to people at the time. He was always quick to point out that Bach wrote church music of the time and often borrowed from the folk music of the day. Summerlin was very deliberate in incorporating the compositional techniques of the day into his liturgical and secular works. He also refers to his liturgical jazz service as “an experiment” in the program.

It is unclear if he thought liturgical jazz would be short lived, a onetime investigation of the possibility of fusing contemporary American jazz with the traditional liturgy or if once again he was trying to calm the fear of change in the clergy and congregations. Summerlin performed the service a final time on April 16, 1961 at the Universalist Unitarian Church in Urbana, Illinois.

Summerlin had a certain amount of credibility at this point as a liturgical jazz composer, performer, and expert. He was increasingly being sought out as an expert—perhaps the only expert—in this new liturgical jazz endeavor. In March of 1961 Summerlin published an article in the Christian Action periodical titled “Jazz in the Church,” in which he explained the logic of using jazz in church services and reaffirmed his commitment to contemporary jazz as that vehicle. He wrote that jazz works served to augment, not replace, the music that was already

350 Ibid.
351 Ibid.
352 Liturgical Jazz Service, Service Program, 1961, Universalist Unitarian Church. private collection.
being used and that much of the music in the Protestant hymnals was “poorly written and even more poorly harmonized.”\(^{354}\) This push toward modernity was a philosophy he increasingly practiced as well as preached. His music increasingly embraced current compositional, improvisational, and structural musical practices throughout the 1960s.

The first new projects he took on after *Liturgical Jazz* were with Dr. Roger Ortmayer, the man responsible for commissioning the liturgical jazz service and the preacher on the album *Liturgical Jazz*. Summerlin provided the music for two contemporary religious plays, *The Sheepherder* and *The Word Is…*, both of which tackled religious issues through a contemporary lens. He was also the musical arranger and conductor for a series of television specials on the CBS program *Look Up and Live* that had five episodes titled “Glory of the Heart” which aired in October and November of 1960. Narrated by Edward Mulhare, the special provided a look at the history and evolution of church music.\(^{355}\) The program had an estimated nationwide viewership of 176,000 at the time of Summerlin’s\(^{356}\) first appearance on the show.\(^{357}\) He appeared on *Look Up and Live* again in January 1962 on an episode entitled “The Upbeat Downbeat.” This time he enlisted an all-star septet, which featured Ron Carter on bass, Hank Jones on piano, Freddie Hubbard on trumpet, Sonny Igo on Drums, Hal McKusick on alto saxophone and flute, Will Dennis on trombone, and Artie Drellinger on tenor saxophone.\(^{358}\)

\(^{354}\) Ibid.


\(^{356}\) Summerlin was listed by imdb.com as leading a jazz octet for the special, which is most likely his *Liturgical Jazz* album. The show contained both live and pre-recorded music and I could find no personnel listings of live jazz musicians during these episodes.


They played the original composition “Dialogue” by Summerlin while the poem “Let Us Play,” written by Reverend John Harrell, was being read by actor Whitfield Connor. Summerlin appeared on the television series Look Up and Live in January 1967. He brought in a group and original compositions for a three-part series called “The Celebrations,” with part one’s subject being work, part two’s was love, and part three’s was leisure. The group consisted of Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Don Heckman on alto saxophone, Steve Kuhn on piano, Ron Carter on bass and an unidentified drummer. The group performed on camera while the Anna Sokolow Dance Company performed choreographed material with narration by actor Lawrence Pressman. His final appearance on the program was on August 13, 1972 when he provided the music for Dr. Roger Ortmayer’s original dramatic work Come Along.

Evensong, A Jazz Liturgy

In 1962 Summerlin was commissioned to write a liturgical jazz service by Broadcast Music Incorporated for a special service held on June 3, 1962 in Washington, D.C. as the final performance for the First International Jazz Festival. The service was sponsored by President John F. Kennedy’s Music Committee of the People-to-People Program and was held at The

Church of the Epiphany. Filmed by the Colombia Broadcasting Company, the event was aired on a special *Look Up and Live* program on August 12, 1962.

The service was titled *Evensong, A Jazz Liturgy* and was conducted by Summerlin and performed by an all-star nonet consisting of Don Ellis on first trumpet, Lou Gluckin on second trumpet, J.R. Monterose on tenor saxophone, Eric Dolphy on flute, Slide Hampton on trombone, Dick Lieb on bass trombone, Barry Galbraith on guitar, Ron Carter on bass, and Charlie Persip on drums. The lyrics for *Evensong, A Jazz Liturgy* were written by Reverend John Harrell. This new liturgical jazz service contained an instrumental “Prelude,” “Processional Hymn,” “Motet: Song of the Apostles,” “Offertory,” “Closing Hymn,” and “Postlude.” The service also contained some music played by J.R. Monterose on the tenor saxophone accompanying “The Lord’s Prayer.” It is unclear if this accompaniment was composed by Summerlin or freely improvised by Monterose. Psalm 96 also featured music which included a muted trumpet and bass with no mention in the program if more of the group was playing underneath the recitation.

The next day, Summerlin’s new service received a scathing review by Paul Hume in *The Washington Post*. Hume was the music editor for the paper from 1946 until 1982 with more

---

366 Ibid.
367 Ibid.
369 Ibid.
than 20,000 articles and reviews to his credit. He contributed to many other publications, wrote several books, and became faculty at Georgetown and Yale.\footnote{Patrick J. Smith. "Hume, Paul." Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online. Oxford University Press, accessed January 11, 2017, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/47670.} According to The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians, Hume was considered to be an expert in “serious music”\footnote{The author could not locate the definition of “serious music” in the Grove Dictionary.} as well as church music.\footnote{Ibid.} I found no mention of any expertise in jazz, however. He wrote that the music for the service was badly written and he singled out the saxophone music accompanying “The Lord’s Prayer” as a blues that “throbbed the way it does between dances while you are having a quick bourbon on the rocks.” Hume wrote that the bass “began slapping away as if he were working out at the Casino Royale.”\footnote{Paul Hume, “Epiphany’s Worshipers Join in Jazz Liturgical Service,” The Washington Post, June 4, 1962. A14.} He wrote that the choir sang valiantly while accompanying the organ and dance band but could not hope to sound good with Summerlin’s music. Hume finished by referring to the “Postlude” as sounding like the “Ascension Day Twist” and the whole service as “sick music, and some good jazz, for worship in a sick generation.”\footnote{Ibid.}

His review was not unusual in that it expressed the attitude of some worshipers that jazz was unfit for the church. The references to hard alcohol, a casino, and the twist in his review serve the purpose of telling the reader that jazz is not serious music and does not belong in church; rather, it a music for dancing and drinking in places where such things are appropriate is the long-standing logic here. He also singles out this new generation coming up in the 1960s as “sick.” For all these reasons it is difficult to take this review seriously. Considering that he

\footnote{Ibid.}
published the book *Catholic Church Music* in 1957, it is not unreasonable to assume that Hume likely had a preconceived set of parameters of what music was permissible in church. In the book, Hume laments the current state of church music in certain congregations where “music is regulated, not according to the legislation of the Church, but strictly according to the whim of the pastor?... he is allowing atrocities to run rampant in his choir loft.”375 It must also be noted that this critique of church music was voiced before any liturgical jazz had been produced. Clearly Hume held a very narrow view on what music could be considered liturgical and he was not going to deviate from that, especially not for jazz.

An article by Fred Cloud titled “Can Jazz Be Religious?” took a more balanced approach. Cloud was a Christian author who published several books on a variety of faith-based topics. He begins his article by writing that the validity of jazz as worship music was one the most controversial issues facing the church of the day. Cloud attended the *Evensong, A Jazz Liturgy* service and interviewed several worshipers after the conclusion of the service. One parishioner, who disliked the service, complained of the use of a saxophone during the Lord’s Prayer while another felt the text was not contemporary enough. One jazz fan said, “I dig jazz and I dig church – but not together!”376 Several clergy as well as lay people offered high praise for the music and confirmed that jazz was a genre appropriate for worship. Cloud interviewed the organist, who stated that the choir was initially hesitant to perform the work, but as the rehearsals progressed they virtually all understood the composer’s intent. He also offered his opinion that it was appropriate music for worship using modern rhythms and harmony.377

---

377 Ibid.
conceded that in order for it to be truly effective, the congregations had to be educated just like during Brahms’ era.

Cloud also interviewed Summerlin, Ron Carter and Barry Galbraith. Summerlin stated, “the real contemporary music of our time is jazz. Basic concerns of religion don’t change, but the style of getting across to the people has to change…. My attempt is to explore new musical ways of opening up meanings of life and religion.” Ron Carter referred to Summerlin’s music as “startling music... I think this type of music is way past due.” Galbraith also offered up praise the for service’s music. Reverend Charles D. Kean referred to Psalm 150 as evidence that jazz was an acceptable genre for worship and that instruments of the day were often used in the glorification of God. He stated, “If jazz is a real part of the way many people find their feelings expressed in music, then this service is a most important attempt to connect worship and everyday life.” The sermon by Kean, referred to as an apology by Hume in his review, emphasized several times that this music was appropriate music for worship.

Cloud’s conclusion was that for some people, jazz was a way to worship God, but that it would certainly take time for it to be used widely in the church if it were to ever happen. He also wrote that for a certain group, jazz could never be a liturgical music because of the preconceived notions of what characterizes jazz. Galbraith suggested in his interview that the work should be performed again. Summerlin did revisit the work, performing *Evensong, A Jazz Liturgy* again at the multiday Festival of Religion and the Arts in Cleveland, Ohio on April 28, 1963 with Dr. Roger Ortmayer preaching the sermon. The festival contained religious music,

\[378\] Ibid.
\[379\] Ibid.
\[380\] Ibid.
film, lectures, paintings, plays, dance, and two worship services of which Summerlin’s was one.  

Summerlin, Heckman, and Gensel

The same year Summerlin led an unusual quartet for a liturgical jazz service on December 22, 1963. The group consisted of Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Don Heckman on alto saxophone, Bob Norden on trombone and Ron Carter on bass. The lack of a chordal instrument and drummer was an unusual combination for Summerlin at the time. The service also featured a completely improvised piece entitled “Joy” as well as several new pieces. The prelude was titled “Observation” and the postlude was “Sounds and Space.” The service also included many hymns, but it is unclear if they were played in a jazz style. Summerlin also played with the group at the Festival of Contemporary Arts in October of 1964 during a liturgical jazz worship service and a contemporary jazz concert. He also composed the score for a theatrical work, “Hairy Woman,” but it is unclear if his and Heckman’s group provided the music. Summerlin composed jazz scores for four film strips: “God and Outer Space,” “God and Evolution,” “Science and Evolution,” and “Religion and Technology,” all of which were shown at the festival and were intended to demonstrate that the sciences are compatible with Christianity.

381 Festival of Religion and the Arts, Program, 1963, Church of the Savior. private collection.
384 Ibid.
385 “Festival of Arts Schedules Films,” Poughkeepsie Journal, September 13, 1964, 3C.
On January 12, 1964 Summerlin led a liturgical jazz service at Northern Illinois University in Dekalb, Illinois. This service contained a new prelude simply titled “Prelude in D minor,” which I suspect was Summerlin’s Liturgical Jazz service. The rest of the service had many parallels to Summerlin’s Liturgical Jazz service, including the same hymns performed with the same instructions to the congregation. The structure of the service varied to some degree from the original Liturgical Jazz service, but presumably much of the music and arrangements came from this earlier work. Summerlin’s original Liturgical Jazz service was performed at the University of South Florida on May 24, 1964 with a nonet led by Mark Morris and the sermon preached by Allan J. Burry.\footnote{Liturgical Jazz: Wesley’s Order for Morning Prayer with Jazz Setting, Service Program, 1964, University of South Florida. private collection.} The band consisted of student volunteers, but Summerlin was not present. This is significant because Summerlin’s service was five years old at the time and still in circulation. It is also telling that although he was not present, other congregations had chosen to use Summerlin’s service as a resource for worship. The service itself had begun to take on a life of its own without Summerlin guiding the process. That evening, Dr. John “Knocky” Parker led a lecture on jazz in worship for the university students.\footnote{Ibid.} Parker was a professor of English at University of South Florida as well as a professional jazz pianist who had worked with Zutty Singleton and Joe Turner among others.\footnote{John Edward Hasse. "Parker, Knocky." The New Grove Dictionary of Jazz, 2nd ed., Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online. Oxford University Press, accessed January 12, 2017, http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/J346200.}

In October 1964, Summerlin provided the music for the Advent Players, a theatrical group. The plays were titled Day of Wrath and The Trapped and were performed at Muhlenberg
Summerlin wrote and performed the music for solo clarinet. He frequently wrote the music for and performed with a wide range of ensembles for religious plays. What is particularly interesting about these plays is that Reverend John Gacia Gensel was involved in producing them. Gensel was the head of the jazz ministry at St. Peters Lutheran church in Manhattan from 1965 to 1994. He received a special designation as “Pastor to the Jazz Community in New York City” in 1965. He was a close friend of Duke Ellington, who composed “The Shepard (Who Watches Over the Flock) for him as part of Ellington’s Second Sacred Concert. Billy Strayhorn left Gensel one of his Steinway pianos, which is still housed at St. Peters. Gensel also officiated the funeral services of Duke Ellington, Thelonious Monk, John Coltrane, Coleman Hawkins, Miles Davis, Dizzy Gillespie, and Erroll Garner among many other jazz legends. He was certainly the most highly visible clergyman who championed jazz both in and out of the sanctuary. Gensel once proclaimed, “I think jazz is probably the best music for worship.” He was the most high-profile clergyman with whom Summerlin worked and was a hub for the liturgical jazz composers and performers in New York City.

391 Ibid.
In March 1965, Summerlin performed a Liturgical Jazz Lenten service with a jazz quartet along with Don Marsh’s Presby Players. The Presby Players were a church-sponsored community theater program, which Marsh directed for over forty years. Marsh also published, along with Richard Avery, over 150 hymns, carols, and anthems in a wide range of contemporary styles, starting with *Hymns Hot and Carols Cool* in 1967. The songbook includes a wide range of styles including rock, calypso, traditional choral, folk, and jazz. The “Gloria Patri” and “Doxology” were arranged with standard jazz harmonic progressions and performance notes that suggest a swing feel. Summerlin performed alongside Marsh again at Carnegie Recital Hall on November 28, 1965 in a program entitled *Contemporary Religious Music by Ed Summerlin and Don Marsh*.

Bard College

In March 1965, Summerlin performed at a liturgical jazz service at Bard College in Annandale-on-Hudson, New York. The service included several pieces by Summerlin, including “Prelude,” “Credo,” and “Postlude,” along with several hymns. The program also listed Ron Carter as the bassist as well as contained a special announcement:

---

393 Lent I, Service Program, 1965, St. Peter’s Episcopal Church. private collection.
397 The postlude was titled prelude in the program but took place after the final blessing or benediction which is where a postlude in generally located therefore the author assumes that this is a typo.
The participation in the College Service today by Ed Summerlin and Ron Carter, with Peter Brown and the College Organist and Choir, is part of a special project by Mr. Summerlin, sponsored by Broadcast Music Inc., to study the uses of Jazz in worship. At the present time Mr. Summerlin is doing his work in his office in the basement of Robbins House.  

His curriculum vitae lists a composer-in-residence grant from Broadcast Music Inc., “to compose experimental music for the church” at Bard College. Summerlin had already established himself as the leader in liturgical jazz composition and performance by this time. His move to New York also facilitated the use of world-renowned artists like Ron Carter, Barry Galbraith, Eric Dolphy, Steve Kuhn, and Hank Jones in his services, thus adding to his prestige as a composer, arranger, and composer. The stated goal of the residency was to compose and premiere an oratorio for chorus and jazz ensemble, a complete service for organ and chorus, and two groups of jazz hymns including organ and a jazz ensemble.

Summerlin played a special multi-congregational liturgical jazz service in June 1965 with himself on tenor saxophone, Don Heckman on alto saxophone, Bob Norden on trombone, and Ron Carter on bass. This is significant in that this is the core of the horn section for the Don Heckman - Ed Summerlin Improvisational Jazz Workshop a group, which included Lew Gluckin on trumpet, Bob Norden on trombone, Don Heckman on alto saxophone, Ed Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Steve Kuhn on piano, Ron Carter and Steve Swallow on bass, Joe Hunt and

______________________________

399 Ibid.
400 Edgar E. Summerlin, Curriculum Vitae. private collection.
Joe Cocuzzo on drums and Lisa Zanda, vocals. The group’s recording had a strong avant-garde quality, containing tone rows, tone clusters, extended techniques, improvisational sections free of harmonic or rhythmic constraints, and is discussed in detail in Chapter 5. During the abovementioned service, a hand-written program note over “The Prayer of Confession” suggests that Ron Carter improvised freely during the prayer. The group as a whole played on “The Processional,” “Holy, Holy, Holy,” “The Gloria Patri,” “The Doxology,” “Hymn 401,” and “The Recessional.” Summerlin presented several lectures on liturgical jazz at various churches in 1965, some of which included Ron Carter.

During his residency at Bard College, Summerlin composed The Coming of Christ, an Advent cantata that was premiered at Carnegie Recital Hall on November 28, 1965 in a program entitled Contemporary Religious Music by Ed Summerlin and Don Marsh. It was a piece for tenor saxophone, alto saxophone, trumpet, two trombones, bass, drums, choir, and four vocal soloists. The piece was in three parts: “The New Men,” “The New Humanity,” and “Parousia.” The word Parousia is Greek for the second coming of Christ referred to in the Bible. The Coming of Christ includes improvisation over chord changes, free instrumental improvisation, consistent shifting of time signatures, and many instances of vocal improvisation. The work was

---

presented again at the Methodist University Center in Madison, Wisconsin on December 11, 1966. Summerlin was accompanied by the Ray Lorne Sextet, presumably a local jazz group, and the Methodist University Center Choir. There were also three dancers performing during the service, but it is unclear where that took place in the service. The program also announces “A Happening” under the direction of Summerlin that took place that evening and included musicians, dancers, poets, and painters. According to Karen Summerlin, Ed Summerlin frequently participated in and coordinated Christian happenings throughout the 1960s and 1970s in conjunction with liturgical jazz performances.

Summerlin participated in the Bard College Jazz Festival during his residency at the college. He performed with the Don Heckman – Ed Summerlin Improvisational Jazz Workshop as well as in an original jazz vespers service held at Bard Chapel. The other groups who performed at the festival were the Ron Carter Trio with Ron Carter on bass, Herbie Hancock on piano, and Tony Williams on drums; The Freddie Hubbard Quintet; The Art Farmer Quartet with Art Farmer on trumpet, Jim Hall on guitar, Steve Swallow on bass, and Walter Perkins on drums. Summerlin had professional associations before the festival as a player, composer, or arranger with Ron Carter, Freddie Hubbard, Jim Hall and Steve Swallow. Given Summerlin’s previous connections to many of these musicians as well as his residency at Bard, it is likely that he had some say in selecting the artists for the festival.

---

408 Order of Morning Worship, Service Program, 1966, Methodist University Center. private collection.
409 Ibid.
410 Ibid.
411 Karen Summerlin, interview with author, April 2015.
412 “Bard College Jazz Festival is Slated for This Weekend,” The Kingston Daily Freeman (Kingston, New York), May 5, 1965, 25.
413 Ibid.
By 1966, liturgical, or at least sacred, jazz works had become a much more familiar concept in the United States. *Ebony* magazine ran an article titled “Jazz Goes to Church,” which gave an overview of current practitioners of liturgical and sacred jazz, including Ed Summerlin, Duke Ellington, Lalo Schifrin, Vince Guaraldi, Mary Lou Williams, and Randy Weston.\(^{414}\) The year before, *Time* magazine had run an article “Cool Creeds,” where they chose three liturgical jazz works to review: Ed Summerlin’s *Liturgy of the Holy Spirit*, Lalo Schifrin’s *Jazz Suite on the Mass Texts*, and Vince Guaraldi’s *Jazz Mass*.\(^{415}\) The article stated that jazz was now taken seriously as a music for Christians to praise the Lord. It goes on to say that the music itself was “composed and played by topflight professional musicians who are intrigued by the possibilities of blending their art with the traditional forms of the church’s prayer.”\(^{416}\) One noteworthy aspect of the language employed in the article is that the author acknowledges that the composers and performers are creating “art.” The fact that *Time* magazine was referring to these liturgical jazz services and masses as art is significant; after all “art” can certainly be used to glorify God in a church. The magazine also acknowledged that the use of jazz music in church was still something of an acquired taste, so the public sentiment had certainly not completely turned.\(^{417}\)

The debate was certainly not settled in the Christian community either. *The Christian Century*, an ecumenical weekly magazine, published two articles in June 1966. The first, “Sing to the Lord a New Song,” made the argument that the old hymns that were being used by the

---

\(^{414}\) “Jazz Goes to Church,” *Ebony*, April 1966, 76-80.


\(^{416}\) Ibid.

\(^{417}\) Ibid.
church were of poor quality, a sentiment echoed by Summerlin. The following week, Lester Kinsolving’s “Demurrer on Jazzy Lord’s Suppers,” was published and stated that “in certain liturgical circumstances even good jazz is inappropriate and unseemly.” Kinsolving referred to the current trend of liturgical jazz as a gimmick designed to draw a crowd. He went on to ridicule some of the more bizarre arguments that had apparently been used for having jazz in church. He continued by suggesting that perhaps the talents of Carol Doda, a famous stripper in San Francisco, could be incorporated into the services since that would certainly draw a crowd. Humor aside, this is still perpetuating the narrative that jazz, at worst, is a music for strip clubs and bordellos and, at best, for dance halls. Given that two of the musical references he used were Duke Ellington and Vince Guaraldi, Kinsolving stayed clear of criticizing the merits of the music itself; rather, his argument was that it was good music, just not good for church.

Summerlin also composed *Liturgy of the Holy Spirit* during his residency at Bard College. The work premiered at the New York Conference of the Methodist Church on June 19, 1965. Summerlin wrote the music and William Robert Miller wrote the text for the work. James Geggie wrote that this was “the first work to be conceived both musically and textually as a complete service of worship in jazz.” The service was written for choir and jazz sextet. The instrumentation consisted of alto saxophone, tenor saxophone, trumpet, trombone, bass, and drums. The service in twelve parts included prayers, choral anthems, and four hymns, but not a

\[\text{\footnotesize \cite{418}} \text{ William Robert Miller, “Sing to the Lord a New Song,”} \textit{The Christian Century,} \text{June 15, 1966, 771.} \]

\[\text{\footnotesize \cite{419}} \text{ Lester Kinsolving, “Demurrer on Jazzy Lord’s Suppers,”} \textit{The Christian Century,} \text{June 22, 1966, 803.} \]

\[\text{\footnotesize \cite{420}} \text{ Ibid.} \]

\[\text{\footnotesize \cite{421}} \text{ James C. Geggie, “Across the Religion Editor’s Desk,”} \textit{The San Bernardino County Sun} \text{(San Bernardino, California),} \text{ Jun 26, 1965, 8.} \]

\[\text{\footnotesize \cite{422}} \text{ Ibid.} \]
prewritten sermon, which was deliberately kept open to facilitate a sermon on the preacher’s choice of Biblical passages. During the work’s premiere, the sermon was replaced a by a skit titled “A Fellowship of Loving.” The article has several quotes from Miller in which he discusses the need to update hymns and theology to be relevant in the current age—a sentiment shared by Summerlin. Geggie closes the article by writing that Summerlin and Miller were, at that point, “planning a four-part Pentecost cantata, ‘A Hymn to Christ the Savior,’ adapted from a text by St. Clement of Alexandria” as well as a work for Christmas.

The Liturgy of the Holy Spirit had thirteen distinct sections: The Agape, Invocation, Hymn-“How Sweet and Holy is the Word,” Scripture reading, Anthem-“O Mighty Mystery of the Word,” Pastoral Prayer, Sermon, Offertory, Offertory Anthem-“O Light of Life,” Hymn of Commitment-“Rejoice, Rejoice, Begin a New Day,” Epiklesis, Recessional Hymn-“And Now We Go Our Varied Ways,” and Benediction. The first sections of Liturgy of the Holy Spirit make liberal use of contemporary jazz harmonic progressions, contemporary voicings, wide intervallic leaps, and dissonance. During the “O Mighty Mystery of the Word” anthem there is a section where the accompanying group and choir improvise freely. There is no time signature, key, or harmonic constraints that the singers or players must adhere to. This is the first time we hear Summerlin introducing avant-garde practices into his large-scale liturgical works. The text immediately following this free section is about Pentecost; in this free section, Summerlin makes a musical reference to the practice of speaking in tongues. The offertory anthem “O

\[\text{\footnotesize 423 Ibid.} \]
\[\text{\footnotesize 424 Ibid.} \]
\[\text{\footnotesize 425 Ibid.} \]
\[\text{\footnotesize 426 Morning Worship, Service Program, 1967, Hope Church. private collection.} \]
\[\text{\footnotesize 427 Ed Summerlin, Liturgy of the Holy Spirit, score, 1965. private collection.} \]
Light of Life,” by contrast, has the choir singing a pedal tone accompanied by a unison melody referencing early church music styles. The anthem then has an alto saxophone solo and trombone solo that is open and has no written or implied harmonic accompaniment. The bass and drums offer accompaniment in time for both soloists. The work ends with the recessional hymn “And Now We Go Our Varied Ways” followed by the benediction.

Summerlin performed the work again on May 22, 1966 at the Second Annual Festival of Contemporary Music at Kalamazoo College in Michigan. The service was the culmination of a four-day residency at the college in which Summerlin presented a lecture titled “New Developments in Jazz,” a jazz concert by The Ed Summerlin Ensemble, and a jazz workshop. The service was then performed on April 30, 1967 in Springfield Massachusetts at 9:30 at the Trinity Church and at 11 a.m. at the Hope Church. That program also lists a jazz improvisation happening at the Hope Church that afternoon and recommends some liturgical jazz records for listening, including Joe Masters’ The Jazz Mass and Lalo Schifrin’s Jazz Suite on the Mass Texts.

On August 6, 1967, Summerlin conducted the Herb Pomeroy combo in a performance of Liturgy of the Holy Spirit at the multiday Open Wide Religious Arts Festival of the Kennebunks in Maine. The group was comprised of Herb Pomeroy on trumpet, Charlie Mariano on alto saxophone, John LaPorta on tenor saxophone, Gene DiStasio on trombone, Nate Hygelund on

428 Ibid.
430 Morning Worship, Service Program, 1967, Hope Church. private collection.
431 Ibid.
432 Ibid.
433 Open Wide Religious Arts Festival of the Kennebunks, Brochure, 1967, Lyric Theater. private collection.
bass, and Artie Cabral on drums. The group was accompanying four vocal soloists and an Interchurch choir. Summerlin and Pomeroy had led a combo at Lenox School of Jazz along with Connie Kay in 1960. The performance must have been well received since the festival commissioned Summerlin to compose a new work for the 1968 Openwide festival.

Summerlin attended several religious conferences in 1967. The first was the Revelation ’67 conference. On March 5, 1967, Summerlin led the service at the Hennepin Avenue Methodist Church in Minneapolis, Minnesota as part of a conference with a local choir and jazz ensemble, which included long-time Don Ellis band member Jack Coan on trumpet. The night before, Summerlin led a workshop on improvisation that was open to the musicians, students, and clergy. The conference theme was finding sacred meaning in secular forms. The secular forms represented were jazz, folk music, choral music, baroque music, sculpture, dance, and film. Summerlin then led a happening at the Human Rights in World Perspective conference held at St. Paul School of Theology in Kansas City, Missouri in early August. The happening included jazz music, painting, dance, and drama led by four guest artists. He then presented

---

434 Open Wide Religious Arts Festival of the Kennebunks, Program, 1967, Lyric Theater. private collection.
435 Ibid.
438 Revelation ’67, Service Program, 1967, Hennepin Avenue Methodist Church. private collection.
440 Ibid.
an essay in mid-August at the Experiments in Community liturgical conference in Kansas City. Summerlin’s presentation was titled “Church Music: Creativity or Muzak?” Summerlin wrote:

> The problem is that good poets and composers (with a few exceptions), are not the people who are doing hymns for our hymnals. But let’s not think we are making progress when we substitute new music by inept composers and lyricists. The church cannot survive artistically by substituting new clichés for old ones. We must constantly experiment with new sounds and ways of doing (ritual) together in the hope that a vital and living church is growing, absorbing, changing.

Summerlin was still critical of the quality of hymns being used and was still pushing for more modernity in church music. The essay not only mentions jazz but also uses folk and rock as examples of contemporary styles. This acknowledgement of other styles is a sign of the coming musical trends in church. Summerlin clearly saw the writing on the wall that jazz was no longer a form of popular contemporary music. By 1967, the popularity of The Beatles and folk artists had begun to filter into churches. As a musician who made his living creating liturgical jazz, Summerlin, much like Mary Lou Williams, had to acknowledge these trends. On August 21, 1967, Summerlin led a presentation titled “Music in Worship” at the Ecumenical Conference on Christian Worship in Kansas City.

The Liturgical Conference based in Washington, D.C. sponsored two of the three conferences in Kansas City, all of which were geared toward community engagement and modernity in worship. The final conference Summerlin attended in 1967 was the Methodist Conference on Christian Education in Dallas, Texas on November 6-10. The theme of the

---

443 Ibid.
conference, “The Issue is Change,” echoed the concerns of the other conferences he had attended that year. Summerlin led the music for a happening led by Dr. Roger Ortmayer titled “Change.” The happening was the general session that opened the conference and was held in the grand ballroom and included elements of worship. The focus on modernity was the result of Vatican II, which was discussed in Chapter 1, and trends in church attendance. In the United States, the number of people attending church services saw a steady decline from 1959 to 1972. This consistent drop in attendance was seen by many in religious establishments as a call to make the church more modern and therefore more relevant to the current population. This trend certainly helped church leadership be more open to new music, such as jazz, in the practice of worship.

In 1968, Summerlin entered the recording studio again to document some of the works composed during his residency at Bard College. He recorded his two large-scale works, The Coming of Christ and Liturgy of the Holy Spirit as well as Gift of Joy, a short piece for vocal soloist and jazz combo for a Pentecost service. The group that went into the studio consisted of Ed Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Marvin Stamm on trumpet, Don Heckman on alto saxophone, George Marge on tenor saxophone, Bob Norden on trombone, Tony Studd on bass trombone, Richard Davis and Ron Carter on bass, Ed Shaughnessey on drums, Rosemary

---

446 Ibid.
Unutmaz on vocals, and a choir led by John Murphy.449 The choir was recorded later in London, where Avant Garde records was based.450 Ring Out Joy’s works do not include the preaching or scripture readings that were included in Liturgical Jazz. The music was presented as a collection of stand-alone works, which was a departure from Summerlin’s first liturgical jazz record. In the liner notes, Summerlin writes, “my recent compositions are quite different from these. I have become convinced that we must do more action together in church services and have made more use of projections and mixed media.”451 The album was given a four-star rating out of five by Billboard magazine in the Gospel category and was selected as an album with potential for charting and good sales.452 The album received very little attention, however, despite the formidable lineup. I suspect that by 1968, Summerlin’s recording simply had too much competition from more recognizable names like Mary Lou Williams, Duke Ellington, Lalo Schifrin, and Vince Guaraldi. There was no shortage of liturgical jazz records out at the time and reviewers seemed to ignore the release.

Late Period Liturgical Works

Summerlin returned to the Open Wide festival again on August 4, 1968 with a new work entitled Sourdough and Sweetbread, which was commissioned by and premiered at the festival.453 The piece was a jazz cantata composed for flute, three trumpets, two trombones, and Ibi d.


449 Ibid.
bass, drums, and chorus. It also incorporated “three actors, slide and overhead projectors, artists, priests, ministers, rabbi, youth groups and congregation.” Dr. Roger Otrmayer wrote the text, and the festival classified the work as contemporary in form.  

Sourdough and Sweetbread was in seven sections: Travel to Life, Spread Seed, Dialogue Interlude, Let Us Pray, Bread is to be Broken, Shared Bread, and New Life. That morning Ortmayer and Summerlin led a service titled The Word Is at the Unitarian Church of Kennebunk. Summerlin and Ortmayer performed the work again on March 2, 1969 at the Methodist University Center of Whitewater State University in Wisconsin. Summerlin had been there twice before, where he performed his Liturgical Jazz Service and his Christmas cantata The Coming of Christ. He also performed the work at Cazenovia College near Syracuse, New York on June 18, 1969.  

In 1968, Summerlin took part in a radio broadcast panel discussion titled “The Jazz Mass” on WRVR, a New York radio station. The panelists included Summerlin, Reverand John Garcia Gensel, Father Norman J. O’Connor, Eddie Bonnemère, and Don Stratton. Gensel, O’Connor, and Bonnemère were discussed in Chapter 1. Don Stratton was a trumpet player who had played with Charlie Parker, Phil Woods, Lester Young, Steve Lacy, and Herbie Mann,
among others, and was also as a longtime music educator at the University of Maine. The panel discussion was lively and informal. The main new piece of information gathered from listening was that Bonnemère was clearly frustrated by what he saw as a lack of opportunity to present his liturgical jazz more frequently and in more churches. The men were friends, as was clearly demonstrated by their easy rapport and familiarity with each other. Given the significant number of jazz artists who had composed, recorded, and performed in the liturgical jazz style by 1968, it is significant that Summerlin was chosen for the panel and that two of his pieces were played at the conclusion of the broadcast.

Summerlin took part in several religious conferences and festivals in 1968, starting with the Festival of the Arts on March 10, where he performed Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?, a new work commissioned by the festival at Grace Episcopal Church in Massapequa, New York. On March 23, 1968, Summerlin took part in a panel discussion titled “The Church and the Arts in Contemporary Dialogue” at the Sixteenth Middle Atlantic Adult Convocation of the Methodist Church in Buck Hills Fall, Pennsylvania. The next day, Summerlin and his group led A Contemporary Service of Worship for the convocation participants. Summerlin led a performance of the same service on April 28, 1968 in Elkton,

462 John Garcia Gensel et al., The Jazz Mass, panel discussion, WRVR, digital audio tape, 1968.
463 Ibid.
464 Festival of the Arts, Poster, 1968, Grace Episcopal Church. private collection.
465 Sixteenth Middle Atlantic Adult Convocation of the Methodist Church, Conference Program, 1968, The Inn. private collection.
Maryland.\footnote{466} He led the service again on August 28, 1968 in Schenectady, New York with the following group of musicians: Ed Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Targan Unutmaz on bass, Rosemary Unutmaz on vocals, Charles Morano on drums, and dancer Brenda Baum.\footnote{467}

The earliest performance of the service appears to have occurred on February 12, 1967 at the Methodist Church in Wappingers Falls, New York.\footnote{468} The service began with a scripted salutation and was followed by an original poem written by Brenda Baum titled “The Living Ash,” which was set to music by Summerlin. Then a congregational reading took place, followed by a dance by Brenda Baum. During the dance, a clip from the film “Celebration of Love” was played with a score by Summerlin. This was followed by excerpts from T.S. Elliot’s “The Love of J. Alfred Prufrock,” “The Hollow Men,” and “East Coker,” as well as Robert Francis’s poems “Old Men” and “The Hawk,” all of which were set to Summerlin’s music. There was an Offertory with music and the final event was a dance by Brenda Baum with music and readings from Thomas Wolfe and Kahlil Gibran.\footnote{469} The service ended with Summerlin’s original Hymn “Rejoice, Rejoice, Begin a New Day,” which comes from \emph{Liturgy of the Holy Spirit}. In the program, Summerlin acknowledges additional sources from the writings of Dr. Roger Ortmayer and poems by Jorge De Lima, a Brazilian poet and Christian mystic.\footnote{470}

Summerlin’s liner notes for \emph{Ring Out Joy} discussed his newer works that included projections and mixed media. A \emph{Contemporary Service of Worship} seems to have been the first

\footnotesize
\begin{itemize}
  \item \footnote{466} A Contemporary Service of Worship, Service Program, 1968, Elkton Methodist Church. private collection.
  \item \footnote{467} A Contemporary Service of Worship, Service Program, 1968, First United Methodist Church. private collection.
  \item \footnote{468} A Contemporary Service of Worship, Service Program, 1967, Methodist Church. private collection.
  \item \footnote{469} Ibid.
  \item \footnote{470} Ibid.
\end{itemize}
of many works that included dance, projections, poetry, and jazz combined in worship.

Summerlin led the service again on September 6, 1967 at the “National Consultation on the Church in Community Life” held at the Ohio State University in Columbus, Ohio. On February 8, 1967, Summerlin, along with Ortmayer, led an Ash Wednesday service at Western Maryland College. The service had several contemporary readings, dance, a sermon accompanied by music, and what was listed in the program as a “Congregational Event.” The event was written about some months later in the New York Times in an article titled “Liturgies Embracing More Pop Art Forms.” Edward Fiske described the event as:

A jazz combo led by Ed Summerlin, a saxophonist, provided the music while dancers moved down the aisles and hurled paper plates at the congregation. Random sentences from the Bible, newspaper ads and books were pasted on each plate, and the worshiper who caught a plate was instructed: ‘Sometime, during the next four minutes, stand up and read.’

Ortmayer stated in the article that participation was the point. Summerlin was quoted as saying he “conducts choirs of ‘non-musicians’ in anthems of clicks, sighs, and other vocal effects” frequently.

The article also draws attention to the fact that liturgical jazz had been supplanted by folk and rock styles in contemporary church services. By 1967, the British Invasion had already taken place and folk styles were exploding in popularity. Jazz saw a steady and steep decline in

---

471 National Consultation on the Church in Community Life, Conference Program, 1967, Ohio State University. private collection.
472 Ash Wednesday Service, Service Program, 1967, Western Maryland College. private collection.
473 Ibid.
475 Ibid.
popularity in America. If the impetus for having jazz in church was really to connect with the new generation or to draw more people to church, many clergy must have been questioning the jazz genre as the vehicle to accomplish that. Many of the innovations happening in music in the late 1960s were avant-garde in nature and potentially less palatable to casual audiences. Summerlin, always a modernist, wholeheartedly embraced these compositional and improvisational techniques.

Summerlin premiered Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here? on March 10, 1968 at the Grace Episcopal Church in Massapequa, New York. The work was based on J.S. Bach’s 1724 cantata no. 4, Christ Lag in Todesbanden (Christ Lay in the Bonds of Death.) Bach composed the work for Easter Sunday and it is Bach’s only cantata “completely set on one chorale melody without recitatives.” The text is based on a poem by Martin Luther that was set to music by Johann Walther in 1524. W. Murray Young writes that it was Bach’s “first true chorale cantata.” Summerlin’s work of the same name was scored for strings, two trumpets, three trombones, alto saxophone, bass, drums, tape recorder, transistor radios, overhead projector, chorus, and a reader. The work is comprised of seven sections:

“Todesbanden,” “Sundigen,” “Gottes Sohn,” “Ein Wunderlicher Krieg,” “Osterlamm,” “Das Hohe Fest,” and “Dem Wort.” In the performance notes Summerlin, wrote:

It incorporates traditional orchestral writing as well as aleatory (indeterminate) notation. The work is intended to use the full range of musical possibilities for both the

---

476 A Choral Concert, Concert Program, 1968, Grace Episcopal Church. private collection.
478 Ibid.
479 Ibid.
480 A Choral Concert, Concert Program, 1968, Grace Episcopal Church. private collection.
481 Ibid.
choir and instrumentalists. The choir members are called upon to make clicking, hissing sounds, etc., as well as shouting and talking. The orchestra members use their instruments in a variety of ways, the strings tap on the wood of their instruments and the brass players are instructed at one point to ‘blow air into the horn without producing a note.’

Summerlin had certainly embraced many of the new musical techniques that had emerged in classical music as well as avant-garde jazz in his new compositions. The text was written by Dr. Roger Ortmayer and was a contemporary version of Bach’s text. The text included words like “Vietnam,” “Korea,” “Bay of Pigs,” and “laser beams.” The work includes long sections of both structured and free improvisation by the jazz instrumentalists as well as several sections with a pronounced swing feel.

The premiere was reviewed in Newsday in an article titled “Jazz Mass Lags Before it Swings.” Ron Eyer wrote that the work seemed like it was lacking in impact until he heard the final chorus, “The Word is Life,” where everything seemed to coalesce behind the swinging group. The concert was performed again April 6, 1969 in Ithaca, New York; February 22, 1970 at Duke University; April 8, 1970 at the Pittsburgh Festival on the Gospels; May 3, 1970 at Duke Chapel.

---

482 Ibid.
483 Ibid.
484 Ibid.
485 Ed Summerlin, Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?, recorded June 25, 1969, Compact Disc. private collection.
487 Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?, Concert Program, 1969, Duke Chapel. private collection.
488 Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?, Concert Program, 1969, Terrace Cafeteria. private collection.
489 Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?, Festival Program, 1970, Pittsburgh Theological Seminary. private collection.
1970 in Flint, Michigan; and May 15, 1971 at Wittenberg Arts Festival and Symposium. The work had its New York premiere on June 25, 1969 at the Chapel of the Interchurch Center in Manhattan. This performance was recorded and featured Don Heckman on alto saxophone, Lynn Christie on Bass, and Joe Cocuzzo on drums. It is unreleased and the only known recording of the work.

Summerlin and Ortmayer premiered a new work titled Celebration: The Word Is on March 31, 1968 at The First Church of Christ in Longmeadow, Massachusetts. The work featured by a text by Ortmayer and was scored for trombone, French horn, three trumpets, two flutes, cello, four violins, youth choir, adult choir, and five-piece rock band. This is the only time Summerlin included a rock band instead of a jazz group. The United Church of Christ commissioned the work, but it is unclear if the rock ensemble was part of the commission requirements or Summerlin’s idea. His articles of the time indicated no negative feelings about rock as a genre, but did emphasize his distaste for bad composing in any genre.

Summerlin was commissioned by the National Liturgical Conference in Washington, D.C. to compose a work to open the 1969 Liturgical Week in Milwaukee, Wisconsin. The title of the work and conference theme was Celebration of Man’s Hope and once again Ortmayer

---

490 Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?, Concert Program, 1970, Woodside Church and Court Street United Methodist Church. private collection.
491 Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?, Festival Program, 1971, Wittenberg University. private collection.
492 Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?, Concert Program, 1969, Chapel of the Interchurch Center. private collection.
495 Edgar E. Summerlin, Curriculum Vitae. private collection.
496 Ibid.
wrote the text for the work.\textsuperscript{497} The work premiered on August 25, 1969 and was described as a multimedia experience created to engage the conference participants.\textsuperscript{498} The audience participants were given a large poster containing directions for both verbal and physical cues; instructions were also displayed on the arena’s screens to facilitate participation.\textsuperscript{499}

The work was in nine sections and was scored for flute, alto saxophone, three trumpets, two trombones, bass, drums, strings, and choir.\textsuperscript{500} \textit{Celebration of Man’s Hope} is a musical montage\textsuperscript{501} taking large sections from both \textit{Sourdough and Sweetbread} as well as \textit{Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here}? Comparing the scores of all three works reveals that sections I and II come from \textit{Sourdough and Sweetbread}. Section III’s opening and ending comes from \textit{Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here}? with the middle section of III repeating earlier music. Part IV is a hymn titled “Hello! And Did You Hear the Word,” which was new material. Part V is section IV of \textit{Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here}? Section VI is titled “Dialogue Interlude,” which doesn’t include music. Section VII is “Unison Reading” and “Let Us Break Bread Together,” which may come from \textit{Sourdough and Sweetbread}, but it is unclear. Section VIII is a hymn taken from \textit{Sourdough and Sweetbread}. Section IX comes from the same work and then transitions to material from \textit{Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here}? with a couple of words of text added at the end.

\textsuperscript{497} \textit{Celebration of Man’s Hope}, Conference Program, 1969, Auditorium-Arena Milwaukee. private collection.
\textsuperscript{498} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{499} \textit{Celebration of Man’s Hope}, Conference Poster, 1969, Auditorium-Arena Milwaukee. private collection.
\textsuperscript{500} Ed Summerlin, \textit{Celebration of Man’s Hope}, score, 1968. private collection.
\textsuperscript{501} The act of joining sections of other works into a new work was a technique used in music by more contemporary composers like Kurt Weill, Heinz Werner Zimmermann and Frank Zappa among many others.
Other than the hymn “Hello! And Did You Hear the Word,” there is no new music or text. What is new is the audience participation instructions and possibly the projections, but that is impossible to know.

On October 30, 1969, Summerlin premiered a new work, Pentecost: Ecstasy Breaks Out, at Fairfield Hall in Croydon, England.\(^{502}\) It was one of four works commissioned for a special contemporary multi-religious concert titled “Four Seasons of God,” which included Ed Summerlin, Summer; Donald Swann, Autumn; Sidney Carter, Winter; and Michael Garrick, Spring.\(^{503}\) Summerlin’s Pentecost: Ecstasy Breaks Out, which represented Summer, was scored for two violins, viola, cello, bass, three trumpets, two trombones, bass trombone, jazz trio (tenor saxophone, bass, drums), reader, and chorus. The score instructs the chorus to be randomly seated among the audience and take a staggered approach to entering the music.\(^{504}\) Summerlin described his current thoughts on composition in the program:

> I have come to the conclusion that it is not important to make violins play jazz or have jazz players play in so-called ‘classical’ style. Instead, I like to take groups of instrumentalists and singers and ask them to do things together, each one being called upon to do the individual player’s realm of possibilities…. the human voice is capable of many sounds, from screams and shouts to grunts and groans and clicks…. Therefore, I say down with style, up with eclecticism in the best sense, i.e. let’s use our experiences from back to Charlie Parker to the Beatles to Stockhausen.\(^{505}\)

His works A Contemporary Service of Worship, Sourdough and Sweetbread, Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here? and Pentecost: Ecstasy Breaks Out certainly

---

\(^{502}\) Four Seasons of God, Concert Poster, 1969, Fairfield Hall. private collection.  
\(^{503}\) Ibid.  
\(^{504}\) Ed Summerlin, Pentecost: Ecstasy Breaks Out, score, 1969. private collection.  
\(^{505}\) Four Seasons of God, Concert Program, 1969, Fairfield Hall. private collection.
demonstrate his willingness to explore the full range of sounds available from his instrumentalists and singers while still keeping a strong connection to the jazz genre.

Summerlin’s next commission was Bless This World, which was a multi-media experience commissioned by The American Guild of Organists 1970 for their national convention held in Buffalo, New York on June 30, 1970. The work premiered at Rutgers University Livingston Campus on February 4, 1970 and was listed as a contemporary worship celebration. Bless This World featured a text by Dr. Roger Ortmayer and was scored for mixed chorus, solo baritone singer, reader, pre-recorded tape, three slide projectors, two trumpets, two trombones, bass trombone, organ, and a jazz trio consisting of tenor saxophone, bass, and drums. The work is very avant-garde, with the first eight minutes of a recorded performance featuring tape of various soundscapes; singers singing random pitches; the sounds of instrumentalists setting up, warming up, and tuning after the performance had started; the reader saying “I want you to listen” in a call-and-response format to the audience; and the organist using a wooden two-by-four to play all the natural foot pedals while using his other foot to play random black-key clusters punctuated by the chorus doing vocal effects.

When the music becomes more structured it features a tenor saxophone and organ solo over a funk-inspired ostinato and drum groove. The work has a great deal of dissonance, wide dynamic ranges, and extended techniques for both vocalists and instrumentalists. The work features improvisation and funk-jazz grooves and ostinatos as well as some swing sections.

---

506 Bless This World, Concert Poster, 1970, Kleinhans Music Hall. private collection.  
507 Bless This World, Program, 1970, Rutgers University Livingston Campus. private collection.  
508 Ed Summerlin, Bless This World, score, 1970. private collection.  
509 Ed Summerlin, Bless This World, recorded 1970, Compact Disc. private collection.
When you consider that the majority of the works being performed at the convention fell into the traditional classical repertoire, *Bless This World* must have been quite a shock and departure for the participants.\(^{510}\) Music critic Daniel Cariaga wrote that the work was disastrous and filled the audience ears with noise. He wrote, “with such sloppy thinking and style-mixing going for it, the work was already moribund at this first hearing. The assembled AGO seemed both stunned and angry when it was over. Gave it one of the shortest rounds of applause I have ever heard.”\(^{511}\) Cariaga was a classically-trained pianist and performer before becoming a longtime music critic in Los Angeles, California.\(^{512}\)

The recording I heard was a live performance of the work in an unknown location, but the large crowd, judging by the applause, was extremely enthusiastic and participated wholeheartedly, so it is clear that the expectations of the audience appeared to have played a role in the poor reception it received in Buffalo. The work was also performed on November 8, 1970 at the Vassar College Chapel\(^{513}\) and on November 22, 1970 at United Church on the Green’s “Festival of Our Earth Home” in New Haven, Connecticut.\(^{514}\) In his review of the Vassar performance, Walter Borawski wrote that the skeptical audience was rude during the opening

---


\(^{513}\) *Bless This World*, Concert Poster, 1970, Vassar College Chapel. private collection.

\(^{514}\) Festival of Our Earth Home, Concert Poster, 1970, United Church on the Green. private collection.
of the work, but that by the end Summerlin and his group had received a standing ovation and cheers for an encore.\(^{515}\) This performance is the likely source of the recording I referenced.

In 1969, Summerlin contributed several original hymns to a book titled *Contemporary Music for Congregations*, including “God Give Us Your Peace,” “Bread,” “God’s Own Son,” “Hello, and Did You Hear the Word,” and “Music for Minister Congregation and Saxophone,” the later avant-garde work located in the New Forms section of the book.\(^{516}\) Summerlin edited the collection and wrote:

> There is a crisis in worship in the church. This crisis, in part, involves the problem of developing liturgies which express the concerns of people in the language and other modes of expression which they understand. Music is a part of that crisis. ... It is our hope that the church will eventually realize the importance of commissioning contemporary composers to do congregational music and that their music will be included in our denominational hymnals.\(^{517}\)

Summerlin also contributed some compositions to *The Genesis Songbook* in 1973.\(^{518}\)

In 1970, Summerlin self-published a guide on how to use multi-media in worship. The guide included sections on why you should use multi-media in worship, how to harness local talent, incorporating dance, musical genres, projector use, film use, rehearsal tips, incorporating avant-garde, and had several musical examples.\(^{519}\) It was sold as part of a complete kit, which included the twenty-four-page guide, forty-eight slides of abstract paintings, 16 mm film for color loops, paint, a paintbrush, and a cassette of Summerlin’s

\(^{515}\) Walter Borawski, “Hey, They Want Us To Listen!” *Poughkeepsie Journal*, February 5, 1971, 8.


\(^{517}\) Ibid., 65.


worship music. Summerlin and Ortmayer teamed up again to publish *Heavy Hymns*, a book of fifteen contemporary hymns in variety of styles. The hymns included were: “Come Loving,” “Doors,” “Feed Back,” “God’s Own Son,” “Hello-Goodbye,” “Listen to What the Spirit Says,” “Prayer of Peace,” “Salvation,” “Say Hope,” “Say Joy,” “Say Love,” “Shared Bread,” “This Heart of Mine,” “Time,” and “Truth.” Summerlin also wrote articles for several publications during this period. For instance, he wrote “Does the Church Really Want to Sing a New Song?” for *Your Church*; “Having Fun With Sight and Sound” for *Baptist Leader*; “Fun With Sight and Sound” for *Fun*; and “Rappin’ With Sydney Carter” for *Colloquy*. Sydney Carter had shared the bill on the London concert “Four Seasons of God” with Summerlin. He was a journalist and songwriter who frequently used modern satire, informal texts, folk melodies and is considered the “patron saint of a modern school of conversational style hymnody.”

Summerlin attended several conferences and festivals during this period, including The Celebration of the New conference in February 1969; the Art Water 70 Festival in Wisconsin in February 1970; the Liberation Conference at Vassar on September 15, 1972; and the

---

529 Salvation Today, Conference Program, 1972, Vassar Farm. private collection.
Salvation Today Conference in Bangkok, Thailand in January of 1973. Summerlin also led liturgical jazz services at Bennet College in New York; in Stockton, California; Keene, New Hampshire; Billings, Montana; Nashville, Tennessee; and Carleton College in Minnesota that same year.

Summerlin’s ultimate goal was to change the way the congregation and clergy approached worship. After fourteen years of trying one day he threw up his hands and said it’s not working. I can’t do it you know and I just sort of retired. I would go in and people would really enjoy doing it. Sometimes they would have a very good time, sometimes people would walk out, but the end result was that once I was gone things didn’t change.

Summerlin who by this point had become Presbyterian stopped composing for liturgical jazz services. He would continue to compose music for religious documentaries and short films as a result of his friendship and working relationship with Al Cox, an independent filmmaker.

It was almost a decade before Summerlin would lead a worship service again. He led an Advent service at Washington Square Church in New York in 1982. Summerlin also

532 Sensory Celebration V, Service Program, 1968, Morris Chapel. private collection.
533 Worship in the Modern Idiom, Service Program, 1969, First Baptist Church. private collection.
534 Campus Chapel Service, Service Program, 1970, Rocky Mountain Chapel. private collection.
538 Karen Summerlin, interview with author, April 2015.
participated in the now-legendary All Nite Soul event at St. Peter’s Church on October 10, 1982, which was organized by John Garcia Gensel. He brought in an eleven-piece group to play a new work dedicated to the St. Peter’s Church tradition called The Prodigal Son, a fitting title after Summerlin’s nine-year hiatus from liturgical jazz.\footnote{All Nite Soul, Concert Program, 1982, St. Peter’s Church. private collection.} Summerlin had also become affiliated with the Washington Square Methodist Church in New York City and attended services there with his wife Karen several Sundays a month despite the two-hour drive.\footnote{Karen Summerlin, interview with author, April 2015.} Clearly he did not have a crisis of faith but he did, with the abovementioned exception, decide not to pursue composing for or leading liturgical jazz services anymore.

During Ed Summerlin’s liturgical period of 1959 to 1973 he composed the major liturgical jazz works Requiem for Mary Jo; Liturgical Jazz Service; Evensong, A Jazz Liturgy; The Coming of Christ; Liturgy of the Holy Spirit; A Contemporary Service of Worship; Sourdough and Sweetbread; Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?, Celebration of Man’s Hope and Bless This World. Along with these major works he composed many original hymns, shorter liturgical jazz works, and many distinct liturgical jazz services. He also was heavily involved in liturgical conferences all over the country and was a frequently televised liturgical jazz artist. Summerlin was the only authority on liturgical jazz in the early 1960s and he remained its most prolific composer. He was constantly evolving as a composer and performer and pushed modernity in the liturgical jazz genre more than any other composer.
Chapter 5

Non-Liturgical Work

The Lenox School of Jazz

After completing his studies at North Texas State University, Ed Summerlin was involved in another groundbreaking effort in jazz education. In 1960, he became a faculty member at The Lenox School of Jazz. While there, Summerlin came into contact with the highest caliber of jazz artists, who were both faculty and students. They were artists he built professional connections with and worked with in the future throughout his liturgical period and later in academia. His time at Lenox made him a peer of some of the most prominent jazz musicians of the day and built his professional network in a very short span of time. This was his introduction to the heavy hitters of the New York jazz scene and established him as a professional arranger, composer and player on a bigger stage. While he never achieved the notoriety of these peers, he would compose, conduct, arrange and perform with them. Summerlin became a member in a very exclusive network of jazz musicians as a result of his abilities and his time at Lenox.

The Lenox School of Jazz was located in Lenox, Massachusetts in the center of the Berkshires. The area was already well known for a wealth of cultural attractions like the Norman Rockwell Museum, the Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute, several theater companies and festivals, and Tanglewood, which is where the Boston Symphony Orchestra takes up residency in the summers.\(^{542}\) Stephanie and Philip Barber, a wealthy New York couple, had purchased one hundred acres of land and the outbuildings of the Wheatleigh estate in

---

1950 after the death of the Countess de Heredia, who had lived there for almost fifty years.\textsuperscript{543}

The Boston Symphony Orchestra purchased the mansion along with twenty-five acres of land and used it as a dormitory for its students.\textsuperscript{544} The Barbers decided to start a “Music Inn” that would be a place for “music making and musical investigation, with particular focus on folk music and jazz.”\textsuperscript{545}

The Lenox School of Jazz began as “an outgrowth of seminars and roundtable discussions held at the Music Inn in Lenox.”\textsuperscript{546} These began the first summer the inn was open and lecturers and performers included Alan Lomax, Woody Guthrie, Pete Seeger, Marshall Stearns, Eubie Blake and Mahalia Jackson. The list of speakers and performers would continue to grow each summer and represented an extremely eclectic group of great artists in a variety of mediums, as well as renowned scholars. Jazz was a focal point of these events and speakers included Marshall Stearns, Rudi Blesh, Nat Hentoff, John Lewis, Dave Brubeck, Paul Desmond, Willis James, Connie Kay, Milt Jackson and Jimmy Giuffre, among many others.\textsuperscript{547}

The music was not the only progressive thing happening at the inn. Despite the prevailing attitudes in the United States and, in particular, the Berkshires, “the Music Inn housed its black and white patrons and musicians side by side.”\textsuperscript{548} Other mixing included the jazz musicians and the Tanglewood musicians. Many of the classical musicians came to the Music Inn after rehearsals or performances, the most notable being Leonard Bernstein and his

\textsuperscript{543} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{544} Ibid., 22.
\textsuperscript{545} Ibid., 25.
\textsuperscript{546} Ibid., 10.
\textsuperscript{547} Ibid., 26-27.
\textsuperscript{548} Ibid., 32.
wife, who were regulars.\textsuperscript{549} With high-profile speakers, musicians and guests, word started to spread about the Music Inn. The Barbers were now open for holidays as well as the summer and were often at capacity.\textsuperscript{550}

The increasing popularity of the Inn made it possible to expand the musical season. By 1954, the season, now three weeks long, was being called a “Jazz Festival.”\textsuperscript{551} Despite this label, the music “ranged from blues to New Orleans marching bands to square dances, Jamaican music, the music and dance of Trinidad, and a ‘Calypso Costume Ball.’”\textsuperscript{552} Jazz festivals were still in their infancy in 1954 with the Newport Jazz Festival, one of the most prestigious and longest running jazz festivals, being founded that same year by George Wein. Building on the success of the previous season, the Barbers expanded their jazz festival to five weeks and had internationally renowned figures such as Art Farmer, Dizzy Gillespie, Coleman Hawkins, the Count Basie Orchestra, the Max Roach-Clifford Brown Quintet, the Modern Jazz Quartet, Dave Brubeck, Gene Krupa, Jimmy Rushing, and Thelonious Monk, among many others.\textsuperscript{553} In 1956, Louis Armstrong opened the season and the Modern Jazz Quartet was in residence. The roundtables and lectures continued on through the 1956 season, which featured performers Louis Armstrong, Count Basie, Duke Ellington, Tommy and Jimmy Dorsey, Erroll Garner, Sarah Vaughan, Dizzy Gillespie, Glen Miller, Lee Konitz, Bud Powell, Stan Getz, Shelly Manne, J.J.

\textsuperscript{549} Ibid., 35.
\textsuperscript{550} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{551} Ibid., 36.
\textsuperscript{552} Ibid., 37.
\textsuperscript{553} Ibid., 38-39.
Johnson, Phineas Newborn, Chico Hamilton, Marian McPartland, Max Roach, and Kai Winding.\textsuperscript{554}

The 1956 season also produced two recordings, \textit{The Modern Jazz Quartet at Music Inn}, \textit{Guest Artist: Jimmy Giuffre} and \textit{Historic Jazz Concert at Music Inn}, both of which came out on Atlantic Records.\textsuperscript{555} John Lewis also composed a piece, “Fugue for the Music Inn,” for the recording. The second recording featured Jimmy Giuffre, Connie Kay, Herbie Mann, Pee Wee Russell, Rex Stewart, Teddy Charles, Oscar Pettiford, Ray Brown, Dick Katz, and George Wein.\textsuperscript{556} The panelists that year included Charles Mingus, Milt Jackson, Dick Katz, Jimmy Giuffre, John Lewis, Oscar Pettiford, Quincy Jones, Willie “The Lion” Smith, Ray Brown, Count Basie, Freddie Greene, Thad Jones, Connie Kay, Max Roach, Sonny Rollins, and Dizzy Gillespie.\textsuperscript{557} That year’s lineup and the free exchanging of ideas among these jazz greats were what finally led to the formation of The Lenox School of Jazz.

The School’s Opening

The Barbers formed the Lenox School of Jazz in 1957. John Lewis was its Executive Director. The Governing Committee consisted of the Barbers, Nesuhi Ertegun, J.J. Johnson, and Gunther Schuller. Trustees consisted of Leonard Feather, Nat Hentoff, Marshall Sterns, Barry Ulanov, Dizzy Gillespie, Jimmy Giuffre, Oscar Peterson, Max Roach, and George Avakian, among others.\textsuperscript{558} The first three-week session consisted of thirty-four students, all of whom were

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{554} Ibid., 48.
\textsuperscript{555} Ibid., 49.
\textsuperscript{556} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{557} Ibid., 52.
\textsuperscript{558} Ibid., 54-55.
\end{footnotesize}
selected from taped auditions. They attended lectures, student concerts, professional concerts, and combo rehearsals that all culminated in an end-of-the-semester concert titled “School of Jazz on Parade,” which featured a blend of students and professionals in each group performing original compositions. Over a dozen students from the inaugural class went on to become professional musicians. The session also yielded a record, *The Modern Jazz Quartet and Guests: Third Stream Music*, which featured guest musicians Jimmy Giuffre, Jim Hall, and Ralph Pena who would go onto form the group the Jimmy Giuffre 3. The 1957 music season continued to offer some of the biggest names in jazz and included artists Ella Fitzgerald, Billie Holiday, Dave Brubeck, Gerry Mulligan, Lionel Hampton, Duke Ellington, Woody Herman, the Modern Jazz Quartet, and the Jimmy Giuffre trio, among others.

In 1958, the Music Inn expanded by buying the Wheatleigh estate from the Boston Symphony Orchestra. The faculty of The Lenox School of Jazz was Bob Brookmeyer, Kenny Dorham, Jimmy Giuffre, Jim Hall, Percy Heath, Milt Jackson, Lee Konitz, Max Roach, George Russell, Bill Russo, and Marshall Stearns. Professional musicians in residence were Connie Kay, George Coleman, Art Davis, Ray Draper, Booker Little, Modern Jazz Quartet, Jimmy Giuffre 3, and the Max Roach Quintet. There were thirty-three students that year with several having received scholarships to attend. The concerts, “that summer included “regulars” Dave Brubeck, Duke Ellington, Lionel Hampton, Wilbur de Paris, Bobby Hackett, Mary Lou Williams, Oscar

---

559 Ibid., 57-58.
560 Ibid., 64.
561 Ibid.
562 Ibid., 67-70.
563 Ibid.
Peterson, and the Modern Jazz Quartet.\textsuperscript{564} There were also first-time performers, which included Anita O’Day, Chris Connor, George Shearing, Joe Turner, and Sonny Rollins. Several recordings were made that summer: \textit{The Music Inn Suite}, \textit{The Modern Jazz Quartet at Music Inn, Guest Artist: Sonny Rollins} and \textit{The Four Brothers Sound}, a recording which featured the Jimmy Giuffre 3 with Giuffre overdubbing four saxophones to achieve a sound comparable to the Four Brothers.\textsuperscript{565} Once again, several students went on to become professional musicians.

During the 1959 session, there were now forty-five students at the school and the amount of scholarships for the school had expanded to $10,000. More than half of these students went on to have careers in music, such as David Baker, Don Cherry, Steve Kuhn and Attila Zoller.\textsuperscript{566} Despite these scholarships and the faculty receiving minimal compensation, the school had run a small deficit from the previous two years.\textsuperscript{567} The music series had many regulars returning and had added the Miles Davis quintet, Amhad Jamal, the Lambert, Hendricks and Ross trio, and Ray Charles, among others, but the season was plagued by cancellations.\textsuperscript{568}

Ornette Coleman was a student at the Lenox School of Jazz in 1959. John Lewis had arranged scholarships for Coleman and Don Cherry to attend the School of Jazz.\textsuperscript{569} By 1959, Ornette had already recorded the groundbreaking albums \textit{Something Else!!!!: The Music of Ornette Coleman}, \textit{Tomorrow is the Question: The New Music of Ornette Coleman} and \textit{The Shape of Jazz to Come}. Despite his student status, Coleman was really more of a visiting artist.

\textsuperscript{564} Ibid., 54-55.
\textsuperscript{565} Ibid., 73-75.
\textsuperscript{566} Ibid., 86-87.
\textsuperscript{567} Ibid., 76.
\textsuperscript{568} Ibid., 81-85.
\textsuperscript{569} Ibid., 89.
According to Gunther Schuller his student status was conferred because it was the only way he could receive a scholarship to fund his residency.\textsuperscript{570} Coleman’s reception was mixed at the school. Whereas Gunther Schuller and Jimmy Giuffre were vocally supportive, Bob Brookmeyer quit the faculty in protest.\textsuperscript{571} The local newspapers wrote stories claiming students and faculty alike were split down the middle in accepting or rejecting Coleman’s new style. The final faculty and student concert featured three of Coleman’s compositions, which received favorable reviews in the papers\textsuperscript{572} and according to Schuller was an “astonishing performance.”\textsuperscript{573} This concert also spurred \textit{Jazz Review} co-editor Martin Williams to arrange the debut of the Coleman Quartet later that year at the Five Spot Café in New York\textsuperscript{574} which has gone down in history as one of the most revered and reviled concerts of all time. Regardless of people’s reactions, it was a seminal moment in Ornette Coleman’s career and put him at the forefront of the new free jazz movement.

It was in the summer of 1960 that Ed Summerlin joined the faculty at The Lenox School of Jazz to teach saxophone, arranging, and theory.\textsuperscript{575} Summerlin was studying with George Russell who arranged for Summerlin to be on the staff of the School of Jazz in Lenox.\textsuperscript{576} While the concerts at the Barn were now in their sixth year, the school was in its fourth year of

\textsuperscript{571} Yudkin, 89.
\textsuperscript{572} Ibid., 91.
\textsuperscript{573} Schuller, 490.
\textsuperscript{574} Yudkin, 91.
\textsuperscript{575} Edgar E. Summerlin, Curriculum Vitae. private collection.
\textsuperscript{576} Ed Summerlin, liner notes to \textit{Sum of the Parts}, Ed Summerlin, Ictus Records 102, compact disc, 1998.
existence and, according to Jeremy Yudkin, “had acquired a nationwide reputation.”\textsuperscript{577} The jazz festival featured Louis Armstrong, Dave Brubeck, George Shearing, Mahalia Jackson, The Modern Jazz Quartet, J.J. Johnson, Duke Ellington, Ahmad Jamal, and Maynard Ferguson.\textsuperscript{578} The faculty in 1960 consisted of Milt Jackson, John Lewis, Connie Kay, Percy Heath, Gunther Schuller, J.J. Johnson, Earl Zindars, Susan Freeman, Ed Summerlin, Freddie Hubbard, and John Garvey, while the George Russell Sextet was in residence along with the Modern Jazz Quartet.\textsuperscript{579} John Garvey, a violist and professor at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, brought six string players with him. Schuller conceived of the idea in order to experiment more with “third stream” compositions.\textsuperscript{580} There were forty-five students that year and some of the more notable newcomers were Jamey Aebersold and Chuck Israels. Sadly, the financial problems finally caught up to the school and, despite plans for a 1961 season, the school was closed.\textsuperscript{581}

New York

Summerlin’s time at the Lenox School of Jazz had provided him an introduction to many of New York’s top jazz musicians. Freddie Hubbard, who had been in Summerlin’s combo at Lenox, hired him to arrange one of Hubbard’s original compositions for a record date. Recorded for Blue Note Records on April 9, 1961 at Rudy Van Gelder’s studio, \textit{Hub Cap} (BLP 4073) was

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{577} Yudkin, 100-101.
\item \textsuperscript{578} Ibid., 101.
\item \textsuperscript{579} Ibid., 102-103.
\item \textsuperscript{580} Ibid., 104.
\item \textsuperscript{581} Ibid., 105-105.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
Freddie Hubbard’s third recording as a leader. This was just a few months before Hubbard would replace Lee Morgan in Art Blakey’s Jazz Messengers, possibly the premier jazz trumpet gig in the world at the time. Hubbard was known as one of the “foremost hard-bop trumpeters, his improvisations combining imaginative melody with a glossy tone, rapid and clean technique, a brilliant high register, a subtle vibrato, and bluesy, squeezed half-valve notes.” Summerlin contributed an arrangement of “Earmont Jr.,” a Hubbard composition written for his pianist brother. The liner notes state that the song was “arranged for this date by Ed Summerlin, the composer and saxophonist who with Freddie has been studying. Freddie was featured on the Look Up and Live CBS telecasts with Summerlin, whose jazz-oriented writing for a Methodist Sunday church service created a sensation in 1959.” The studying that is referred to was most likely at the Lenox School of Jazz since there has been no other mention of Hubbard studying with Summerlin. The album featured an all-star lineup of trombonist Julian Priester, tenor saxophonist Jimmy Heath, pianist Cedar Walton, bassist Larry Ridley, and drummer Philly Joe Jones.

Summerlin’s arrangement begins with an eight-bar introduction, which features piano, bass, and drums for the first four bars. In measures five through eight, the rhythm section is joined by trombone playing a counterline to the pianist’s left-hand notes while the trumpet and saxophone play the harmony notes. The composition is a twenty-four bar piece with trumpet

582 Leonard Feather, liner notes to Hub Cap, Freddie Hubbard, Blue Note Records BLP 4073, 33⅓ rpm, 1961.
584 Ibid.
585 Leonard Feather, liner notes to Hub Cap, Freddie Hubbard, Blue Note Records BLP 4073, 33⅓ rpm, 1961.
and tenor saxophone playing in harmony while the trombone plays counterlines. The melody is played identically on the way out with the addition of a coda where the horns play a sequence of descending chords in harmony with the trombone, piano, and drums playing a final flourish.

Summerlin would be the arranger for another Lenox School of Jazz alum, pianist Steve Kuhn. The album *The Country & Western Sound Of Jazz Pianos* (DM-4308) was released by Dauntless records in 1963 and featured pianists Steve Kuhn and Toshiko Akiyoshi, bassists Dave Izenzon and John Neves, guitarist Barry Galbraith, and drummer Pete Laroca. While Kuhn had already recorded and performed with jazz artists Kenny Dorham, John Coltrane\(^5\), Stan Getz, Don Ellis, and Charles Lloyd, this was his first outing as a leader.\(^6\) Summerlin penned the liner notes, conducted the group, and wrote the arrangements. Summerlin wrote:

There is no attempt at recreating the feel of a “western” band in this album, instead, the arrangements are intended to make use of the feeling and spirit of the music itself—much the same way classical composers, such as Bartok have made use of folk tunes in their compositions. Some of the pieces are played without much variation, but others, such as “Down In The Valley,” (which I have heard and sung since my childhood days in Missouri), have been altered to fit my personal impressions of them.\(^7\)

The songs on the record are “Trouble in Mind,” “Hang Your Head In Shame,” “May the Good Lord Bless and Keep You,” “Someday You’ll Want Me to Want You,” “Down in the Valley,” “Beautiful Brown Eyes,” “It’s No Secret What God Can Do,” “Nobody’s Darling But Mine,”

---

\(^5\) Kuhn played with John Coltrane’s first incarnation of what later became known as the classic quartet. He was replaced after six weeks with pianist McCoy Tyner. Coltrane expressed admiration for Kuhn’s playing but felt it was not right for the direction the quartet was going in. According to Kuhn, he was understandably devastated.


\(^7\) Ed Summerlin, liner notes to *The Country & Western Sounds of Jazz Pianos*, Steve Kuhn & Toshiko Akiyoshi, Dauntless Records DM-4308, 33 ½ rpm, 1963.
“Along the Navajo Trail,” and “Foggy, Foggy Dew.” Every track features solos by Kuhn and Akiyoshi, with the bassists taking solos on some of the tracks. Akiyoshi plays celesta on “May the Good Lord Bless and Keep You” and “Beautiful Brown Eyes” and Kuhn plays harpsichord on “Beautiful Brown Eyes.” Presumably, since Summerlin was the arranger and conductor, these unusual instrument choices were his. Kuhn’s style has been described as ranging from “bop to modal jazz and encompasses impressionistic playing and dissonant harmony; he takes a quasi-orchestral approach to the keyboard. His compositions often have fractional time signatures (or no time signature at all) and phrases of unusual length.”

Summerlin describes Kuhn’s style as a “more introspective, reflective way of playing—more behind the beat” while, “Toshiko’s playing is more of the Bud Powell school, with long lines and explosions of notes in the right hand, and a more percussive, brittle approach than Steve.” Akiyoshi had already played and recorded with Charles Mingus and Charlie Mariano by the time she made this album.


Ibid.


Steve Kuhn, interview with author, March 2015.
Booker Ervin, Herbie Mann, Bob Dylan, and John Coltrane, with many more to come.594

Originally, the two pianists were supposed to be Steve Kuhn and Herbie Hancock, but Hancock was unavailable according to Kuhn. In May 1963, Hancock would join Miles Davis’s new quintet, which would go on to become known as the second great quintet, one which revolutionized group interaction in jazz.595

Summerlin’s profile had risen significantly since having taught at The Lenox School of Jazz. The connections he had made at the school helped him procure arranging gigs with some of the bigger new names in jazz, both performers and producers. Freddie Hubbard and Tom Wilson clearly had faith in Summerlin’s abilities as an arranger and, in Wilson’s case, as a conductor as well. These dates were the most significant in Summerlin’s career up to this point.

Don Heckman

Another newcomer to the school was Don Heckman, an alto saxophone player who played a prominent role in Summerlin’s professional career in the 1960s and 1970s. In 1960 Heckman was studying music theory at Florida State University where he received his BA in 1961.596 Heckman and Summerlin met in the summer of 1960 at The Lenox School of Jazz.597 Heckman recalls, “I was there, as a musician playing in a group with Freddie Hubbard and Ed

597 Don Heckman, interview with author, March 2015.
was one of the instructors. He was the instructor for the group that we were in." The group consisted of Freddie Hubbard on trumpet, Jim D’Angelo, and Don Heckman on alto saxophones, Ed Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Mike Gibbs on trombone, John Payne on piano, David Mauney on piano and vibes, Narma Feuer on bass, and Connie Kay and Peter Blum on drums. The group consisted of Freddie Hubbard on trumpet, Jim D’Angelo, and Don Heckman on alto saxophones, Ed Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Mike Gibbs on trombone, John Payne on piano, David Mauney on piano and vibes, Narma Feuer on bass, and Connie Kay and Peter Blum on drums. The leaders were listed in a concert program as Herb Pomeroy, Connie Kay and Ed Summerlin, with Summerlin and Kay performing with the group. Their portion of the concert featured all jazz standards or current pieces by established artists with the exception of Heckman’s “Tante Rifka.” Heckman stated that the concert was recorded that evening but to his knowledge has never been released commercially. Although Jim Hall did not return as a faculty member in 1960, he was the featured soloist with several of the groups in the second half of the concert, although not with Summerlin’s. During their time together at the school, Summerlin learned of Heckman’s involvement with musician and composer John Benson Brooks, “who was developing ways of improvising using twelve note rows.” Heckman played alto saxophone on Brooks’s record *Avant Slant (One Plus 1 = II)* on Decca records (DL 75018.) Heckman and Brooks played a large event in Washington, D.C. in 1963 and Heckman recalled “Ed found out what I was doing and was very curious about it. He was always very musically curious. So we got together and began to sort of occasionally, do an occasional rehearsal to try things out. He was interested in avant-garde stuff.

---

598 Ibid.
600 Ibid.
601 Ibid.
602 Don Heckman, interview with author, March 2015.
603 “Lenox School of Jazz,” Concert Program, 1960.
604 Don Heckman, interview with author, March 2015.
and so was I.”  

Both Summerlin and Heckman were part of trumpeter Don Ellis’s group after meeting him at Lenox. Ellis was part of the avant-garde scene and was playing in George Russell’s group while leading his own bands. Summerlin and Heckman played in Ellis’ group at the legendary Five Spot in New York opposite the Eric Dolphy group. The band had Don Ellis on trumpet, Lalo Schiffrin on piano, Steve Swallow on bass, Don Heckman on alto saxophone, and Ed Shaughnesssey on drums. When Ellis left for California, Summerlin and Heckman began doing concerts together with a seven- or eight-piece band in New York City, putting these concepts into practice. 

One such event was recorded and released on Bill Dixon’s “Compilation tape B.” The group premiered a piece by Dixon, “All the King’s Women,” which Don Heckman had commissioned sometime in early 1964. The piece was performed at Hardware Poets’ Playhouse in New York City. The group consisted of Lew Gluckin on trumpet, Don Heckman on alto saxophone, Ed Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Steve Kuhn on piano, Steve Swallow or Ron Carter on bass, Joe Cocuzzo on drums, and Bob Norden or Brian Trentham on trombone. Linda Zanda is credited with having performed vocals, but is not audible on the tape. Dixon recalled that the group rehearsed often and he frequented these rehearsals because the group was so talented.

605 Ibid.
608 Ibid.
610 Ibid.
611 Ibid.
On Sunday, October 4, 1964, Heckman performed at Bill Dixon’s legendary four-day avant-garde jazz festival, The October Revolution in Jazz, with his own group the Don Heckman Octet. His set followed the Sun Ra Sextet’s set on the final evening of the festival. The Octet appears to have been only a quintet, which featured Don Heckman on alto saxophone, Don Friedman on piano, Alan Silva on bass, Joe Hunt on drums, and vocalist Sheila Jordan. Heckman also appeared on a panel discussion during the event, presumably with Sun Ra, who was also listed as a panelist and performed that day. The festival “triggered a resurgence of the jazz avant-garde movement (also known as the ‘free jazz’ and ‘the new thing’) after nearly three years of apparent somnolence and near-absence from the public eye.... By 1964, the avant-garde seemed to have been reduced to a minor rivulet meandering far from the mainstream. But, in the wake of the October Revolution, it rebounded dramatically.”


---

612 Ibid., 347.
613 Ibid.
614 Ibid., 344.
616 Don Heckman, interview with author, March 2015.
617 The liner notes have the track listed as “Leisure #5” while the album's label just has “Leisure” as the track.
on alto saxophone, Ed Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Steve Kuhn on piano, Ron Carter on bass, and Joe Hunt on drums. Recorded the previous year, “Five Haikus” has the same personnel with the exception of Steve Swallow on bass, Joe Cocuzzo on drums, and the addition of Lisa Zanda on vocals.618

The liner notes reveal that the Don Heckman – Ed Summerlin Improvisational Jazz Workshop was more than just a record title; it was a “laboratory for the continuing exploration of new music. Its materials include jazz, electronic music, happenings, theatrical events, dance, film, religious services, written music, improvised music and chance music.”619 This was more of an umbrella organization where Summerlin and Heckman could explore a wide range of musical projects. The religious services mentioned above were Summerlin’s liturgical works of the mid- and late 1960s discussed in the previous chapter. This mission statement did not go unfulfilled; they did indeed explore all of these avenues of creative collaborations. The choice of including “Improvisational” in the title was not simply because Charles Mingus had beat them to the Jazz Workshop title but was meant to stress that this was not just about composition. The liner notes go on to elaborate, “jazz workshops in the past have often stressed composition at the cost of the life blood of jazz—improvisation. Heckman and Summerlin are deeply convinced that a valuable musical contribution can be made by the creative, improvising composer/performer.”620

619 Ibid.
620 Ibid.
The album *Don Heckman - Ed Summerlin Improvisational Jazz Workshop* contains three compositions that are more in line with 1960s contemporary jazz compositional practices or, as the liner notes put it, improvisation “in a fairly traditional contemporary jazz context.” They were “Dialogue,” “Leisure #5,” and “Jax or Better.” Summerlin’s “Dialogue” was composed for use in a CBS television program in 1961 and was then expanded into the version on the record. The CBS program they are referring to is *Look Up and Live*, a thirty-minute religious television program in collaboration with the National Council of Churches that aired every Sunday from 1954 to 1979. Summerlin was involved with nine episodes during the 1960s. The show’s goal was to tackle various issues from a Protestant perspective that were perceived by the church to be relevant during each period. Various issues it tackled over the years were youth culture, rebellion, nonconformity, teenage approach to life, atheism and death. Summerlin’s musical inclusion is indicative of the 1960s hope that the inclusion of jazz, seen as a music of the youth, would help bridge a growing divide between the youth of the day and the church.

In “Dialogue,” Summerlin’s writing is linear in nature and he states that he considered “it to be the culmination of a period of linear writing that I was involved in for several years.” He also explains his use of “changing time signatures” as a vehicle for creating tension and

---

621 Ibid.  
momentum. The melody, although complex, is memorable, featuring several call-and-response sections and is broken up into A and B sections. After the melody, the improvisation is free starting with a dialogue between pianist Steve Kuhn and bassist Ron Carter. There is a written break with the horns and then Ed Summerlin on tenor saxophone and drummer Joe Hunt join in the conversation. The improvisation is broken up at various times by written figures. Finally, alto saxophonist Don Heckman and trumpeter Lew Gluckin join the fray before the group returns to the main B theme.

“Leisure #5” is Summerlin’s second compositional contribution to the album. This, too, was written for a television program, a three-part series for CTV Canada called Celebrations. The special had Summerlin and Heckman being joined by a Canadian rhythm section for the broadcast. Summerlin describes the piece as “an updated be-bop tune with free solos.” The piece is based on an E Lydian Dominant b9 scale, which “is played by the tenor and trombone in the third and fourth bars of the introduction.” The composition begins with a short eight-bar introduction. The form and melody explain Summerlin’s used of the description of an “updated be-bop tune.” The AABA form of the piece is a very typical in jazz and has been used in countless standards. The melody in the A sections is largely eighth-note based and at a brisk tempo of 260 beats per minute. The B section is a bit more unusual in its use of highly rhythmically displaced figures of longer note duration. The solos begin with Summerlin on tenor

624 Ibid.
625 Edgar E. Summerlin, Curriculum Vitae. private collection.
627 Ibid.
628 Ibid.
saxophone playing free of any harmonic and rhythmic constraints, accompanied by Ron Carter on bass, Steve Kuhn on piano, and Joe Hunt on drums. The solo concludes with material from the introduction and then Heckman begins a free solo. With the same players accompanying him, Joe Hunt then takes an extended unaccompanied drum solo ending Heckman’s solo section. The whole group returns with the AABA form to end the piece with a short free coda at the end.

Summerlin viewed this recording as the culmination of a period of composition. He states, “I considered it important to record these two pieces as I felt they were the end of a stage in my development as a composer, and therefore, finished works. I am now involved in a much different music that involves more freedom as well as actions and mixed media; this music is in a stage of flux and development.” Clearly he felt that he had already begun a new musical chapter in his life during this period and it was still coalescing. As discussed in the previous chapter, his liturgical works had become much more experimental by this time.

Don Heckman’s piece “Jax or Better” is the bluesiest of the tracks on the album. Its style is very reminiscent of Charles Mingus’s writing in its melodic and harmonic content. The solos are more indebted to Ornette Coleman than Mingus. The introduction is played by Ron Carter on bass, Joe Hunt on drums, with Steve Kuhn adding some sporadic piano clusters. It has a steady pulse but no clear time signature. The melody enters and Heckman describes the melody as having a “freely declamatory style over a fast, unrelated rhythm section pulse.” I would not go so far as to say it is unrelated to the pulse as there is a strong connection to the

---

630 Ibid.
tempo that is clearly present. There is quite a bit of tension created by the interaction of the rhythm and the melody but the melody is certainly not free of the time. The piece evokes the blues more than any other track on the album and is described by Heckman as “an attempt to retain the feeling, the spirit, and in one sense, at least, the content of the blues, in a piece whose procedures exceed the bounds of the traditional jazz styles.”

I believe the exceeding Heckman is referring to has more to do with the solo sections than the melodic statement. Heckman takes the first solo and is free of any harmonic constraints, with the pulse eventually breaking down completely and freeing the whole group of any set rhythm. As Heckman’s solo continues he is joined by Summerlin, Norden, and Gluckin, who “play individual permutations of the basic tone row: F, Eb, Ab, Db, Gb, E, A, D, G, Bb, B, C.”

Steve Kuhn follows Heckman’s solo and the pulse returns albeit more fractured than in its original incarnation until it eventually breaks down. The rhythm returns toward the end of Kuhn’s solo and the horns enter a “Basie like middle section.” The Basie-ness of the section is somewhat debatable; I would refer to it more in a Mingus vain than Basie because of its rhythmic and harmonic content. Ron Carter takes the final solo unaccompanied on bass and eventually sets up the pulse again. The band returns with the melody again to end the piece.

The final piece, “Five Haikus,” is, as Downbeat reviewer Pete Welding put it, “a piece of a different color.” The Heckman piece was a musical portrait of five haikus by Ryota, Buson,

__________________________

632 Ibid.
633 Ibid.
Issa, Izen and Shiki. Heckman gave the players freedom to play the notes he wrote “freely, but within certain time segments and with various dynamic and articulative instructions.” Heckman was much freer with the vocalist Lisa Zanda. She was simply given “tonal directions (up, down, mid-range, screech, etc.).” The first haiku is Winter Evening by Ryota. It is free from any time signature or harmonic framework. The text and its delivery are the most traditional, featuring gospel and blues based melodic material. The second haiku, The springtime sea, is also free with the vocals taking on a more chromatic palette. The third haiku, Snow melts, begins with an almost inaudible and sparse vocal punctuated by a single fast three-note piano figure by Steve Kuhn. The rest of the group enters midway through the section with a dissonant chord that is held against Zanda’s moving vocal line. The tenor saxophone, piano, trumpet, and bass drum all play a single note separated by a good deal of space, with Zanda singing the final words to the end the section. The fourth haiku, Blooms on the plum, begins with a very dissonant chord played by the whole group while Zanda’s vocals move against it at times in a very dissonant fashion. The group then take turns playing short figures against the vocal line at seemingly random intervals. The section ends in a similar fashion as it began with a dissonant chord being held against a moving vocal line. The fifth haiku is Spring Road, which begins with an almost inaudible vocal line that is joined by sporadic figures from the rest of the group. The vocal line and figures slowly gain in volume and frequency. Ron Carter ends the piece with a rhythmic walking bass line.

636 Ibid.
637 Ibid.
Downbeat reviewed Don Heckman - Ed Summerlin Improvisational Jazz Workshop in the October 19, 1967 issue and gave it an impressive 4½ stars out of a possible 5. Pete Welding writes, “there is a real sense of spontaneity to the group’s music, and this applies equally to the composed sections. The success of the latter is due wholly to the writers’ ability to fashion thematic materials that are in themselves interesting, have an air of naturalness and inevitability about them, and are also shaped by the normal playing styles of the executants. And they swing.” Welding goes on to compare Summerlin’s two compositional contributions to the record as a “contemporary small orchestra—or rather a cross between the Miles Davis nonet and avant-garde.” The Birth of the Cool album is often associated with Miles Davis’s trumpet and Gil Evans’s arrangements, so it is fitting that Welding compared Summerlin’s writing to a mix with this group and the general avant-garde style given Summerlin’s affection for Evans and Coleman. Welding’s review elaborates more on the similarities in compositional style by stating that “the two groups employ roughly the same approach to writing; the composed sections generally have the same kind of linear movement, being horizontally rather than vertically oriented. And there is, to a degree, the same kind of contrapuntal activity beneath the soloists.” This linear approach is also very much in line with another one of Summerlin’s influences, Ornette Coleman.

While Ornette Coleman did attend the Lenox School of Jazz, he was there one year prior to Summerlin. There is certainly no doubt that his tenure at the school created controversy and must have been the stuff of legend the following year. Summerlin was already familiar with

---

639 Ibid.
640 Ibid.
641 Ibid.
Coleman’s work during his time at North Texas State University and was a fan. Coleman’s approach is one that stresses melodies created without the traditional constraints of a harmonic framework or strict form. It also espouses an equal treatment of the instruments as opposed to the traditional jazz model of a soloist supported by accompanists. This free and equal approach had a profound impact on jazz practices not only in free styles but in more traditional settings as well. A new level of interaction occurred in groups like the Bill Evans trio or the John Coltrane quartet, which in part was due to this new found democratization of the bass and drums. Welding describes Summerlin’s delivery as follows:

the more overt swinger of the pair: Dialogue and Leisure are brighter and more buoyant in character than is Heckman’s work in the same genre, Jax (Haikus is a piece of a different color). Actually, there is a marked difference in charter between the composed and improvised sections; the former seem far more conventionally jazz-inflected... the solo statements by Heckman, Summerlin, Kuhn, and Carter, which reflect current avant-garde practice for their respective instruments. The soloists for the most part, however, lead on gradually into this more energized kind of playing. And, it must be admitted, it works.

The review was extensive and took up almost the entire page. Welding was clearly impressed by the first and last recorded outing by this band.

There would be a twenty-six year recording gap for Summerlin and his non-liturgical groups. The drought was broken by the aptly titled Still At It, which was released in 1994. The recording drought is not an accurate way to describe this period because Summerlin was recording but for Heckman and Caedmon records. Heckman had been doing incidental music

642 Morgan Powell, interview with author, August 2015.
for Caedmon records, which was a spoken word company. The recordings Heckman could not participate in were passed along to Summerlin. Heckman describes Summerlin as “a very, very capable guy. He could you know write for small groups and was a very good arranger. He was capable of doing any kind of musical task and doing it very well.” Summerlin worked as an arranger and conductor on Winnie-The-Pooh Told And Sung By Carol Channing (TC-1408) and Whoever heard of a Fird? (TC-1735). Summerlin was the composer, arranger and conductor for Many Moons (TC-1410), The great Quillow (TC-1411), Curious George and other stories about Curious George (TC-1420), and Curious George learns the alphabet and other stories about Curious George (TC-1421).

When Heckman was put in charge of doing a cover record of the band Chicago’s music, he hired Summerlin as the arranger and conductor. The record Saturday In The Park was released by RCA Camden and produced by Don Heckman. It featured many top-tier New York jazz musicians like guitarist Joe Beck, trumpeter Randy Brecker, bassist Tony Levin, trumpeter Marvin Stamm, as well as Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Don Heckman on alto and soprano

645 Don Heckman, interview with author, March 2015.
646 Ibid.
647 A. A. Milne, Winnie the Pooh Told and Sung by Carol Channing, arranged and conducted by Ed Summerlin and Don Heckman, Caedmon Records TC1408, 33⅓ rpm, 1972.
649 James Thurber, Many Moons, Music composed and conducted by Edgar Summerlin, Caedmon Records TC1410, 33⅓ rpm, 1972.
650 Ibid.
651 H.A. Rey, Curious George and Other Stories About Curious George, Music composed and conducted by Edgar Summerlin, Caedmon Records TC1420, 33⅓ rpm, 1972.
652 H. A. Rey, Curious George Learns The Alphabet And Other Stories About Curious George, Music composed and conducted by Edgar Summerlin, Caedmon Records TC1421, 33⅓ rpm, 1973.
saxophone, and Bob Norden on trombone.\textsuperscript{653} Marvin Stamm recalled the recording session as a very tense one in which an unnamed player was struggling with the music. He felt that Summerlin was particularly harsh with the player during the session and it made for an uncomfortable time in the studio.\textsuperscript{654} Summerlin has widely been described as someone who spoke his mind. He often complimented musicians when he thought they were performing well, but did not hesitate to voice his displeasure when someone’s playing was not up to par. I believe this character trait is part of what endeared him to so many and also permanently ruffled a few feathers.

City College of New York

In 1971, Ed Summerlin took a job as the Director of the Jazz Program at the City College of the City University of New York. This was his full-time job until his retirement in 1989. Don Heckman was completing a master’s degree at the City College when he was offered a job at the school and given a mandate to start a jazz program. He accepted, but a short time later Heckman was offered a job with RCA as “head of their east coast A&R.”\textsuperscript{655} Heckman realized he could not do both jobs and recommended Ed Summerlin to the City College, stating, “he was even better than I am…. because he has a broader educational background.”\textsuperscript{656} Summerlin built an impressive program and hired some of the most accomplished and recognizable jazz musicians in New York. Faculty that he hired during his tenure were Ron Carter (1982-2002),

\textsuperscript{653} liner notes to \textit{Saturday In the Park}, The Rock Generation, RCA Camden ACL1-0251, 33⅓ rpm, 1973.  
\textsuperscript{654} Marvin Stamm, interview with author, March 2015.  
\textsuperscript{655} Don Heckman, interview with author, March 2015.  
\textsuperscript{656} Ibid.

From the start, Ed Summerlin was fighting an uphill battle creating a jazz program at the City College. While there were already established jazz programs at universities like North Texas State University, the Berklee College of Music, the Eastman School of Music, Indiana University, and the University of Miami, they were far from the norm.\(^\text{658}\) By 1969 there were “165 colleges with non-credit jazz courses; 135 gave academic credits.”\(^\text{659}\) While this is a significant number, it does not tell the whole story. As author Charles Suber put it in 1976:

> For all of its considerable current academic status, Jazz Education is not yet considered – by those who determine such matters – an essential part of the musical training \textit{required} by teachers and student musicians. This determination is reflected in the widespread use – in school curricula and echoed by mass media- of such elitist characterizations of European music as “serious” or “good” or “classical” music. Jazz and blues – synonymous terms in the context of this essay – are too often characterized by educational pejorative expressions, such as “popular” or “commercial” or “youth” music. Jazz Education seems to be, like jazz, a shade too popular, a shade too dark and common to warrant complete integration into the Music Education club.\(^\text{660}\)

Forty years later, this sentiment has diminished but is not completely gone. Summerlin faced a constant struggle in achieving his mandate, but he did build an outstanding program with world-class faculty over his eighteen-year tenure at the City College. Dan Carillo stated that City College was “one of the first programs to be a jazz major and it would never have happened if


\(^{660}\) Charles Suber, “Jazz Education,” p. 366.
Ed wasn’t as strong an individual and passionate an individual as he was because other than a few high-level administrators who believed in him and believed in the program it wasn’t well received or well thought of…. He had to fight for everything…. It only succeeded because Ed is who he is. I don’t know that there is another man or person in the world who would have been able to fight every one of those battles and come out winning.” Former student, pianist, and lecturer in jazz studies Ray Gallon echoed Carillo’s sentiment, saying that Summerlin “really had to fight really hard to get the jazz program, not just to get it going, but to keep it going.”

Summerlin had several students go on to have successful professional careers as performers and teachers. Dan Carillo started at the City College in 1969 as a chemistry major. He had been playing professionally since the age of thirteen and put himself through college by playing gigs. Eventually he made a living as a studio musician and by playing and recording with high-profile artists like Harry Belafonte and Diane Reeves, among others. He took several music classes and was encouraged to switch his major to music. In 1971, Summerlin arrived to start a jazz program at the City College and began with a small jazz band and a jazz history class.

Summerlin, Carillo notes, “took a real interest in some of the players who were a little more advanced and we used to play with him in a small group on our time. I learned a lot from him there.” When recalling Summerlin’s playing style at the time, Carillo stated, “I marvel at it because he was a master of traditional jazz language, bebop. He was a bebop master but he was a modernist too. [He] really understood the orchestrations of Gil Evans and always reminded me of Sonny Rollins in his playing. The freeness of the way he would approach things

---

661 Dan Carillo, interview with author, March 2015.
663 Dan Carillo, interview with author, March 2015.
664 Ibid.
especially time and his sound.” Summerlin wrote a great deal of music for the student band upon his arrival. He had the ability to write technically simple music that sounded good, according to Carillo.

Summerlin had a very tell-it-like-it-is approach to teaching, music, and life. Carillo described Summerlin as a “no holds barred person. What you see is what you get with Ed. He doesn’t stand on any pretense. He doesn’t hold back what he really believes and feels. He comes out and says it and as a teacher he was the same way.” Carillo actually felt that it was refreshing to hear honest, albeit unfiltered criticism of his and others’ work. Carillo concluded his thought on Summerlin as a teacher by stating that “he was thorough, he was very opinionated and very passionate and really knew his stuff.” Summerlin would also invite students up to the Poughkeepsie area to play on weekends at his home and was very involved with students’ lives, according to Carillo. Summerlin was able to bring in Ornette Coleman, Freddie Hubbard, Steve Kuhn, Jim Hall, George Duvivier, Connie Kay, Harvie Schwartz, Lew Soloff, Charles Mingus, Lee Konitz, and Gil Evans for residencies at the City College. He also brought in Charlie Palmieri to direct the latin band. Palmieri was a pianist, arranger, and bandleader who began playing professionally with the Osario Selasie Orchestra at age sixteen. Later, he joined the Rafael Muñoz Band and Tito Puente band. In “1959 he debuted his popular charanga, La Orquesta Duboney, featuring Johnny Pacheco on flute....Palmieri was one

665 Ibid.
666 Ibid.
667 Ibid.
668 Ibid.
of the most important Puerto Rican musicians to popularize and develop Latin music in New York.\footnote{669}

By the late 1970s, Summerlin’s jazz program at the City College had grown enough to begin offering graduate degrees. Ray Gallon began his undergraduate degree at the City College in 1975 and, after graduating in 1982, became the first graduate student in the jazz program to receive a MA in composition in 1989.\footnote{670} He taught classes during his graduate studies and then took on a faculty position at the school under Summerlin’s leadership. A pianist, Gallon has performed with Ron Carter, Sheila Jordan, Lionel Hampton, George Adams, Harper Brothers, Dakota Staton, Charli Persip, Benny Golson, the Mingus Big Band, Herb Harris, Art Farmer, Lew Tabackin, and T.S. Monk.\footnote{671} Gallon described Summerlin’s teaching as “totally direct and totally honest and blunt. He was also very concerned with pushing envelopes and trying to do new things.”\footnote{672} Gallon studied harmony in Summerlin’s class as an undergraduate and then composition and orchestration with him as a master’s student. In the composition class, he said Summerlin “really pushed me to write something really personal and not something that just sounded in the style that something had already been done. Try to find something new that was really his thing. He really encouraged [that.]” Summerlin also encouraged his students to be more artistically well rounded: “he always would encourage us to do things like go to the museums and look at art. Don’t just be caught up in just jazz or just music you should be
exposed to all forms of art.” Summerlin also brought in The Viola Farber Dance Company and had the students play to his sketches and improvise to the dancers with Summerlin both conducting and playing as well. By the time Gallon began his studies there, the school had two big bands, a traditional big band playing standard repertoire led by Bob Norden and a contemporary big band led by Summerlin primarily playing his challenging original music. Gallon described the music as “very modern, having a lot of free jazz elements to it. A lot of dissonant harmonies.... He liked diminished chords but using double diminished.”

Ornette Coleman was an artist-in-residence during Gallon’s student tenure and performed a concert with the big band. Coleman had sent Summerlin several of his compositions and Summerlin created big band arrangements of the music for the concert. He also wrote an original composition, “I Thought I Heard Ornette Say,” for the concert, a reference to an earlier composition by trombonist William Cornish, who was in Charles “Buddy” Bolden’s band, called “Funky Butt.” Bolden, a cornetist, is described as a pioneer in early New Orleans jazz. According to Donald M. Marquis, Bolden was not “the first to play jazz, but he was the first to popularize it and give the music a base from which to grow.” Summerlin’s choice of song title says much about his feelings about Ornette Coleman’s influence on jazz as a whole. Bolden has historically been viewed as a kind of father figure to jazz, the first in the “great man” theory of jazz. I believe Summerlin is drawing a direct correlation between Bolden and Coleman

673 Ibid.
674 Ibid.
675 Ibid.
676 Ibid.
678 Ibid., xv.
and is making it known he feels Coleman’s, albeit controversial, innovations were a seminal moment forward for jazz. In his liner notes for *Sum of the Parts*, Summerlin writes, “I have always loved Ornette and his music and I feel that he showed all of us the way after bebop.” Summerlin also created extended works for Jim Hall and Hank Jones during his tenure at the City College.

When Summerlin first arrived at the City College, he was playing a good deal of gigs in the city, but as time passed he became more focused on playing opportunities upstate, where, according to Gallon, he became “an important member of the scene.” Carillo recalled that Summerlin had occasionally played with trumpeter Nat Adderley and bassist Harvey Schwartz, but I could not corroborate this with any other sources. Summerlin brought his free jazz experience to the City College jazz program and his students. His big band charts included open modal sections, vamps, and pedal points. According to Carillo, Summerlin “would write pretty free stuff above these vamps and these pedal points and a lot of sectional interaction with a lot of dissonances in his writing. When it opened up for solos it was, I wouldn’t call it free jazz, but it was very open. The other thing that he did when he would have some of us play with him off on our own and have a few of play we would play free jazz.” Summerlin would have the students play standards as well as his own original compositions. Carillo recalls “some of the pieces he wrote didn’t have chords you know they just had sounds and we would play them, so yeah he brought it [free material] in.”

681 Dan Carillo, interview with author, March 2015.
682 Ibid.
Final Years

After Summerlin retired from the City College of New York in 1989, he poured his energy into composition and performance. He became even more active as a performer in upstate New York. Summerlin also recorded three CDs of his original compositions which were released on his own label Ictus: *Still At It* (ICTUS 104), *Sum of the Parts* (ICTUS 102), and *Eye on the Future* (ICTUS 103). These three recordings would be a vehicle for him to continue exploring his compositions and avant-garde improvising.

*Still At It* is the first of his post-retirement recording projects. It was recorded in 1994 and the group is listed as the Ed Summerlin/Bob Norden Quartet with both Summerlin and Norden listed as producers. Recorded December 27-28, 1993 at The Make Believe Ballroom, the album’s personnel includes Ed Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Bob Norden on trombone, Charlie Kniceley, and Christian Starpoli on percussion. According to the liner notes, the album had been recorded and was supposed to be released on another unidentified label but was shelved for years. This explains the curious numbering of ICTUS 104 for an album that was recorded years before *Sum of the Parts* (ICTUS 102) and *Eye on the Future* (ICTUS 103). The album has nine tracks: “Y.A Title,” “Déjà vu,” “Roadrunner,” “Second Hand,” “Sonic Dudes,” “Cire,” “Osky,” “Scoop It Up,” and “Old Flowers.” Summerlin composed “Déjà vu,” “Second Hand,” “Sonic Dudes,” “Scoop It Up,” and “Old Flowers” with Norden and Kniceley each contributing two of the other tracks.

*Sum of the Parts* was released in 1998 and featured a quintet of Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Ron Finck on alto saxophone, Bruce Ahrens on trumpet, Tony Marino on bass, and

---

Joe Chambers on drums. This time, Summerlin composed each of the compositions except two tracks, “Broadway Blues” by Ornette Coleman, and “Sound Lee” by Lee Konitz. Summerlin produced and arranged all the music and it was recorded at The Make Believe Ballroom.

Summerlin’s compositions were “Where’d You Find This?,” “Hop SKIP and Jump,” “Dialog,” “Sonic Dudes,” “Waltz for Toshi and Ryoko,” and “Chords and Lines.” Summerlin viewed the record as the culmination of all his experiences up to that point. He gave a chronological history of his musical exploits in the liner notes and stated, “as I approach my 70th year, I feel I should get my musical thoughts on record—so this is the beginning of a summing up of some of the parts of my musical life.”

*Eye on the Future* was Summerlin’s final recorded work and featured a sextet largely made up of the members of his quintet, with the exception of replacing Joe Chambers with Adam Nussbaum, a former student of Summerlin’s. All of the compositions and arrangements are Summerlin’s. It was recorded December 14-15, 1998 at The Make Believe Ballroom with Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Ron Finck on alto saxophone, Bruce Ahrens on trumpet, Bob Norden on trombone, Tony Marino on bass, and Adam Nussbaum on drums. The compositions were “Golden Oldie,” “Tricky,” “Another Waltz,” “Backwards We Glance,” “Relentless,” “Song,” “Third Man,” “Episodes,” “Trickly (Alternate take),” and “Improvisation.” The album features all new compositions but the concepts explored in the songs, according to Summerlin, “go all the way back to the sixties and my participation in the

---

686 This is presumably a typo on the title Tricky, which is track 2 on the album.
Don Ellis group and [later] the Don Heckman, Ed Summerlin Improvisational Jazz Workshop.\textsuperscript{687}

While Summerlin considered the album as a part of the summing-up he started in \textit{Sum of the Parts}, it is forward-looking and searches for “ways to integrate freedom and discipline without losing the swing and without letting the freedom turn into undisciplined chaos.”\textsuperscript{688}

The album received a positive review in \textit{Jazziz} magazine, with Steve Futterman writing:

Eye on the Future is additional evidence that the 70-plus-year-old remains a captivating musical figure whose take on jazz is more adventurous than that of most players half his age.... In their dissonant tonalities and their mixture of free jazz and tight construction, Summerlin’s compositions are reminiscent of the brilliant early ’60s work of Booker Little, Max Roach, and Eric Dolphy. The leader has a brawny tenor tone and unlimited energy that he uses to great advantage... A distinctive improvisor, Summerlin is also an exceptional thinker blessed with a group-player mentality - jazz needs lots more like him.\textsuperscript{689}

According to Adam Nussbaum, there was to be a follow up to \textit{Eye on the Future}.\textsuperscript{690} Although Summerlin wrote and rehearsed new material, the project never came to fruition. Summerlin had been diagnosed with throat cancer despite never having been a smoker. As his condition worsened, he was no longer physically able to play saxophone and he turned his attention to composition. Edgar Eugene “Ed” Summerlin passed away on October 10, 2006 in Rhinebeck, New York.\textsuperscript{691}

\textsuperscript{688} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{690} Adam Nussbaum, interview with author, February 2015.
Ed Summerlin’s time at Lenox School of Jazz was his introduction to the world of the elite New York jazz musicians. While there, he worked with some of the biggest names in jazz like Freddie Hubbard, Jim Hall, John Lewis, Milt Jackson, Gunther Schuller, and Connie Kay, many of whom he would work with again in the near or distant future. He also met Don Heckman, a musician with similar avant-garde interests who would be a musical partner for decades. He would provide Summerlin with some of his most long-lasting opportunities, like working at the City College of New York. During his tenure there, Summerlin would grow a program from scratch into one which included some of the best jazz musicians in the world. After retirement Summerlin would redouble his efforts to play, compose, and record the music he loved right up until his death. Summerlin took many of the concepts and practices he perfected in his liturgical period into the classroom with the same zeal and total commitment to his students that he had for his congregation.
Chapter 6

Conclusion

This dissertation provided a close examination of three vital facets of Ed Summerlin’s long, accomplished, and influential career: his formative years, his contributions to liturgical jazz and his experiences with avant-garde music and musicians that helped shape his liturgical works, and his contributions to jazz education. Although these three areas of his life may seem to be separate focal points, they were, in reality, intertwined and thus provided him the tools to produce the first liturgical jazz service and then mount a sustained career that constantly pushed the boundaries of what liturgical music could be. Summerlin’s deep knowledge and respect for the jazz tradition was balanced by a constant searching for the freedom of expression that the avant-garde provided him. These two perspectives allowed his music to be contemporary while still being grounded in the tradition of jazz.

When education became his focus, Summerlin was able to impart wisdom to his students that can only be acquired from working as a performer, arranger, and composer. The trials and tribulations he faced in promoting jazz as an appropriate vehicle for expression and devotion in sacred spaces gave him a resiliency that served him well in running a jazz program. Summerlin prevailed despite a constant struggle with institutional forces, both in religious organizations and in collegiate bureaucracies. He was always willing to fight for jazz music and jazz musicians to be given the respect they deserved.
Achievements

Here, in summary, are Summerlin’s major musical achievements in jazz:

1. He composed, performed, recorded, and released the first liturgical jazz service.
2. He was the first to use world-class jazz musicians for liturgical jazz services.
3. He was a pioneer in incorporating avant-garde jazz performance and compositional practice into liturgical jazz services.
4. He was an innovator in incorporating multimedia into liturgical jazz services.
5. He was a tireless advocate and brought jazz into churches across the United States.
6. He developed the jazz program at the City College of New York, which, under his guidance, had some of the greatest jazz musicians in history as its faculty.
7. He has left behind an ever-evolving legacy in the form of his students, many of whom are still part of the jazz community all over the world.

Further Study

Despite the findings of this study, there is still more work that can be done on Summerlin and on liturgical jazz. Many of Summerlin’s liturgical works are deserving of deeper theoretical analysis, and could be compared to the works of prominent avant-garde musical innovators. This study focused on Summerlin’s contributions as both a performer and composer, but he was also a prolific arranger of secular jazz standards and original compositions. There are unreleased recordings of City College of New York bands playing with a variety of guest soloists, including Ornette Coleman, that could be studied. The liturgical jazz works of Frank Tirro, Eddie Bonnemère, Paul Knopf, and David Baker could be analyzed in
greater detail. Finally, many of the liturgical jazz works in this study have not been performed in recent times and, in some cases, have never been professionally recorded. There is still a wealth of information on liturgical jazz that has yet to be explored.
Bibliography

Books


Attributed Articles


Browne, Bob. Sharps and Flats, Newspaper clipping paper unknown, 8.


———. "Jazz Enthusiasts From All Over the County Flock to NT." *Denton Record-Chronicle*. Jan 19, 1958.


———. “Does the Church Really Want to Sing a New Song?” *Your Church*. 1969.


———. “Having Fun With Sight and Sound.” *Baptist Leader*. August 1969.


Unattributed Articles


"Dentonite’s Composition: Experimental Jazz Service Well Received at Premier." *Denton Record-Chronicle*. May 21, 1959.


“Jazz Goes to Church.” *Ebony*. April 1966.


Dissertations


Scores


Liner Notes


Feather, Leonard. liner notes to *Hub Cap*, Freddie Hubbard, Blue Note Records BLP 4073, 33⅓ rpm, 1961.


Heckman, Don. liner notes to *Saturday In the Park*, The Rock Generation, RCA Camden ACL1-0251, 33⅓ rpm, 1973.


Milne, A.A. *Winnie the Pooh Told and Sung by Carol Channing*, arranged and conducted by Ed Summerlin and Don Heckman, Caedmon Records TC1408, 33⅓ rpm, 1972.


Rey, H.A. *Curious George and Other Stories About Curious George*, Music composed and conducted by Edgar Summerlin, Caedmon Records TC1420, 33⅓ rpm, 1972.


———. *Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?*, recorded June 25, 1969, Compact Disc. private collection.


Witkowski, Deana. liner notes to *From This Place*, Deanna Witkowski, Tilapia Records 0002, compact disc, 2009.

Archival Materials

All Nite Soul, Concert Program, 1982, St. Peter’s Church. private collection.


Kelly, Kevin P. “Community of St. Thomas the Apostle in Harlem.” promotional material.


———. A Choral Concert, Concert Program, 1968, Grace Episcopal Church. private collection.


———. A Contemporary Service of Worship, Service Program, 1968, First United Methodist Church. private collection.


———. Annual All-American Concert Program, May 13, 1959, private collection.


———. *Bless This World*, Concert Poster, 1970, Kleinhans Music Hall. private collection.

———. *Bless This World*, Concert Poster, 1970, Vassar College Chapel. private collection.

———. *Bless This World*, Program, 1970, Rutgers University Livingston Campus. private collection.


———. Central Missouri State, Commencement Program, 1951. private collection.


———. *Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?*, Concert Program, 1969, Chapel of the Interchurch Center. private collection.

———. *Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?*, Concert Program, 1969, Duke Chapel. private collection.

———. *Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?*, Concert Program, 1969, Terrace Cafeteria. private collection.

———. *Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?*, Festival Program, 1970, Pittsburgh Theological Seminary. private collection.

———. *Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?*, Concert Program, 1970, Woodside Church and Court Street United Methodist Church. private collection.

———. *Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here?*, Festival Program, 1971, Wittenberg University. private collection.

———. Curriculum Vitae. private collection.


———. Festival of the Arts, Poster, 1968, Grace Episcopal Church. private collection.

———. Festival of Religion and the Arts, Program, 1963, Church of the Savior. private collection.


———. George Russell to Ed Summerlin, 19 October 1959. private collection.


———. Lenox School of Jazz, Concert Program, 1960. private collection.

———. Liturgical Jazz Service, Service Program, 1961, Universalist Unitarian Church. private collection.


———. Liturgical Jazz: Wesley’s Order for Morning Prayer with Jazz Setting, Service Program, 1964, University of South Florida. private collection.

———. Merrimon Cuninggim to Ed Summerlin, 21 May 1959. private collection.


———. Morning Worship, Service Program, 1967, Hope Church. private collection.


———. Open Wide Religious Arts Festival of the Kennebunks, Festival Program, 1968, Kennebunk. private collection.


———. Order of Morning Worship, Service Program, 1966, Methodist University Center. private collection.


———. Praise the Lord in Many Voices, Program, 1967, Carnegie Hall.


———. Salvation Today, Conference Program, 1972, Vassar Farm. private collection.


———. Seventh Annual Symposium of International Federation of Music Schools, Contemporary Jazz Concert Program, 1953. private collection.

———. Sixteenth Middle Atlantic Adult Convocation of the Methodist Church, Conference Program, 1968, The Inn. private collection.

———. Sourdough and Sweetbread, Program, 1969, Cazenovia College. private collection.


———. Sourdough and Sweetbread, Program, 1969, Methodist University Center. private collection.


———. The Music of the Eucharist In a Contemporary Idiom, Service Program, 1960, University of Nebraska Student Union.

———. This Spring at… Anderson “Y” Center, Spring Event Bulletin, 1961, University of the Pacific Student YMCA-YWCA. private collection.

———. Transcripts, North Texas State College, 1959.

———. Wesley’s Order for Morning Prayer in a Jazz Setting, Service Program, 1961, University of the Pacific. private collection.

———. Whitsunday, Service Program, 1959, Collection on Schubert M. Ogden, Bridwell Library, Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University.

———. Worship in the Modern Idiom, Service Program, 1969, First Baptist Church. private collection.

“Edward V. Bonnemère,” Biography. Institute of Jazz Studies: Rutgers University. Newark, N.J.

“Eddie Bonnemère,” Judith Finell Music Services, Promotional Material. Institute of Jazz Studies: Rutgers University. Newark, N.J.

“Missa Hodierna,” Ticket. Institute of Jazz Studies: Rutgers University. Newark, N.J.


“St Peter’s Church News Release,” Eddie Bonnemère. Institute of Jazz Studies: Rutgers University. Newark, N.J.

Online Articles


197
http://articles.latimes.com/2006/nov/03/local/me-cariaga3.


Interviews Conducted by Author


Carillo, Dan. Interview with author. March 2015.


Heckman, Don. Interview with author. March 2015.


Kuhn, Steve. Interview with author. March 2015.


Nussbaum, Adam. Interview with author. February 2015.

Powell, Morgan. Interview with author. August 2015.


Stamm, Marvin. Interview with author. March 2015.


Tirro, Frank P. Interview with author. November 2015.


Wisotsky, Jeffrey. Interview with author. March 2015.

Witkowski, Deanna. Interview with author. March 2015.
Appendix A: Ed Summerlin Discography

As Leader


As Co-Leader


As Arranger and Conductor


A. A. Milne, *Winnie the Pooh Told and Sung by Carol Channing*, arranged and conducted by Ed Summerlin and Don Heckman, Caedmon Records TC1408, 33⅓ rpm, 1972.


———, *The Great Quillow*, Music composed and conducted by Edgar Summerlin, Caedmon Records TC1411, 33⅓ rpm, 1972.


Unreleased Recordings

Ed Summerlin, *Liturgical Jazz Service*, Ed Summerlin, recorded May 20, 1959, compact disc, Collection on Schubert M. Ogden, Bridwell Library, Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University.

———, *Lenox School of Jazz*: featuring Freddie Hubbard on trumpet, Jim D'Angelo, and Don Heckman on alto saxophones, Ed Summerlin on tenor saxophone, Mike Gibbs on trombone, John Payne on piano, David Mauney on piano and vibraphone, Narma Feuer on bass, and Connie Kay and Peter Blum on drums, Ed Summerlin, recorded September 1, 1960, compact disc. private collection.

———, *Christ Lag in Todesbanden or Where Do We Go From Here*, recorded June 25, 1969, Ed Summerlin, compact disc. private collection.

———, *Bless This World*, Ed Summerlin, recorded 1970, compact Disc. private collection.


———, *Ed Summerlin Big Band*, Ed Summerlin, compact disc. private collection.

———, *Quartet at Rosendale*, Ed Summerlin, recorded 2003, compact disc. private collection.
Film and Filmstrips

*We Shall Return*, 1963.

*Ciao*, 1967.

*Violence Has No Enemies*, 1977.


*Jazz Improvisation*, 1979.


*More Than a Place to Live*, 1981.


*The Blue Devils Come Home*, 1993.

*A Solemn Contract*.

*Block in the Bronx*.

*Brownsville Transfer*.

*Crack Kills*.

*Dangerous Crossing: Militarization of Southeast Asia*.

*Early Days Ago*.

*Ethiopia*.

*It’s Up to You*.

*Looking Back*.

*Looking Forward*.

*Lumia*. 
Making the Dream Come True.

Manhattan Transfer.

On Our Own.

The Subway Fantasy.
Appendix B: Liturgical Jazz Service and Jazz Mass Discography


Deana Witkowski, *From This Place*, Deanna Witkowski, Tilapia 0002, compact disc, 2009.


